<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No.</th>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Pages</th>
<th>Topic No</th>
<th>Sutra No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Summary</strong></td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Introduction of Brahma Sutra</strong></td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Jijnasa adhikaranam</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a)  <strong>Sutra 1</strong></td>
<td>103</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Janmady adhikaranam</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a)  <strong>Sutra 2</strong></td>
<td>132</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Sastrayonitv adhikaranam</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a)  <strong>Sutra 3</strong></td>
<td>133</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Samanvay adhikaranam</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a)  <strong>Sutra 4</strong></td>
<td>204</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Ikshatyadyadhikaranam: (Sutras 5-11)</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a)  <strong>Sutra 5</strong></td>
<td>324</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b)  <strong>Sutra 6</strong></td>
<td>353</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c)  <strong>Sutra 7</strong></td>
<td>357</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d)  <strong>Sutra 8</strong></td>
<td>362</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e)  <strong>Sutra 9</strong></td>
<td>369</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>f)  <strong>Sutra 10</strong></td>
<td>372</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>g)  <strong>Sutra 11</strong></td>
<td>376</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. No.</td>
<td>Topic</td>
<td>Pages</td>
<td>Topic No</td>
<td>Sutra No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Anandamayadhikaranam: (Sutras 12-19)</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a)</td>
<td><strong>Sutra 12</strong></td>
<td>382</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b)</td>
<td><strong>Sutra 13</strong></td>
<td>394</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c)</td>
<td><strong>Sutra 14</strong></td>
<td>397</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d)</td>
<td><strong>Sutra 15</strong></td>
<td>407</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e)</td>
<td><strong>Sutra 16</strong></td>
<td>411</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f)</td>
<td><strong>Sutra 17</strong></td>
<td>414</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g)</td>
<td><strong>Sutra 18</strong></td>
<td>416</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>h)</td>
<td><strong>Sutra 19</strong></td>
<td>425</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Antaradhikaranam: (Sutras 20-21)</td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a)</td>
<td><strong>Sutra 20</strong></td>
<td>436</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b)</td>
<td><strong>Sutra 21</strong></td>
<td>448</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Akasadhikaranam :</td>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a)</td>
<td><strong>Sutra 22</strong></td>
<td>460</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Pranadhikaranam :</td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a)</td>
<td><strong>Sutra 23</strong></td>
<td>472</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. No.</td>
<td>Topic</td>
<td>Pages</td>
<td>Topic No</td>
<td>Sutra No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Jyotischaranadhikaranam : (Sutras 24-27)</td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a)</td>
<td>Sutra 24</td>
<td>486</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b)</td>
<td>Sutra 25</td>
<td>508</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c)</td>
<td>Sutra 26</td>
<td>513</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d)</td>
<td>Sutra 27</td>
<td>517</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Pratardanadhikaranam: (Sutras 28-31)</td>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a)</td>
<td>Sutra 28</td>
<td>526</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b)</td>
<td>Sutra 29</td>
<td>538</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c)</td>
<td>Sutra 30</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d)</td>
<td>Sutra 31</td>
<td>558</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SUMMARY

Brahma Sutra Bhasyam
Topics - 191

Chapter – 1

- Samanvaya – reconciliation through proper interpretation
- Topics - 39

Chapter – 2

- Avirodha – non-contradiction
- Topics - 47

Chapter – 3

- Sadhana – spiritual practice
- Topics - 67

Chapter – 4

- Phala – result
- Topics 38

Sections | Topics
---|---
1 | 11
2 | 07
3 | 13
4 | 08

Sections | Topics
---|---
1 | 13
2 | 08
3 | 17
4 | 09

Sections | Topics
---|---
1 | 06
2 | 08
3 | 36
4 | 17

Sections | Topics
---|---
1 | 14
2 | 11
3 | 06
4 | 07
Puja:

- Gratitude to lord for completion of Upanishad course (last Chandogya Upanishad + Brihadaranyaka Upanishad).
- Brihadaranyaka Upanishad took 4 years to complete normally 6 Upanishad taken for study.
- Seek grace to complete Brahma Sutra in 3 yrs.

Introduction:

- Written by Vyasacharya.
- 555 Sutras (Aphorisms).
- Small statement in capsule form.
- Aphorism deals with Vedantic teaching on Brahman.
- Heard, remembered, transmitted.
- How to store ideas in memory?
- **2 Ways:**
  
  a) Keep ideas in sutra form, topics form, Sutras found in grammar, philosophy, ethics, sciences purpose to remember.
  
  b) All ideas in metrical poetry form, verse form sing & remember Ramayana, Mahabharata, 18 puranas. All ideas in 555 Sutras. Each Sutra atom bomb to expand.

Vyasa’s 3 Projects / 3 Tasks

- Extract right interpretation from 10 Upanishads.
- Defend right teaching
- Offensive refuting wrong interpretation.
- Report logical loopholes in other systems.
Who is qualified to study Brahma Sutras with advantage?

- One with strong logic, grammar, etymology.
- One who has studied 10 Upanishads. (Many Sutras from Chandogya Upanishad + Brihadaranyaka Upanishad).
- One who does Parayanam of Upanishad – Remembers Mantras.

Question:

- Do we need Brahma Sutra for Jnanam and Moksha.

Answer:

- No – not required Gita + Upanishads enough.

Question:

- Why Brahma Sutra?

Answer:

- It is one of 3 basic texts – Prasthana Trayam of Vedantic teaching.
Sutra:

- Code word – Can’t make any simple translation.
- Shankara Sutra Bashyam very famous 3 years to complete
- RK Mission  - Sutras with English translation.
1) Superiority of Human:

Common aspects with animals – Sadharmyam:

- Ahara – Eating
- Nidra – Sleep
- Bayam – Sense of insecurity
- Maithunam – Desire for propagation of Species.

Vaidharmyam – Uncommon Aspects:

- Buddhi - Evolved intelligence.
  - Rational thinking, Discrimination Right / Wrong, Real / Unreal, Good / Bad – Extra Faculty more developed.
  - Thinking faculty – Unique feature.
  - Judge / Reason / Achieve goal.
  - Because of intellect, human forms opinion, have goal, work for achievement of goal.

Human:

- Thinker with clear ideas.
6 Topics Analyzed + Come to Systematic Conclusion

(1) - Who is Jiva / living being?
(2) - What is Jagat?
(3) - Who is Ishvara – cause of Jiva & Jagat – “Source”
(4) - What is Bandah?
(5) - What is Mukti, Moksha liberation salvation?
(6) - What are Sadhanas for Moksha - means by which person goes from bondage to liberation.

- Not whimsical / casual thinker / capricious philosophy.
- Philosophy called Darshanam consistent view / teaching.
- **Darshanika**:
  One who holds philosophy.
- Because of his consistency, there will be followers.
- Founder – called Acharya – Darshanika.
12 Philosophies

6 Astikas

1) Accept Veda Pramanam as reliable source of knowledge.
2) Veda Astiiti Yaha Vadati Saha Astika.

6 Nastikas

1) Don’t accept Veda Pramanam.
2) Veda Nasti.
3) Base on Pratyaksham, Perception and inference - Anumanam reasoning.
4) Veda Pramana Nasti Hi Yaha Vadati.

1. Charvakas:

- Source: Brihaspati – Deva guru.
- To mislead Asura, he didn’t accept but to destroy Asuras.
- Asuras will follow materialistic philosophy. Will not accept Vedas.
- Prathama Sishya - Charvaka, popularized teaching.

Charu

↓

Beautiful

Vaka

↓

Speech

“yavād jīvet sukham jīvet rnam kṛtva ghṛtam pibet | bhasmibhutasya dehasya punar aagamanam kutah ||

Eat, drink and be merry, for death is certain and there is nothing beyond.
• Borrow and eat sweet things. Returning not my problem, take it you can.
• Will you go to hell after cheating?
• Kasmi Butasya Dehasya who knows after body turns to ashes Punar Agamanam Kutaha?
• Don’t believe in Sukshma / Karana Shariram all bluff ... who has seen.
• Don’t accept Punarjanmam, heaven, hell, Dharma....
• Accepts only sense pleasures as ultimate goal.
• Body is be all + end all, no Atma.
• Modern science close to Charvaka.
• Consciousness is temporary product of matter.
• Don’t believe in scriptures Kevala Pratyaksha source of knowledge inference, not Jnanam, not Pramanam.
• Brihaspati – Founder.
• Prakrutam / wild / not considered in Brahma Sutra.
• Other 10 Philosophies, Analyzed, criticized in Brahma Sutra.

2. Jainism:
• Formed by 24 Acharya Teerthakaras.
• 1st Acharya: Rishaba deva.
• 24th Acharyas : Vardhamana Mahavira also called Jinaha.
• Jayati iti Jinaha – one who has conquered his sense organs and minds passions – anger, etc..

[Diagram of Jainism (One philosophy) with branches for Shvetanbara (White robed) and Digambara (Space robed).]
3. Buddhism:

- Founder – Buddha – Prince Siddhartha enlightened one – Wise.
- No systematic philosophy.
- Uttered stray statements to disciples initially not well developed.

Tripatamks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sutra Pitakam</th>
<th>Abidharma Pitakam</th>
<th>Vinaya Pitakam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pati: Sutta Pitakam</td>
<td>Abidamma Pitakam.</td>
<td>Vinaya Pitakam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statements of Buddha / Master</td>
<td>Philosophy</td>
<td>Lifestyle</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4 Branches of Buddhism

- Sountrantika
  - Based on Sutra book
- Vaibashika
  - Based on commentary on Abidharma Pitakam called Vibhasha.
- Yogachara
  - Emphasis on Yoga + Achara.
- Madhyantika
  - Golden middle.
  - Madhyantika Marga.
  - Follow disciplines teaching.
  - Yukta Ahara, chestaha.
Astika – Nastika:

- Sankhya, Nyaya, Veiseshikas.
- Accept Veda.
- Give primary importance to reasoning – hence called Tarquikas.
- Shankara calls all 4+6 as Nastikas.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vedas primary, logic secondary</th>
<th>Logic primary, Vedas – secondary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Purva Mimamsa, Uttara Mimamsa.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Tarqa supporting Vedas, good for understanding Vedic teaching.</td>
<td>- Sankhya, Nyaya, Veisishihas, Yoga.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Common feature of all Darsanams:

- All presented in Sutra form by their founders.
  a) Sankhya Sutram.
  b) Yoga Sutram.
  c) Nyaya Sutram.
  d) Veiseshika Sutram.
  e) Purva Mimamsa Sutram.
  f) Uttara Mimamsa Sutram.
• Uttara Mimamsa Sutrani – other names are Brahma Sutrani, deals with Brahma Vedanta Sutrani, Shariraka Sutrani (Atma), Vyasa Sutram, Badarayana Sutram.

• Sarvagyatma – Condensed Bashyam of Brahma Sutra called Sankshepa Shariram.

• Because they are brief statements, there could be ambiguity / doubt regarding, Dvaitam, Advaitam.

3 Popular Schools

- Shariraka Mimamsa Bashyam or Nirvisesha Advaitam revealed by Shankara.
- Advaita Brahman without attributes.

- Visishta Advaitam – “Shree Bashyam” by Ramanuja Acharya.

- Dvaitam Anubashhya by Madhava Acharya.

• Our philosophy literature very vast.

• Ritualistic method of learning adopted.

• Dasa shanthi Mantras.

• Dakshinamurthy Namaskara.
LECTURE 3

• Dasa Shanti Mantras chanted together.

1) 

अ श नो मिति: शं वरुणः। शं नो भवत्वर्यमा।
शं नो इन्द्रो बृहस्पति:। शं नो विष्णुरुक्रमः।

नमो ब्रह्मणे। नमस्ते वायो। त्वमेव प्रत्यक्षं ब्रह्मासि।
त्वमेव प्रत्यक्षं ब्रह्म वदिष्यामि। कृं वदिष्यामि। सत्यं वदिष्यामि।
तन्मामवतु। तदुक्तकारमवतु। अवतु माम्। अवतु वक्तारम्।

ॐ शान्तिः शान्तिः शान्तिः।

Om Sham No Mitrah Sham Varunah | Sham No Bhavatv-Aryamaa |
Sham No Indro Brhaspatih | Sham No Vissnur-Urukramah |
Namo Brahmane | Namaste Vaayo | Tvam-[e]Iva Pratyaksam Brahmaasi |
Tvaa-[e]Iva Pratyaksam Brahma Vadissyami | Rrtam Vadissyami | Satyam Vadissyami |
Tan[d]-Maam-Avatu | Tad-Vaktaaram-Avatu | Avatu Maam | Avatu Vaktaaram ||
Om Shaantih Shaantih Shaantih ||

Om, May Mitra be Propitius with Us, May Varuna be Propitius with Us, May the Honourable Aryama be Propitius with Us, May Indra and Brihaspati be Propitius with Us, May Vishnu with Long Strides be Propitius with Us, Salutations to Brahman, Salutations to Vayu (the Breath of Purusha), You Indeed are the Visible Brahman, I Proclaim, You Indeed are the Visible Brahman, I Speak about the Divine Truth, I Speak about the Absolute Truth, May That Protect Me, May That Protect the Preceptor, Protect Me, Protect the Preceptor, Om Peace, Peace, Peace.

2) 

ॐ सह नाववतु। सह नौ भुनक्तु।
सह वीयं करवाहे। तेजस्विनि प्राक्षीतमस्तु मा विद्विषावहे।

ॐ शान्तिः शान्तिः शान्तिः।

Om Saha Nau-Avatu | Saha Nau Bhunaktu |
Saha Viiryam Karavaavahai | Tejasvi Nau-Adhiitam-Astu Maa Vidvissaavahai |
Om Shaantih Shaantih Shaantih ||

Om, May God Protect us Both (the Teacher and the Student), May God Nourish us Both, May we Work Together with Energy and Vigour, May our Study be Enlightening and not give rise to Hostility, Om, Peace, Peace, Peace.
3) Om yashabdasmruthi vishvaraupah | chandobhoyo'dhyamrutsamsabhuhva |
sa mendro medhay sapnotu | amrtyasa deva dharaṁ bhuyasam |
śarīrāme vicarśanam | jihvāme madhumattamā |
karmabhyām bhūri viśruvam | brahmaṇaṁ kośo'śi medhayā pihitaḥ |
śrutaṁ me gopāya | om sāntiṁ sāntiṁ sāntiṁ ||

May He, the Lord of all, pre-eminent among the Vedas and superior to the nectar contained in them, bless me with wisdom! May I be adorned with the knowledge of Brahman that leads to immortality! May my body become strong and vigorous (to practise meditation)! May my tongue always utter delightful words! May I hear much with my ears! Thou art the scabbard of Brahman hidden by worldly taints (not revealed by impure, puny intellects). May I never forget all that I have learnt! Om peace, peace, peace!

4) Om aham vrkṣasya reśivā | kirtiṁ puṁṣu gireśivā |
ūrdhva-pāvo vājītvā śvamrūtakṣamśi |
draviṇam sāvarṣam | sūmedha amṛto'kṣitam |
iṁti triśaṅkorkaṁudvam | om śāntiṁ śāntiṁ śāntiṁ ||

I am the destroyer of the tree (of samsar; worldly life). My reputation is as high as the top of the hill. I am in essence as pure as the sun. I am the highest treasure. I am all-wise, immortal and indestructible. This is Trishanku’s realisation. Om peace, peace, peace!
Om, That is Full, This also is Full, From Fullness comes that Fullness, Taking Fullness from Fullness, Fullness Indeed Remains. Om Peace, Peace, Peace.

May my limbs, speech, Prana, eye, ear and power of all my senses grow vigorous! All is the pure Brahman of the Upanishads. May I never deny that Brahman! May that Brahman never desert me! Let that relationship endure. Let the virtues recited in the Upanishads be rooted in me. May they repose in me! Om peace. peace. peace!
Om, Let My Speech be Established in My Mind, Let My Mind be Established in My Speech, Let the Knowledge of the Self-Manifest Atman Grow in Me, Let My Mind and Speech be the Support to Experience the Knowledge of the Vedas, Let what is Heard by Me (from the Vedas) be Not a mere Appearance but what is Gained by Studying Day and Night be Retained. I Speak about the Divine Truth, I Speak about the Absolute Truth, May That Protect Me, May That Protect the Preceptor, May that Protect Me, May that Protect the Preceptor, May that Protect the Preceptor, Om Peace, Peace, Peace.

Salutations! May my mind and all these (the body, senses, breath etc.) be good and well! Om peace, peace. peace!
Om, O worshipful ones, may our ears hear what is good and auspicious! May we see what is auspicious! May we sing your praise, live our allotted span of life in perfect health and strength! May Indra (who is) extolled in the scriptures, Pushan, the all-knowing Trakshya, who saves from all harm, and Brihaspati who protects our spiritual lustre, vouchsafe prosperity in our study of the scriptures and the practice of the truths contained therein! Om peace, peace, peace!

He who creates this entire universe in the beginning, and He about whom the Vedas gloriously praise and sing, in Him I take refuge with the firm faith and belief that my intellect may shine with Self-knowledge. Om peace, peace, peace!
Salutations to Brahman, to the holy sages that have given us the Brahma vidya; Salutations to the great Masters of Divine Knowledge and to all the masters that have awakened the Divine Wisdom in us. Om I am Brahman.

Dakshinamurthy Stotram:

(Salutations to Sri Dakshinamurthy Who Awakens the Glory of the Atman within us through His Profound Silence)

The Entire World is Like a City Seen within a Mirror, the Seeing happening within One's Own Being, It is a Witnessing happening within the Atman, (the Witnessing) of the Externally Projected World; Projected by the Power of Maya; As if a Dream in Sleep, One Experiences this Directly (this Play of Maya) during Spiritual Awakening within the Non-Dual Expanse of One's Own Atman, Salutations to Him, the Personification of Our Inner Guru Who Awakens This Knowledge through His Profound Silence; Salutation to Sri Dakshinamurthy. [Verse 1]
Verse 2:
(Salutations to Sri Dakshinamurthy Who Awakens the Glory of the Atman within us through His Profound Silence)
This World is Like a Sprout of a Seed Within which transforms what is Changeless state Before, appear Again as Space and Time, and endless Varieties of Pictures over it; all due to the Creation of Maya, This Unfolding of the World (from the Seed) which is Like a Play of a Magician, happens to one Who is Like a Mahayogi out of His Own Free Will (i.e. a Mahayogi can enter the state of Samadhi out of his own free will and witness the unfolding of the world when He comes out of Samadhi), Salutations to Him, the Personification of Our Inner Guru Who Awakens This Knowledge through His Profound Silence; Salutation to Sri Dakshinamurthy. [Verse 2]

Verse 3:
(Salutations to Sri Dakshinamurthy Who Awakens the Glory of the Atman within us through His Profound Silence)
By This Throb Alone which is of the Nature of Eternal Underlying Awareness, the Unreal Forms get their Meanings and Appear over the Mind, This Knowledge of the Atman Spoken of in the Vedas as "Tat-Tvam-Asi" is Imparted by Our Inner Guru as a Direct Experience when we Surrender Whole-Heartedly to Him, By Direct Experience of this Knowledge, the Delusion of being tossed within an unending Ocean of Worldly Existence will Not Appear Again, Salutations to Him, the Personification of Our Inner Guru Who Awakens This Knowledge through His Profound Silence; Salutation to Sri Dakshinamurthy. [Verse 3]
Verse 4:

(Verse 4: Salutations to Sri Dakshinamurthy Who Awakens the Glory of the Atman within us through His Profound Silence)

As the Light of a Great Lamp Situated Inside a Pitcher having Many Holes, Shine Outwards, similarly, the Knowledge of That Only (i.e. Atman) Throb Outwards through our Eyes and Other Sense Organs, "I Know", He Alone Shining (i.e Atman), This Entire World Shines Salutations to Him, the Personification of Our Inner Guru Who Awakens This Knowledge through His Profound Silence; Salutation to Sri Dakshinamurthy. [Verse 4]

Verse 5:

(Verse 5: Salutations to Sri Dakshinamurthy Who Awakens the Glory of the Atman within us through His Profound Silence)

Those who Consider the Body or Prana (Vital Force) or Sense Organs or the Changing Mind or the Void (Total Non-Existence) as the "I", are Like a Naive Innocent Girl Child, or a Blind, or a Dull-Headed; they are Deluded but they Vehemently Assert their Points, The Inner Guru Destroys this Great Delusion Created by the Play of the Power of Maya, Salutations to Him, the Personification of Our Inner Guru Who Awakens This Knowledge through His Profound Silence; Salutation to Sri Dakshinamurthy. [Verse 5]
This is the famous stanza in which we get the hierarchy of Acarya-s in the line of Sri Sankara and his disciples. We find that the hierarchy starts with Lord Visnu from whom in the following sequence, the great knowledge has reached us – Sri Narayana, Vasistha, Sakti, his son Parasara, Vyasa, Suka, Gaudapada, Govindapada, Sri Sankara, Padmapada, Hastamalaka, Trotakacarya and Varttikakara i.e., Suresvara.

Guru Stotram:

Salutations to Master Shankara, Bhagavadpaada, the bestower of felicity and unity on humanity, and the repository of all the wisdom, contained in the sacred scriptures. He is the manifestation of compassion. [Mantra 22]

Salutation to Shankara who has explained the mystic lore handed down to us by Baadaraayana (Vyasa). Let us adore Him again and again – Aum Bhagavaan Shankara. [Mantra 23]
I prostrate to Sri Dakshinamurti who manifests in three different forms as God, Guru and Self, and whose body is all-pervading like the sky. [Mantra 24]

Guru Stotram:

इश्वरोगुरुरात्मेति मूर्तिभेदविभागिने ।
द्वयोमवस्त्वायप्तदेहाय दक्षिणामूर्त्येषे नमः ॥

iṣvaro gururātmeti mūrtibhedāvibhāgīne ।
vyoavadyāptadehāya daksīṇāmūrtaye namaḥ ॥

Mangala Charanam:

अशुभानि निराचष्टे तनोति शुभसन्ततिम् ।
स्मृतिमात्रेण यत्पुसं ब्रह्मतन्मङ्गलं परम् ॥

aśubhāni nirācaṣṭe tanoti śubhasantatim ī
smṛtimātrēṇayatpuṁsāṁ brahmatanmaṅgalaṁ param ī

Let there not be any inauspiciousness. May Brahman, the Supreme Being, bless mankind with good children and grant all auspiciousness (to us). [Mantra 6]

अतिकल्याणरूपत्वात् नित्यकल्याणसंभ्रायात् ।
स्मर्तृं ब्रह्म तन्मङ्गलं विदुः ॥

atikalyāṇarūpatvāt nityakalyāṇasamābhayāt ।
smartīnāṁ varadatvācca brahma tanaṁaṅgalaṁ viduḥ ॥

That which has an extremely auspicious appearance, which is the eternal source of all auspiciousness, which grants the wishes (of all those) who meditate upon it, know that Brahman as all auspiciousness. [Mantra 7]
Forever do I pay obeisance to my Preceptors who have expounded the entire Vedanta with the aid of Vyakarana (pada), Mimamsa (vakya) and Tarka (pramana) shastras.

Mangala Charanam:

In the beginning, it is said, that the two sounds OM and Atha (now) came from (the throat of) Brahman and therefore they are auspicious. [Mantra 8]

• Traditional way.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No.</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Prarthana</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Taittiriya Upanishad Siksha valli : Santi Mantra : Om Sam no mitra sam varunah....</td>
<td>a) Mangalyam</td>
<td>- Auspiciousness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>b) Hiranyagarba Namaskara</td>
<td>- Prostration to embodiment of Devatas.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Prana Deva indriyas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Karma Deva indriyas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>c) Hiranyagarba Stuti</td>
<td>- Glorification of Hiranyagarba as Prana / Vayu tatvam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Embodiment of Virtues Satyam, Ritam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>d) Guru – Sishya Rakshanam</td>
<td>- Protection of Teacher – student.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>b) Veeryam Karvayahe</td>
<td>- Not passive listening, active.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Both do homework for better grasping.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>c) Prayathna</td>
<td>- Put effort</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>d) Sowhardaha</td>
<td>- Mutual goodwill</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Teacher – has Compassion to student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Student – Trusts one Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Good relationship lubricates smooth communication.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. No.</td>
<td>Source</td>
<td>Prarthana</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 3.     | Taittiriya Upanishad Siksha Valli : Santi Mantra : Om Yaschandasaamrsabho visvarupah.... | a) Medha Shakti - Memory  
  b) Jnanam - Knowledge of Atma  
  c) Sharira yogyata - Sthula – Sukshma to be fit for Pursuit  
  d) Continuous sravanam - Without Break  
  e) Dharanam srutam me gopaya - Retain whats learnt |
| 4.     | Taittiriya Upanishad Siksha Valli : Santi Mantra : Om Aham vrksasya reriva.... | a) Japa for Atma Jnanam – Quotes statement trishanku rishi  
  b) Ishvara Shakti - I am great as Ishvara. Omnipotent as Lord. I have shakti of Ishvara.  
  b) Glorious - Enliven, invigorate creation.  
  - Have Ishvara Vibuti  
  b) Wealthiest - Have great wealth Brahman Jnanam.  
  - In Due course student owns up statement. |
| 5.     | Brihadaranyaka Upanishad : Santi Mantra : Om purnamadah purnamidam... | a) Essence of Upanishad Jivatma / Paramatma Aikyam - In terms of Atma Drishtya  
  b) Karya – Karana Sambanda - With respect to Anatma.. Creation  
  c) Atma alone Satyam, Anatma is mithya - If you remove Atma, Anatma can’t survive independently. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No.</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Prarthana</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 6.     | Sama Veda - Chandogyo Upanishad + Keno Upanishad : **Santi Mantra:** Om Apyayantu mamangani vakpranascaksuh... | a) Sharira Yogyata  - Sthula – Sukshma Shariram (17 Organs)  - Sraddha  - Faith in Brahman until Student understands Brahman.  - Brahman not known through sense organs, not grasped handled by karmaindriyas, not thought by mind.  - No Pramanam can reveal Brahman.  - Not available for transaction.  - Initial conclusion – Non-existent.  - Naham Brahman Nira couryat  - I say Brahman is there so that one day I will be able to understand that it is not something to be experienced.  - It is myself the expeirencer. Till then let me have sraddha.  
  b) Ishvara Anugraha  - I shouldn’t reject Brahman  - Ishvara should not reject me.  
  c) Deivi sampat  - Virtues required for Atma revelation  
  d) Atmani Upanishadsu  - Dharma = Abayam, Amanitvam  - Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No.</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Prarthana</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 7. | Rig Veda Aitareya Upanishad: **Santi Mantra:** Om van me manasi pratisthita.... | a) **Aarjavam**: - Harmony of thought and word - Utter what I think - Think what I utter - No split between thought and word and deed. - Harmony of Kahika, Vachika, Manasa personality  

b) **Grahanam**: - Grasp teaching - Vedas should search me. - Lord to Bring vedic knowledge to me  

c) **Dharanam**: - Retention  

d) **Anusarana**: - Let my life be as per teaching, understanding of upanishad  

e) **Rakshanam**: - Protection  

| 8. | **Santi Mantra:** Om bhadram no’pivataya manah.... | 2 Meanings  
a) **Addressed to Lord**: - Oh Lord lead our mind to Brahman, Badram, Auspicious  
b) **Addressed to Mind**: - Oh Mind, lead me to Brahman.  


b) **Sharira Yogyata** |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No.</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Prarthana</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Svetasvataro Upanishad / Krishna Yajurveda :</td>
<td>a) Saranagathi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
|        | Santi Mantra : Om yo brahmanam vidadhati purvam yo vai vedamsca.... | - I surrender to Ishvara. Its your job to give Virtues and guru.  
- Jnana Yoga – Precedes and ends with sharanagati. |
|        | b) Stuti | - Glorification – who creates Brahmaji  
- Hiranyagarbha Samashti – Sukshma Sharira.  
- Ishvara = Samashti Karana Sharira. = Hiranyagarbha’s father  
- Giver of Vedas to Hiranyagarba, disciple of Ishvara.  
- By tapas, gathers by intuition.  
- Gurosthu Mounam vakyam |
| 11.    | Brihadaranyaka Upanishad / Vamsha Brahmanam : | - Guru Parampara worshipped  
- Incomparable gurus  
- In Association, I discovered Brahmaiva Aham Asmi – I am Brahman. |
<p>|        | Santi Mantra : Om namo brahmadibhyo brahmavidya..... | Sarva Upalava / Dosha Rahitaha |
|        | | - Pure Conciousness, pragyana ghanaha |
|        | | Shuddham |
|        | | - Such Ishvara who gave Jnanam to Maya Sahitam Brahma – Hiranyagarba I surrender. |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No.</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Prarthana</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Brihadaranyaka Upanishad / Vamsha Brahmanam</td>
<td>Name of Ishvara</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Gita:**
- **Tesham Satata Yuktanam.....**
- Why I want self knowledge because I am mumukshu – seeker of Moksha.
- Svarupa Jnanam not Vritti Jnanam

**Pratyag Arthaha Antar Atma**
- Inner reality
- As such I am identical with Brahman

**Verse 6:**

(Salutations to Sri Dakshinamurthy Who Awakens the Glory of the Atman within us through His Profound Silence)

Just Like the Sun and the Moon are Eclipsed by Rahu, the Pure Consciousness is Eclipsed by Maya (for a spiritually ignorant person), A Spiritually Elevated Soul can enter that state of Unborn Deep Sleep (i.e. Pure Consciousness) by Withdrawing His Sense Organs to such an extent that Only the Real Essence remains, That state (i.e. Pure Consciousness) is experienced during Spiritual Awakening whereby one clearly Perceives that "Before I was Sleeping" (by being eclipsed by Maya), Salutations to Him, the Personification of Our Inner Guru Who Awakens This Knowledge through His Profound Silence; Salutation to Sri Dakshinamurthy. [Verse 6]
(Salutations to Sri Dakshinamurthy Who Awakens the Glory of the Atman within us through His Profound Silence) During Boyhood and Other stages of Life (Youth, Old age etc), during Waking and Other states (Dreaming, Deep Sleep, Turiya etc) and Similarly in All Conditions the Atman Always Shines as the "I" Within, Free from All Conditions but at the same time Present in All Conditions, The Inner Guru Awakens this Knowledge of One's Own Atman to those who Surrender to Him; this Knowledge which is represented by the Auspicious Cin-Mudra, Salutations to Him, the Personification of Our Inner Guru Who Awakens This Knowledge through His Profound Silence; Salutation to Sri Dakshinamurthy. [Verse 7]

Verse 8 :

(Salutations to Sri Dakshinamurthy Who Awakens the Glory of the Atman within us through His Profound Silence) The Differentiations that we See in the World as Cause and Effect, as Possessor-Possession Relations, as the Disciple-Teacher, and Also as Father-Son Relations etc, are all Differentiations within the One Atman, In Dream or Waking state, He, the One Purusha is always present, and (as if) Maya Wanders over Him and gives rise to all these Differentiations, Salutations to Him, the Personification of Our Inner Guru Who Awakens This Knowledge through His Profound Silence; Salutation to Sri Dakshinamurthy. [Verse 8]
Verse 9:

(Salutations to Sri Dakshinamurthy Who Awakens the Glory of the Atman within us through His Profound Silence)

Earth, Water, Fire, Air, Space, Sun, Moon and Jiva, are Verily His (i.e. Atman's) Eight Manifestations Shining within the Moving and the Non-Moving forms, Apart from Him (i.e. Atman) there Cannot Exist anything; The Yogis who Reflect (i.e. Meditate) within Discover Him as the Essence From Which Everything Originates, ... Discover Him as Existing Beyond Everything as the Eternal Essence, Salutations to Him, the Personification of Our Inner Guru Who Awakens This Knowledge through His Profound Silence; Salutation to Sri Dakshinamurthy. [Verse 9]

Verse 10:

(Salutations to Sri Dakshinamurthy Who Awakens the Glory of the Atman within us through His Profound Silence)

Since the Divine Essence in All is Made Clear in this Hymn, Hence by Listening to It, Contemplating on its Meaning, Meditating on It, and Glorifying it, One becomes Endowed with the Greatness of the Knowledge of the Divine Essence ( present in All ); Perhaps the Divine Essence by Itself ... will Awaken within him after that Again, the Eightfold Manifestations of Divine Powers (Siddhis) Unimpeded. [Verse 10]
Prayer Verses – Meaning:

1) Narayananam padma Bujam / Yo Brahma Vei Vidati Purvam - Salutation to all gurus.

This is the famous stanza in which we get the hierarchy of Acarya-s in the line of Sri Sankara and his disciples. We find that the hierarchy starts with Lord Visnu from whom in the following sequence, the great knowledge has reached us – Sri Narayana, Vasistha, Sakti, his son Parasara, Vyasa, Suka, Gaudapada, Govindapada, Sri Sankara, Padmapada, Hastamalaka, Trotakacarya and Varttikakara i.e., Suresvara.
Totaka – wrote:
• Sruti Sara Samudaranam (170 Verses).
• End – Bu padar yasya nabhi – Dhyana Sloka of Vishnu Sahasranama.

Sureshvaracharya:
• Vartikam – Critical commentary on Shankara Bashyam.
• Taittriya Bashyam + Brihadaranyaka Upanishad Bashyam 12,000 Verses (Main Work).
• All teachers directly, indirectly have contributed, hence I worship.
• Shankaras glory – Aalayam, Abode temple of vedic wisdom.
• Shankara knew vedas by heart – Shabda and Artha Grahanam.
• Had wisdom of Smriti – (Manu + others) Sruti, 18 Puranas, Itihasa. (Ramayana + Mahabarata (1 Lakh verses)).
• Quotes Ramayana – Once.
  Mahabaratha Many times.
• Vishnu Sahasranama Bashyam from Vishnu Purana.
• Bagawatam not quoted by Shankara may be later addition?
• Alayam – Abode of wisdom.
• Karunalayam – Abode of Compassion.
• Otherwise will not share wisdom, my superiority will go. No patenting.
• Leads us to Bhagavat Padam.. Leads us all to.
• Bhagavan – Lord not away, different from me but me.
• Lokasankara – Mangalam karoti Brahma Ananda / Atma Ananda Svarupa Anandatvam Mangalam.
• Through written work, taught all generations.
• Jagat Guru – Loka Sankaraha.
Salutation to Shankara who has explained the mystic lore handed down to us by Baadaraayana (Vyasa). Let us adore Him again and again – Aum Bhagavaan Shankara. [Mantra 23]

- Prostration to Shankara + Vyasa both Bagavans avatars not Jivas.
- Shankara is Lord Shivas Avatara.
- Vyasa is Lord Vishnus Avatara.
- Did Tapas in Badari Vanam – Badara Tree (Elanda Pasham Forest).
- Vishnu gave out Brahma Sutra.
- Vyasa wrote Commentary.
- Shankara wrote Bashyam.
- In Vishnus Hridayam is Shiva.

a) Sutra Bashau Kritau Vande – 2 meanings

\[
\text{Vyasa Author of Brahma Sutra} \quad \text{Shankara – Commentator}
\]

b) Kalyana Sundara Shastrigal :

- Vyasa puts in pocket / Shankara wrote truck loads of notes.
• Removes misconception that Vyasa is founder of Sutra like others.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Philosophy</th>
<th>Founder</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kapila</td>
<td>Sankhya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patanjali</td>
<td>Yoga Muni</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nyaya</td>
<td>Gautama Muni</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Veisishkas</td>
<td>Kanaada Muni</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Uttara Mimamsa / Vedanta, not invention of Vyasa, but teaching extracted from vedas.
• Revelation by Lord, Apaurusheya.
• Vyasa – 6\textsuperscript{th} Generation to reveal.

**Guru Stotram:**

- I prostrate to Sri Dakshinamurти who manifests in three different forms as God, Guru and Self, and whose body is all-pervading like the sky. [Mantra 24]

- When Lord is seen as Guru he is called Dakshinamurthy or Sadashiva – faces south.
South:

- Represents Yam Dharmaraja.
- Lord not afraid of Death. Mrtinjaya, Kala Kalaha.
- Destroys Yama Bayam.
- Gives immortality by teaching Brahma vidya.

Gita:

And I am seated in the hearts of all; from Me are memory and knowledge, as well as their absence. I am verily that which has to be known in all the Vedas; I am indeed the author of the Vedanta, and the “knower of the Vedas” am I. [Chapter 15 – Verse 15]
• Vishnu / Shiva – Appear as 3 forms / expressions / murti.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Original</th>
<th>Now</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Vyomavath space like Nirvikalpa (Undivided) Niravayava (Indivisible)</td>
<td>- Ghatakasha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Mahakasha</td>
<td>- Auphadika</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Nirupadhika</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- All pervading real nature</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Chaitanyam like Akasha</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Brahman most auspicious in the world – I prostrate.
• By remembering itself we get Mangalam. That Ishvara is Supreme Mangalam.
• Everything Auspicious because of Sambandha. Brahman removes in - auspicious obstacles to pursuit of Ananda gives auspiciousness constantly by mere remembrance.
• Nitya Kalyana Ashrayat – Auspiciousness at all times.
LECTURE 5

Last Prayer Verse:

चैरिमे गुरुभि: पूर्व पदवाक्यप्रमाणान: ||
व्याख्याता: सर्वेदान्तास्तान्तिनित्य प्रणतोस्य्यहम् ||

yairme gurubhiḥ pūrvam padavākyapramāṇataḥ ||
vākhyātāḥ sarvavedāntastāannityam praṇastosmyaham ||

Forever do I pay obeisance to my Preceptors who have expounded the entire Vedanta with the aid of Vyakarana (pada), Mimamsa (vakya) and Tarka (pramana) shastras.

- Taken from Shankara Bashyam Taittriya.
- Credit not to me, Arguments existed before.
- No contribution of mine, only perpetuation.
- Govinda / Gauda Pada / Verbal form not in written form.

3 Sciences for Rules of Interpretation

- Pada Shastram
  - Words
  - Prefix, Root, Suffix
  - Vyakaranam

- Vakya / Mimamsa Shastram
  - Sentences
  - Ukti – Real meaning
  - Viraksha – intended meaning

- Pramana / Tarqa Shastram
  - Reasoning / Logic
  - Where are you going?
  - Can you drop me
Mangala Charanam:

Mangala Charanam:

\[
\text{ॐ तत्सद्विद्विनं निर्देशो ब्रह्मणस्तिविधि: समृतः।}
\text{ब्रह्मणस्तेन वेदश्च यज्ञश्च विहितः: पुरा॥ १७.२३॥}
\]

In the beginning, it is said, that the two sounds OM and Atha (now) came from (the throat of) Brahman and therefore they are auspicious. [Mantra 8]

- Om Atha – 2 words – Traya Dasho Dhyayaha.
- Glorious words from throat of Brahmaji before creation / srishti.

Gita:

Gita:

\[
\text{oन्नकारास्थाभांदश्च द्वावेतो ब्रह्मण: पुरा।}
\text{कण्ठं भित्वा विनियाती तस्मान्मांगिकावुब्धौ।}
\text{ॐ अत ॐ अत ॐ अत॥}
\]

Om that sat – this has been declared to be the triple designation of Brahman. By that were created formerly, the Brahmanas, Vedas and Yagnas (Sacrifices). [Chapter 17 – Verse 23]

- Glory of Om Tat Sat.
- Uttered Om – to make creation wonderful, well ordered, defect free.

Outline of Brahma Sutra:

- 4 Chapters – Adhyayas.
- 4 Sections per chapter – 4 Padas.
- 16 Padas – sections in all
- 191 Adhikaranas – Topics from Vedanta
- 555 Sutras – Aphorisms.
Topics:

- Analysis of Statements from Upanishads.
- Bharata Tirtha – verse form commentary on 191 topics – 2 verse per topic... 382 verses – summarised Brahma Sutra Bashyam called Vai – Yasika Nyaya Mala reasoning given by Vyasa.
Contradictions

- Sruti Virodha Nasti
  - Internal
  - Within Veda.
  - Paraspara Virodha not there

- Smriti Virodha Nasti
  - (Gita, Mahabharatha, Manu)

- Yukti Virodha Nasti
  - Not illogical
  - Takes up all Nastika Darshanam:
    1) Yoga, 2) Nyaya,
    3) Veiseshika, 4) Sanklyya,
    5) Buddhism, 6) Jainism.
  - All depend on Logic primarily.
  - Brahma Vidya free from logical contradictions.
  - 2nd Chapter heaviest / logic based.

Definitions:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sutram</th>
<th>Bashyam</th>
<th>Adhikaranam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Crisp statement</td>
<td>Commentary</td>
<td>Topic</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sutram Definition:

अल्पाक्षरसन्दिग्धं सारविद्धतोमुखः
अस्थोभममलवं च सूत्रं सूत्रविद्यो विदुः

alpākṣaraṁ asandigdham sāravad viśvatomukham I
astobhaṁ anavadyaṁ ca sūtram sūtravidā viduḥ II

“A sutra should have few words (alpa-akshara), an unambiguous meaning, be full of essence (sara-yukta), said only after considering all arguments for and against it, infallible and without blemish."
Sutram / aphorism should fulfill following 6 conditions:

a) Alpakasharam:
   • Concise / small / brief – should be easy to memorised.

b) Asandigdam:
   • Clear, not vague, unambiguous after commentary.

c) Sarvad:
   • Deal with essence alone, pregnant with meaning.

d) Vishwatomukham:
   • Having many facets / meanings / more topics (3 in 1), Tat Purusha to Bahivrihi Samasa, save one word / one alphabet (Same Sukham to Bashyakara as one getting a child after a long time).

e) Astobham, Stobhaha:
   • Free from unnecessary parties, glorification.
   • Stobhaha – Glorification or practice.
   • Samaveda – Aahu…. For chanting.
   • No logic reasoning / end to words – Chapter 11 – Arjunas Namaskara – left, right.. Here terse, no decoration of words can’t add “Cha” if not required.

f) Anavadyam:
   • Defect free, faultless.

   **Diagram:**
   - **Nir Dosha**
     - **Shabda Dosha**
       - Man are going.
       - Grammatically wrong
     - **Artha Dosha**
       - Fire is cold.
       - Meaning wrong

   • If 6 conditions fulfilled – called Sutram.
Literal Meaning:


Definition of Bashyam – Commentary:

Those who are knowledgeable about Bhashya say that a bhashya is one in which the meaning of a sutra (or aphoristic statement in the shruti) is expounded through sentences which are in accordance with the Sutra and also the meanings of the words contained therein.

- Bashyam explains every word occurring in sutra in same order.
- If own technical words used, Vakyaihi – Sutratevai Vartate must explain.
- Sva padinicha vartate.

Definition of Adhikaranam – topic:

Topic – Adhikaranam: 5 factors – conditions of enquiry

a) Vishaya subject:

- Sadhana / Brahman / Avirodha.
- Statement from Upasana.
b) Samshaya:
  - Doubt in statement.
  - Vishaya must be nonevident.
  - Break coconut – will become 2 – evident no enquiry.
  - Must have doubt – Vedanta, Mimamsa, Sankhya – all with doubts.

  Brahman – 4 meanings
  
  Truth
  Omkara
  Veda
  Brahma

  Therefore doubt.

c) Purva Pakshi:
  - Views of Nonvedantin Purva Mimamsa / yoga.
  - Give view with logic called Purva Paksha.

d) Siddanta:
  - Vedantic conclusion to be established by refuting all objections and showing our conclusion is free of all logical defects.
  - Brahma sutra called Nyaya Shastra / Prasthanam, because every statement supported by logic.

e) Sangatihi:
  - Connection between 2 topics.
LECTURE 6

Introduction:
- Nyaya Prasthanam gives reasoning to establish upanishad.

Nyaya

Yukti

Tarqa

Anumana

a) Anumana: Inference
- Always with Pratyaksha data.
- Imagination is without data.

Example: Age of Moon
a) Take sample rock – infer, 450 years old.
   Valid based on perceptual data.

b) Look at moon and say 1 Billion years old – speculation, imagination, wishful thinking without data.
   Inference valid only if based on perceptual data / observed data.

Inference / Anumanam 4 factors in vedanta (In Tarqa 5 factors)

Paksha, Parvata
- Mountain
- Locus of discussion.
- Visible / known partially

Sadhyam
- Agniman fire
- Conclusion: Fiery / Non fiery
- Not perceptible / Dispute

Hetu
- Dhumavat
- Smoky

Drishtanta
- As seen in kitchen fire.
- Yatra maha nase
Example:

- Parvataha agnim an dhumatvat yata maha nase.
- We will use this pattern throughout Brahma sutra.
- Mountain is fiery because it is smoky like kitchen fire.
- If fire visible / perceptible – no debate.
- Non perceptible fire needs inferncetial method of proving.

Conclusion:

- Mountain is fiery.

1st Part:

- Proving by inference = Fiery invisible part – Not visible mountain part.
  \[ \downarrow \]
  \[ \text{Dharma - feature} \]

2nd Part:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sadhyam</th>
<th>Paksha</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Fieryness not perceptually available</td>
<td>- Always known</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Always Apratyaksham – unknown</td>
<td>- Not fire, but fieryness of mountain.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3rd Part: Hetu / Reason

- Not smoke – “If smoke in kitchen can’t say mountain is fiery.”
- Smoke obtaining in mountain.
- Smokiness of mountain is reason – Hetu.

4th Part: Drishtanta

- Kitchen in Yagnashala where smoke + fire exist together, which I have experienced.
- Smoke & fire exist invariably, coexist alongwith smoke.
Don’t say:

• Smoke invariably coexists with fire because fire exists without smoke in modern kitchen.

Say:

• Fire invariably exists with smoke.
• **In Kitchen**: Smoke is there and fire is there.
• To make inference, I require basic knowledge gathered through perception.
• Basic knowledge = invariable coexistence of fire with smoke.
• Where smoke is, fire exists.
  
  ↖ ↘
  Visibly   Invisibly

• Yatra yatra dhuma, tatra tatra agnihi.
• Wherever smoke, there is fire.

Not:

• Yatra yatra agni, tatra tatra dhuma.
• In body, fire principle – 28°C no smoke.
• Vyapti Jnanam = Basic knowledge in logic. Invariable coexistence of fire along with smoke.
• Coexistence = Vyapti – Basic knowledge has 2 factors.

![Diagram of Vyapti and its components]

Vyapti

- Yatra Yatra Dhuma
  - Smoke called Vyapya

- Tatra Tatra Agni
  - Fire called Vyapakam
• Study vyapti vakyam yatra yatra.. And arrive at anumana vakyam.
• Parvata agniman dhumavat yata maha nase.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vyapakam – Agni of Vapti Vyakym</th>
<th>Vyapti Vakyam – Dhuma of Vyapti Vakyam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Becomes sadhyam in Anumana vakyam</td>
<td>- Becomes hetu in Anumana vakyam</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Vyapti Vakyam**

- Yatra Yatra Vyapyam
  - Tatra Tatra Vyapakam

- Represent + Prove
  - Yatra Yatra Hetuhu – Dhuma
    - Tatra Tatra Sadhyam Agni
      - If proved, then Anumana Vyakym valid.

• Only if Vyapti Vakyam valid, then alone Anumana Vakyam valid.

**How do we validate Anumana Vakyam?**

- Yatra yatra dhuma, tatra tatra agni.
- Only validation possible is through perception. Study smoker / kitchen / yagya shala...
- Valid through perception and then validate anumanam.
- When perception disproved, then anumana disproved.
- Science uses this method only.
- Study rocks of moon – Hetu – observed data collection helps him to arrive at conclusion.
Conclusion:

- Inference based on observed data collect data from Moon.
- Conclusion deals not with – Mars but with Moon.
- Data + conclusion will deal with same object. Hetu and Sadhyam conclusion belongs to same Paksha.
- Hetu sadhyayo samanyadhikaranyam.
- My blood data – gives my health report not my neighbours.
- Very important fact derived.
- Science collects data from observed universe Anatma, not Atma which is Ashabdam, Asparsham....

Katha Upanishad:

He, who has realised that (Atman) which is without sound, without touch, without form, without decay, and also without taste, without smell, without beginning, without end, beyond the Mahat (great), eternal and unchanging, is freed from the jaws of death. [I – III – 15]

- Anatma = Cell / Stars.
- All observed data deal with Anatma. If scientific reasoning is used, conclusion will be about Anatma.
- Satyam deals only with that Paksha about which we have collected data.
- Entire scientific reasoning = Laukika Anumanam. Based on data from external world based on Pratyaksha.
- All Lukika Anumanam deal with Anatma. Apara Vidya has no access to Atma Vidya.
- Scientific reasoning method has no access to Atma Vidya.
This knowledge which thou hast obtained is not attainable by argumentation; it is easy to understand it, O dearest, when taught by a teacher who beholds no difference (between one Self and another); thou art fixed in Truth. May we have, O! Naciketas, an enquirer like thee? [I – II – 9]

- Don’t hope to arrive at atma from scientific process of reasoning, because it has no access.
- Can’t hear thru eyes. Don’t abuse pramanam to see atma.. It is born of delusion.
- Tarqa can know speed of light and age of moon.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tarqa</th>
<th>Shastra</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Field:</strong></td>
<td><strong>Field:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Anatma</td>
<td>- Atma / Brahman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Laukika Logic</td>
<td>- Shastric logic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Common:</strong></td>
<td><strong>Common:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Data collected from perception / observation</td>
<td>- Data collected from Shastric statements.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Hubble telescope ok</td>
<td>- No observation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Questions conclusion not source / observation</td>
<td>- Astika, Shastra valid source.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Assumes Pratyaksha valid</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Nastika – don’t believe in Shastra</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Is there a thing because I see?
- Do I see because there is a thing?
Wave / particle:
- Think of Wave.... See wave
- Think of Particle.... See particle.
- Seems to depend on observer.

Scientist:
- Arrives at conclusion based on observation.

Shastra:
- Conclusion based on shastric statements.
- Advaitam / Dvaitam / Visishta Advaitam can question conclusion, understanding not shastric statement.
- Valid as pratyaksha. Shastriya anumanam.
- Hetu = Reason behind Shastram.
- Basic Assumption = Student Astika.
- Scientist = Wants data based on perception. Shastra invalid.
- Brahma sutra has scientific reasoning for refuting Laukika Purva Pakshi, not for establishing Vedanta.
- Laukika deals with Anatma.
  Amavasya, Abdula Karim – No Sambanda.
- General logic has no access to Atma in Vedanta, can’t prove / disprove Vedanta.
- Access not there. Ears can’t prove / disprove color.
- Nastikas use Laukika Anumanam to disprove Vedanta.
- Wrong field – Atma.
- Fallacy in his inference.
- Laukika Anumanam to prove Vedanta is illogical.
- What is 2nd use of Laukika Anumanam?
LECTURE 7

Introduction:

Common feature: Laukika and Shastriya

- Both depend on external source for Data.
- Both don’t question validity of source. Validity of source taken for granted in both reasoning.
- Laukika – Perception.
- Shastriya – Upanishad.
- Can question conclusion based on data.
- Data valid in both inferences.
- Perception / observations + scriptures not questioned.

Uncommon features:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Laukika</th>
<th>Scriptural</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Anumanam : Anatma based fields different</td>
<td>1) Anumanam : Atma based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Eyes – Color + form</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Ears – Sound</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Vyavaharikam</td>
<td>2) Paramartikam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laukika</td>
<td>Scriptural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Laukika logic sometimes used by Brahma sutra to refute other philosophies.</td>
<td>4) Mainly discussed in Brahma sutras.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Laukika logic if used is only supporting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Some laukikas use laukika logic to prove</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vedanta wrong.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Vedanta points out their falacy by pointing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>out falacies in laukika logic.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Not to say Vedanta is logical.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Vedanta neither logical or illogical but is</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>beyond logic – ultra / alogic.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2nd purpose of Laukika anumanam in Brahma Sutra:

6 Nastikas:

- Jain / 4 Baudhas / Charvaka.
- Don’t accept veda.
- Others based on Laukika.
- Arrive at Atma Svarupam and truth of world.
Vedantin:
• Truth never arrived by laukika anumanam or science because logic never final.
• More Brilliant / intelligent logician or scientist can make other wrong.
• Mohamed Ali : I am latest – you may be greatest.
• Logic gives functional information, working knowledge of truth with which we can conduct vyavahara.

Scientist:
• Says my observation, not fact.
• Science useful, not for truth.
• Truth is apaurusheya vishaya.
• Creation beyond science + logic. Accept humility – Achintya Bavaha.
• Samshaya sagara – can’t be solved by logic + perception.
• 27 theories on creation – confused and confounded – solid state / big bang / evolution.

2 purpose of Laukika anumanam

To establish vedanta not illogical
To refute & establish other philosophies illogical

Introduction to Brahma sutra – Shankara Adhyasa Bashyam:
• Adhyasa = Error = Mistake
• Samsara, human suffers because of error, mistake.
• Samsara Nivritti by Adhyasa Nivritti
• Samsara Nivritti by error nivritti.
• Error gone, error based problems gone.
• Agyana goes – Adhyasa goes.
• Adhya goes – samsara goes.
• Jnanena eva moksha not by Karma, Upasana, Bhakti, Sankhya Yoga. All prepare you. None liberates you.

• Bondage – ignorance based.

**Purusha Suktam:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>dhātā purāstādyamudājahāra</th>
<th>śakrah pravidvānpradīśatāsraḥ</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>tamevam vidvānamṛta iha bhavati</td>
<td>nānyah panthā ayanāya vidyate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Him whom prajapathi proclaimed as the Virat-Purusha, Him whom Indra propagated in the four quarters of the universe, He is the One by “realising” whom the realised masters become Immortal, even in this life. There is no other way for liberation”. [Verse 17]

**Kaivalya Upanishad:**

• Jnaanad eva kaivalyam....

**Gita:**

The Blessed Lord said : You have grieved for those that should not be grieved for; yet, you speak words of wisdom. The wise grieve neither for the living nor for the dead. [Chapter 2 – Verse 11]

**Mandukya Upanishad : Karika**

Aniscita yatha rajjur-andhakare vikalpita, sarpa-dharadbhir-bhavais-tadvad-atma vikalpitah ॥ 17 ॥

As the rope whose real nature, when not known, is imagined in the dark to be a snake, a water-line, etc., so also the Atman is imagined in various ways. [II – K – 17]

**Details:**

• Gaudapada in Mandukya upanishad uses Rajju sarpa example : Anishttasya – Rajju....
• When rope in front and not visible clearly, it is mistaken as snake.
• Sense perception on rope is error Rajjan sarpa buddhim....
• Kambaramayanam – BC.
• 5 butas mistaken on Brahman.

- When error takes?

  - Rope
    - Completely not seen
    - Ignorance bliss
    - Sleeper
    - Total Darkness no mistake.
  - Total knowledge
    - Knowledge Bliss
    - Wise person
  - Semi darkness
    - Mandah prakasha
    - Twilight / Dusk

- Visesha Amsha
  - Ropeness covered
  - Specific feature
  - Aavruta, mithya, Anrutam
  - Another Visesha Amsha replaced.
  - Why it comes because real visesha amsha covered.

- Samanya Jnanam
  - This is
  - Thingness
  - Not covered
  - Anavruta, Satya, Samanya
  - General features, real part, uncovered
  - Rope

- Satyam Anavrutta Amsha remains.
Visesha Amsha:

- Instead of snake I say it is a rope.
- Fear caused by snake gone.
- Samsara nivritti happens.
- Rope does not frighten you, useful.
- Aham samsari – is miserable aham.

```
I am Miserable

2 Amshas

I Am

- Samanya Amsha
  - Concious, existent being.
  - Anavruta, Satya, noncovered, self evident.
  - Pratibodha viditam matam
  - Ananda / Anantha – covered
  - Bliss / limitless
  - Poornam / Asamsari - covered

“Samsari” Miserable

- Visesha Amsha
  - Samsari
  - Unreal like snake
  - It has come because of covering which belongs to Visesha Amsha.
  - Visesha amsha of atma’s “limitlessness” covered

In its place – “Samsari”
```

- Apoorna, Dukhi samsari has come.
- Aham jiva samsari – error – mistake has come – cause of all problems.
- No need to change samanya amsha, Sat / Chit – only projected mithya samsari amsha to be replaced with the help of torchlight of vedanta upadesa – pressing “Tat Tvam Asi” button.
• Brahma amsha, poornatva amsha evident, Aham Brahma Asmi Jnanam comes, eliminates visesha amsha, samsari amsha removed aham asmi common for error and knowledge.

• Change only Visesha Amsha.

• Aham Muktaha knowledge comes.

• Aim of Prasthana trayam – analysed elaborately.

Error definition – 3 angles

(1) Anyatha Grahanam
- Understand rope wrongly
- Misapprehension of Rope (fact)
- w.r.t. rope

(2) Adhyaropa / Adhyasa
- Superimposition of snake which is not there
- Unreal snake
- Non existent snake superimposed
- Projection
- w.r.t. snake

(3) Satya Anruta Mithuni Karanam
- 3rd entity created
- Satyam mithya mixing up.
- Mix of Real rope and unreal snake

• Science called Epistemology of knowledge – what is knowledge / error.

• How knowledge / error comes. Error – vishayaka bashyam.

• Visesha saptami, not karma dharaya saptami.

• Khyadi vada = Error discussion

• Jain / Mimamsa / Buddhism – don’t accept error.
LECTURE 8

Purpose of Adhyasa Bhashyam:

- Samsara is error with respect to oneself.
- Self error, self misjudgment, self wrong conclusion, cause of samsara.
- With real part + unreal part, 3rd part.
- 3rd entity created (mix of real / unreal).
- There is a snake.

Mistaker:

- Doesn’t know there are 2 entities.
- Not aware of 2 things.

In one unitary perception

Satya – Real part
- There “is”
- Belongs to Rope existence part, length.

Anruta Mithya – unreal part
- Snake part
- Anrutam
- Frightening, poisonous

Satya – Anrutam mixture entity is Jiva... which is seeking moksha / liberation.

3 error’s / 3 knots

Mistaken rope
- Anyatha Grahanam

Superimposed snake
- Adhyaropa / Adhyasa

Mixing of real / unreal
- Satya Anruta mithuni karanam
**Aim of Brahma Sutra:**
- Break 3 knots.
- Moksha = Unknot, distangled knots, Sthula / Sukshma / Karana sharira knots.

**Adhyasa Bashyam of Shankara:**

6 Topics

1) Adhyasa Lakshanam:
   - Definition of error

2) Adhyasa Shankha:
   - Objection to error from other philosophers.
   - No error possible

3) Adhyasa Shankha Samadhanam:
   - Negating objection

4) Adhyasa Sambavana:
   - Possibility of Adhyasa

5) Adhyasa Pramanam:
   - Proof of Adhyasa

6) Adhyasa Upasamhara:
   - Conclusion

**Definitions**

2 Direct Definitions

1 Indirect Definition

a) Smriti Rupaha Pavatra, Purva Drishta Avabasa ha Adhyaropa:
- Perception of experienced object on wrong locus is error.
- Perception of experienced snake before on wrong locus Rope now.
- Person who has never seen snake can’t superimpose, will never mistake it.
b) Simpler – Popular:

- Atasmin tat buddhihi.
- Perception of object on a wrong locus.

  ↓  ↓

  Snake  Rope

- Seeing snake on rope.
- Perceiving silver on shell.

  ↓  ↓

  Object  Wrong locus.

c) Indirect definition:

- Satya Anruta mithuni karanam mixing real and unreal.
- I am the Body.

2) Topic 2:

- Adhyasa Shankha
- Objection to Adhyasa.
- Sankhya, Yoga, Veiseshika, say Adhyasa is improper.
- Atma – Anatma Adhyasa impossible.
- Rope snake adhyasa possible.
- Why Atma – Anatma Adhyasa impossible?
Superimposition requires 4 conditions:

a) Pratyaksham: (Perception)
   - Rope should be Pratyaksha Vishaya.
   - Object perceived in front.
   - Rope somewhere — no adhyasa.

b) Agyatavam: (Ignorance)
   - Rope should not be completely known. One must be ignorant of fact that it is rope.
   - Full darkness / full light — no adhyasa.

c) Sadrishyam: (Similarity)
   - Similarity exists between what is mistaken and the object.
   - Pipe / crack on rock / Snake / not Pushnikai & Rope.
   - Shell — silver — small — shining — round.
   - No rope — silver superimposition.

d) Purva Anubava Janya Vasana / Samkara: (Impressions)
   - If not experienced snake before — no adhyasa.

4 Conditions

- Pratyaksha Vishayatvam
- Agyatavam
- Sadrishyam
- Samskara
Purva Pakshi: Atma – Anatma

a) Apratyakshatvat – Avishaya:
   • Atma never perceived as object.

b) Agyatatvam:
   • In rope ignorance is there.
   • Atma Svayam Prakasha, Nitya Chaitanya Svarupa, Prakasha rupa, self evident, self effulgent.
   • How ignorance w.r.t. Atma self evident? Known all the time. Nityopalabatah svarupah.

Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

That man has only two abodes, this and the next world. The dream state, which is the third, is at the junction (of the two). Staying at that junction, he surveys the two abodes, this and the next world. Whatever outfit he may have for the next world, providing himself with that he sees both evils (sufferings) and joys. When he dreams, he takes away a little of (the impressions of) this all-embracing world (the waking state), himself puts the body aside and himself creates (a dream body in its place), revealing his own luster by his own light – and dreams. In this state the man himself becomes the light. [IV – 3 – 9]
c) Sadrishyam:

- Atma – Anatma – Diagonally opposite.
- Rope – Pushnikai – Both Jadam, Both object.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Atma</th>
<th>Anatma</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Subject</td>
<td>Object</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chetanam</td>
<td>Jadam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sarvagyatvam</td>
<td>Alpagyatvam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Niravayram</td>
<td>Avayaram</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nirgunam</td>
<td>Sagunam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Light</td>
<td>Darkness</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- No Sadrishyam.

d) Samskara:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Atma</th>
<th>Anatma</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Ever Real</td>
<td>- Ever unreal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Unreal Snake possible because experience Snake before.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Vasanas created &amp; unreal Anatma projected.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Unreal silver possible, because experienced real silver before.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• No real Anatma, Atma alone real.
• No vasana created, no samskruta samsara.

3rd Topic + 4th topic:
• Adhyasa shanka samadhanam.
• Adhyasa shanka sambavanam
• Negation of Adhyasa objection & proving possibility of adhyasa.

1st Condition:
• Pratyaksha Vishayam.
• Modify 1st condition – object should be perceived in front.
• Mistake in presentation of condition.
• For mistake to take place object should be known (not present in front).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unreal</th>
<th>If Experienced</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Snake</td>
<td>- Real Snake before</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Dream</td>
<td>- Real Waker before</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Anatma</td>
<td>- Atma before</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unknown Object</th>
<th>Known / Evident Object</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- No Mistake</td>
<td>- Need not be object in front</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Atma not object in front but subject knower always exists. It is evident always. Hence mistake is possible of the knower/subject who is ever present.
Known / evident entity

Object
- Pratyaksham
- Prakasha Vishayatvam

Subject
- Apratyaksham
- Prakasha Manatvam

• Hence error possible.

2nd Condition : Agyatavam

Rope

Partially known
- Partial knowledge
- Long, curved

Partially unknown
- Partial ignorance
- Poisonous

Amshika Agyatavam of Atma / Aham as

Known
- Aham Asmi
- Concious – Chit Amsha
- Existing – Sat Amsha

Unknown
- Aham Brahma Asmi
- Aham ananda, Ananthata Asmi
- We replace / project
- Aham Anityam Asmi
- Aham parichinnaha Asmi
- Self ignorance is there
If no self ignorance, upanishads not required – it need not teach self – knowledge.

Chandogyo Upanishad:

True, I have learnt much, but I know only the word meaning. I do not know the Self. Sir, I have heard from great persons like you that only those who know the Self are able to overcome sorrow. I am suffering from sorrow. Please take me across the ocean of sorrow’. Sanatkumara then said to narada, ‘Everything you have learnt so far is just words.’ [7 – 1 – 3]

- Atma vitu shokam Tarati

Knower of self crosses sorrow.

- All samsara’s don’t have self knowledge, but they all have self ignorance. Our Anubava is proof.

- Partial knowledge exists with partial ignorance.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I am</th>
<th>Samsari</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Correct</td>
<td>- Wrong because of ignorance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3rd Condition:

Similarity is general condition, but exceptions are there.

Example:

- Lord = Intelligent cause / Material cause like spider.
- Normal – Carpenter – Intelligent cause  Wood – Material cause
  Separate
- Atma – Anatma adhyasa is exception sadrushyam condition. No – similarity.
- 3rd rule – not required.
LECTURE 9

4 Conditions:

a) Pratyaksha Vishayatvam:

- Atma must be available for objectification for adhyasa.
- Need not be pratyaksha vishaya. It should only be evident for Adhyasa to take place.
- Anything evident can be mistaken.

- Atma ever evident as aham. Ideal locus for committing mistake.
- Atma self evident but only partially evident. I am existent, conscious, sat, chit being evident.
- Aham Brahma Asmi, Poornatvam not evident.
- Ananda Amsha veiled by ignorance (Maya).
- Agyatatvam – Partial covering is there.

3rd Condition:

Sadrushyam – Similarity:

- Rope – Snake
- Shell – silver
- Atma – Anatma – Dissimilar
Shankara:

- We do have cases where error take place without similarity.
- Apratyaksha hi Akasha.. Meglavatu.

```
Blue sky / Blue space
```

```
Error
Knowledge
```
- Sky – Ni – Rupam
- Rupa Rahitaha

- Superimposing blueness upon sky.
- Sky – concave shape – like vessel turned upside down.
- Concavity of space, pollution, blueness all falsely superimposed.
- No similarity between akasha and blueness.
- Akasha – never similar to anything
- Water
- Air
- Earth
Kamba Ramayanan: Yuddha Kanda

Seeing that matchless struggle and observing that the sky is its own compeer and the ocean is its own analogue, the battle between Rama and Ravana can be likened only to the battle between Rama and Ravana, the hosts of Gandharvas the celestial musicians and Apsaras, the heavenly lymphs, looked on that battle between Rama and Ravana. [6 – 107 – 52 & 53]

- Ram – Ravana yudha – is it comparable to Mahabarata? Worse?
- Like space has no comparison. War has no comparison.
- Space like space.
- Ocean like ocean.
- Akasha Adhyasa should not be possible but takes place.
- 3rd Condition not compulsory 1st / 2nd condition fulfilled.

4th Condition:
- Snake seen in movie can cause adhyasa.
- Hence real snake experience not required to create adhyasa – error.
- One Anatma Adhyasa possible because of previous Anatma Adhyasa – which is unreal.
- How 1st Anatma adhyasa came?
Ignorance Anaadi:

- Naisargiyukam loka vyavaharah
- Anaadi Adhyasa.
- Never talk of beginning....
- Anaadi Anatma Avidya Vasanaya, samskara.
- 4\textsuperscript{th} Condition – Samskara gained by previous Anatma Anubava which is unreal.
- Real atma anubava is not there. Unreal atma anubava is there from beginningless time.
- 1\textsuperscript{st} / 2\textsuperscript{nd} / 4\textsuperscript{th} – conditions fulfilled – 3\textsuperscript{rd} not required, not compulsory.

Hence:

- Atma – atma adhyasa is possible 1\textsuperscript{st} Answer to Purva Pakshi.
- Temporary provisional Answer.

2\textsuperscript{nd} Real Answer:

a) Understand well, most important.

- Adhyasa is based on veda pramanam between atma – atma.
- Rope – snake example not to prove Adhyasa – Adhyasa not derived from example.
- Adhyasa derived from veda / sruti.
- Example to show corollaries.

b) Adhyasa shouldn't be questioned

- Astikas – Sankhya, yoga, nyaya, veiseshikas, purva mimamsa – have accepted vedas and adhyasa is there in their systems.
- All accept Atma is Nityaha.
- In all darsanams atma is eternal. Accept Karma Khanda, Punya papam... surviving death...
- Atma = Aham = I – self.
All say – I am immortal, nitya based on veda – accepted as fact by purva pakshi.

We also say: I am father, husband, human.. I = Body – not Atma. Atma – not human, father, mother.

I am human being is error, not knowledge.

I am mortal – error.

Deha Atma buddhi is error.

Martyavat buddhi is error.

Manushyavat buddhi is error

Pitruvat buddhi is error.

Error accepted by astika. This is sthula sharira adhyasa.

Accepted by all Astikas Nastikas dealt in 2nd chapter.

If they don’t accept error, they will become charvaka.

Dehatma vadis – a fact if not error.

Charvaka = criminal.

Dehatma buddhi is error – adhyasa.

We are not basing adhyasa based on Rope – snake example.

3rd Corollary:

Purva Pakshi – shouldn’t question atma anatma adhyasa – because he has atma – sthula sharira adhyasa.

For sthula sharira no condition fulfilled.

Even though atma is not a pratyaksha vishayam, sthula shariram is superimposed on Atma by Purva Pakshi based on sruti.

Similarly shankara says I can also talk of adhyasa.

There is no similarity between atma and sthula shariram.

All systems say – atma is all pervading, formless, partless, niravayavam and sthula is limited, formed with parts.
Shankara:

- Don’t bring laukika rope – snake.
- Shell – silver conditions while dealing with atma – anatma adhyasa (Worldly conditions).
- Adhyasa based on sruti accepted by both purva pakshi and advaitin.

- Can’t question adhyasa – how it takes place called Kyati vada.
- How rope snake error / adhyasa?
- Madhyantika buddhist – Asat Kyati
- Nyaya veiseshika – Anyatha Kyati
- Mimamsa – Akhyati
- Advaitin – Anirvachaniya kyati
• Atma – Anatma Adhyasa – based on sruti.
• Rope – Snake adhyasa – based on anubava.
• Where is problem?
• Problem is to what extent adhyasa takes place... to what extent error takes place?
• No problem w.r.t. existence of error, but with reference to extent.

**Tarquika:**
• I am Anityam, Kartrutvam, boktrutvam.

**Nyaya:**
• Mortality superimposed.
• I am Anitya error – I am nitya correct
• I am Karta Bokta – Fact – not error.

**Sankhya Yoga:**
• Aham Anitya error
• Aham Karta error
• Atman is Purusha – Bokta
• Atma – bokta – fact
• 2 errors – 3rd is Jnanam.

**Advaitin:**
• All 3 Adhyastham – Anityatvam, kartrutvam, boktrutvam.

**Gita:**

> नादते कस्यचित्तापं न धैव सुकृतं विभुः।
> अज्ञानेनावृत्तं ज्ञानं तेन मुहूर्ति ज्ञतवः॥ ५.१५ ॥

The Lord takes neither the demerit nor even the merit of any; knowledge is enveloped by ignorance, thereby beings are deluded. [Chapter 5 – Verse 15]
Katho Upanishad:

If the slayer thinks “I slay,” and if the slain thinks, “I am slain,” then both of them do not know well. This slays not nor is This slain. [I – II – 19]

- Sarvam Adhyasa... quarrel not w.r.t. presence of Adhyasa. Only w.r.t adhyasa.

5th: Adhyasta Pramanam:

Proof of Adhyasa:

- Purva Pakshi – accepts Adhyasa for sthula sharira – devoted from veda pramanam.

Proof of Adhyasa:

- Arthapatti Pramanam
  - Idea postulated to explain proven fact
- Anumana Pramanam

Laukika pramanam work only in Anatma prapancha
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fact</th>
<th>Idea postulated</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Roads flooded</td>
<td>- Night rain = Prama knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Pratyaksham</td>
<td>- Not pratyaksham but artha patti</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Without presuming, night rain, can’t explain floods.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Vedantin:
- Karta, Aham karta, Bokta, Anitya is Adhyasa error.

Katho Upanishad:

If the slayer thinks “I slay,” and if the slain thinks, “I am slain,” then both of them do not know well. This slays not nor is This slain. [I – II – 19]

Gita:

He, who takes the self to be the slayer and he, who thinks he is slain; neither of them knows. He slays not, nor is he slain. [Chapter 2 – Verse 19]

Atma:
- Akarta – Ayam – Na Hanti don’t kill
- Abokta – Ayam – na Hanyate – I am not killed.
  - No object to be killed. Not bokta.
Atma does not take punya papam because atma is nirvikara – changeless.

- If karta, bokta, will undergo change.
- Action, experience requires change. As nirvikara, not karta, bokta – fact.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fact</th>
<th>Derived postulate – Artha – patti</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Atma Akarta abokta</td>
<td>- I am karta, bokta is error – adhyasa.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Intelligent people do not grieve</td>
<td>- You are shedding tears</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Gita : Asrupurnakuleksanam....</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Rishi Dantam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Conclusion:</strong></td>
<td>- Arjuna you are Ajnani not wise – ignorant.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sanjaya said: To him, who was thus overcome with pity and despondency, with eyes full of tears, and agitated, Madhusudana (the destroyer of Madhu, the demon) spoke these words. [Chapter 2 – Verse 1]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fact – Sruti</th>
<th>Arthapatti – postulate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Atma Akarta, Abokta</td>
<td>- I claim I am karta bokta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- I conclude I am karta, bokta.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LECTURE 10

Introduction:

Idea becomes valid knowledge even though postulated.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Adhyasa Lakshanam</th>
<th>Adhyasa Shankha</th>
<th>Adhyasa Shankha Samadhanam</th>
<th>Adhyasa Sambavana</th>
<th>Adhyasa Pramanam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Definition of Error</td>
<td>Doubt regarding error</td>
<td>Answer to doubt regarding error</td>
<td>Possibility of error</td>
<td>What is proof for error?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Process of postulation – called Arthapatti.
- Knowledge gained = Artha patti prama derived.
- Night rain – known through artha patti pramanam.

Fact | Postulate Idea
---|---
- Roads flooded | - Night rain postulated based on another fact.
- Pratyaksha Based | - Not experienced.
- Valid – no doubt | - Postulation based on another fact.
- Not imagination, mental projection | |
• As idea postulated to establish proven fact.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fact</th>
<th>Postulate Idea</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Atma Akarta based on scripture.</td>
<td>- Based on sruti idea, postulate to explain idea.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Sruthyartha pramanam not pratyaksha pramanam.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Here postulate based on sruti. Adhyasa not directly said in sruti but it is not shankaras imagination / projection.
• How do we do that postulation?
• Srutyartha Pramanam used by sankhya, neiyayika.
• All say I am mortal – this notion is error.
• Sankhya, Neiyayika accept.
• How they come to this conclusion?
• Sruti says – I am immortal.
• Body alone dies.
• We shed one body and take another body.
• Sruti gives knowledge – I am immortal.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hence Postulate</th>
<th>Fact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- I am mortal – error</td>
<td>- I am immortal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Atma anitya - adhyasa – based on Nityatvam said in sruti</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- Atma anitya adhyasa is based on Atma nityatva sruti vakyam.
- It is sruti – artha patti pramanam alone.
- If others accept – mortality is error, based on sruti, we are arriving at some other conclusions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nyaya</th>
<th>Shankara</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Atma is karta</td>
<td>- Ayam karta is adhyasa error.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Because sruti says Atma – Akarta.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sankhya / Yoga:
- Atma is Karta = Adhyasa
- Atma is Bokta = Fact.

Advaitin:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sruti</th>
<th>Adhyasa – error</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Atma is Abokta</td>
<td>- Atma is bokta / Karta...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a) Anityatvam, kartrutvam, boktrutvam – Adhyastam.
- Where in sruti – atma is akarta?

Katho Upanishad:

If the slayer thinks “I slay,” and if the slain thinks, “I am slain,” then both of them do not know well. This slays not nor is This slain. [I – II – 19]
• Atma does not kill – Indicates all actions killing
• Atma is not killed – Object of Action. Therefore Abokta.

Gita:

Mentally renouncing all actions and fully self-controlled, the embodied one rests happily in the city of nine gates, neither acting nor causing others (body and senses) to act. [Chapter 5 – Verse 13]

Neither agency nor actions does the Lord create for the world, nor union with the fruits of actions. But it is nature that acts. [Chapter 5 – Verse 14]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Atma – I</th>
<th>I am doer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Can never do</td>
<td>Error</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Next Superimposition : Pramatram.
• I am knower also superimposition.
• I am Consciousness – not superimposition – I am knower is superimposed.
• How to prove?
• Postulation based on sruti which says, atma is not a knower. Atma is Jnanam not Jnanta – not Pramata.

Sruti : Mandukya Upanishad

Nantah-prajnam na bahis-prajnam nobhayatam prajnam na prajnana-ghanam na prajnam naprajnam,
adrstam-avyavaharyam-agrahyam-alaksanam acintyam-avyapadesyam-ekatma-pratyaya-saram
prapanco-pasamam santam sivam-advaitam caturtham manyante sa atma sa vijneyah || 7 ||
It is not that which is conscious of the internal subjective world, nor that which is conscious of the external world, nor that which is conscious of both, nor that which is a mass of consciousness, nor that which is simple consciousness, nor is it unconsciousness. It is unseen by any sense-organ, beyond empirical dealings, incomprehensible by the mind, uninferable, unthinkable, indescribable, essentially by of the Self alone, negation of all phenomena, the peaceful, the auspicious and the nondual. This is what is considered as the Fourth (Turiya). This is the Atman and this is to be realised. [Verse 7]

- Atma is not waking knower (Vishwa) dream knower (Teijasa), sleep knower (Pragya).
- Not Vishwa Jnanata
- Not Teijasa Jnanata
- Not Pragya Jnanata.
- Atma is Apragyata – not knower.
- Atma is not knowing Conciousness.
- I am knower – Adhyasa – error based on sruti – Arthapati pramana.
- All ideas derived from another sruti statement also.

b) Atma Nirvikaraha...

- Hence Anityam, Akarta, Abokta.

Gita:

अच्छेदोऽयमदाहोऽयमक्रेदोऽशोष्य एव च।
नित्यः सर्वशतः स्थायुपचलीपय सनातनः॥ २४॥

This Self cannot be cut, nor burnt, nor moistened, nor dried up. It is eternal, all pervading, stable, immovable and ancient. [Chapter 2 – Verse 24]

- Atma is free from changes – Vikaras.
- If Atma is Karta, Bokta, Pramata, (knower) it becomes subject to change, action involved.
- Sukha + Dukha Anubava is change. All 3 processes involve change.
- Karta
- Bokta
- Pramata
- Knower
- Doer
- Enjoyer
- Driver
- Carpenter

\[\text{Er} = \text{Process}\]

- \text{Modification}

\[\text{Atma Not Karta} \rightarrow \text{Nirvikaratvat}\]
  
  - Not Bokta \rightarrow \text{Nirvikaratvat}
  
  - Not Pramata \rightarrow \text{Nirvikaratvat}

- All activities do not belong to me Atma. Hence notion I am knower, doer, enjoyer is adhyasa – error.

3rd method to prove adhyasa:

- All Karta, Bokta, Pramata associated with Karanam – instrument.
- Doer not doer without associating with instrument.

All 3 – Karta, Bokta, Pramata have sanga with karanam.

Karta / Bokta / Pramata – Sa – Sanga, Atma – Asanga.

Sruti:

Asangatvam hi Ayam purushaha.

Unrelated with Anything.

Atma:

Asanga – Can’t be karta, bokta, pramata.

Nirvikaratvat – Atma Akarta, Abokta, Apram.

Asangatvat – Atma Akarta, Abokta, Aparam.

Then kartrutvam, Pramatrutvam, Boktrutvam must be adhyasa – error - Superimposition.

Anityatvam

Kartrutvam

Boktrutvam – Superimposed on Atma

Pramatrutvam

Sangatvam

Vikaritvam

I mistake myself as mortal, doer, enjoyer, knower, related, with modification.

2 more important adhyasa:

Parichedatvam : I am limited, here, in Singapore, is adhyasa. I am not elsewhere, paricheda is adhyasa.
He, who has realised that (Atman) which is without sound, without touch, without form, without decay, and also without taste, without smell, without beginning, without end, beyond the Mahat (great), eternal and unchanging, is freed from the jaws of death.  [I – III – 15]

- Atma – Aparichedaha.
- Ashabdam... Anantham

\[ \downarrow \]
Limitless

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Limitlessness</th>
<th>Limitation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Brahmatvam</td>
<td>- Jivatvam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Fact</td>
<td>- Error / Adhyasa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Aham Brahma Asmi</td>
<td>- Artha Patti Pramanam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Aham Jiva Asmi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Last Adhyasa : Anekatvam

- Atma Bahutvam accepted by all other philosophies. Many Atmas are there.

Shankara :

- Anekatvam – Adhyasa – error.
- What is the basis?
God, who is one only, is hidden in all beings. He is all-pervading, and is the inner self of all creatures. He presides over all actions, and all beings reside in Him. He is the witness, and He is the Pure Consciousness free from the three Gunas of Nature. [Chapter 6 – Verse 11]

When, to the knower, all beings have become one in his own Self (Atman), how shall he feel deluded thereafter? What grief can there be to him who sees oneness everywhere? [Verse 7]
Anumanam: Inference
• Based on Vyapti – coexistence.

Anumanam:
• Yatra yatra dhuma tatra tatra agni.
• Where smoke – fire.

Vyapti Jnanam:
• Coexistence knowledge.
• Paravata agnivan – inference.
• Mountain is fiery
  ↓
Not perception, not pratyaksham - Mahanase kitchen
If pratyaksham no need of Anumanam
• Fiery because smoky as in kitchen.
• What is vyapti jnanam?
• Yatra yatra vyavaharatvam – tatra tatra adhyasthavatvam.
• Wherever there is transaction, there is adhyasa.
• Pasvadibhisca avisesat.
• Atma can’t do transactions.
• Atma different from body.
Pruva Pakshi: Agrees

- Cow different from cow body.
- When chasing cow / feeding green grass
  
  ↓             ↓

Nivritti     Pravirthi

- Cow has notion – I am body. Hence comes or runs.
- Adhyasa : I am hungry - am this body.
- Deha adhyasat pashu trinam abhimukti karoti.
- No Pravriti / Nivriti – Vyavahara. Without deha adhyasa.
- If cow knows, I am different than body, neiva kurvan na karayan.
- Learn from cow – Pravirthi / Nivritti Adhyasa – Vyapti Jnanam from cow.
- Man goes to restaurant – Dosa – Pravritti
- Man goes away from fire... Nivritti.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Manushyaya</th>
<th>Adhyasavan eva</th>
<th>Vyavaharatvat</th>
<th>Pashuvatu</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Paksha</td>
<td>Sadhyam</td>
<td>Hetu</td>
<td>Drishtanta</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Vyapti:**

- Yatra yatra vyavahara tatra tatra adhyasa.
- Adhyasa as pramanam over.
Corollary:

- Not aware 2 things involved.
- One who has mixed up – rope – snake, in his vision, there is only new single entity which consists of Atma and Anatma.

**Aham Janami – I am knower**

- **Chetana tatvam**
  - Belong to Atma

- **Achetana – Anatma**
  - “ER” / Doer part
  - Vritti part
  - Vritti modification part
  - Jadam part

**Chetana Atma**
- No modification
- Nir-vikara
- Chetanam, Conciousness
- Sat / Chit Atma

**Achetana Vritti**
- Achetanam
- Has no Conciousness
- Savikara, Jadam
- Not knower

**Atma Bodha:**
- *Atmanaha vikrihi Nasti*....
- Not knower, can’t go through knowing process
Atma bodha:

**Verse 25**

Atmanah Satchidamsascha Buddheh vruttiriti Dwayam I
Samyojya cha Avivekena Jaanaameeti Pravartate II 25 II

Due to the indiscriminate blending of the existence knowledge aspect of Atma and the thought wave of the Budhi or Intellect, there arises the notion of 'I know'. [Verse 25]

**Verse 26**

Atmano Vikriyaa naasti Buddherbodhohna Jaatwiti I
Jeevah Sarvam Alam Jnatwa Jnataa Drusteti Muhyati II 26 II

Atma never does anything. It is eternal. It is knowledge itself and is not affected by the mental thoughts and physical actions. Buddhi or Intellect has no capacity to experience "I know". But the individuality (Jeeva) in us in its ignorance of its true nature falsely identifies itself with the Body – Mind and Intellect and thinks out of delusion that himself is the seen and the knower. [Verse 26]


**Final 6th topic : Upasamhara**

**Conclusion of Adhyasa Bashyam :**

**a) Adhyasa :**

- Dangerous, harmful to humanity because it brings anityatvam, mortality, fear of death constantly.
- Money – important because I am seeking security through money.
- Insecurity because of Adhyasa – error.
- Adhyasa eva samsarasya karanam.
• Problem for present and future.
• All Karmas, Pravirti + Nivritti because of Adyasa.
• Karma – produces Punya Papam, Punarapi Jananam – Maranam.

Anvaya Vyatireka :
• Adhyasa satve – Samsara satva
• Adhyasa Nivritou – Samsara Nivritou

Gita :

The Blessed Lord said: When a man completely casts off, O Partha, all the desires of the mind and is satisfied in the Self by the Self, then is he said to be one of steady wisdom. [Chapter 2 – Verse 55]

For him there is no interest whatever in what is done, or what is not done; nor does he depend upon any being for any object. [Chapter 3 – Verse 18]

• Remedy for Adhyasa = Adhyasa Nivritti
• Adhyasa Karanam = Atma Ajnanam
• Atma Jnanam comes, Adyasa, Samsara goes.
LECTURE 11

Adhyasa Upasamhara :

- Atma free from Pramatrutva, Kartrutva, Boktrutvam – fact.
- Notion I am Pramata, Karta, Bokta = Error.
- Entire Samsara due to this Samsara error.
- We enter into different activity because of notion – I am Karta, Bokta.

\[
\begin{array}{c}
\text{Laukika} \\
\text{Veidika Karmas} \\
\text{Produce Drishta Phalam} \\
\text{Produce Adrishta Phalam}
\end{array}
\]

- Constant Janma, Jara, Vyadhi, Dukham.
- Adhyasa at various levels.

a) Antahkarana Adhyasa :

- I am Pramata – caused by mix of Atma – Antahkaranam.
- Primary error – Aham Pramata I am knower.

b) Indriyasya Adhyasa :

- Error flows from mind to sense organs.
- Mix of I and sense organs.
- Secondary error.
- I am blind / deaf ... problem of sense organs superimposed on Atma.
- Antahkarana Adhyasa leads to Indriyasya Adhyasa.
c) Sharira Adhyasa:
- Aham Purusha / Stree / Sthula / Krisah / Tarunah / Vrddah – Properties.

Dhanyastakam:

Blessed are they by whom the *brahman* is contemplated with one pointed attention in the following way, ‘It is not that which is not, nor that which is, nor is it the combination of both. It is neither the big nor the subtle, nor is it the female or the male or the neutral. It is the one source of all’. Such people shine (with glory) while others remain imprisoned by the shackles of worldly life. [Mantra 6]

d) Through Sharira Adhyasa to surroundings:
- Root of tree spreads to tentacles.
- Through body get associated with sambandha – relationship with people, things, house, pets.
- Atma – Asanga has no relation, spreads a lot.

Gita:

- Spreads to USA / Japan....
- Because of samsara, person constantly experiences Janma, Mrityu, Jara, Vyadhi, Dukham, due to primary and secondary adhyasa.
Primary Adhyasa

- Aham / Mamakara
  - I belong to them, they belong to Material cause

- One has to remove Adhyasa if Samsara has to go away

- Anarta Heto Prahanaya...
  = New name of Adhyasa
  = Cause of all problems of life.

- One has to work for removal of Adhyasa.
- How one removes Adhyasa?

- Adhyasa – product of some other cause.
- Self Error – Adhyasa – Mistake

  ↓

- Cause Ajnanam / Self ignorance (Not Physics ignorance).

  ↓

- By any other knowledge, self ignorance can’t be removed.
- Samsara does not go educated, erudite Samsari.
- Samsara removed by Atma Jnanam, because we have error w.r.t. Atma.
Like Arjuna climbed ladder – grief doesn’t go.

Gita:

Sanatkumara:

- Tarati Shokham atmavitu – Self knowledge corrects self error. Removes samsara.

Samsara:

- Atma ekatva vidya pratipattaye sarva vedanta arabyate.
- All upanishads begin with intention of giving atma Jnanam.
- Asya Anartha Hetoho Pramayaha Atma Jnanam to gain atma ajnanam.
- Rope in pitch darkness – Not seen
- Rope in bright light – Seen

- Have samanya Jnanam of Atma – visesha jnanam not known.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aham Asmi</th>
<th>Brahma Asmi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Sat / Chit known</td>
<td>- Brahmatva Amsha not known.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Satyam – Jnanam known</td>
<td>- Brahman hood / status not known.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Atmanaha, Brahma Atmanam Asti.
- No new thing known called Jnanam.
- Knowing Brahman status – Jiva / Jagat / Ishvara adhistana karanam not known.
- I am the substance. Not knowing new thing. Unfamiliar status not known.
- Because Brahmatva status not known, I commit Jeevatva error / Adhyasa – immortality accepted as real.
- Self correction required – it involves 2 things.

Displacing Jeevatva status → Knowing Brahman Status → Atato Brahma Jingyasa

2 things
Lecture - 11

Introduction:

- “Atato Brahma Jingyasa “
- I should learn my own superior status. For this purpose Upanishad study begins.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Karma Khanda</th>
<th>Vedanta</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Go to heaven</td>
<td>- I have low self image – not fact.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Get status of Indra,</td>
<td>- Know higher Brahman Status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brahaspati, Ananda</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All other Shastras:

- Take inferior status as a fact – Jeevatvam as a fact.
  Present methods of improving status.
- Acquire Money / MLA status / BMW /Rotary member / struggling to improve status.
- Karma Kanda – promotes mistake.

Self Enquiry:

- Claim – Nitya, Mukta, Shudha, Svabava Ekaha status.
- All Upanishads for self correction, Removal of low self image.
- To negate superimposed, low image.
- Adhyasa bashyam over.
Brahma Sutra text:

1st sutra:

Hence (is to be undertaken) thereafter a deliberation on Brahman. [I – I – 1]

- 4 Chapters - Adhyaya
- Each chapter has 4 sections

Pada:

- Samanvaya pada - 1st (section) (Consistency)
- Each pada has Adhikaranam (Topic).
- 1st Adhikaranam – only one sutra.

1st Pada:

- Spashta Brahma Linga Vakya Samanvaya Pada (SBLVS) - Pada.
- Name of topic is based on 1st sutra of topic - Atato - Brahma Jingyasa.
- 1st topic called Jingyasa Adhikaranam.

Method:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>General Analysis</th>
<th>- Samanya Vichara</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Word Analkysis</td>
<td>- Shabda Vichara</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion of Sutra</td>
<td>- Technical / Corollary / General remarks Upasamhara</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1st sutra – General Analysis:

- Introduction to Brahma Sutra.
- Introduction to Vedanta Shastram / Brahma Vidya.
Like preface To book / Foreward / Upodgatha / Anubandha - connecting link between Inside and outside Shastram.

Like door - neither inside or outside

Like 1st chapter of Gita – Gita Shastram begins with chapter 2 - Verse 11:

**The Blessed Lord Said:** You have grieved for those that should not be grieved for; yet, you speak words of wisdom. The wise grieve neither for the living nor for the dead. [Chapter 2 – Verse 11]
Tattva Bodha / other Prakaranan texts originate from Brahma Sutras

Moksha:
- Correction of self knowledge is goal of life. Remove super imposed image.
- Improving self image
  - Dharma / Artha / Kama
  - Preyaha

- All other pursuits – earning, money, family life Aparavidya are incidental means not end.
- Moksha – end.
- Seeing means as end = Passion
- Seeing means as useless = Foolishness
- Seeing means as means - Dispassion

Family / Money required in life – not useless but as means to reach Moksha.
Lecture – 12

I – I – 1:
• 1st topic: Jingyasadhikaranam
• 1st Sutra: Brahma Jingyasa
• Introduction sutra
• Utpodgatha Sutra
• Provides Anubandha Chatushtayam.

Anubandha Chatushtavam:
• Adhikari, Vishaya, Prayojanam, Sambandaha.

a) Adhikari:
• Who is competent to study shastra?

b) Vishaya:
• Brahma Vidya, not new entity, substance or thing.
• Brahman = New status of listener / Higher status of listener / Para Prakrti, Srota, Atmanas Brahmatvam.

c) Phalam:
• Negate, Disclaim - Abrahman status - misconception, sublation, elimination.
• Rope knowledge displaces snake status of Rope.
• Brahmavatva Jnanam displaces Jeevatva / Abrahmatva status of mine.
• Jivatva Nivritti, Samsara Nivritti, Moksha prapti, Freedom from sense of limitation, inadequacy.

d) Sambandaha:
• Brahman and Upanishad.
• Anubandha Chatushtaya not direct – meaning but implied meaning of 1st sutra Aartika Artaha.
• Direct Meaning - Sruteha Artaha.
I – I – 1 : Atato Brahma Jingyasa

- Therefore Brahman enquiry should be done is direct meaning.
- Unlike Sankya, yoga others – Vyasa not founder and profounder of new system. He extracted the darsanam, teaching contained in Upanishad.
- Vishaya Vakhyam = Upanishad statement.
- Without Bashyam we can’t know “Vishaya Bashyam” of many sutras.
- Get pamphlet from Swami of Brahma Sutra Sanskrit text meaning of sutras.

a) Taittriya Upanishad :

| त होवाच । यतो वा इमानि भूतानि जायन्ते । येन जातानि जीवनि । यत्रप्रयत्नयत्त्वसंविशिष्टि ।
| --- |
| तदविज्ञासास्व । तदृ श्रद्धोति । स तपोस्तप्यत् ।
| स तपस्तप्यत् । || 3 ||

> tagmhowaca, yato va imani bhutani jayante,
yena jatani jtvanti, yatprayantyabhisamvisanti,
tadvijjnasasa, tad brahmeti, sa tap'o'tapyata,
sa tapastapta || 3 ||

To him (Bhrgu) he (varuna) again said : “that from which these beings are born ; that by which, having been born, these beings live and continue to exist ; and that into which, when departing, they all enter ; that seekest thou to know. That is Brahman”. He, (Bhrgu) performed penance ; and after having done penance…. [3 – 1 – 3]

- Tad Vijingyasa – oh Brighu – you have to conduct Brahma Enquiry to get peace, Security, fulfillment in life (Tad – Feminine).
- Statement of commandment, imperative mood.
- Nama Sankeertanam in Kaliyuga can’t give Moksha. Yugas not mentioned in Upanishad.

b) Chandogya Upanishad:

> य अत्मापहतपप्मा विजरो विमृत्युविरिश्को विजिष्टतोषपिपासः
> सत्यकामः सत्यसंकल्पः सोवेष्ट्व्यः स विजिष्टासिन्यः
> स सर्विञ्ज्ञो लोकानास्योऽसर्विञ्ज्ञ कामान्यस्तमतमत्मानन्मूविद्या
> विजनातीति ह प्रजापतिरवाच १

> Ya atmapahatapma vijaro vimrtyurvisoko vijighat so'pipasah
> satyakamah satyasankalpay so'nvestavyah sa vijijnasitavyah
> sa sarvamsca lokanapnoti sarvamsca kamanyastamatmanamanuvidya
> vijanatiti ha prajapatiruvaca || 1 ||

107
Prajapati once said: ‘the Self is free from sin, free from old age, free from death, free from sorrow, and free from hunger and thirst. It is the cause of desire for Truth and for commitment to Truth. This self has to be sought for and thoroughly known. The person who has sought for and known the Self attains all worlds and all desires. [8 – 7 – 1]

• Saha vijingyasitvyaha
  ↓
  Masculine

c) Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

sa hovāca: na vā are patyuḥ kāmāya patiḥ priyo bhavati, ātmanas tu kāmāya patiḥ priyo bhavati: na vā are jāyāyai kāmāya jāyā priyā bhavati, ātmanas tu kāmāya jāyā priyā bhavati; na vā are pūtraṇāṁ kāmāya putrāḥ priyā bhavanti, ātmanas tu kāmāya putrāḥ priyā bhavanti; na vā are vittasya kāmāya vittam priyam bhavati, ātmanas tu kāmāya vittam priyam bhavati; na vā are brahmaṇāḥ kāmāya brahma priyam bhavati, ātmanas tu kāmāya brahma priyam bhavati; na vā are kṣatrasya kāmāya kṣatrām priyam bhavati ātmanas tu kāmāya kṣatram priyam bhavati; na vā are lokānāṁ kāmāya lokāḥ priyā bhavanti, ātmanas tu kāmāya lokāḥ priyā bhavanti; na vā are devānāṁ kāmāya devāḥ priyā bhavanti, ātmanas tu kāmāya devāḥ priyā bhavanti; na vā are sarvasya kāmāya sarvam priyam bhavati, ātmanas tu kāmāya sarvam priyam bhavati; ātmā vā are draṣṭavyaḥ śrotavyo mantavyo nidīhyātityaḥ: maîtreyaḥ ātmano vā are darśanena śravaṇena matyā vijñānenedaṁ sarvam aṣṭamaṁ tattvam. II 6 II
He said: “It is not for the sake of the husband, my dear, that he is loved, but for one’s own sake that he loved. It is not for the sake of the wife, my dear, that she is loved, but for one’s own sake that she is loved. It is not for the sake of the sons, my dear, that they are loved, but for one’s own sake that they are loved. It is not for the sake of wealth, my dear, that it is loved, but for one’s own sake that it is loved. It is not for the sake of the Brahmana, my dear, that he is loved, but for one’s own sake that he is loved. It is not for the sake of the Ksatriya, my dear, that he is loved, but for one’s own sake that he is loved. It is not for the sake of worlds, my dear, that they are loved, but for one’s own sake that they are loved. It is not for the sake of the gods, my dear, that they are loved, but for one’s own sake that they are loved. It is not for the sake of beings, my dear, that they are loved, but for one’s own sake that they are loved. It is not for the sake of all, my dear, that all is loved, but for one’s own sake that it is loved. The Self, my dear Maitreyi, should be realised – should be heard of, reflected on and meditated upon. By the realisation of the Self, my dear, through hearing, reflection and meditation, all this is known. [IV – V - 6]

• Self alone object of real love. Ananda svarupa.
• Whatever is object of love is of nature of Ananda.
• Atma alone loved by all.
• At crisis we will drop the world.

Example:

• Marriage = Tennis game.
  Starts with love + fight like hell later.
• Discovering Ananda requires discovering Self.
• Atma va are srotravyaha 3 Upanishads asking us to do enquiry on Brahman.

Condensed Version:

• Atato Brahma Jingyasa Kartavyaha therefore Brahman Enquiry should be done if you want Moksha.
• Brahman not object, can’t do enquiry independently with all scopes – need Upanishad scope.
• Sarvam Brahma Upanishadaha
  ↓
  - Title given to Brahman
  - Enquiry through Vedanta alone.

• Do Vedanta Vichara for Brahman Jnanam.

• All sutras have logic – Nyaya – studied with 4 factors – Paksha / Sadhyam / Hetu / Drishtanta.

Example:
• Parvataha Dhumavat agnihi, yatha mahanasa.
  • mountain smoky as fire, as in Drishtanta kitchen.

Here:
• Vedanta Shastram Arabaniyam, Anubandha Chatushtayatvati.

• Vedanta Should be Enquired.
  ↓
  ↓
  Paksha Sadhyam
  Chatushtayatvat
  Hetu
  Why?
  Because it has 4 fold factors
  Subject + Phalam
  “Main” = Benefit
Drishtanta – Example – Dharma Shastravatu:

Vyapti:

• Generalisation = statement of co-existence wherever smoke fire exists.
• Yatra yatra anubandha chatushtayam, Shastra has benefit of moksha.

Direct meaning:

• Vedanta should be studied.

Implied meaning:

• Vedanta has anubanda chatushtayam.
Word Meaning:

- **Ataha** - Brahma Jingyasa.

**Om Atah – chanted 3 times**

**2-functions**

**Prameya Shabda Rupa**
- Sound as Prameyam enters mind.
- Object of ears
- Functioning as Prameyam Chinese sound.
- Heard as Vibration
- Mangala Janane produces Auspiciousness
- Without Mangalam no realisation
- Purana tatva : Vasudeva...

**Pramana pada rupa**
- Word as Artha Pramanan
- For one trained in language Shabda becomes Prameyam
- Artha Bodhaka

**Brahmaji started wonderful creation with 2 words Paninis 1st vyakarana sutra:**

- Vridhi Radhai.
- Vridhi sound = Prosperity / Growth.
- Next technical vyakarana meaning.
- Any study requiring qualifications Yogyartha.
- Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti - Not directly mentioned but indirectly implied by vyasa.
- Atha – thereafter, after acquiring 4 fold qualifications.
We know Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti indicated by 2 pramana’s

Yukti
- Anvaya Vyatireka logic
- Co-presence & co-absence logic
- Yat Sadhana chatushtaya sampatti Satve Moksha Satva
- Yat Sadhana Chatushtaya sampatti Abava Moksha Abava
- Add sugar – Milk Sweet
- Remove sugar – Milk not sweet

Sruti
- Nachiketa – Katho Upanishad
- Kena Upanishad

Katho Upanishad:

Na-virato duscaritan, nasanto nasama-hitah,
Nasanta-manaso va'pi, prajnane-naina-mapnuyat ॥ २४ ॥

But he who has not turned away from bad conduct, whose senses are not subdued, whose mind is not concentrated, whose mind is not pacified, can never obtain this Atman by knowledge. [I – II – 24]

Kena Upanishad:

Naham manye suvedeti no na vedeti veda ca
yo nastad veda tad veda no na vedeti veda ca ॥

I do not think that ‘I know it well.’ But not that I do not know; I know too. Who amongst us comprehends it both as the Not known and as the Known... He comprehends It. [2 – 2]
Students with Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti - get Moksha.
Students without Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti - doesn’t get Moksha.
Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti satve vicharena phlam Prapti / Apnoti.
Hence Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti = Karanam.

**Vivekchookamani:**

Great sages have spoken of four qualifications for attainment which, when present, succeed in the realization of Brahman and in the absence of which the goal is not attained. [Verse 18]

- Sadhananya... Wise say 4 fold qualifications - required.
- With qualification get Brahma Nishta / Mukti = Anvaya.
- Na Siddanti.... Vyatirekena.
- Without Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti – Vedanta time pass.. information, not transformation.
- Yukti shows Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti required.

**Sruti: Mundak Upanishad**

Let a brahmana (an aspirant), after he has examined the worlds gained by Karma, acquire freedom from all desires, reflecting that nothing that is eternal can be gained by Karma. Let him, in order to obtain the knowledge of the eternal, take sacrificial fuel (Samit) in his hands and approach that preceptor alone who is well-versed in the Veda-s and is established in Brahman. [I – II – 12]

- Go through life. Discriminate what is Real / Unreal, Permanent / Impermanent, Nitya / Anitya, Vastu Viveka.
• Having suffered, know limitation Nirvedyam kurya.. Pure dispassion vairagyam.

Vivekchoodamani :

I am burning in the blazing infernal fire of this world-forest; I am being tossed around by the cruel storms of misfortune; I am terrified (within and without)—O Lord! save me from death; I have taken refuge in you, for I know no other shelter. [Verse 36]

• Tired of Samsara – give me Moksha - Permanent thing...

Katho Upanishad :

Whatever desires are difficult to attain in this world of mortals, you ask for them all according to thy wish. These fair maidens with their chariots and musical instruments – such indeed are not enjoyable by mortals – thou be attended on by them, I will give them to thee but O Naciketas do not question about the state of the Soul after death. [I – I – 25]

Both the good and the pleasant approach the moral man; the wise man examines them thoroughly and discriminates between the two; the wise man prefers the good to the pleasant, but the ignorant man chooses the pleasant for the sake of this body through avarice and attachment (for getting and keeping). [I – II – 2]
This has been expressed by the following hymn: This is the eternal glory of a knower of Brahman: it neither increases nor decreases through work. (Therefore) one should know the nature of that alone. Knowing it one is not touched by evil action. Therefore he who knows it as such becomes self-controlled, calm, withdrawn into himself, enduring and concentrated, and sees the Self in his own self (body); he sees all as the Self. Evil does not overtake him, but he transcends all evil. Evil does not trouble him, (but) he consumes all evil. He becomes sinless, taintless, free from doubts, and a Brahmana (knower of Brahman). This is the world of Brahman. O Emperor, and you have attained it – said Yagnavalkya. ‘I give you sir, the empire of Videha, and myself too with it, to wait upon you.’ [4 – 4 – 23 ].

- Nachiketa asks for Moksha when tempted - chooses only Shreyas not Preyas.

**Nachiketa - Example:**

a) Vairagya:
- Dropped Dharma / Artha/ Kama – 14 lokas.

b) Mumukshutvam:
- Sruti – Mundak Upanishad + Katho Upanishad presents Viveka, Vairagya & Mumukshutvam
- Where is Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti presented?

**Brihadaranyaka Upanishad :**

This has been expressed by the following hymn: This is the eternal glory of a knower of Brahman: it neither increases nor decreases through work. (Therefore) one should know the nature of that alone. Knowing it one is not touched by evil action. Therefore he who knows it as such becomes self-controlled, calm, withdrawn into himself, enduring and concentrated, and sees the Self in his own self (body); he sees all as the Self. Evil does not overtake him, but he transcends all evil. Evil does not trouble him, (but) he consumes all evil. He becomes sinless, taintless, free from doubts, and a Brahmana (knower of Brahman). This is the world of Brahman. O Emperor, and you have attained it – said Yagnavalkya. ‘I give you sir, the empire of Videha, and myself too with it, to wait upon you.’ [4 – 4 – 23 ].

- Nachiketa asks for Moksha when tempted - chooses only Shreyas not Preyas.

**Nachiketa - Example:**

a) Vairagya:
- Dropped Dharma / Artha/ Kama – 14 lokas.

b) Mumukshutvam:
- Sruti – Mundak Upanishad + Katho Upanishad presents Viveka, Vairagya & Mumukshutvam
- Where is Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti presented?

**Brihadaranyaka Upanishad :**
LECTURE 14

Shankara:

• Anantaram Ata... There after...
• After What?

Shankara:

• After Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti.

Another commentator:

• After – Purva Mimamsa – Karma + Upasana Pradhana.
• Uttara Mimamsa – Deals with Jnanam.
• Jaimini – Sutras – Bigger – 12 chapters.
• How Shankara refutes Purva Mimamsa view.
• Yukti + Sruti.
  ↓
  4 Reasons

a) Vyabichara Dosha:

• **Lack of consistency gives 2 Problems:**
  o Unqualified enters Vedanta.
  o Studied Purva Mimamsa and no Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti.
• Person born with Viveka / Vairagya - wastes time in Rituals again...
• Hence Purva Mismasma not compulsory for all. Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti necessary for all prepared and unprepared.
3 Reasons:

Jnana – karma Samuchhaya Vadi:

Philosophy of Purva Pakshi:

- Kevala Jnanam – Natu Moksha.
- With Vedanta, practically see associates in behaviour.
- Combine with karma.
- Do Rituals, Yagam, Puja, Tyaga, Japa... Jnana yoga.

Shankara refutes Samuchaya vadis:

- Diagonally opposite.
- Combination possible with similar subjects as they will be complimentary.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Karma Khanda</th>
<th>Jnana Khanda</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Bavyam - Unaccomplished goal.</td>
<td>1) Butam - accomplished goal.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Sadhyam.</td>
<td>2) Siddham.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Anatma Vishaya.</td>
<td>3) Atma Vishaya.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Extrovertedness – Dependence on world.</td>
<td>4) Dependence on myself.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) Anitya Phalam.</td>
<td>5) Nitya Moksha Phalam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Dharma, Artha, Kama.</td>
<td>- Outside Samsara</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Within Samsara.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6) Based on Kartrutvam “Aham Karta”</td>
<td>6) Based on Akartrutvam “Aham Akarta”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7) Full of Sangha – relationship.</td>
<td>7) Deals with I - free from all relationships.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- 3 generations in Sankalpa.</td>
<td>- Neti neti</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8) Avidya</td>
<td>8) Vidya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Katho Upanishad:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Durameeta Ete Dhuram Viparite....</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These two, ignorance and what is known as Knowledge, are wide apart and lead to different ends or goals. I believe Naciketas to be one who is desirous of Knowledge, for, even many objects of pleasure a have not shaken thee. [1-2-4]
### Karma Yoga

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>9) Preyas</th>
<th>9) Sreyas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tama Pravartikam - Virudtha Svabava.</td>
<td>Sreyas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Gita: Abrahma Puraravartha Loka...</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Jnana Yoga

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>9) Preyas</th>
<th>9) Sreyas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sreyas</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Pravirthi Bheda:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Karma Khanda - Pravartakam</th>
<th>Jnana Khanda - Nivartakam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Incites person to action.</td>
<td>- What you have to accomplish in life is your nature.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Jyotishto homa – for svarga.</td>
<td><strong>Taittiriya Upanishad:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Karma Khanda 1st gives Svarga benefits – no Hunger / Thirst / Old age/ No body.</td>
<td>- <em>Sa ya esha Purusha Yashva... Aditya sakaha...</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Listener tempted to do action.</td>
<td>- In Brahma Ananda, have Indra, Prajapati, Brihaspati Ananda.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Pravartakam.</td>
<td>- So – Ushnute Sarvan kaman Saha....</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Makes person active action, achievement oriented.</td>
<td><strong>Gita:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- <em>Sa budhiman manushyesha... Sa Krishna karma krutis...</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Reality in the core of man and the Reality which is in the sun are one. He who knows this, on leaving from this world, first attains the Atman made of food, next the Atman made of prana, next attains the Atman made of mind, next attains Atman made of buddhi and lastly attains the Atman Made of Bliss... regarding this there is the following Vaidika verse. (2-8-12)

Gita:

- One who has discovered Brahman has nothing more to accomplish. Have you known that Brahman?
- I am poornaha, no more temptation Apravartakam.
- Bodhakam natu chodakam.
- Jnana Khanda:
  - Only reveals nature.
  - Never pushes you into action.
• If tempted to do action, says you are akarta.
• Reveals Poornatva + Akarta nature makes a person udasina, contented Atman eva Atmana tushtaha.
• Be full and complete by being what I am?

**Shankaras refutation of Samuchaya Vadi (Yukti):**

• Karma Khanda / Jnana Khanda can’t be combined.

**4 Reasons**

- Vyabichari Dosha
- Vishaya Bhedha
- Prayojana Bheda
- Pravirti Bheda

- Prepared person wastes time.
- Unprepared enters vedanta no use.

**Srutiyan Purva Pakshi – Nirasa – Refutation:**

• Without - Purva mimamsa can come to Jnana Khanda.
• Not sequential, Krama Nasti.
• **Purva Pakshi:** No veda pramanam to show purvva mimamsa not required.

**Shankara:**

• **Rituals:**
  Do simultaneously or in krama - in order – sequentially.

• **Poorna Kumba:**
  4 Poorna Hutis pour simultaneously.
Any one of the 3 conditions to be fulfilled to decide krama or simultaneous:

a) Eka Pradhana Seshatvam:
   - Many rituals but subsidiary to one ritual... Part of one ritual have status of Eka pradhana Seshatvam to be done by one who wants to perform main rituals.
   - Washing hands to be done by one who wants to eat.
   - Many rituals - all subsidiary Sesha ... Sesha...

b) Heshaseshitvam:
   - One main – one subsidiary.
   - Shesha – Seshitvam.

c) Adhikruta Adhikaratvam:
   - Person qualified alone can do ritual.
   - If married, do punyajalanam. Can’t do simultaneously but one after another.
   - What should be order?

6 Pramanams to establish - Sruthi, Artha Patti, Krama.
Introduction:
- Relationship between Purva Mimamsa (PM) and Vedanta - No krama .... between them.

Essence:
- No veda pramanam to prove Purva Mimamsa is compulsory for study of Vedanta.

Purva Pakshi:
- There is Veda Pramanam.

a) Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

sa vā eṣa mahān aja ātmā yo'yaṁ vijñānamayaḥ prāṇeṣu;  
 ya eso'ntar-hṛdaya ākāśaḥ tasmin śete, sarvasya vasī, sarvasyeśānaḥ,  
sarvasyaēhipatiḥ; sa na sādhunā karmanā bhūyān no evāsādhuṇā kaniyān.  
esa sarvesvarāḥ, eṣa bhūtādhipatiḥ, eṣa bhūtāpālaḥ. eṣa setur vidharaṇa  
esām lokānāṃ asambhādāya. tam etam vedānucanena brāhmaṇa vīvidiśanti,  
yajñena, dānena, tapasānāsakaṇa; etam eva viditvā munir bhavati, etam eva  
pravṛjino lokam icchantaḥ pravrajanti etadd ha sma vai tat pūrve vīdvāṁsaḥ  
prajām na kāmayante: kiṃ prajāyā karisyāmach; yesām no'yaṁ ātmāyam loka iti.  
te ha sma putraiaśaṇyāś ca vittaiaśaṇyāś ca lokaiśaṇyāś ca vyuṭthāya, atha  
bhikṣā-caryaḥ caranti; yāḥ hy eva putraiaśaṇā sā vittaiaśaṇā, yā vittaiaśaṇā sā lokaiśaṇā;  
ubhe hy ete eṣaṇe eva bhavataḥ sa eṣa neti neti ātmā; aghṛyāḥ,  
nā hi grhyate; aśīryah, na hi śīryate; asaṅgaḥ, na hi sajyate; asito na vyathate,  
nā hi śrīyati; eṣaḥ śrīvaiḥ te na tattvāt—āt: pāpaṁkarṣayam,  
āt: kalyāṇamkarṣayam; uṣā u śrīvaiḥ pate tattvāt, naṁ  
hūtātāte nāpate. II 22 II
That great, birthless Self which is identified with the intellect and is in the midst of the organs, lies in the ether that is
within the heart. It is the controller of all, the lord of all, the ruler of all. It does not grow better through good work
nor worse through bad work. It is the lord of all, It is the ruler of all beings, It is the protector of all beings. It is the
bank that serves as the boundary to keep the different worlds apart. The Brahmanas seek to know It through the
study of the Vedas, sacrifices, charity, and austerity consisting in a dispassionate enjoyment of sense-objects.
Knowing It alone, one becomes a sage. Desiring this world (the Self) alone, monks renounce their homes. This is (the
reason for it) ; The ancient sages, it is said, did not desire children (thinking), What shall we achieve through children,
we who have attained this Self, this world (result). They, it is said, renounced their desire for sons, for wealth and for
the worlds, and lived a mendicant’s life. That which is the desire for sons is the desire for wealth, and that which is
the desire for wealth is the desire for worlds, for both these are but desires. This self is That which has been
described as ‘Not this, not this.’ It is imperceptible, for It is never perceived; undecaying, for It never decays;
unattached, for It is never attached; unfettered – It never feels pain, and never suffers injury. (It is but proper) that
the sage is never overtaken by these two thoughts. I did an evil act for this, I did a good act for this. He conquers
both of them. Things done or not done do not trouble him. [IV – IV – 22]

- Tame tam vedaihi vachana.
- One has to go thru 3 Ashramas to get Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti - Brahmacharyam.
- Yagna Dana... Grihasta.
- Tapasya ..... Vanaprastha.

b) Jabala Upanishad:

```
brahma
carya
parisamapya
grhi bhaveti

grhi bhutvah
vani bhaveti
vani bhutvah
pravrajet
```

After completing the Brahmacarya life, student life, one has to become a Grhasta, and then, he should become a
Vanaprasta. Then, there afterwards, he should become a sanyasi. [Verse 4 – 2]
• Go thru 3 Ashramams to get Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti.
• Therefore Purva Mimamsa – also compulsory.
• Grihasta requires Karma Anushtanam.
• Vanaprasta requires Upasana Anushtanam.
• Practice Karma + Upasana in 3 Ashramas.
• Karma - Upasana only in Veda Purva Baga.

Subcommentator: Siddantin
• Read next verse of Jabala Upanishad.
• Can go from Brahmacharyam to Sanyasa. Triple promotion.

Question: What is compulsory?
• Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti compulsory.
• Karma, upasana not compulsory.
• Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti possible because of Karma / Upasana.
• Without Karma – Upasana, some born with Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti.

Gita:

There, he comes to be united with the knowledge acquired in his former body and strives more than before for Perfection, O son of the Kurus. [Chapter 6 – Verse 43]

By that very former practice, he is borne on and gets attracted to the Highest inspite of himself. Even he, who merely wishes to know yoga, goes beyond the sabdabrahman. [Chapter 6 Verse 44]
Saptavada – nyaya: (Swami. Dayananda)

Restaurant Manager:

- Whatever removes hunger pay...

Hungry man:

- Eats 7 vadai - & says 7th filled my stomach – will pay only for the 7th and my friend ate one & filled up stomach first 6 vada is useless.
- Karma Yoga + Upasana – Vadai consumed in last Janma, unseen.
- Purva Mimamsa /Karma Yoga / 3 Ashramas required for majority. Some don’t require.
- Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti is compulsory.
- Ata – Thereafter refers to Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti.
- Atato Brahma Jningyasa.

Ataha Shabda Vichara:

- Literal Meaning:- Therefore, Indicates reason.
- I am hungry ..... Need food.
  ↓
  Reason for food
- I am sick.... Need medicine.
- Thereafter..... Reason for Brahma enquiry To be conducted.
- Since Karma can’t give Moksha and Brahma Jnanam alone gives Moksha, Hence Brahman enquiry should be done.
- Why Karma can’t give Moksha?
a) Sruti: Kaivalya Upanishad

Not by work, nor by progeny, nor by wealth, but by renunciation alone, Immortality is attained. Higher than heaven, seated in the cave of the intellect, It shines, which the seekers attain. [Verse – 3]

b) Yukti: Chandogya Upanishad

- Moksha = Samsara Nivritti.
- Freedom from Samsara ------ Only through Jnanam because it is Adhyastham, superimposed.....

Example :
- Rajju Sarpavatu.
- Samsara – Jnana Nivartyaaha because Adhyasa is superimposed Rope Snake.
- Can’t destroy rope snake with stick, Garuda mantra, Iruda tribe.....
- It has to be eliminated only by Jnanam.

How Samsara is Adhyasa?

a) Yukti:
- Samsara bashyam for Athaha word.
- Samsara is Adhyaasa. There is Atma Anatma Aviveka, Jeevatva Buddhi, Paricheda Buddhi, I am husband, brother.

b) Anubava:
- Superimposed problem goes only by knowledge, Mirage water --- mere experience --- Bayam from rope snake.
- Adhyasta problems go by knowledge.
- Problems caused in dream go away on waking up to knowledge – Adhyastham.
Dakshinamurthy Stotram:

Salutations to Sri Dakshinamurthy Who Awakens the Glory of the Atman within us through His Profound Silence

The Entire World is Like a City Seen within a Mirror, the Seeing happening within One's Own Being, It is a Witnessing happening within the Atman, (the Witnessing) of the Externally Projected World; Projected by the Power of Maya; As if a Dream in Sleep, One Experiences this Directly (this Play of Maya) during Spiritual Awakening within the Non-Dual Expanse of One's Own Atman, Salutations to Him, the Personification of Our Inner Guru Who Awakens This Knowledge through His Profound Silence; Salutation to Sri Dakshinamurthy.

By Kevala Jnanam or waking, problem goes then problem is of superimposition.

Real snake + false snake exists.

There is no real Samsara - Hai Hi Nahi!

c) Sruti:

Mandukyo Upanishad:

There is neither dissolution, nor birth; neither anyone in bondage, nor any aspirant for wisdom; neither can there be anyone who hankers after liberation, nor any liberated as such. This alone is the Supreme Truth. [2 - K - 32]
 Sruti, Yukti, Anubava - Jnanena eva kaivalyam.
 Na Karmana - Moksha.
 Therefore Brahma Jingyasa Kartavyaya.
 Ata: Indicates Adhikari
 Ataha: Prayojanam
 Anubanda chatushtayam in 1st sutra
 Ata Shabda Vichara over.

Brahma Jingyasa:
 Brahma enquiry / Vedanta enquiry.

Ata Shabda Vichara:

---

Brahma Meanings

- Jagat Karanam Brahma
- Veda
- Brahma
- Omkara
- Hiranyagarbha

- Taittriya Upanishad:
  - Satyam Jnanam Anantham Brahman...
  - [2 – 1 – 1]
- Gita:
  - Bramodbavam Vidhi [3 – 15]
- Katho Upanishad:
  - Yasya Brahma ca ksatram.. [I-II-25]
- Taittriya Upanishad:
  - Brahma vidha Apnoti Param [2 – 1 – 1]
- Taittriya Upanishad:
  - Mahaiti tad Brahma..
  - [1 – 5 – 1]
- Taittriya Upanishad:
  - Tad Vidya Kama Brahma Vidyam Pratishtam [1-1-5]
- Mundak Upanishad:
  - Vidhya given by “Hiranyagarbha”

---

Om, the knower of Brahman attains the Supreme. With reference to that, is the following hymn recited : Brahman is the Truth, Knowledge and Infinity. He who knows It as existing in the cave of the heart in the transcendent akasa, realises all his desires along with omniscient Brahman. [II – I – 1]
Gita:

To whom the brahmana and the ksatriya classes are (as it were) but cooked rice and death itself is a condiment (curry or pickle), how can one thus know where that Atman is! [I – II – 25]

Katho Upanishad:

यस्य ब्रह्म च कश्चनं च उभे भवत ओदनः।
मृत्युर्यसयोपसेचनं क इत्थ वेद यत्र सः॥ २५॥

To whom the brahmana and the ksatriya classes are (as it were) but cooked rice and death itself is a condiment (curry or pickle), how can one thus know where that Atman is! [I – II – 25]

Taittriya Upanishad:

भृृवः सुविरि का एतासिद्रो व्याहत्यः।
तासामु ह स्मिता च तुसुरैः। महाचमस्यः प्रवेदयते।
मह महि तत् ब्रह्म। स आत्म। अज्ञान्यन्या देवता:॥ २॥

Bhuh, bhuvaḥ, suvaḥ are the three short utterances of mystical significances. In addition to these, there is, the fourth one, Mahah, made known by the seer, Mahacamasya. That is Brahman. That is the body; other gods are its limbs. [I – V – 1]

Mundak Upanishad:

ॐ ब्रह्म देवानां प्रथमं सम्भवृवः विश्वस्य कर्तर्भुवनस्य गोपः।
स ब्रह्मदेवां सर्वब्रह्मात्रात्माः प्रतिष्ठामथवर्त्य ज्ञेषुपुत्राय प्राह॥ १॥

Of the Gods, Brahmaji, the Creator and the protector of the universe, was self-born first. He gave out the knowledge of Reality (Brahma Vidya), the knowledge of all knowledges, the foundation for all sciences, to his own eldest son, Atharva. [I – I – 1]
Brahman here based on context of 2\textsuperscript{nd} sutra:

\begin{center}
\begin{tabular}{|c|}
\hline
जन्माद्यस्य यत: ।
Janmadyasya yatah
\hline
\end{tabular}
\end{center}

That (is Brahman) from which (are derived) the birth etc. of this (Universe) [I – 1 – 2]

- Brahma Jingyasa = Satyam jnanam anantham Brahma.
- Jingyasa = Jnanam - Not whether report.
  - = Dridha aparoksha jnanam of Brahma.
- “Sa” = Suffix - An Pratyaya.
  - Iccha – desire.
  - Desire to know/enquiry.
- Mumukshu = Desire to be free.
- Brahma Jnanaya – Vedanta Vichara

\[\downarrow\]

Why not self enquiry by closing eyes - Asking who am I?

- Answer you will get = I am an idiot is what you know yourself as.
- Self enquiry not independent study but self enquiry with help or guru, Shastra Vichara.
- Vedanta alone Pramanam for Brahma.
Lecture – 16

• Brahma Jingyasa = Brahma Jnana Ichha.

Brahma Jnana Vedanta Vichara.

• Jnanam - By operation of appropriate Pramanam.

**Pramana Janya Prama:**

![Diagram of 6 Pramanams: Pratyaksha, Anumana, Upamana, Artha patti, Anupalabdhi, Shabda]

• Mere independent thinking Vichara not Pramanam. Without Pramanam – only speculation, hypothesis not knowledge.

• Without Upanishad Shabda Pramanam, no Prmana for brahman.

• Independent enquiry only speculation. Vichara should be with – Upanishad Shabda Pramanam.

**3rd Suta :**

(Brahman is not known from any other source), since the scriptures are the valid means of Its knowledge. [I – 1 – 3]

• Vedanta alone Pramanam for Brahma Shastra yonitvatu.

• Why Brahma Jnana enquiry required?

• We are interested in Moksha, Samsara, Nivritti.

• Why Brahma Jnana Removes Samsara?

• Why Karma can’t give Moksha?
Logic:
- Samsara is Adhyastha – superimposed.
- Jnanam alone can remove Rajju Sarpa.
- What knowledge removes Superimposition of rope – snake?

Rule:
- Any Adhyasa removed by knowledge of its Adhishtanam.
- Yatra Yatra Adhishtanam, Tatra Tatra Svadishtana Jnana Nivartakam.
- Whatever is superimposed is removed by knowledge of its Substratum.
- Samsara Sva Adhishtana Jnana Nivartatyaha.
- Samsara Can be removed by knowledge of its Adhistana.
- Jeevatvam is superimposed like snake in Adhistana Atma.
- Atma Jnanam alone removes Samsara.
- Because Atma is Adhistanam of Samsara.

Purva Pakshi:
- Therefore Atma enquiry must be made.
- Why Atato means Bramaha Jigyasa?
- Ataha Atma Jigyasa should be correct 1st sutra.
- You are enquiring shell to remove rope snake.

Answer:

a) 1st Answer:
- Brahman is same as Atman.
Taittriya Upanishad:

- Tat Vijingyasa..... Bramaha Vichara

To him (Bhrigu) he (Varuna) again said: “that from which these beings are born; that by which, having been born, these beings live and continue to exist; and that into which, when departing, they all enter; that seekest thou to know. That is Brahman”. He, (Bhrigu) performed penance; and after having done penance.... [3 – 1 – 3]

Brihadaranya Upanishad:

- Atma vare Srotavyaha ..........
- Upanishad uses 2 words loosely – Brahman & Atma.....
- Aikyam revealed in 1st sutra.
- Bramaha Vichara = Atma vichara.

b) 2nd Answer:

- Brahman Not new substance revealed by Scripture.
- Biggest mistake of listener.
- Don’t look for Brahman In meditation.
- Brahman Not new substance but new status of already available substance called “Aham”.
- Aham not new substance but new status as Aham Aham Aham available always – Siddha Rupasya Atmanaha.
Brahman Knowledge = Knowledge of higher Brahman Status now lost in Apara Prakrti.

Discovering my own status, superior, higher, Para Prakrti.

Atmanaha Brahmatva Vichara.

Brahman enquiry in my own Atma – self.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Old Status</th>
<th>New Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jeevatvam / Abrahmatvam</td>
<td>Brahmatvam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bahutvam</td>
<td>Ekatvam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Samsaritvam</td>
<td>Mokshatvam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Displaced</td>
<td>Discovered</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rajju Sarpa status</td>
<td>Rajju status</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Atato Brahma Jingyasa:

- Atmanaha Brahma Jinayasa. Subject revealed indirectly.
- Jeevatma / Paramatma – Aikyam indirectly.
- Ata reveals indirectly – Adikaraha.
- Ataha reveals indirectly – Prayojana.
- Brahma Jingyasa reveals indirectly – Vishaya.
- 4th Word to be supplied = Kartavyaha - Should be done.
  - Vidhi rule prescribed.
- Atmavare Drishtavyaha.
- All Tavyaha’s put together - Kartavyaha.
  - Imperative mode.
  - Should be done.
- Without that can’t escape from Samsara.
Final meaning:

- Sadhana Chatushtaya Anantaram.
- Brahman jnanaya Vedanta Sravanam, Mananam, Ninidhyasanam, Yasmat Brahma Jnanena Moksha, Na Karmanaha.
- After enquiring 4 fold Qualification, one should do Sravanan, Mananam, Nindhyasanam of Vedanta for sake of Brahma Jnanam because Brahma Jnanam alone gives Moksha not Karma.
- This is final Expanded meaning of 1st Verse.

What should I do?

- Have you acquired Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti – In Purva Janma, then do Sravanam, Mananam, Ninidhyasanam.
- If no Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti, Acquire through Purva Mimamsa and then do Vedanta Vichara.
- No universal advise.
- Advise depends on status of student.
- Follow Karma Yoga / Upasana Yoga – life style & with priest do Sradha, Sandhya Vandanam and get knowledge.
- Majority not Qualified – study + increase intensity of Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti.
- Study more meaningful, relevant significant, as we acquire qualification.
- Without qualification, only academic exercise, casual approach becomes serious approach.
Example:

2 Stages for illumination

1st Stage
Connecting Wire

Normal Way:
- Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti

Kaliyuga Way:
- 2nd Stage

2nd Stage
Putting Bulb

Vedanta

Kaliyuga Way:
- 1st Stage

- Bulb glows – Bright
- Results in Removing Darkness.
- Glooming life disappears
- Bulb burns with full power.

- Without Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti it appears academic study.
- Casual approach becomes serious approach.
- Vedanta makes life Brighter + Brighter.
- Converts Jnanam into Jnana Nishta.
- Pragya into Sthira Pragya.
- Paroksha Jnanam into aparoksha Jnanam.
- Pratibandaka Jnanam into Apratibandaka Jnanam.
• Continue Vedanta + Ashrama Dharma.
• Refine qualification + Sravanam + Mananam + Ninidhyasanam.
• General analysis over ↑
  +
• Word analysis of 1st Sutra over.

Final Conclusion: (5 - Factors / 5 - Stages)
• Technical format / pattern / design / method.
• Like letter has format – for address, date, end, beginning.

a) Topic:
  • Jingyasa Adhikaranam.

b) Vishaya:
  • Vedanta Shastram.

c) Samshaya: Doubt
  • Vicharaniyam va.
  • Worth / not worth studying.

Purva Pakshi:
• View of objectionist – nonvedantin – should give Anumanam / reason for his contention.
• Vedanta Vichara - Na Vicharaniyam no use, Anubanda Chatushtaya.
• Abavat – No Adhikari, Vivena, Vairagya, Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti, Mumukshutvam from Vedanta.
• Only in Katho upanishad story - no one has seen hares horn, how Nirguna Vastu...
• Can’t know / see / colour / form / taste...
• In delusion – Brahma of teacher, no Atma, no independent consciousness.
• Consciousness – illusion happening in matter.
• Matter illusion in consciousness.
• Research shows consciousness is illusion in Brain Matter and Vedanta talks of independent consciousness.
• No Brahma / Atma / subject / Vishaya.
• No Prayojanam if no Brahma itself.
• No Sambandha it no Brahma itself.
• Here Purva Pakshi says Vedanta Shastra Na Vicharaniyam.

**Siddhanta Anumanam:**

• Vedanta Shastram Vicharaniya.
• Anubanda Chatushtaya Anubatvat – unlike dharma Shastra.
• Vishaya, Adhikari, Sambanda, Prayojanam is there.

a) Adhikari:

```plaintext
मनुष्याणां सहस्रे छः कशिचिद्वतिः सिद्धुये।
यत्तामिथि सिद्धान्त कश्चिंन्म वेत्ति तत्त्वः॥ ७.३॥

आश्चर्यवत्त्यति कश्चिदेननम् आश्चर्यवव्यवहति तथेव चान्यः।
आश्चर्यवव्यवहत् भृणों भृणाश्च पृष्ठमेव बेद न चैव कवित्त॥ २.२९॥
```

Among thousands of men, one per chance strive for perfection; even among those successful strivers, only one per chance knows Me in essence. [Chapter 7 – Verse 3]

One sees this as a wonder; another speaks of this as a wonder; another hears of this as a wonder; yet, having heard, none understands this at all! [Chapter 2 – Verse 29]

• Rare but they are there.

b) Brahman is there because it is you yourself.

• Brahma Negation = Self Negation

c) Prayojanam:

• Many attained Moksha.

d) Sambandaha:

• Asti – hence, Vicharaniyam.
LECTURE 17

1st Sutra:
- Utpothgatha Sutra.
- Introduction to Brahma Vichara Shastram presented: Adhikari, Vishaya, Sambanda, Prayojanam, Purvapaksha.

2nd Sutra:
- Janmandasya Yataha
- Beginning of Shastram.

Gita:
- 2nd Chapter = Beginning of Shastram
- 1st chapter = Utpothgatha Adyaya.
- Topic of 2nd sutra - Janmadhi adhikaranam is Brahma Lakshanam.

Definition of Brahman:
- Lakshana Pramana by Vastu Siddhi.
- Any object established only through Lakshanam + Pramanam.

\[
\begin{array}{c|c}
\text{Lakshanam} & \oplus \\
\hline
\text{Description} & \text{Pramanam} \\
\hline
\end{array}
\]

- Eyes – means of Knowledge

- If object is established, then enquiry possible.

Example:
- Has Krishnan come to class?
- Who is Krishnan?
- Analysis / Vichara presupposes Siddhi / existence / knowledge of Vastu.
Example: Question to Child

- Is there moon in the sky?
- Child has Pramanam – eyes to see.
- He doesn’t know description of moon. Unless he knows definition of moon, can’t say it is there or not.
- Without moon lakshanam, can’t say biggest luminary in the night.
- Lakshanam + Pramanam = Vastu Siddhi

\[ \Downarrow \]

Enquiry throughout life

- If Brahman is Rabbit horn – no enquiry.
- Brahman Siddhi required for enquiry.

For Brahman Siddhi require

- Lakshanam
  - 2nd Sutra
    - Janmadyasya yatah
- Pramanam
  - 3rd Verse
    - Sastryonitvat

- Shankaras discussion at end of 1st sutra.

Purva Pakshi: Question

- Enquiry of Brahman
  - Known
    - Jnanata
  - Unknown
    - Ajnanata

- Either way enquiry not required. Vichara na apekshita.
Brahman not Unknown:

- It is known through Veda Pramanam.
- Brahma Veda Braheiva Bavati [Mundak Upanishad III – II – 9].
- Brahma Aapnoti Param… Satyam Jnanam Anantham Brahman [Taittriya Upanishad II – I – 1].

\[\text{Indicates existence of entity / object}\]

Mundak Upanishad:

\begin{align*}
& स यो ह वै तत परम ब्रह्म वेद \\
& ब्रह्माव भवति नास्याब्रह्मविकुले भवति \\
& तरति शोक तरति पाप्मान \\
& गुहाग्रन्थिभ्यो विमुक्तो भवति ॥ ३ ॥
\end{align*}

S Yo ha vai tat paramam brahma veda
brahmaiva bhavati nasya-brahmavit kule bhavati

tarati sokam tarati papmanam

guha-granthibhyo vimukto-'mrto bhavati ॥ ९ ॥

He who knows that Supreme Brahman becomes Brahman, and in his line (family), none who knows not the Brahman will ever be born. He crosses grief; crosses sin, and being free from the knots-of-the-heart, becomes immortal. [III – II – 9]

Taittriya Upanishad:

\begin{align*}
& अः ब्रह्मविदापनोति परम् । तेषांमुक्ता । \\
& सत्यं ज्ञानमन्त्रं ब्रह्म । \\
& यो वेदं निहितं गुहायं परमं व्योमम् । \\
& सोःस्नुते सर्वां कामान्तसह । ब्रह्मणं विपश्चितं ॥
\end{align*}

Om brahmavidapnoti param, tadesa'bhyukta,
satyam jnanamanatam brahma,
yo veda nihitam guhayam parame vyoman,
sosnute sarvan kaman sama brahma na vipascititi ॥ १ ॥

Om, the knower of Brahman attains the Supreme. With reference to that, is the following hymn recited : Brahman is the Truth, Knowledge and Infinity. He who knows It as existing in the cave of the heart in the transcendent akasa, realises all his desires along with omniscient Brahman. [II – I – 1]
• Know there is Brahman and infinitely big.
• Root – Brihate / Brimate.
• Brahman – expansion – bigness.
• Brahme – The Big
• Big – Relative word / big mosquito – mountain – corpuscle.
• Dimension of bigness adjective – determined by noun.
• Brahman – The Big – Noun.
• Upanishad converts adjectives (Relative) into absolute – noun.
• No noun to condition bigness.
• Brahma = Noun = Unconditionally big / infinite.
• The big. Existence – not adjective but noun.
• In scriptures, adjectives converted to noun to indicate absolute not relative.
• Conscious – adjective – in Vedanta – Consciousness.
• Existence – Adjective – in Vedanta – existence.
• From Veda know there is big – infinite entity – called Brahman.
• I have experienced only time bound, space bound objects.
• Hence I doubt its existence. To remove doubt of existence – scriptures say : “You are Brahman”

\[
\text{Tat Tvam Asi.}
\]
• Infinite Brahman is Atma itself.
• Which means I should never doubt its existence.
• Doubting existence of Brahman is doubting self existence.
• Can doubt Buddhi.. But no doubt regarding my existence.
• Doubter can’t be doubted.
• Doubt can’t exist without doubter.
• Nobody says – “I am not there”.
• No doubt Reflected Consciousness = Atma Astitvam or Brahma Astitvam.
• Enquiry is into known Brahman only. Having known from Veda.

Purva Pakshi : Question
• If Brahman already known, why make big enquiry? Stop Saturday – morning class.

Shastra :
• I know I am Brahman from Shastra clear knowledge of Brahman I have.
• I don’t have clear knowledge of myself.
• Different philosophies have different contentions regarding “I” self.

Charvaka :
• What is emotion, thinking… fused Brain.. Follow dead.
• Travel not seen.
• Acquisition of another body – nobody knows.
• Body = Atma for Charvaka… and sense organs.
• Clock stops – dispose body.

Buddhism :
• Mind is Atma.
Dakshinamurthy Stotram:

Deham Praannam-Api-Indriyaanny-Api Calaam Buddhim Ca Shuunyam Viduh
Strii-Baala-Andha-Jaddo(a-U)pamaas-tv[u-]Aham-Iti Bhraantaa Bhrsham Vaadinah |
Maayaa-Shakti-Vilaasa-Kalpita-Mahaav-Vyaamoha-Samhaarinne
Tasmai Shrii-Guru-Muurtaye Nama Idam Shrii-Dakssinnaamuurtaye ||5||

(Salutations to Sri Dakshinamurthy Who Awakens the Glory of the Atman within us through His Profound Silence) Those who Consider the Body or Prana (Vital Force) or Sense Organs or the Changing Mind or the Void (Total Non-Existence) as the "I", are Like a Naive Innocent Girl Child, or a Blind, or a Dull-Headed; they are Deluded but they Vehemently Assert their Points, The Inner Guru Destroys this Great Delusion Created by the Play of the Power of Maya, Salutations to Him, the Personification of Our Inner Guru Who Awakens This Knowledge through His Profound Silence; Salutation to Sri Dakshinamurthy. [Verse 5]

Neiyayika:

- There is self beyond body and mind.
- Atmas – many – don’t quarrel.

Example:

- Each atma – infinite atmas, all pervading.
- Aneka Vibhu Atmanaha.
- Aham Karta Bokta.
**Sankhya + Yoga:**

- Many Atmas, all pervading Atma only Bokta – not Karta.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Body – Mind</th>
<th>Atma</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Karta</td>
<td>- Bokta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Do action</td>
<td>- Enjoyer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Wife 7 AM – 7 PM working</td>
<td>- Complains</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Man complains</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Example:**
- who ever cooks without helping wife is Sankhya atma.
- Akarta Atma – but Bokta.

**Vedanta Atma:**

- Atma Ekaha, Sarvagataha, Akarta, Abokta, many confusions regarding – Atma. Therefore enquiry required.

**Purva Pakshi:**

- Brahman – unknown – can’t be enquired.
- Brahman – known – need not be enquired.

**Siddhantin:**

- Brahman not totally known, unknown.
- Apatha Jnanam – unclear, vague, partial knowledge Paroksha Jnanam.
- Brahman unclearly known – like rope.
- Brahman Vichara for converting unclear knowledge to clear knowledge.
- Veda Pramanasya Brahman Siddhatvam + Brahma Lakshanam is there.
- Poornatvam of Brahman not known. General analysis over.
Brahma Lakshnana Sutra:

- Lakshanam required for siddhi.

## Lakshana description / definition

### 2 types

- **Svarupa**
  - Object defined thru its intrinsic feature.
  - Satyam Jnanam Anantham brahman
  - Awareness

- **Tatastha**
  - Object defined through its incidental feature, temporary feature.
  - Jagat karanam brahman

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tataha</th>
<th>Sthaha</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Bank of River</td>
<td>- Remaining</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Ganga tataha</td>
<td>- Teeraha</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- River Bank not in river.
- That which remains on the bank.
- That which is not part of river, not inside river, aloof, away.
- In shastra – Tatastha means aloof, not intrinsic.
Svarupa Lakshanam:

Example:

• Prakrushta Prakashaha chandra.
• Moon is that object which is most luminous in night sky. Brightest, shining luminary – planet, stars, moon have borrowed light.
• Brightness – intrinsic – never experience moon without brightness.
• Brahman = Atman = Awareness = Jnanam
  Satyam – Existence
  Anantham – Brahman – Bliss.
• Sat / Chit / Ananda – Intrinsic features Svarupam Satu Vyavarthakam.
• It is that intrinsic feature which reveals or defines an object.

Example:

• Devadatta Griham – Red / 2 storey / intrinsic features of house.

Tatasta Lakshanam:

• Kakavat griham devadatta griham.
• Crow is incidental feature of house.
• Wherever crow is sitting is not devadatta.
• House – after sometime crow goes to neighbours house.
• Temporary, incidental feature.
• Kadachitkam Bavati – Vyavartakam
  ↓                     ↓
  Anitya Dharma          Which specifies
Shastra Example:

- Brahman = Jagat Karanam Brahman.
- Srishti, Sthiti, Layam Karanam Brahman. Cause of universe.

Question:

- Whether world is intrinsic feature or incidental feature of Brahman.
- Videha Mukti – Anantaram – Sarvada Nasti.
- World permanently not there.
- Jagat Karanam Brahman is incidental definition – Tatasta Lakshanam (TL) of Brahman.
- 2nd sutra presents Tatasta Lakshanam of Brahman.

General Meaning:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Janmadasya Yataha</th>
<th>Tat Brahma Bavati</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Alpaksharam</td>
<td>- Adhya Ahara</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Supplied</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- In all Sankhya / Yoga sutras Adhyahara required.

Example:

- Give him cup of coffee.
- Give me also one... [Coffee → Adhya Ahara]
- Context helps in Adhyahara.
- Brahman is that from which origination, sustenance and resolution of world takes place.
- Jagat Srishti, Sthiti Laya Karanam Brahman.
LECTURE 18

2nd Sutra:
- Tatastha Lakshana to establish existence of Brahman according to rule.

Rule:
- Lakshana Pramanabyam vastu siddhi.

General meaning of sutra:

Janmadhi  
\[\downarrow\]  
Srishti, Sthiti, Laya (Bangam)

Asya  
\[\downarrow\]  
Of this

Yataha  
\[\downarrow\]  
Cosmos / Universe / World

Tat Brahma Bavati

Yataha:
- Yasmat Karanat.
- From which cause this world is born, exists + resolves is Brahman.

Nyaya:
- Yatra Yatra lakshana satvam, tatra tatra vastu siddhi.
- Lakshana pramanbyam vastu siddhi.
- Brahman asti – Ghatavatu.
- We prove existence of Brahman Lakshanam then Vichara possible.
- Without Brahman Siddhihi – no Vichara.
- 1st Sutra = Brahma Vichara.
- 2nd Sutra = Brahma Siddhihi – Nyaya Vakyam.
- Vishaya Vakyam of this sutra – Brahma sutra not product of Vyasa brain.
- Apaurusheya – Vedanta Baga.
To him (Bhrugu) he (Varuna) again said: “that from which these beings are born; that by which, having been born, these beings live and continue to exist; and that into which, when departing, they all enter; that seekest thou to know. That is Brahma”. He, (Bhrugu) performed penance; and after having done penance. 

- Yatho va imani butani... very important verse in Vedanta.
- Brahman is srishti karanam. Ena Jayante – Ena Jatani Jeevati... sthithi karanam.
- Yat Pratyat abishamvisanti... laya karanam.
- This is vishaya vakyam of 2nd sutra.

**World Analysis:**

Janmadhi \(=\) Janma \(\oplus\) Aadhi

- Bava = Pada Artha
- Asti (Jayata), Vartate, viparinamate, Apakshiyate, Vinashyati.
- 1st lesson of sthula shariram in tattva bodha.
- Yaska puts Jayate, Asti...

- Yaska muni in book called Niruktam.
- Shad Bava Vikaras.
- 6 modifications / conditions changes / phenomena.
- Every object in creation goes through 6 modifications.

- Srishti + Sthithi + Layam
- “3”
- Bahuvrihi compound
Shankara Answer:

a) Yaska Nirukta Granita:

- Science of etymology – word – derivation is human – Paurusheyam - Discussed in Mundak Upanishad.

There, the ‘lower knowledge’ is constituted of (the four Veda-s) the Rg, the Sama, the Yajur and the Atharva, and the (six Vedanga-s) Siksa (Phonetics), Nirukta (etymology), Chanda-s (metrics) and Jyotisa (astrology). Now the “Higher Knowledge” is that which leads to immortality or that which goes beyond the worl-meaning in languages.

[I – I – 5]

- He can talk of only objects within creation – not talk of creation of whole universe including time, space.
- Human intellect has no access to study Jagat Karanam. Yaska can’t talk of origin of Akasha, Vayu, Agni, Pancha Buta Utpatti.
- Bautika Prapancha Utpatti – Ok.
- Objects within Universe – Tree, Wall, River.
- Janmaadhi Shatkam talks of Bhautika Prapancha.
- Here cosmos discussed – Bhuta Prapancha, Kala Utpatti, Samsta Srishti. His discussion irrelevant.

Purva Pakshi:

- Yaskas text book based on Sruti like Gita – Smrita based on Sruti.
- Can get validity of Apaurusheya Grantha.
- Deals with cosmos.
- Yaskas Vakhyam relevant based on Sruti.
Shankara:
- Deals with partial universe because it is based on intellect.

Purva Pakshi:
- Yaska depends on borrowed validity from Sruti only.

Shankara:
- I have commented on Sruti Vakyam itself, has original intrinsic validity.
- Sruti talks of: Yatho imani...

Taitriya Upanishad:

| Taitriya Upanishad | Tagmohaca, yato va imani bhutani jayante, yena jatani jtvanti, yatprayantyabhisamvisanti, tadvijijnasasa, tad brahmeti, sa tapo’tapyata, sa tapastaptva || 3 ||

To him (Bhrugu) he (varuna) again said: “that from which these beings are born; that by which, having been born, these beings live and continue to exist; and that into which, when departing, they all enter; that seekest thou to know. That is Brahman”. He, (Bhrugu) performed penance; and after having done penance…. [3 – 1 – 3]

- Sruti deals with Buta + Bautika – Janmadasya – Trayam.

b) 2nd Answer of Shankara – simple
- Entire Brahman sutra by Vyasa analysis is on Vedanta Vakyam of Ishvara.
- Vedanta Sutrani / Uttara Mimamsa Sutrani another name of Brahman sutra.
- Don’t go to another text – Nirukta Grantha.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Primary Meaning</th>
<th>Implied – Secondary Meaning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Srishti Sthithi Laya Karanam</td>
<td>- Shad Vikaras also included.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2nd Purva Pakshi:

- Argument chastens intellect.
- You don’t accept linear creation – creation beginning and end – only cyclic.

Question: when all began?

- Srishti because of karma.
- Karma because of Srishti.

Gita:

Beings were unmanifest in the beginning, and unmanifest again in their end, seem to be manifest in the middle, O Bharata. What then, is there to grieve about? [Chapter 2 – Verse 28]

From the unmanifest, all the manifest proceed at the coming of the ‘day’; at the coming of ‘night, they dissolve verily in that alone, which is called the unmanifest. [Chapter 8 – Verse 18]

- Can’t say which is beginning – end.
- In cycle – how you say beginning with Srishti...
- Why not beginning with Sthithi or Layam?

Shankara 2nd Answer:

a) Our comprehension goes in order of:

- Srishti – Sthithi – Layam.
- Particular order – in events no order, in our understanding there is order.
- Death presupposes – Sthithi – existence + origination.
• Existing thing alone has destruction and resolution.
• Child born – survives or dies.
• Srishti came, is, goes.

2nd Answer:
• Vyasa writing keeping sruti vakya in mind.
• Choice of order in sruti by God.

Gita:

The origin and destruction of beings, verily, have been heard by me in detail from you, O lotus-eyed Krsna, and also your inexhaustible greatness. [Chapter 11 – Verse 2]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bava</th>
<th>Apyayah</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Janma</td>
<td>Laya</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Bhagawatam:
• Beginning with Brahman + Dharma in Dhyana sloka.
O my Lord, Śrī Kṛṣṇa, son of Vasudeva, O all-pervading Personality of Godhead, I offer my respectful obeisances unto You. I meditate upon Lord Śrī Kṛṣṇa because He is the Absolute Truth and the primeval cause of all causes of the creation, sustenance and destruction of the manifested universes. He is directly and indirectly conscious of all manifestations, and He is independent because there is no other cause beyond Him. It is He only who first imparted the Vedic knowledge unto the heart of Brahmājī, the original living being. By Him even the great sages and demigods are placed into illusion, as one is bewildered by the illusory representations of water seen in fire, or land seen on water. Only because of Him do the material universes, temporarily manifested by the reactions of the three modes of nature, appear factual, although they are unreal. I therefore meditate upon Him, Lord Śrī Kṛṣṇa, who is eternally existent in the transcendental abode, which is forever free from the illusory representations of the material world. I meditate upon Him, for He is the Absolute Truth. [1 – 1 – 1]
Which cause sruti refers to

Intelligent cause / Nimitta Karanam
- Maker
- Nimitta
- Srishti matra karanam
- Potter not responsible for sustainance and destruction.

Material cause / Upadana Karanam
- Material
- Upadana
- Srishti, Sthithi, Laya
- Primary meaning of Yataha = Upadana karanam = Maintenance + Laya karanam
Lecture 19

Yataha:

- Refers to Upadana Karanam of Brahman.
- Jagat Karanam has to be only one, not two.
- Worldly objects can have Nimitta Karanam (Maker) & Upadana Karanam (Clay).
- World includes Desha + Kala....
- Creator is beyond Desha Kala, creates Desha Kala.

Dakshinamoorthy Stotram:

(Salutations to Sri Dakshinamurthy Who Awakens the Glory of the Atman within us through His Profound Silence)
This World is Like a Sprout of a Seed Within which transforms what is Changeless state Before, appear Again as Space and Time, and endless Varieties of Pictures over it; all due to the Creation of Maya, This Unfolding of the World (from the Seed) which is Like a Play of a Magician, happens to one Who is Like a Mahayogi out of His Own Free Will (i.e. a Mahayogi can enter the state of Samadhi out of his own free will and witness the unfolding of the world when He comes out of Samadhi), Salutations to Him, the Personification of Our Inner Guru Who Awakens This Knowledge through His Profound Silence; Salutation to Sri Dakshinamurthy. [Verse 2]

- Creator has to be Ekam Eva Advitiyam.
- No 2nd thing. Itself serves as Material cause + Intelligent cause.
- Since no separate Nimitta Karanam, direct primary meaning = Upadana Karanam.
Final meaning:

- Abinna Nimitta, Upadana Karanam.

Example: Mundak Upanishad

```
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abinna Nimitta Karanam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yathorna-nabhih srjate grhnate ca yatha prathivyam-osadhayah sambhavanti,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yatha satah purusat kesalomani tatha-'ksarat sambhavatiha visvam ॥ ७ ॥</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
```

As the spider projects and withdraws (unto itself) the web, as the herbs and plants sprout out from the earth, as hairs grow on the head and body of man, so from the Imperishable Being comes out the universe. [I – I – 7]

- From which material and intelligent cause, world has Srishti, Sthithi, Laya Karanam, that Abinna Nimitta Upadana Karanam is Brahman.

- Sanskrit:
  
  Yasmat abinna nimitta Karanat asya prapancha srishti, sthithi, laya sambavanti, tatu nimmita upadana karanata brahman. [Swamiji’s warning: don’t take dictation in class – take notes here + there].

Taittriya Upanishad:

```
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Taittriya Upanishad</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>t hovaca । यतो वा इमानि भूतानि जायन्ते ।</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>येन जातानि जीवन्ति । यत्प्रयात्यभिसंविशिष्टि ।</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>तद्विद्विज्ञासत्व । तः प्रहोल्दि । स तपोजल्प्यत ।</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>स तपस्तप्तव ॥ ३ ॥</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
```

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>To him (Bhrgu) he (varuna) a gain said : “that from which these beings are born ; that by which, having been born, these beings live and continue to exist ; and that into which, when departing, they all enter ; that seekest thou to know. That is Brahman”. He, (Bhrgu) performed penance ; and after having done penance.... [3 – 1 – 3]</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>tagmhoverca, yato va imani bhutani jayante,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>yena jatani jtvanti, yatprayantyabhisamvisanti,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tadvijijnasasa, tad brahmeti, sa tapo'tapyata,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sa tapastaptva ॥ ३ ॥</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
```

- Yato va imani.... That from which, because of which Srishti, Sthithi, Laya takes place.
• Upanishad does not say what it is. Unknown factor – “X”... (father) varuna, says to Brighu (son).
• Jagat Karanam = Tastatha Lakshanam.
• Doesn’t say directly what it is.
• Svarupa Lakshanam – Satyam, Jananam, Anantham says description of Brahman.

Enquiry :

• Annam Brahme Divya Janaat [Taittriya Upanishad III – II – 1]
• Prana Brahme Divya Janaat [Taittriya Upanishad III – III – 1]
• Manas Brahme Divya Janaat [Taittriya Upanishad III – IV – 1]
• Vijnanan Brahme Divya Janaat [Taittriya Upanishad III – V – 1]
• Anando Brahmeti vyajanat [Taittriya Upanishad III – VI – 1]

Taittriya Upanishad :

Bhrgu learnt that food is Brahman because it is from food that all these beings are born; by food, when born, do they live and having departed, into food they enter. Having known that, he approached his father Varuna, and said” “Revered Sir, teach me Brahman”. Varuna told him” “By deep thinking (tapas) seek thou to know Brahman. Tapas is Brahman”. He performed tapas and having performed tapas.... [III – II – 1]
Bhrgu understood that prana is Brahman; because it is from prana alone that all these living beings are born; having been born from it, they live by it and (in the end) on departing, they go towards prana and become one with it. Having known that, he again approached his father Varuna saying: “O Revered Sir, instruct me about Brahman”. He, (Varuna) told him: “Desire to know Brahman by tapas, tapas is Brahman”. He performed tapas and having performed tapas... [III – III – 1]

He knew that mind was Brahman; for, it is from the mind that all these living beings are produced. Being born from it, they all live by it; and on departing, they enter into the mind and become one with it. Having known that, he again approached his father, Varuna, saying: “O Venerable One, teach me Brahman”. He, (Varuna) told him: “Desire to know Brahman by penance. Tapas is Brahman”. Bhrgu performed tapas and having performed tapas... [III – IV – 1]
He understood that knowledge is Brahman, because it is by knowledge that all these living beings are born; having been born, by knowledge they live, and having departed, into knowledge alone they enter. Having known that, he approached his father, Varuna, to know the Truth further and said, “Revered Sir, teach me Brahman”. He, (Varuna) told him, “By tapas seek thou to know Brahman. Tapas is Brahman”. He performed tapas and having performed tapas... [III – V – 1]

He knew that Bliss was Brahman, for, from Bliss all these beings are produced, by Bliss do these beings live. They go to Bliss on departing and become one with it – this is the knowledge learnt by Bhrgu and taught by Varuna. This is established in the supreme space – in the excellent cavity of the heart. He who knows thus becomes one with Brahman. He becomes the possessor (assimilator) of food and the eater (enjoyer) of it. He becomes great in progeny, cattle and gains the splendor of true brahmana-hood. Indeed, he becomes great through fame and renown. [III – VI – 1]
• X-factor = Ananda Svarupam – Brahman.

Meaning of Yataha (Dvyaya Svarupa Sutra)

- Upadana Karanam
  - Tatastha Lakshanam
  - Directly reveals

- Nimitta Karanam

- Ananda Svarupam
  - Svarupa Lakshanam
  - Indirectly reveals

• X-factor = Ananda Svarupam – Brahman.
• Yasmat prapanchasya abinna nimitta upadana karanat anandasya svarupatvat.
• Prapanchasya srishti sthithi laya sambavanti.
• Tatu abinna nimitta uapdana karanat ananda svarupat brahma bhavati.

Tatu Brahma:
• Shankara adds one more feature.
• Amount of intelligence can be inferred by nature of product.
• Greater product – greater intelligence (Son – Father – Nature).
• See nature of Srishti – See glory of creator.
• See Vibhuti in world – Ishvara is sarvagya sarva shaktiman.

4 Adjectives described Ishvara Glory:

a) Well designed Universe:
• Not accidental evolution.
• Not drawing natural selection of specie.
• Shakespeare’s work = Not big bang – letter coming together accidentally.
• Cosmos not accident.
• Chetana Karta – intelligent being required.

b) Countless Jivas – Kartas / Boktas:
• Jiva + creation = Product of creation.
• Producer = Non Jiva.
• Cosmos not chaos, every event in specific place / time.
• Countless Jivas, countless experiences, caused by Desha / Kala / Nimitta.
• Sarvagyatvam – Infinite knowledge to run the show.
• Infinite intelligence and infinite power sarva shaktiman to implement.
• Some events common to Jivas giving Papam, Punyam.

- Class / Sleep / Handicapped child
  - Thrilling experience Punyam
  - Boring experience – Exhausted Papam

- Scientist / doctors only knows how brain functions, can’t create one, no power.
  - Omniscience
    - Intelligence
  - Omnipotence of Lord
    - Power to implement intelligence, produce creation, inconceivable
Final Definition of Brahman:
- Sarvagya Sarvashakti, sarva karanatvat vyatireka, sarvasya karta sarvagya shakti, sarvasya shaktima yasmat, abinna nimitta ubaya karanat ananda svarupat, sarvagata, sarvashakti prapanchasya srishti, sthithi, laya sambavati, tat brahman.

Nyaya Purva Pakshi:
1st Sutra:
- Do Brahman enquiry.

2nd Sutra:
- Establishes Brahman by

3rd Sutra:
- Shastra yonivatu pramanam presents Brahman Pramana – Sruti – means to know Brahman.
- Pramanam for Jagat karanam = Ishvara.

Neiyevikas suggestion:
- Take 2nd sutra – Pramanam for Brahman by inference.
- Rama is Dasharatas son.
- Dasharata is Ramas father.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Visible</th>
<th>Invisible – Inferred</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rama (Son)</td>
<td>Dasharatha (Father)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karyam</td>
<td>Karanam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>World</td>
<td>Ishvara</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tree</td>
<td>Root</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smoke</td>
<td>Fire</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Pramana for Ishvara = Karya Lingaka Anumana.
- Shastram not required to prove Ishvara.

**Vedantin:**
- Ishvara can’t be proved by reason.
- Ishvara proved through shastra.
- Shastra primary, logic secondary.
LECTURE 20

Shankaras Answer :

a) Simple Answer :

- If 2\textsuperscript{nd} sutra gives Anumana Pramana, it can’t be called Vedanta sutras.
- Vyasa doesn’t propound philosophy by using his own reasoning power.
- 6 Nastikas + Sankhya, Nyaya, Yoga, Veiseshika are Tarquivas – Anumana based, accept Sruti as subservient, and give step motherly treatment to sruti.
- Vedanta uses reason to derive philosophy from Veda. Understand Veda not to propound new philosophy.
- Every sutra has backing of veda for analysis.
- If 2\textsuperscript{nd} sutra is Anumana Vakyam to establish Ishvara, importance will go to Anumana not Shastra.
- Will defeat Vyasas intention.
- Many sutras provide Anumana but it is not independent Anumana.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tarqua, Anumanam thread</th>
<th>Flower garland / Necklace</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- No independent use</td>
<td>- Vedanta Vakyam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Hides behind flowers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Secondary, subservient</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- 2\textsuperscript{nd} sutra – brings out Lakshana Vakyam.

Taittriya Upanishad :

To him (Bhrgu) he (varuna) a gain said : “that from which these beings are born ; that by which, having been born, these beings live and continue to exist ; and that into which, when departing, they all enter ; that seekest thou to know. That is Brahman”. He, (Bhrgu) performed penance ; and after having done penance.... [3 – 1 – 3]
• Brahma Lakshana given, not Pramana sutra.

Sub-commentators:
• Neiyayikas believe Ishvara can be logically proved, established.

Shankara:
• Ishvara established only through shastra.
• It can be assimilated through logic.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Shastra</th>
<th>Liquid</th>
<th>Funnel</th>
<th>Manas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bottle</td>
<td>Ishvara</td>
<td>Logic</td>
<td>Container</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Can’t give liquid Ishvara

• Funnel can pour what shastra gives.

Neiyayikas:
• Ishvara arrived at by 3 logical statements / anumanam.

a) Jagat Sa Kartrutvat – Karyatvat Ghatavatu

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>World</th>
<th>Vyapti - Generalisation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Effect</td>
<td>- Yat yat karyam, sa kartrukam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Product</td>
<td>- Whatever is product must have creator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Must have creator like pot</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• There is creator – 1st step.
b) 2nd Step:
- Jagat karta – Ishvara.
- Jiva binnatvet sati chetanatvat.
- Vyatirikena – Kulalavatu.
- Creator must be Ishvara.
- I know there is a creator.
- Jiva not creator of world.
- Creator is intelligent.
- What is intelligent other than Jiva?

Vyapti:
- Yatu jiva binna tasya chetana, tatu ishvara.
- Whatever is being other than jiva must be ishvara.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1st Step</th>
<th>2nd Step</th>
<th>3rd Step</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- There is creator</td>
<td>- Jiva – Chetanam</td>
<td>- Ishvara = Sarvagyata</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Intelligent not creator of world.</td>
<td>sarvakanwratvat vyatirikena kulalavatu.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Hence Ishvara is creator.</td>
<td>- Ishvara has to be omniscient – unlike pot maker.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Who can create only pot.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Vyapti**: Yatra sarva kartrutm, tatra sarvagyatvam bavati.
- Yo yat karta – tat sarvagyata.
- Sarvagya Ishvara established. Don’t required Ishvara from veda.
- Neiyayika establishes Ishvara by logic / reason / rationalist.
Shankara:

- 3 inferences defective.

a) World has creator because it is a product like a pot.

- Yat yat karyam, sa kartrukam.
- Product must have creator.
- Hall / wall / clock – has creator / all products.
- Anumana requires vyapti gathered through pratyaksha.
- Not by Shastra / Anumanam.
- Mountain has fire.

**Vyapti**: By observation, only if there is no exception – Vyabichara.

- If exception, vyapti will collapse.
- No smoke without fire.

Can’t say:

- Wherever there is fire – there is smoke.

1st Anumanam:

a) Vyapti has to be proved by perception.

b) Vyapti should not have exception.

- Only in case of artificial products like hall, clock, etc, you are able to prove creator through perception.

Example:

- Tree in Amazon jungle – “Nature”.
- Can’t prove creation in case of natural products.
- Exception = Natural products.
- Vyapti Asiddou.
2nd Anumanam:
- **Vyapti**: Conscious being other than Jiva is Ishvara.
- Vyapti Jnanam: Requires perception.
- Any other being other than Jiva not proven.
- If we see Jiva + Ishvara dinking coffee we can point out creator.
- Ishvara not perceptually proved to apply Parivesha Nyaya.

3rd Anumanam:
- Ishvara Sarvagya – Sarvakartrutvat.
- Omniscient because creator of everything.
- Every knowledge born out of mind Yatu Jnanam Tatu Mano Janyam. He depends on perception + mind. Whatever perception, mind is seen.
- **Each system**: wonderful independently – when one segment taken – when you try to tie it together and make it consistent, it falls off.
- Science – allergic to Consciousness.

Example:
- Aware of universe (not sure of title hear CD again) by Amit Goswami.
- All Darshanams have problem with “Jnanam”. All knowledge born out of mind.
- According to Nyaya: Ishvara – Asharira / no mind.
- How Sarvagya and no mind.
- Mind means Samsara.
- Ishvara = Asamsari – can’t fit Jnanam.
- How to establish Ishvara? Come to shastra.
Introduction:
- 2nd sutra – foundation of vedanta, Brahma Lakshana Sutram.

**Brahman**

**Svarupa Lakshanam**

- **Taittriya Upanishad**:
  - Brahmanda valli – Brahma vidu
    apnotiparam... [II – I – 1]
  - satyam Jnanam Anantham Brahman.
  - House – colour / Height / Area.
  - Intrinsic feature, innate feature.
  - Difficult to understand Jnanam, Satyam, Anatham.

**Example**:
- Searching meaning in dictionary:
  - Garulous = Loquacious = Voluble = Garulous = Talkative.
- Come from unknown to known.
- Not easily perceptible.
- Svarupa Jnanam / Chaitanyam
- Nirvisesha Chaitanyam.
- Attributeless Conciousness not known to me.
- Can’t define one unknown through another unknown.
- Brahman house.

**Tatasta Lakshanam**

- Indirect definition
- Jagat Karanam Brahman, Jagat Adharam Brahman.

**Taittriya Upanishad**:
- Yatho va Imani butani... [III – I – 3]
- Incidental features, extraneous feature.
- Crow on house “Kakavat Devadatta Griham”.
- Brahman revealed through Jagat.
- World feature to define Brahman.
- World non-intrinsic feature of Brahman.
- External feature, tangible, visible.
- Go from known to unknown.
- Vritti Jnanam.
- World “Crow”
- World disappears in pralayam + sleep.
- Pralaya kale pranashyati – shows world is extrinsic feature of Brahman.
Om, the knower of Brahman attains the Supreme. With reference to that, is the following hymn recited: Brahman is the Truth, Knowledge and Infinity. He who knows It as existing in the cave of the heart in the transcendent akasa, realises all his desires along with omniscient Brahman. [II – I – 1]

Question:

• Why Vyasa used tatasta lakshanam instead of svarupa lakshanam – Jagat karanam instead of Satyam Jnanam Anantham Brahman?

Answer:

• Easier to understand Tatasta instead of Svarupa Lakshanam initially.

• Definition of Jnanam requires Tatasta Lakshana. Through Vritti Jnanam alone I can define Svarupa Jnanam, Svarupa Lakshanam requires Tatasta Lakshanam.

• Satyam not visible.

• Jnanam not experiencable.

• Anantham not known to me.
• Satyam Jnanam Anantham useful after using Tatasta Lakshanam.
• In house, Svarupa Laksham colour, area, height visible.
• Hence Vyasa chose Janmadasya Yataya.
• Brahman = Jagat Upadana Karanam = Material Cause of universe.
• In upanishad, Brahman – presented as Material cause of creation.
• Sometimes, Maya, prakrti is mentioned as Material Cause of creation.

Material Cause of

- Brahman / Purusha
- Prakrti / Maya

Taittiriya Upanishad:
- Yato va imani butani.... [III – I – 3]
- Chetanam vyasa shows brahman as Material Cause here in 2nd sutra.

Svetasvatara Upanishad:
- Mayantu prakritim vidyad mahinum... [4 – 10]
- Ajam Ekam.... [4 – 5]

Gita:
- Prakritim purusham cheiva..... [13 – 1]

Tagmhovacca, yato va imani bhutani jayante,
yena jatani jtvanti, yatprayantyabhisamvisanti,
tadvijijnasasa, tad brahmeti, sa tapo'tapyata,
sa tapastaptva II 3 II

To him (Bhrugu) he (varuna) a gain said: “that from which these beings are born; that by which, having been born, these beings live and continue to exist; and that into which, when departing, they all enter; that seekest thou to know. That is Brahman”. He, (Bhrugu) performed penance; and after having done penance.... [III – I – 3]
Svetasvatara Upanishad:

There is one unborn prakriti - red, white and black - which gives birth to many creatures like itself. An unborn individual soul becomes attached to it and enjoys it, while another unborn individual soul leaves it after his enjoyment is completed. [Chapter 4 – Verse 5]

**मायाम् तु प्रकृति विद्यामायिनं च महेश्वरम् ।
तस्यायत्त्वशृङ्खलस्तु व्याप्तं सर्वमिदं जगत् ॥ १० ॥**

Know then that Nature is Maya, and that the great God is the Lord of Maya. The whole world is filled with beings who form His parts. [Chapter 4 – Verse 10]

Gita:

Arjuna said: Prakrti (Matter) and Purusa (Spirit), also the Ksetra (the field) and Ksetrajna (the Knower-of-the-Field), Knowledge and that which ought to be known – these, I wish to learn, O Kesava. [Chapter 13 – Verse 1]

**अर्जुनं उवाच
प्रकृतिः पुरुषं चैव क्षेत्रं क्षेत्रज्ञेऽवमेव च।
एतद् वेदितुमिच्छामि जानं लेवं च केशव ॥ १३.२ ॥**

Why vyasa chose chetana Brahman as Karanam of Jagat?

5 Reasons:

a) Vyasa wants to differentiate Vedanta from Sankhya.
   - In Brahma Sutra – predominately the opponent is Sankhya – main opponent.
   - Prathama Mallan Nyaya.
b) Purusha + Prakiti used by both Sankhya + Shankara.

Gita:

Arjuna said: Prakrti (Matter) and Purusa (Spirit), also the Ksetra (the field) and Ksetrajna (the Knower-of-the-Field), Knowledge and that which ought to be known – these, I wish to learn, O Kesava. [Chapter 13 – Verse 1]

Katho Upanishad:

(11) Beyond the great (Mahat) is the unmanifested (Avyaktam). Beyond the Avyaktam (Prakrti) is the Purusa; beyond the Purusa there is nothing; that is the end; that is the highest goal. [I – III – 11]

In both:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Prakrti</th>
<th>Purusha</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Achetanam</td>
<td>- Chetanam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Trigunatmakam – Sattwa / Rasajs / Tamas.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Savikara, changing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• In vedanta – Gita – Chapter 2 – Sankhya yoga.
• Bhagawatam – Sankhya philosophy by kapila deva huti samvada.

Differences:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sankhya</th>
<th>Vedanta</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Prakrti is Material cause of universe.</td>
<td>- Brahman is Material cause of universe.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Achetana Tatvam Material cause of universe.</td>
<td>- Chetana tatvam Material cause of universe.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• 2nd Sutra – key sutra to differentiate vedanta and sankhya.

2nd Reason:
• In all philosophies – question: where did universe originate from?
• Unified theory – theory of everything – “TOE”.
• Energy not one – Atomic, Electro, Hydro, Mechanical.
• All arrive at Achetana Material cause.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sankhya / Yoga</th>
<th>Vedanta</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Material cause is Achetana Prakrti</td>
<td>- Material cause is Chetana Brahman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Achetana Karana vada</td>
<td>- Chetana Karana vada.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Nyaya + Veiseshika:
• Basic material cause is Atom – Parama Anu vada like science. During pralayam, only atoms existing, at approximate time, joined to become molecules and then everything came.
• Parama Anu are Achetanam.
• Also achetana karana vadis Nastika system, Panja Skandas, Astikaya Jainisin, khandas – buddhis.
• Achetana karana vadis.

Science:
• Matter fundamental.
• Big explosion, no life – particles came out, RNA, DNA, Multi cellular organism + confused human being carved out, life only recent origin Conciousness has recently originated out of matter.
• Matter fundamental. Conciousness parallel reality in Sankhya and yoga or Conciousness product of matter.
• Conciousness = Matter or secondary matter.
• Achetana karana vada.
Nyaya Veiseshika:

- 9 types of matter – like elements.
- Atma / Achetanam – one of matter.
- Consciousness comes & goes in matter Atma.
- Atma becomes sentient being when Consciousness arrives and when Consciousness disappears, Atma becomes insentient matter.
- Vedantin – Chetana Karana Vada.
- Spirit excels matter.
- Consciousness not equal to matter.
- Consciousness not subservient to matter.
- Consciousness is fundamental to creation, basic cause of universe, basic stuff of universe.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Substance</th>
<th>Stuff / content Material Cause – of</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gold</td>
<td>Ornament</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wood</td>
<td>Furniture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brahman / Chaitanyam</td>
<td>Matter / Universe</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- 2\textsuperscript{nd} Sutra = Chetana karana vada:
  
  Brahman is Material cause / content of universe.
  
  Put mountains (Rivers / 5 elements in vedantic mixi
  
  \[\downarrow\]
  
  What comes out is Chaitanyam.

- Matter = Diluted Chaitanyam.
- How Chetana Karana Vada is different from other Philosophies, Vyasa discusses in 2\textsuperscript{nd} sutra.
1st difference:

- Main – opponent Sankhya – opposed.

2nd difference:

- Distinguishes other philosophers.

3rd reason:

- In upanishads Brahman + Prakṛti both given as Material cause but predominately Brahman described as Material cause of universe.
- Entire 1st chapter – Tattu samanya adhyasa.
- Deals with Brahman being Material cause of universe.
- Brahman as Material cause is unique teaching of vedanta.
- Vedantins = Chetana karana vadins.
- As Brahman is predominant, Vyasa chooses Brahman in Janmadasya Yataha.

4th reason:

- When prakṛti and purusha both mentioned in upanishads as upadana karanam of universe, is it not contradictory?
- Misleading / confusion / contradiction?
- Important answer – many corollaries derived out of this answer.
Both Statements correct:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Purusha / Brahman is Material cause (Upadana Karana)</th>
<th>Maya / Prakrti is Material cause (Upadana Karana)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Svatantram</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Brahman is Vivarta Upadana Karanam.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Lender of existence to Parinami Upadanam.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Vivarta Upadana Karanam is Adhishtana of Parinami Upadana Karanam.</td>
<td>- Doesn’t exist Separately, independently of Purusha.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Asvatantram / Paratantram.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Since Maya is nonseparate from Brahman, whatever is attributed to Brahman can be attributed to Maya.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Hence Prakrti is also Karanam because Prakrti is based on Brahman.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Prakrti borrows existence from Brahman.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Prakrti is Parinami Upadana Karanam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Borrower of existence.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Hence no contradiction:

- Independent
- Prakrtis action not attributed to Purusha.
- There.
- Prakrti doesn’t exist independent of Brahman.
- Parvati – Shiva Sarvati – Brahma Ardhanareshwara.
- World has come out of Prakrti for which Adhishtanam is Brahman.
- Brahman lends existence to Prakrti and through Prakrti lends existence to world, creation.
5th Reason:

- Mundak Upanishad + Chandogya Upanishad.
- Eka vigyanena sarva vigyana bavati.

**Mundak Upanishad:**

The great householder Saunaka duly approaching Angira in the prescribed manner asked. “What is That, my Lord, having known which all these become known?” [I – I – 3]

**Chandogya Upanishad:**

‘That teaching by which what is never heard becomes heard, what is never thought of becomes thought of, what is never known becomes known?’ [Svetaketu asked] ‘Sir, what is that teaching?’ [6 – 1 – 3]

**Important topic in Vedanta:**

- Eka Vigyanena Sarva Vigyanam Bavati by knowing one, can know everything.
- What is it by knowing which everything is known?
• Upadana karana vigyanena sarva karyam vigyanam bavati.
• By knowing one material cause, all products known.
• Products do not exist separate from material cause - Upadana Karanam.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Material Cause</th>
<th>Product</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gold</td>
<td>Ornament</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clay</td>
<td>Pot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water</td>
<td>Ocean, Waves</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brahman</td>
<td>World</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Gita:

I shall declare to thee, in full, this knowledge combined with realisation, which being known, nothing more here remains to be known. [Chapter 7 – Verse 2]

• If Prakrti is Material cause then Prakrti Vigyanena Sarvam Bavati.
LECTURE 23

1st Sutra :
• Atato Brahma Jingyasa.

2nd Stura :
• Janmadasya Yataha – Brahma Lakshana Sutram.
• Chetana karana vada.
• Brahma karana vada.

Teaching :
• Consciousness is ultimate cause of everything. 5 ideas accomplished.

1st Idea :
• Vyasa negates other systems as cause of universe.
• Anya Sarva Darshana Nirakaranam Param Anu, Khandas.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vedanta</th>
<th>Others</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Consciousness is Material cause</td>
<td>- Matter is material cause of universe.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2nd Idea :
• Through chetana Karana vada, Vyasa shows difference between Sankhya + Vedanta.
• Achetana Karana Vada and Chetana Karana Vada.
3rd Idea:

- **Primary teaching**: Chetana Brahman repeatedly presented as Jagat Karanam.

4th Idea:

- **Some Upanishads say**: Achetana prakriti is Material Cause.

**Svetasvatara Upanishad**:

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{मायां तु प्रकृति विद्याम्यायिनं च महेश्वरम्} & \\
\text{तस्यायत्वसूतः व्यासं सर्वेष्ठिं जगत्} & \text{१०} \\
\end{align*}
\]

Know then that Nature is Maya, and that the great God is the Lord of Maya. The whole world is filled with beings who form His parts. [Chapter 4 – Verse 10]

**Gita**:

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{प्रकृति पुरुषं चैव विद्यानादि उभावपि} & \\
\text{विकारांश्च गुणांश्च विद्भि प्रकृतिसंभवान्} & \text{१३.२०} \\
\end{align*}
\]

Know you that Matter (Prakrti_ and Spirit (Purusa) are both beginningless; and know you also that all modifications and qualities are born of Prakrti. [Chapter 13 – Verse 20]

- Here prakrti is said to be Material cause. It means Brahman is Material cause because prakrti doesn’t exist separate from Brahman.

**Very important difference**:

**Sankhya**:

- Prakrti is independent.
- Purusha is independent and exists separately.
- We can’t interchange Prakrti and Purusha.
In Vedanta can interchange because ultimately there is no prakrti without purusha.

No Maya separate from Brahman.

Prakrti karana vada is brahman karana vada only.

5th Idea:

Brahman is ultimate karanam. Therefore Brahma Jnanena Sarva Jnanam Bavati.

Law in chandogyo and Mudak Upanishad.

Karya vigyanena karana vigyanam bavati.

Eka Karana vigyanena aneka karanam vigyanam bavati.

This eka jnanena sarva jnana bavati impossible in sankhya.

In Sankhya purusha not possible in = Eka Vigyanena Sarva Vigyanam Bavati.

2nd Sutra: Chetana Karana Vada – Unique in Vedanta.

Not in Astika or Nastika Systems.
3rd Sutra:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Adhikaranam</th>
<th>Sutra</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Shastra Yoni</td>
<td>Shastra Yonitvat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Janmadi</td>
<td>Janmadsya Yataha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jingyasa</td>
<td>Atato Brahma Jingyasa</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Learn by heart sutra sanskrit definitions.

3rd Sutra interpreted in 2 ways:

Essence:
- Sutra confirms omniscience of Brahman, indirectly revealed in 2nd sutra.
- Brahman Sarvagyatvam Dvidhayati
  ↓
  Confirms as indicated in 2nd Sutra.

2nd Sutra:
- Brahman is Sarva Karanam.
- Direct meaning.
Derived meanings:

- Ghatasya karta – Ghatajnayaha sarvata karta – Sarvajnyaha.
- Brahman sarvagyam – Sarva karatvat - kulalavatu.
- Karta means one with Jnanam.
- Brahman is omniscient – Nimitta Karanam of everything.
- To derive omniscience, take nimittam – knowledge.
- Omniscience indirectly said – in 2nd sutra but confirmed in 3rd sutra by pointing out that Brahman is creator of vedas also (Shastra yoni).
- Karta means Nimitta Karta.

2nd Sutra:

- Brahman is Nimitta Karanam of Artha Prapancha (objective universe).

3rd Sutra:

- Brahman is Nimitta Karanam of Shabda Prapancha.

How Omniscience revealed?

- Chandogya upanishad + Brihadaranyaka Upanishad – shows interdependence of world.
- Significant portion of Vedas lost. Samaveda had 1000 Shakas – branches only 2 left now.
- Shankara lived 1200 years ago – quotations missing – can’t find Upanishads.
- Veda has total knowledge of universe.
Vyapti:

- Author of Grantha (works) always knows more than content of work because you can never express what you know in a verbal form.
- Expressed is always less than what is known portion.
- Panini – existed before Shankara.
- Shankara praises paninis knowledge as more than grammar expressed in sutras.
- Patanjali wrote volumes of Bashyams on 4000 sutras of Panini.
- Knowledge of Brahman is more than content of vedas.
- **Inference**: Brahma Sarvagyam.

![Diagram]

- Vedas – Anaadi – Apaurusheya – not created by human intellect.
- Brahman not intellectually creator vedas. Knowledge already there in potential form.
- Brahman brought teaching to manifestation.
- Similarly world was not non-existent.
- Exist in potential form.
- Non – existent world brought out / created = Asat karya vada.
- World already exists in potential form.
- Job of Brahman = Manifestation.
• Avakta prapanchasya – vaya karanam.
• Unmanifest – to Manifest – Brahman’s job.
• **Nyaya**: Bagawan created vedas.
• **Vedanta**: Bagawan manifest vedas, already existent.

**Brihadaranyaka Upanishad**:

![Text in Sanskrit]

As from a fire kindled with wet faggot diverse kinds of smoke issue, even so, my dear, the Rg-veda, Yajur-veda, Sama-veda, Atharvanagirasa, history, mythology, arts, Upanishads, pithy verses, aphorisms, elucidations and explanations are (like) the breath of this infinite Reality. They are like the breath of this (Supreme Self). [II – IV – 10]

• Meitreyi brahmanam – Brahman logically revealed as Srishti / Sthithi laya karanam.

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3 Examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>From Agni</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- From wet fuel smoke comes out.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Srishti – breathing of Brahman – effortless (Nyaya).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dundu bee</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Drum beat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Sthithi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Samudra</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Rivers merge into ocean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- World merges into ocean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Layam</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

• 10th verse – Srishti karanam.
• In Sutra 2 – Srishti karanam.
Taittiriya Upanishad:

To him (Bhrgu) he (varuna) again said: “that from which these beings are born; that by which, having been born, these beings live and continue to exist; and that into which, when departing, they all enter; that seekest thou to know. That is Brahman”. He, (Bhrgu) performed penance; and after having done penance…. [III – I – 3]

- In all srishti statements, Brahman is creator of world and vedas. Bagawan created effortlessly – vedas.
- While writing notes, don’t think about breathing.
- It is effortless, not even aware of Job.
- Itihasa – story part of veda (not Ramayana or Bagwatam).
- Purvena – other portions.
- Upanishads, sutras…..
- All effortless for Bagawan.

Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

As from a fire kindled with wet faggot diverse kinds of smoke issue, even so, my dear, the Rg-veda, Yajur-veda, Sama-veda, Atharvanagirasa, history, mythology, arts, Upanishads, pithy verses, aphorisms, elucidations and explanations are (like) the breath of this infinite Reality. They are like the breath of this (Supreme Self). [II – IV – 10]

**Word Analysis:**
- One compound word = Shastrayoni.

- Shasanat trayate iti shastram.

- All life prepared, worked for Moksha Shastra – you are free – no commandment.
Shasanam – 2 meanings

- Karma Khanda
  - Commandment
- Jnana Khanda
  - Revelation of fact

- Through these two, veda protects people from samsara.
- Shastram = Veda.
- Yoni = Nimitta karanam creator, author, karta.

Conclusion:
- 5 factors of Adhikaranam.

viṣayo samśayaścaiva pūrva pakṣastāthontaram I
saṅgatiṣceteḥ pañcāṅgam śastraḥ dikaraṇam smṛtam II

a) Vishaya:
- Subject matter = Brahman.

b) Samshaya:
- Doubt – is Brahman – author of vedas or not?
- Sarvasya vedasya karta va nava?
c) Purva Pakshi:

- Brahman na vedasya karta, vedasya Anaaditvat, nityatvat veda need not be created.
- Creation will have Aadhi + Anta.
- Anaadhi – ni – dana
- Anaadhi – Anantham.
- Vedas has state of Manifestation and unmanifestation.
- It begins + ends – like the world.
- Veda unmanifest = Omkara.

Taittriya Upanishad:

He whose form is manifold, who is pre-eminent among the sacred hymns of the Vedas and who has sprung up from the sacred hymns which are immortal, that Indra (Omkara) may fill me with intellectual vigour. O Lord, may I become the possessor of the immortal revelations. May my body become able and active, my speech sweet and agreeable to the utmost. May I listen abundantly with my ears. Thou art the sheath of Brahman. May you preserve my learning. [I – IV – 1]
• Taittriya siksha valli. By churning vedas from butter essence is “Omkara” = Avyakta shabda.
• Shabda is Akasha guna unmanifest – veda is in Akasha form because sound is in Akasha.
• Akasha is in Brahman.

Taittriya Upanishad:

From that (which is) this Atman, is space born; from akasa, air; from air, fire; from fire, water; from water, earth; from earth, herbs; from herbs, food; and from food, man. [II – 1 – 2]

• From Avyaktha Akasha – Omkara born. From Omkara, prapancha born.
• Veda = eternal, authored by Brahman not intellectual creation but in form of Manifestation.

Akshepa Sangataha:

• What is connection between 2nd and 3rd Sutra?
• This Adhikaranam Answers objection raised in 2nd Adhikaranam.

2nd Sutra:

• Brahma Sarva Karanam.
• Objection by Purva Pakshi. Not karanam of Vedas.
• Why not veda?
• Veda is Anaadhi.

3rd Sutra:

• Brahman = Sarvagyam eva. Karanam of Veda also.
• Omniscience reinforced. Negation of objection raised purva mimamsa.
LECTURE 24

Sutra 3 : Shastra Yoni

Interpreted in 2 ways

1. Jagat Karanam Brahman is Omniscient.
   - Sarvagya Yoni because it is shastra, karta / veda karta / author of veda.
   - Brahman is Omniscient because it is author of veda.
   - Veda deals with all topics.

2. Brahman – Ishvara is Sarvagya.

General Analysis:

- 2nd sutra – Brahman = cause of universe.
- Neiyayika – Brahman = Jagat Karanam.
- Can be inferred by karya linga anumanam.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>World</th>
<th>Brahman</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Effect</td>
<td>Cause</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Vyasa doesn’t accept because he follows vedas.
- Brahman can’t be known through Tarqa.
Katha Upanishad:

This knowledge which thou hast obtained is not attainable by argumentation; it is easy to understand it, O dearest, when taught by a teacher who beholds no difference (between one Self and another); thou art fixed in Truth. May we have, O! Naciketas, an enquirer like thee? [I – II – 9]

- Not knowing through logic – anumanam.
- Shastra alone is source.
- Punyam not known through logic, Adrishtam, Apaurusheya, Apoorva Vishaya.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1st Interpretation</th>
<th>2nd Interpretation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brahman = Author of Vedas</td>
<td>Brahman = subject matter of Vedas.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- What is vishaya vakyam based on which topic is discussed.

1st Interpretation: Brihadaranyaka Upanishad

As from a fire kindled with wet faggot diverse kinds of smoke issue, even so, my dear, the Rg-veda, Yajur-veda, Sama-veda, Atharvanagirasa, history, mythology, arts, Upanishads, pithy verses, aphorisms, elucidations and explanations are (like) the breath of this infinite Reality. They are like the breath of this (Supreme Self). [II – IV – 10]
‘On what do the body and the heart rest?’ ‘On the Prana’. ‘On what does the Prana rest?’ ‘On the Apana.’ ‘On what does the Apana rest?’ ‘On the Vyana.’ ‘On what does the Vyana rest’ ‘On the Udana.’ ‘On what does the Udana rest’ ‘On the Samana.’ This self is That which has been described as ‘Not this, not this.’ It is imperceptible, for it is never perceived; undecaying, for it never decays; unattached, for it is never attached; unfettered – it never feels pain, and never suffers injury. ‘These are the eight abodes, the eight instruments of vision, the eight deities and the eight beings. I ask you of that Being who is to be known only from the Upanishads, who definitely projects those beings and withdraws them into Himself, and who is at the same time transcendent. If you cannot clearly tell me of Him, your head shall fall off.’ Sakalya did not know Him; his head fell off; and robbers snatched away his bones, mistaking them for something else. [III – IX – 26]
Prayer – Shankaracharya:

Pratah Bhajami Manaso Vachasam Agamyam
Vacho Vibhanti Nikhila Yad Anugrahena
Ya Neti Neti Vachanai Nigama Avocuh
Tam Deva Devam Ajam Achutam Ahuragryam

At dawn, I worship the True Self that is beyond the reach of mind and speech, By whose grace, speech is even made possible, This Self is described in the scriptures as “Not this, Not this,” (not this body, not this mind) It is unborn, undying, one with the Divine.

- Adjective to purusha = Anupanishadam purusha.
- Purusha eka vedyam.
- That which can be known only through upanishad. Na pratyakshena, anumanena, na kundalini.

Mundak Upanishad:

Let a brahmana (an aspirant), after he has examined the worlds gained by Karma, acquire freedom from all desires, reflecting that nothing that is eternal can be gained by Karma. Let him, in order to obtain the knowledge of the eternal, take sacrificial fuel (Samit) in his hands and approach that preceptor alone who is well-versed in the Veda-s and is established in Brahman. [I – II – 12]

- Such unique Brahman – do you know Shakalya?
- Your ego will fall if you don’t answer.
- Brahman known through Shastra alone = Shastra Yoni Brahman.
### Word Analysis:

**Shastra yoni vat**

- **Shastram**
  - Vedanta
  - 1st Interpretation

- **Yoni**
  - Pramanam
  - Source / means of knowledge
  - Karta / Author

### Grammatical difference:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tatpurusha Samasa</th>
<th>Bahuvrihi Samasa</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Shastrasya yonih karta</td>
<td>- Shastram yonih pramanam yasya.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Brahman = Author of Shastra</td>
<td>- Shastram is means of knowledge.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Loka Nayaka King</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- You are master of Loka.</td>
<td>- I am world master.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Lokasya nata.</td>
<td>- Lokaha nathaha yasya.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Protector of world.</td>
<td>- I am one for whom world is the master protector.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Shastrasya karta.</td>
<td>- I am beggar, slave of world – protected by world.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- One who recognises world as swamy.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Brahman is that for which shastram is pramanam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Shastra vedyam, shastra vishaya.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Tradition story:**

- Sanskrit poet – scholar – beggar went to king.
- Aham chartam Jara jendra, loka nadam bavapi, Bahuvrihi samsaharam, sashti tatpurusha bavam.
- Both you and I are world masters – which is original?
Conclusion: Format

\[ viṣayo samśayaścaiva pūrva pakṣastāṭhontaram I \]
\[ saṅgatiśceteḥ paṅcāṅgam śastraḥdikaraṇam smṛtam II \]

a) Vishaya:
   - Chetanam jagat karanam brahman.

b) Samshaya:
   - Doubt / Vacillation / pendulam.
   - Does Brahman fall within scope of science – logic or not?

Purva Pakshi:
   - Brahman is within logic / science because it is cause of universe like pot and clay.
   - Purva pakshi’s view – Anumana Gamyam.

Vyasa:
   - Only Shastra Vishayam not Anumana Vishayam.
   - Like dharma known only through Veda, Brahman known only through Veda.

Veda:
   - That which gives knowledge of Brahman not available for any other means like Pratyaksham, Anumanam, Upamanam, Arthapatti, Anupthalabdi (5 Pramanams).

c) Sangatihi:
   - Connection between 2\textsuperscript{nd} / 3\textsuperscript{rd} sutra.
   - Eka phalatva sangatihi.
   - Both topics have common benefit / goal = Brahman siddhi.
(i) Atato Brahma Jingyasa:

- One should enquire into Brahman.

(ii) Janmadasya yathaha:

Connection:
- Both 2nd + 3rd give Brahman Siddhi – Eka Phalam.

Summary: Sutra 1 - 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sutra</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Enquire into Brahman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Brahman is cause of universe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Brahman can be enquired through vedanta pramanam</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Jagat dhyana kartavyam – vedanta vichara kartavyam.
May my limbs, speech, Prana, eye, ear and power of all my senses grow vigorous! All is the pure Brahman of the Upanishads. May I never deny that Brahman! May that Brahman never desert me! Let that relationship endure. Let the virtues recited in the Upanishads be rooted in me. May they repose in me! Om peace. peace. peace!

- Brahman only known through shastra – not available for science.
**LECTURE 25**

- Brahman has to be enquired into for sake of knowledge and liberation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Brahman Lakshanam</th>
<th>Shastra Pramanam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Janmadasya Yataha</td>
<td>- Shastra Yonitvat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Brahman = Jagat Karanam</td>
<td>- Shastra Pramana Gamyam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>= Cause of Universe.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>= Nimitta + Upadana Karanam</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4th Sutra:

But that Brahman (is known from the Upanisads), (It) being the object of their fullest import. [I – I – 4]

---

![Diagram]

Adhikaranam

(1) Jingyasa
(2) Janmadhi
(3) Shastra Yoni
(4) Samanvaya
General Analysis:

1st Chapter:

- 134 Sutras – 130 sutras elaboration of 4th sutra. Therefore 1st chapter named Samanvaya Adhyaya.
- 2nd Sutra – foundation of Brahman sutra – 555 sutras – Chapter 1 to 4.
- Janmadasya yataya.
- Brahman = Jagat Karanam.
- Hence 2nd + 4th sutra very important in Brahman Sutra.

Summary

- 2nd Sutra
  - Foundation of Chapter 1 to 4 (555 Sutras)
    - Janmadasya Yataha
    - Brahman = Jagat Karanam.
    - Very powerful sutra.

- 4th Sutra
  - Chapter 1 (130 Sutras)
    - Tattu Samanvayatu
    - Brahman = Central teaching of Vedanta.

- Sutra 1 – 4 = Chatur - Sutri
Shastra Yoni – 2 Meanings

Shastra Vishayavat
- Shastra Vishaya = Brahman

Shastra Yoni
- Pramanam = Shastram
- Shastra pramanatvat / Prameyatvat.
- Brahman = Central topic in Shastram.

How you know central topic of Shastra?
Gita:

What is central teaching

Karma Yoga
- Chapter 3, 4, 5
- Supporting teaching

Bhakti Yoga
- 7th Chapter - 12th Chapter
- Chapter 11: Naham vedena tapasa, Na Danai only by Bakti subservient

Jnana Yoga
- Chapter 13, 14, 15
- Main Teaching

Upasana Yoga
- Chapter 6
- Subservient

Neither by the vedas, nor by austerity, nor by gift, nor by sacrifices can I be seen in this form as you have seen Me (in your present mental condition). [Chapter 11 – Verse 53]
• Joke : Bought 12 cards = I love you only.
• More topics means vakya bheda dosha.
• Author not around. Hence contradiction.
• Tarqa shastra grantha – author writes commentary.
• Samanvaya = Condition to prove central teaching.
• Tatparya vishayam.
• Consistency, importance.
• Central theme arrived by Shad Lingas / 6 factors.

Simple Meaning of Sutra :
• Brahma is central theme of vedanta shastram, because it enjoys importance, consistency harmony.
• Anumana vakyam : Logic
• Brahma shastra vishaya, samanvayat dharmavatu.
• Brahma = Vendanta central teaching like dharma in veda purva baga – karma khanda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sutra</th>
<th>Vishaya vakyam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Atato Brahma Jingyasa</td>
<td>- Atma Va Are Drishtavyaha... [Brihadaranyaka Upanishad : IV – V – 6]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Janmadasya Yataha</td>
<td>- Yato va imani butani Jayante... [Taittriya Upanishad : III – 1 – 3]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Shastra Yonitvat</td>
<td>- Yasya Mahato butasya... [Brihadaranyaka Upanishad : II – IV – 10]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Tam tva apanisadam purusam... [Brihadaranyaka Upanishad : III – IX – 26]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Tatu Samanvayat</td>
<td>- Entire vedanta vakyam.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
He said: “It is not for the sake of the husband, my dear, that he is loved, but for one’s own sake that he loved. It is not for the sake of the wife, my dear, that she is loved, but for one’s own sake that she is loved. It is not for the sake of the sons, my dear, that they are loved, but for one’s own sake that they are loved. It is not for the sake of wealth, my dear, that it is loved, but for one’s own sake that it is loved. It is not for the sake of the Brahmana, my dear, that he is loved, but for one’s own sake that he is loved. It is not for the sake of the Ksatriya, my dear, that he is loved, but for one’s own sake that he is loved. It is not for the sake of worlds, my dear, that they are loved, but for one’s own sake that they are loved. It is not for the sake of the gods, my dear, that they are loved, but for one’s own sake that they are loved. It is not for the sake of beings, my dear, that they are loved, but for one’s own sake that they are loved. It is not for the sake of all, my dear, that all is loved, but for one’s own sake that it is loved. The Self, my dear Maitreyi, should be realised—should be heard of, reflected on and meditated upon. By the realisation of the Self, my dear, through hearing, reflection and meditation, all this is known. [IV – V - 6]
To him (Bhrgu) he (varuna) said: “that from which these beings are born; that by which, having been born, these beings live and continue to exist; and that into which, when departing, they all enter; that seekest thou to know. That is Brahman”. He (Bhrgu) performed penance; and after having done penance…. [III – I – 3]

As from a fire kindled with wet faggot diverse kinds of smoke issue, even so, my dear, the Rg-veda, Yajur-veda, Sama-veda, Atharvanagirasa, history, mythology, arts, Upanishads, pithy verses, aphorisms, elucidations and explanations are (like) the breath of this infinite Reality. They are like the breath of this (Supreme Self). [II – IV – 10]
‘On what do the body and the heart rest?’ ‘On the Prana.’ ‘On what does the Prana rest?’ ‘On the Apana.’ ‘On what does the Apana rest?’ ‘On the Vyana.’ ‘On what does the Vyana rest’ ‘On the Udana.’ ‘On what does the Udana rest’ ‘On the Samana.’ This self is That which has been described as ‘Not this, not this.’ It is imperceptible, for it is never perceived; undecaying, for It never decays; unattached, for It is never attached; unfettered – It never feels pain, and never suffers injury. ‘These are the eight abodes, the eight instruments of vision, the eight deities and the eight beings. I ask you of that Being who is to be known only from the Upanishads, who definitely projects those beings and withdraws them into Himself, and who is at the same time transcendent. If you cannot clearly tell me of Him, your head shall fall off.’ Sakalya did not know Him; his head fell off; and robbers snatched away his bones, mistaking them for something else. [III – IX – 26]

Word Analysis:

- Tat – Tu – Samanvayat

That pronoun – Stands for Noun.
Anuvritti to shorten sentence.

- Anuvritti method used in sutras – Rama went to temple Krishna also.

a) Atato Brahman Jingyasa
b) (Brahman) Janmadasya Yataha
  Brahman continues + added in all 555 sutras.
c) Shastra yonitvat (Brahman)

- Tatu = Brahman is central theme of shastras.
- Saman vayat – because Brahman enjoys consistency and importance.
- How do you prove this?
- 6 Lingas - clues / indicator / proof / mark / sign.

Author of Vedas:
- Sarvagyam Brahman
- Sarvashakti Brahman
- Shad lingaii tatparya nirmayaha.
- Sutra 5 – 134 – proving brahman alone central theme is in this 1st chapter.

**Shad Lingas**:
- Upakramo upa samharau
  Abyaso apurvata phalam
  Arthavado upapatticha
  Lingam tatparya nirmayaye

**Diagram**:
- **Shad Lingas**
  - **Upakrama Upasamharou**
    - Identity – oneness in beginning and end.
  - **Apoorvata**
    - New topic, Novelty, newness, not known, newly taught
  - **Artha Vada**
    - Stuti
    - Stotram
    - Glorification
  - **Phalam**
    - Benefit
  - **Upapatti**
    - Logic
    - Reason
6th Chapter (Sashta Adhyaya) Chandogyo Upanishad:

- Vedanta Model tat tvam asi prakaranam.

a) Upakrama + Upasamhara:

- Beginning + end.

Verse 1:

Somya, before this world was manifest there was only existence, one without a second. On this subject, some maintain that before this world was manifest there was only non-existence, one without a second. Out of that non-existence, existence emerged. [6 – 2 – 1]

Last Verse – Chapter 6:

‘That which is the subtlest of all is the Self of all this. It is the Truth. It is the Self. That thou art, O Svetaketu.’ [Svetaketu then said,] ‘Sir, please explain this to me again.’ ‘Yes, Somya, I will explain again,’ replied his father. [6 – 9 – 4]
Example:
• Tv news – highlights in beginning + end.
• Brahman – alone Sat (Satyam) everything else mithya.

b) Abyasa:
• 9 times tat tvam asi.
• 9 times Aitat Atmayam Idagum Sarvam.
• Repetition for stress / importance / emphasis.

c) Apoorvata:
• Reveals Brahman not known through any other Pramanam.
• New = Pramanantara Avedyam.
• Not known through other pramanam, instruments of knowledge.
• Not through Pratyaksha, Anumana, Upamana, Arthapatti, Anuptalabdi.
• Even Karma Khanda does not reveal Brahman.
• Karma Khanda reveals karma for gaining different Lokas.
• Brahman revealed only by Vedanta.
LECTURE 26

Introduction:
• 4th sutra – Tattu samanvayat.

General meaning:
• Consistency, harmony, concordance.

Technical Analysis:
• Providing by pruva mimamsa shastram to arrive at tatparyam adopted by uttara mimamsa.

Apporvata: Kena Upanishad

Na tatra caksur gacchati na vag gacchati no manah
na vidmo na vijanimo yathaitad-anusisyat
Anyadeva tad viditad atho aviditadadhi
Iti susruma purvesam ye nastad vyacacaksire

(3) The eye does not go there, not speech, nor mind, We do not know That. We do not know how to instruct one about It. It is distinct from the known and above the unknown. We have heard it, so stated the preceptors who taught us That. [Chapter 1 – Verse 3]

• Brahman not known through Karma Khanda. (Only for Punya papam, dharma, rituals for para loka attainment)

Example:
• 6th chapter – Chandogya upanishad.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Salt Outside</th>
<th>Salt dissolved in water</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Can See</td>
<td>- Can’t see salt in water.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Inferior</td>
<td>- I know, I feel, I taste, unable to separately see.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Water pervaded by something other than water.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Chandogya Upanishad:

What pervades body and enlivens body but I don’t see?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Body Outside</th>
<th>Sentient body = Salttish water</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Bundle of matter</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Pancha bautika</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- See statue, form, colour.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- See body, form colour.</td>
<td>- Sentiency experienced.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Body pervaded by – something other than body.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- I can’t see</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Body experienced by something I don’t see.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Somya, before this world was manifest there was only existence, one without a second. On this subject, some maintain that before this world was manifest there was only non-existence, one without a second. Out of that non-existence, existence emerged. [6 – 2 – 1]

Sadeva somyedamagra asidekamevadvityiam;
Taddhaika ahurasadevedamagra asidekamevadvityiam
tasmadasatah sajajayata [1]
Uddalaka said: ‘Put this lump of salt into water and come to me in the morning.’ Svetaketu did as he was told. Uddalaka said to him, ‘My son, bring me the salt that you put in the water. Svetaketu looked, but he could not find it, as the salt had dissolved in the water. Uddalaka then said: ‘My son, drink the water at the surface. Svetaketu did that, and Uddalaka asked: How does it taste? Svetaketu replied: It is saline. Uddalaka then said: ‘Drink it from the middle. How does it taste?’ ‘It is saline.’ ‘Drink it from the bottom. How does it taste?’ ‘It is saline.’ ‘Throw the water away and then come to me.’ Svetaketu did so. The father said to him: ‘There is salt in every part of the water, yet you cannot see it. Similarly, O Somya, Sat [the self] is here in this body, yet you cannot see it in the body.’ [6 – 13 – 1 & 2]

- Don’t run in search of Brahman – don’t see Brahman. You are Brahman.
- Brahman = Pratyaksha Agocharam. Pramanantara agamyam.
- Therefore Apoorvam Brahman

**Corollary:**

a) Brahman = Subject matter of Vedanta Vishayam / Prameyam of Vedanta / Pratibasyaha.

b) Brahman = Unique subject matter of vedanta.

c) Brahman through vedanta alone. Not by any other pramanam.

**Reverse it:**

- Vedanta is unique pramanam for Brahman.
- Vedanta pramanam are Brahman prameyam.
- Made for each other.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>4th Sutra</th>
<th>3rd Sutra</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Tattu Samanvayatu</td>
<td>- Shastra yonitvat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Brahman is unique prameyam</td>
<td>- Vedanta is unique pramanam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Ulta is tattu samanvayat</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- 4th sutra corroborates with 3rd sutra.
d) Phalam – Benefit : Moksha

- Brahma vida aapnoti param.
- Brahma ni tat paryam asti.

Chandogya Upanishad:

```
तस्य यथाभिनवन्त प्रमुख प्रबृहादेतां दिशं गंधर्वा एवं
दिशं व्रजेति स ग्रामाद्ग्रामम पुच्छन पर्यायं। मेधावी गं
धाराननोपपोपद्वैतमेवाहारायणान् पुरुषो वेद
तत्स्य नावदेव चिरं यावनं विमोदेदेभ्यं संपत्य हि ॥
```

```
Tasya yathabhinahanam pramucya prabruyatam disam gandhara etam
disam vrajeti sa gramadgramam prcchandram prcchar pandito medhavi
gandharanevopasampadyetai- vamevehacaryavanpurusos veda
tasya tavadeva ciram yavanna vimokshe'tha sampatsya iti. II 2 ॥
```

And as someone may remove that person’s blindfold and say, ‘Gandhara is this way; go this way,’ and the intelligent man goes from one village to another, asking his way and relying on the information people give, until he reaches Gandhara; similarly, a person who gets a teacher attains knowledge. His delay is only as long as he is not free of his body. After that he becomes merged in the Self. [6 – 14 – 2]

- Brahman Jnani gets Jeevan mukti and at death gets videha mukti.
- Knowing Anna Maya kosha no phalam.

e) Artha vada glorification:

Mundak Upanishad:

- Eka Vigyanena Sarva vigyanam bavati.
- Brahman Jnani becomes sarva jnani.
- Does not know French + Russian language.
- Gets Sarva atma Jnanam.
- Essence of everything. As good as knowing everything.
- Glory goes to Brahman only.
• Glorification = Stuti, stotram artha vada.
• Other pramanams can’t give moksha.

**Katho Upanishad :**

What is indeed here (visible as the world) the same is there (invisible as Brahman) ; and what is there, the same is here. He proceeds from death to death who beholds here difference (between Brahman and the world). [II – I – 10]

• One in duality will travel from death to death Kripanah.
• Jnani alone Brahmanaha.
• Ajnani – Brahma Abhasa other Jnanam criticised. Glorification and criticism both called artha vada.
• Brahman stuti + Nindha = Artha vada.

**f) Upapatti – Logic :**

• Not irrational, dogmatic blind belief.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Brahma Satyam</th>
<th>Jagan Mithya</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Brahman - Karanam</td>
<td>- World - Karyam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Karanam alone satyam, has independent existence.</td>
<td>- Karyam has dependent existence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Brahman = Karanam</td>
<td>- Entire prapancha = Karyam</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• This is anumana statement. Brahman – Satyam, Karanatvatu – Janma dasya yataha. Jagat mithya karyatvatu.
For Mandah student:

Example:

- Vacharambanam Nama Dheyam Mritika eva satyam.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Clay</th>
<th>Pot</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Satyam</td>
<td>- Mithya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Karanam</td>
<td>- Karyam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- No substance called pot — all the time dealing with clay.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- No world — all the time dealing with Brahman.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Brahman alone karanam.
- Ram alone Intelligent.
- **Vyavaharically we say**:
  - World alone satyam
  - Pot alone satyam
  - Has utility
- By pot example show karyatvat.
- Mithya + karanam – satyam = Upapatti = logic / Brahman lingam.
- Brahman samanvaya – Brahman is important.
- Brahma shastra pramanam – shastra yonitvat.
- Vedanta – Pramanam for Brahman.

**TU**:

- Maximum commentary written.
- Alone – only.
- Brahman alone subject matter, avadharana, emphasis, nothing else.
• Rama alone has visited, nobody else visited is emphasised.
• Nobody visited temple means Rama alone visited temple.
• Every emphasis of ‘X’ – means or implies negation of something else.
• TU = Negating Purva pakshi – who claim subject matter is not Brahman.

Who is Purva Pakshi?
• Astikas who accept Veda not Nastikas.
• 5 Astika Purva Pakshi’s:
  Sankhya / Yoga / Nyaya / Veiseshika / Purva Mimamsa / Uttara Mimamsa.

5 Reduced to 3

(a) Sankhya + Yoga (SY)
(b) Nyaya + Veiseshika (NV)
(c) Uttara Mimamsa (UM)

Sankhya – Yoga:
• Yoga = Ashtanga yoga of patanjali (Practice).
• Sankha – Sutras – theory part.
• Chapter 1 = 5th – 135 sutra – negation of sankhya.
• Only one sutra on yoga = Etena yogaha pratyuktaha.

b) Nyaya – Veiseshika:
• Tarqa sangraha – essence of Nyaya system.
• Same idea of Veiseshika also.
• TU Negates – 3 Purva Pakshi’s.
• Sankya Yoga – most powerful.
• Entire 1st chapter = commentary on ‘TU’.

2 Tasks indicated by TU

Establish Vedanta

Negate Sankhya Yoga – Purva Pakshi

Nyaya – Veiseshika - Purva Pakshi:
• Atomic theory (science) weak opponent.
• 2nd chapter – Nyaya veiseshika – Briefly.
• **Purva mimamsa (PM):**
  Analysis of ritualistic portion.
  • Analysed by Jaimini – disciple of Vyasa – wrote Bashyam of Uttara Mimamsa (UM).
  • Purva Mimamsa sutra Bashyam by Shabara swami, called Shaabara Bashyam.
  • Purva Mimamsa not Purva Pakshi.
  • Purva Mimamsa useful for Dharma, Artha, Kama and Chitta Shuddhi called Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti. It is called Dharma Shastram. Dharma alone gives Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti.
  • Purva Mimamsa useful for material benefit and Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti, but not for Moksha. Shabara swami accepts above fact.
  • Sub – commentary came on Purva Mimamsa Bashyam who presented Purva Mimamsa as means for Moksha and later said Purva Mimamsa alone gives Moksha (Timiru) and Uttara Mimamsa (UM) useless.
  • Unmanifest is Barren land of country not vegetative land Vedanta Ushara unproductive.
  • Subcommentary Purva Mimamsa is Purva Pakshi.
4th Sutra:
- Samanvayatu Adhikaranam
- Tat tu – shastra yoni samanvaya.
- That Brahman is subject matter of vedanta because it has importance.
- “TU” negates other Purva Pakshi.
- “TU” Shabda Vyvrithartha.

Advaitam, Dvaitam, Visishta Advaitam (VA), are based on commentary on Brahman Sutra.
All followers of Brahma sutra, children of Vyasa.
For all vedanta darshanam common source is Brahma sutra.
Dispute between advaitin and Visishta Advaitam is internal dispute (Yadaviya kalasam).
Karnataka not neighbouring country. Water problem internal.
Brahma sutra does not deal with Visihta Advaitam conflict. It deals with vedanta and non-vedanta.
6 Astika – believe in veda pramanam.
Sankhya Yoga / Nyaya Veishesika / Purva Mimamsa / Uttara Mimamsa.
Nastikas not enumerated here.
Chapter 1 : Sankhya Yoga and Purva Mimamsa – Purva Pakshi
Chapter 2 : Nyaya Veishesika – Purva Pakshi

“TU”
Purva Mimamsa Nirakaranam :

- Source Jaimini sutras.
- Older sutra compared to Nyaya.
- Shaabara Bashyam accepted by Shankara and quoted.
- Bashyam complimentary to vedanta.
- Atato Dharma Jingyasa is dharma shastra – foundation for our life.
- We step over dharma shastra and come to Brahma sutra.
- For Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti require karma khanda, Kumarila Bhatta (KB) and Prabhakaraha (P) subcommentary on shaabara bashya.
- Kumarila Bhatta vartikam verses are famous.
- Bhatta vartikams / matam “Brihati” – Prose commentary.
- Knowledge of things and not actions.
- Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam (KBV) statement of commandment persuading people to do action.
- Vidhi – Nisheda vakyam.
- Kartavyaha / Kuryat imperative injunctions.
- Statement of fact leads to only knowledge not action.
- Siddha Bodhaka Vakyam (SBV).
- No benefit. Knowing gives no benefit.
- What are their views?
- Why know more about Purva Pakshi and how vedanta refutes.
- Actually Gita + Upanishads enough.
**Common view of both Matams : (Siddha Bodhaka Vakyam + Karya Bodhaka Vakyam)**

a) Jnanam gives no purushartha :
- Heaven knowledge – no benefit.
- Stomach pain due to cancer – no benefit of knowledge. Taking medicine – gives benefit.
- Sukha prapti + Dukha Nivritti.
- Siddha Bodhaka Vakyam – Aprayojanam with Aham Brahma Asmi Jnanam, family problems not solved.
- Karya Bodhaka Vakyam – has purushartha, get sukha prapti.

**Katho Upanishad :**

```
स्वर्गे लोके न भयं किंचनास्ति
न तत्र त्वं न जरया विभेति ।
उभे तीर्थार्जनायापिपासे
शोकातिगो मोदते स्वर्गलोके ॥ १२ ॥
```

In Heaven, there is no fear whatsoever. You are not there (O! Death) : nor do they (the inhabitants of heaven i.e. Devas) fear old age there. Having crossed both hunger and thirst, one rejoices in Heaven, being above grief. [I – I – 12]

- Knowledge of svarga, no benefit – svarga has no hunger / thirst / nice dance + music.
- Do – Jyotishtoma – go to svarga.

b) Karya Bodhaka Vakyam – Sa Prajyojanam
- Siddha bodhaka vakyam – Aprayojanam.
- Meditation / Japam – Karyam.

c) Purva mimamsa (PM) accepts veda as pramanam.
- Buddhist gone out of India, because of Purva Mimamsa.
Definition of Pramanam:

- Anadigata Abadita artha bodhakam – pramanam.
- Pramanam reveals something.
- Artha = Prameyam = Vishayam bodhakam – revealer.

2 conditions

- Anadigatam (Unrevealed)
  - Not revealed by other pramanam eye, ears, nose, tongue, skin, logic, maths, science.
  - If it reveals, it will become apramanam.

- Abaditam (Unnegated)
  - Not contradicted by other pramanam like Pratyaksham logic.
  - Fire is cold – can’t say.

- Vedas are beyond logic = Not illogical / not logical they are “Alogical”.
- Purva Mimamsa adds 3rd condition:
  Anadigata, abadatvat, phalavat artha bodakatvam.
- Unrevealed / uncontradicted / useful.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Siddha Bodhaka Vakyam</th>
<th>Karya Bodhaka Vakyam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Apramanam</td>
<td>- Pramanam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- No benefit</td>
<td>- Useful.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• **Phalavat revealed by Jaimini sutram**:  
  Aamnayasya kriyartatvat Anartakyam arthadarthanam.
• In vedas, karya bodhaka vakyam alone useful.
• Anartakyam – other statements invalid.
• Atadarthanam – Siddha.

---

**Vedis statements**

- **Fact (Siddha Bodhaka Vakyam)**
  - Apramanam
  - Invalid
  - Aprayojanam

- **Action (Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam)**
  - Sapramanam
  - Valid
  - Sukha prapti dukha nivritti
  - Aprayojanam
Pramanam:

- Anadigata Abadita / Arthavat prayojanavat / Jnanavat bhodhanat.
- Jnana khanda – Siddha vastu.
  
  Brahman, Srishti, Atma, no Karma.

  Jnanam

  No prayojanam

  Karma

  Sa Prayojanam

- By knowing brahman as satyam, jnanam, anantham, or srishti is 5 elements – or pancha koshas – siddha bodhaka vakyams – what is benefit – Nish prayojanam, apramanam.
Jaimini Purva Mimamsa Sutra:

- Since Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam – useful – Pramanam.
- Since Siddha Bodhaka Vakhyam – useless – Apramanam.
- Siddha Bodhaka Vakhyam = Artha vada vakyams – useless.
- Nishprayojanam – Apramanam.
- **Purva mimamsa facing new problem:**

Purva mimamsa accepts vedas as pramanam apaurusheya, not created by human intellect. Hence no defect.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vedanta</th>
<th>Purva Mimamsa</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- God is revealer of vedas</td>
<td>- Does not accept god as revealer of vedas.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Ultimate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- No god to reveal veda.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Example:

Siddha Bodhaka Vakhyam:
- Vayu does everything quickly.
- Gives interest in ritual.

Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam:
- One should also ritual offering oblations to vayu devata.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam</th>
<th>Siddha Bodhaka Vakhyam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Independently taken is useless</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- With Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam useful.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Example:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Compartments</th>
<th>Engine</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| - Useless without engine  
  - Siddha Bodhaka Vakhyam  
  - Useful when connected to engine Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam.  
  - Sa prayojanam, pramanam by joining with Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam. | - Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam |

Whole veda Pramanam

- Directly
  - Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam

- Indirectly
  - Siddha Bodhaka Vakhyam - by joining with Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam

- For purva mimamsa, veda enjoys status of god.

Vedantin:
- If god did not reveal god, how did it come?

Purva Mimamsa:
- Veda never came – Anaadi, apurusheya pramanam.
  Through anumanasya sutras divided into 2.
Vedantin:
- How can you reject part of veda as Apramanam?

Purva Mimamsa:

Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

He said: O Gargi, the knowers of Brahman say, this Immutable (Brahman) is that. It is neither gross nor minute, neither short nor long, neither red colour nor oiliness, neither shadow nor darkness, neither air nor ether, unattached, neither savour nor odour, without eyes or ears, without the vocal organ or mind, non-luminous, without the vital force or mouth, not a measure, and without interior of exterior. It does not eat anything, nor is it eaten by anybody. [III – VIII – 8]
• Asthulam... not brahman.
• Brahma nasti is Prabhakara + Bashta matam.
• What is use of Brahman? Aprayojanam.
• Brahman not attainable – adreshyam – not revealed by sense organs.
• Agrahyang – not grasped.
• Brahman – not direct purushartha, unattainable.

2 Technical words:
• Siddha Bodhaka Vakhyam – Sesha – Amukhya component – Compartment.
• Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam – Seshi – Mukhya Component – Engine.
• Joining together – entire veda becomes pramanam.
• Jnana kanda - Siddha Bodhaka Vakhyam – independently useless.
• All vedanta vakyam should be linked with Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam.
• Therefore Brahman – Connected to Devata, Karta, Karma phalam. Some action required.

What about Brahman revealed?

Taittriya Upanishad:

```
अ ब्रह्माविदार्पनोति परम् ।
तदेशाभ्यूषक्ता ।
सत्यं ज्ञानमनस्ते ब्रह्म ।
यो वेदं निहितं गुह्यां परमेव व्योमन ।
सोंभन्ते सर्वानं कामान्त्सह ।
ब्रह्मणा विप्रक्षित्वात् ॥
```

```
Om brahmavidapnoti param, tadesa'bhuyukta,
satyam jnanamanatam brahma,
yo veda nihitam guhayam parame vyoman,
so'snute sarvan kaman saha brahmaṇa vipasciteti ॥ १ ॥
```

Om, the knower of Brahman attains the Supreme. With reference to that, is the following hymn recited: Brahman is the Truth, Knowledge and Infinity. He who knows It as existing in the cave of the heart in the transcendent akasa, realises all his desires along with omniscient Brahman. [II – I – 1]
Mandukya Upanishad:

It is not that which is conscious of the internal subjective world, nor that which is conscious of the external world, nor that which is conscious of both, nor that which is a mass of consciousness, nor is it unconsciousness. It is unseen by any sense-organ, beyond empirical dealings, incomprehensible by the mind, uninferable, unthinkable, indescribable, essentially by of the Self alone, negation of all phenomena, the peaceful, the auspicious and the nondual. This is what is considered as the Fourth (Turiya). This is the Atman and this is to be realised. [Verse 7]

Mandukya Upanishad:

That which is invisible, ungraspable, unoriginated and attributeless, that which has neither eyes nor hands nor legs – that is Eternal, full of manifestations, All-pervading, Subtlest of the subtle – that Imperishable Being is what the wise perceive as the Source of all Creation. [I – I – 6]

Katha Upanishad:

He, who has realised that (Atman) which is without sound, without touch, without form, without decay, and also without taste, without smell, without beginning, without end, beyond the Mahat (great), eternal and unchanging, is freed from the jaws of death. [I – III – 15]
• Can I use Brahman as instrument.
• Not end/ means – Brahman – Avyavaharyam means not available for any transaction. Not subject, object, instrument, locus, accessories used for transaction.
• Not karta, karanam, kriya karaka phalam, vilakshanam neither end nor means.
• Why veda should reveal such a Brahman?
• Hence according to purva mimamsa – Brahma Nasti.
• What about Atma – self knowledge.
• Self intimately known to everyone. Self evident – why veda should reveal – which is already siddam?
• Svata siddhim atma veda vedyam katham?
• Pramanam should reveal not known thing. Atma already evident.
• Atma – glorifying, encouraging statement to do ritual.
• All Siddha Bodhaka Vakhyam – Kartum stutu vakyam.
  - Yajamana stutu vakyam.
• Glorification of yaga devata to encourage oblations to devata.
• Brahman is not a fact – only glorification of devatas.
• Siddha Bodhaka Vakhyam / Jnana Khanda – Vakyam – should be connected with Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam.

Question:
Which Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam will you connect?
Optional or is there rule of connection?
Kumarila Bhatta – Baashta Matam:

- All Jnana Khanda vakyam should be connected to Karma Khanda vidhi vakyam ritual – Kriya vakyani.
- Glorifies devata or yajman.

Praabakara matam:

- Many Siddha Bodhaka Vakhyam + Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam.

Rule:

- Siddha Bodhaka Vakhyam should be connected to nearest Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam.
- Kumarila Bhatta connected end Siddha Bodhaka Vakhyam to Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam.
- Prakarana Bheda – totally away.
- In Jnana Khanda itself there are many upasana vakyams.
- Upasana = Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam.
- Upasanas to be done, implemented, practiced.
- Instead of connecting Siddha Bodhaka Vakhyam of Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam connect. Siddha Bodhaka Vakhyam of Jnana Khanda to upasana vakya existing within Jnana Khanda itself.
- All Brahma bodhaka vakyams should be connected to upasaka bodhaka vakyams.
Example:

• Atma upasanam kuru.
• Brahma vitu apnoti param
  Brahma Upasaka
• Aham Brahma Asmi iti upasaka kartavam.
• Auto suggestion, brain washing, conditioning.
• Aham Brahma Asmi repetition, aham nitya shudhaha, buddaha.
• This is how Siddha Bodhaka Vakhyam should be validated.
LECTURE 29

Introduction: 4\textsuperscript{th} sutra

- TU – Significance in Tat tu Samanvayatu.
- TU for negation of all Purva Pakshi negates purva mimamsa.

Salient features:

1) Veda Vakya 2 types

- Siddha Bodhaka Vakhyam
  - Lead to knowledge
  - Useless
  - In valid
  - Must join Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam to get validity.

- Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam
  - Lead to action
  - Useful
  - Valid

2) 2 Sutras:

Mimamsa Sutra of Jaimini:

आक्षणायस्य क्रियार्थत्वादानर्थविन्यमतदर्थानाम ||

The veda being for the sacrifice, the portion which is not for the sacrifice is useless therefore it can not be said to be eternal. [I – 2 – 1]

Mimamsa Sutra of Jaimini:

विधिनात्त्वेकवाक्ष्यत्वातस्तुत्यर्थेन विधीनां स्यूः

They by reason of one sentence with the injunction are with the object of the praise, parts of the injunction. [I – II – 7]
• Brahman is nonexistent because it is useless.
• Neither goal to reach or means to attain something.
• Neither sadhana / sadhyam.
• All Vedanta Vakyams are Siddha Bodhaka Vakhyam.
• Siddha Bodhaka Vakhyam should be converted to Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam.
• Otherwise Siddha Bodhaka Vakhyam – useless – invalid – Apramanam.
• Which Karya Bodhaka Vakhyam - Siddha Bodhaka Vakhyam should join?

Kumarila bhatta – Baashta Matam:
• Vedanta glorifies Yajamana as Aham Brahma Asmi.

Taittriya Upanishad:

I am the stimulator in the tree of universe. My fame (glory) is high as the peaks of the mountains. High and pure am I like the essence in the sun; I am the power and the wealth, effulgent with intuition. Intelligent, imperishable and undecaying am I – this is the sacred recitation of Trisanku, after he realised the Truth. [I – X – 1]

Kaivalya Upanishad:

In me alone everything is born; in me alone does everything exist and in me alone gets everything dissolved. I am That non-dual Brahman. [Verse 19]
• Yajamana feels light mood, enthusiastic spirit, inspires karta to perform Jyotishtoma.
• Yajamana stuti done by Jnana Khanda. Hence Siddha Bodhaka Vakyam joins Karya Bodhaka Vakyam existing in Karma Khanda.

**Prabaakara:**

• Siddha Bodhaka Vakyam should join Karma Bodhaka Vakyam in vedanta not in Karma Khanda.
• Aham Brahma Asmi, not knowledge because Brahman nonexistent.
• Upasana to be practiced.
• **Upasana definition:**
  
  Atasmin tat buddhi. Seeing something upon something else is upasana.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Upon</th>
<th>See</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Flag</td>
<td>Country</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stone</td>
<td>Lord</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jiva</td>
<td>Brahman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aham Brahma Asmi</td>
<td>Karya Bodhaka Vakyam</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Person gets purushartha. Jnanam no use, do upasana karma.
• Action is result of veda.

**Vedanta Shankara’s Answer:**

• Refutation of Prabaakara + Bashta matam.

a) **Siddha Bodhaka Vakyam – leads to Jnanam alone which is less.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Siddha Bodhaka Vakyam</th>
<th>Karya Bodhaka Vakyam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Statement of fact</td>
<td>- Statement of action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Gives knowledge which alone is useless</td>
<td>- Produces Sukha Prapti + Dukha Nivritti.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Shankara:

- General rule – you are right mere knowledge of Gangotri (Utsargaha) or Yoga Asana no benefit.
- **Exception:**
  
  When Problem is of ignorance. Example : Raju – Sarpa.
- Ignorance leads to palpitation, fall, problems.
- Rajju Jnanat, Rajju Agyana Nivritti, Rajju Adhyasa Nivritti, Baya Nivritti, Sukha Prapti, Dukha Nivritti.
- Kevala Jnana Matrena purusharta siddhi.
- In general, kevala Jnanam Natu Purusharta sadhanam.

**Exception situation:**

- Kevala Jnanam – mere knowledge without action gives benefit.
- Where problem caused by ignorance in that case only mere knowledge can solve problem.
- Yatra yatra agyanat dukha karyatvat dukham bavati, tatra tatra jnanat sukham bavati.

**Action Required:**

- Gangotri away from me – problem not caused by ignorance – Visit.
- Disease – problem not caused by ignorance take medicine.
- **Example**: Name list for train ticket
  
  G.V. Shastri missing. Vishwanathan Shastri in the list. Problem of ignorance eon listen.

- Another came without ticket – has to do action buy ticket.
- Exception situations where ignorance is problem - (Rope – Snake) Jnana matrena prayojanam.
- Siddha Bodhaka Vakyam – Pramanam, prayojanam, produce knowledge.
- Where no prayojanam, connect to Karya Bodhaka Vakyam.
- All vedanta vakyams come under exceptional case, give Prayojanam Jnana matrena moksha phalam bavati, purushartha siddhi.
Isavasya Upanishad:

When, to the knower, all beings have become one in his own Self (Atman), how shall he feel deluded thereafter? What grief can there be to him who sees oneness everywhere? [Verse 7]

- When person clearly knows Atma as mere substratum of everything after clear knowledge kaha shokaha, mohaha?
- No grief or delusion after jnanam.
- Samsara nivritti = Moksha praptihi.

2) Kena Upanishad:

Indeed, he attains immortality, who intuits It in and through every modification of the mind. Through the Atman he obtains real strength, and through Knowledge, immortality. [Chapter 2 – Verse 4]

- Through mere knowledge moksha.
3) Katho Upanishad:

(That) One (supreme) ruler, the soul of all beings, who makes His one form manifold... those wise men, who perceive Him as existing in their own Self, to them belongs eternal happiness, and to none else. [II – II – 12]

- One who clearly recognises brahman as atman is liberated.
- Not one who does karma + upasana.

4) Prasna Upanishad:

- Viduuhu amrtam vindate.... (At end) amrta bavati.
- One who knows, attains immorality.

5) Mundak Upanishad:

He who knows that Supreme Brahman becomes Brahman, and in his line (family), none who knows not the Brahman will ever be born. He crosses grief; crosses sin, and being free from the knots-of-the-heart, becomes immortal. [III – II – 9]

- One who knows Brahman becomes one with Brahman.
- Tarati shokam papmanam.
6) Mandukya Upanishad:

```
अमात्रात्सत्त्वतःन्यावहार्यः प्रपञ्चोपरमः शिवोद्वैत एवमोकारं
अत्यं सविशेषायत्मानस्तमानं एवं बेद ॥ १२ ॥
```

That which has no parts, the soundless, the incomprehensible, beyond all the sense, the cessation of all phenomena, all blissful and non-dual Aum, is the fourth, and verily it is the same as the Atman. He, who knows this, merges his self in the supreme self – the individual in the total. [Verse 12]

- Samvishith na atmana ya yam veda.
- Paratma eva shati – yaha yam veda.

7) Taittiriya Upanishad:

```
ॐ ब्रह्मविदात्मन्योति परम्। तेद्वाभूमक्ता ।
सत्यं ज्ञानमन्नतं ब्रह्म ।
यो बेद निहितं गुहायां परमे व्योमन् ।
सोऽजुन्ते सर्वानं कामान्त्यसह । ब्रह्मणा विपश्चितेति ॥
```

Om, the knower of Brahman attains the Supreme. With reference to that, is the following hymn recited: Brahman is the Truth, Knowledge and Infinity. He who knows It as existing in the cave of the heart in the transcendent akasa, realises all his desires along with omniscient Brahman. [II – I – 1]

- One who knows Brahman as atma in heart fulfills all purusharthas.
8) Aitareya Upanishad:

This is Brahman. This is Indra. This is creator Prajapati. This is again all the gods and these five great elements, namely, Earth, Wind, Space, Water, and fire, all the small creatures and the other seeds of creation, the egg-born, the womb-born, sweat-born, earth born, viz. trees etc., horses, cattle, men, elephants and all the breathing things that are here – the moving or flying or immovable – all these are guided by Consciousness and are supported by Consciousness. The Universe has Consciousness as its guide (eye). Consciousness is the basis of all; verily, Consciousness (Prajnanam) is Brahman. [III – 1 – 3]

• Pragyanam Brahman.

9) Chandogya Upanishad:

True, I have learnt much, but I know only the word meaning. I do not know the Self. Sir, I have heard from great persons like you that only those who know the Self are able to overcome sorrow. I am suffering from sorrow. Please take me across the ocean of sorrow’. Sanatkumara then said to narada, ‘Everything you have learnt so far is just words.’ [7 – 1 – 3]

• Knower of atma crosses all sorrow. No need of action.
10) Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

If a man knows the Self as “I am this,” then desiring what and for whose sake will he suffer in the wake of the body?

[IV – IV – 12]

- One who knows atma, what action, desire, suffering he has?

11) Kaivalya Upanishad:

Experiencing one’s own Self in all beings and all beings in the Self, one attains the Highest Brahman – and not by any other means. [Verse 10]

- By knowing brahman get amrutam.

12) Purusha sukhtam:

“From the Virat purusha’s navel emerged the “Inner-space” and from his head the “outer-space”, from his feet the “earth”, and from his ears the “quarters” manifested. Thus the worlds came into creation.” [Verse 15]

“I have realised that “First person”, resplendent like the Sun, ever-shining, beyond all “Darkness”, who, having created all forms and names, in his wisdom, exists as though functioning through them all”. [Verse 16]
13) Gita:

• All problems caused by ignorance. What you require is Jnanam. Sruti, smriti, itihasa, purana prakarana granta all prove.

• Siddha Bodhaka Vakyam – Sa Prayojanam – moksha praptihi – get purushartha.

2nd Argument:

• After vedanta use knowledge to do action.. Mere knowledge useless.

Baashta:

• To get benefit use knowledge into some karma (Ritual).

Prabhaakara:

• To get benefit use knowledge into some upasana in Jnana Khanda itself.

Shankara:

a) Jnanam need not be connected to vedanta as it is useful by itself.

b) Jnanam can’t be connected to karma khanda or upasana to maintain validity.

The Lord takes neither the demerit nor even the merit of any; knowledge is enveloped by ignorance, thereby beings are deluded. [Chapter 5 – Verse 15]

But to those whose ignorance is destroyed by the knowledge of the Self, like the sun, to them knowledge reveals the supreme (Brahman). [Chapter 5 – Verse 16]
Why it can’t be connected to Karma?

a) Vedanta jnanam eliminates duality which is basis for karma and upasana.

Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Why it can’t be connected to Karma?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a) Vedanta jnanam eliminates duality which is basis for karma and upasana.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>यथा हि ब्रैहम्यिक भवति तत्वित्त श्वर्तं जिवृति, तत्वित्त श्वर्तं पश्यति, तत्वित्त श्वर्तं श्रुतिः, तत्वित्त श्वर्तं मन्तवे, तत्वित्त श्वर्तं विज्ञानाति। यथा वा भवति सर्वं सत्तेदाधीनमार्थु तत्केन कं जिज्ञेव, तत्केन कं पश्येव, तत्केन कं श्रुत्यात, तत्केन कं मन्तवेत, तत्केन कं विज्ञानियात्। येनेवं सर्वं विज्ञानाति। सं केन विज्ञानीयात्। विज्ञातार्मेण केन विज्ञानीयात्रिति। II १४।</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Katho Upanishad &amp; Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>कथो उपनिषद्धो भवति सर्वं सत्तेदाधीनमार्थु, तत्केन कं जिज्ञेव, तत्केन कं पश्येव, तत्केन कं श्रुत्यात, तत्केन कं मन्तवेत, तत्केन कं विज्ञानीयात्। येनेवं सर्वं विज्ञानाति। सं केन विज्ञानीयात्। विज्ञातार्मेण केन विज्ञानीयात्रिति। II १४।</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Because when there is duality, as it were, then one smells something, one sees something, one hears something, one speaks something, one thinks something, one knows something. (but) when to the knower of Brahman everything has become the Self, then what should one smell and through what, what should one see and through what, what should one hear and through what, what should one speak and through what, what should one think and through what, what should one know and through what? Through what should one know that owing to which all this is known – through what, O Maitreyi, should one know the Knower? [II – IV – 14]

- Tena kam pashyeta?

By mind alone could this (Brahman) be obtained (realised); then there is no difference here at all. He, who sees any difference here, goes from death to death. [II – I – 11] & [IV – IV – 19]
Isavasya Upanishad:

When, to the knower, all beings have become one in his own Self (Atman), how shall he feel deluded thereafter? What grief can there be to him who sees oneness everywhere? [Verse 7]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Upasana Requires</th>
<th>Karma Requires</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Upasaka – Upasana bheda</td>
<td>Kartru, Karana Bheda</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Vedanta knocks all duality. Advaitam can’t be applied in field of dvaitam.

Example:

- I know eyes mei white like turmeric powder.
- I apply advaita jnanam in karma is contradiction.

b) Vedanta negates kartrutvam and varna ashrama status of person which are essential for karma.

- Karma requires 2 qualifications.

Aham:

- Karta – Brahmana, Kshatriya, Brihaspati samam yagam – only for Brahmana Raja suya yagam – only for Raja.

Ashrama Status:

- Brahmachari / Grihasta.. Na varna.
Dasakam:

I am neither castes nor the rules of caste, society and the stages of life, nor for me concentration, meditation, yoga and other practices, for all this illusion of "I" and "Mine" is rooted in the not-self (body, mind and organs) and is dispellable by the knowledge of self. I am that one, auspicious and pure, that alone remains. [Verse 2]

- Vedanta condemns upsana and karma as bandah.

Hetu: Reason

Mundak Upanishad:

Undependable (frail) is this boat of Yajna, is said to be manned by eighteen supporters on whom depend the lower cremonials. Those ignorant persons who acclaim this as the highest, are subject, again and again, to old age and death. [I – II – 7]

- Those who hold to karma to cross samsara, go to svarga and comeback.
- As per vedanta, person looses purusharta buddhi.
- Similarly upsana...
Kaivalyo Upanishad:

Not by deeds, nor by progeny, nor by wealth, but by renunciation alone have some people attained immortality.

That which the renunciates attain is beyond the heavens, yet it shines in the cave of the heart (the intellect).

[Verse 3]

The pure-minded seekers who through renunciation have firm understanding of the knowledge of the Upanisads, being the immortal and absolute, are all totally liberated in brahman at the time of death. [Verse 4]

Gita:

Abandoning all dharmas, (of the body, mind and intellect), take refuge in Me alone ; I will liberate thee, from all sins ; grieve not. [Chapter 18 – Verse 66]

- Vedanta jnanam contradictory to karma. Therefore can’t combine with karma.
- Siddha Bodhaka Vakyam – can’t be connected with Karya Bodhaka Vakyam.
3rd Argument:
- Brahma Nasti....

Shankara’s Argument:

a) To find out what is revealed by shastra, shad lingas prescribed by Purva mimamsakas used.
- Tattu samanvayat – proves Brahman revealed by shastras.
- Upakarama, upasamhara....
- Svarga also revealed by veda.
- Brahman also revealed by veda.
- Hence Brahma Asti.
- Vedanta Tatparya vishayatvat.

b) Brahman useful not as means or goal – end – Sadhana, Sadhyam.... But as Sadhaka – you.
- Different from goal + means. Means it is very Sadhana.
- If Brahman nonexistent, you are nonexistent Brahman existent as Atma Rupa.

4th Argument:
- What is ever evident as Aham, Shastra need not reveal Shastra should reveal what is not evident. It is well known as Adhyasta Jiva not understood as Paramatma.
- Ahamkara Rupaha Prasidda – Natu sakshi Rupena Prasidda.
- Tvam pada vachyartha rupena prasidda – Natu lakshyartha rupena prasidda.
- Shastra reveals jiva svarupam as paramatma svarupam.
- That Brahman is aham.
- It is sufficient to give moksha purushartha.
LECTURE 30

Introduction:

4th Sutra: Tat tu samanvayat

Tu:
- Signifies negation of all objections to Vedanta.
- Purva Mimamsa negation.

Purva Mimamsa:
- Vedanta should be connected to some Action / Ritual / Upasana. Vedanta should have Karma Sambanda.

Vedanti n:
- a) Vedanta does not require Karma Sambanda.
- b) Karma Sambanda not intended in scriptures.
- c) Karma Sambanda is impossible

a) Why karma sambanda not required?
- It gives Purusharta by itself.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Anubava Pramanam</th>
<th>Sruti Pramanam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Rajju Jnanam without action gives freedom from snake.</td>
<td>- Mere Jnanam enough for Moksha.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Similarly Brahman Jnanam gives Moksha from Samsara.</td>
<td>- 11 Upanishads + Gita + Purusha Suktam.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

b) Karma combination:
- Not included in scriptures. Vedanta criticises karma.
- Does not glorify karma.
Kaivalya Upanishad:

Not by deeds, nor by progeny, nor by wealth, but by renunciation alone have some people attained immortality. That which the renunciates attain is beyond the heavens, yet it shines in the cave of the heart (the intellect).

[Verse 3]

Mundak Upanishad:

Undependable (frail) is this boat of Yajna, is said to be manned by eighteen supporters on whom depend the lower ceremonials. Those ignorant persons who acclaim this as the highest, are subject, again and again, to old age and death. [I – II – 7]

c) Karma Sambanda impossible. Vedanta negates all conditions required for karma.

- Kartrutvam negated – Karta negated.
- Varna – Ashrama – negated.

Mundak Upanishad:

That which is invisible, ungrasppable, unoriginated and attributeless, that which has neither eyes not ears nor hands nor legs – that is Eternal, full of manifestations, All-pervading, Subtlesst of the subtle – that Imperishable Being is what the wise perceive as the Source of all Creation. [I – I – 6]
Subject, object, instrument, locus negated.

Katho Upanishad & Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

By mind alone could this (Brahman) be obtained (realised) ; then there is no difference here at all. He, who sees any difference here, goes from death to death. [II – I – 11] & [IV – IV – 19]

- Subject, object, instrument, locus negated.

2nd Condition:
- Brahman is nonexistent, useless.
- Brahman neither means / end.
- Brahman different from Sadhana / Sadhyam, means or end.

Answer:
- There is 3rd thing: “Sadaka” Never search for 3rd entity or Brahman.
- Sadhaka = Brahman.
- By negating Sadhana + Sadhyam, Upanishad says Neti Neti Vakyana.
- Sadhana / Sadya Vytiriktena, Sidda Rupena Sadakam, Tat Tvam Asi iti Bodhayate.
To say I am nonexistent is contradiction. I must be existent to say.

No one can negate existence of Brahman.

Brahman is useful.

When I know I am Brahman.

‘On what do the body and the heart rest?’ ‘On the Prana.’ ‘On what does the Prana rest?’ ‘On the Apana.’ ‘On what does the Apana rest?’ ‘On the Vyana.’ ‘On what does the Vyana rest’ ‘On the Udana.’ ‘On what does the Udana rest’ ‘On the Samana.’ ‘On what does Samana Rest’. ‘On the self.’ This self is That which has been described as ‘Not this, not this.’ It is imperceptible, for it is never perceived; undecaying, for It never decays ; unattached, for It is never a attached; unfettered – It never feels pain, and never suffers injury. ‘These are the eight abodes, the eight instruments of vision, the eight deities and the eight beings. I ask you of that Being who is to be known only from the Upanishads, who definitely projects those beings and withdraws them into Himself, and who is at the same time transcendent. If you cannot clearly tell me of Him, your head shall fall off.’ Sakalya did not know Him; his head fell off; and robbers snatched away his bones, mistaking them for something else. [III – IX – 26]
• Brahma Jnanam negates my Jivatva status. Negates my Abrahmatva status = Jivatvam.
• Moksha = Jiva Bava Nivritti, Purusharta.
• Brahma Atma Rupena Asti.

3rd Contention:
• If Brahman is Atma, it should be self evident, why Vedanta should reveal?
• Balya Dishu, Jagrat, Svapna, Sushupti – Sarva Vyasvastu Api.
• Aham aham iti sarvada Prasidatvat pramanatvat.
• Why Vedanta should reveal if Brahman is self evident?
• Pramanam should reveal what is not known.
• Atma evident but not fully known.
• Samanya Jnanena vartate visesha jnanam nasti.
• I know I am.
• I know I am existent.
• I know my sat ; Chit Svabava / Rupam.
• I don’t know my Ananda Svarupam – hence Adhyasa comes.
• Any superimposition requires Samanya Jnanam, that there is something. Visesha Jnanam not known.
Vedanta required to give Visesha Jnanam not Samanya Jnanam.

3 Main contentions answered.

4th Argument:

Contention against Purva Mimamsa.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Visesha Jnanam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- There is something</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- There is Rope not known – Visesha</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Samanya Jnanam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- There is Sat / Chit.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- It is Ananda and Anantha – eternal not known (Visesha not known)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- There is Samanya Jnanam – Aham Asmi known.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Aham Brahma Asmi – Visesha Jnanam not known.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- I know myself as Ahamkara, I don’t know myself as Sakshi.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Tvam Pada Vachyartha known, Lakshyarthath known.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Karma Khanda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Karma Khanda</th>
<th>Jnana Khanda</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Svata Pramanam</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Useful – valid</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Flower</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Apramanam</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Has to be validated by joining Karma Khanda.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Naru / string to be kept on head.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Nobody keeps mere string, always with flowers of Karma Khanda.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Then Naru gets status.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- No independent validity.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Holds tail of Karma Khanda to get validity.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Defensive argument 1 – 2 – 3.

**Jnana Khanda**

- Alone Pramanam

**Karma Khanda**

- Push down status to Apramanam.
- Gets Validity if it joins Jnana Khanda.

---

**How to prove Jnana Khanda is Pramanam?**

**Definition:**

- Anaadigata Abadita saprayojanam.
- Artha Bodhakam Pramanam.

---

**Pramanam**

- **Anadigatam**
  - Reveals something new
  - Vedanta reveals - Aham Brahma Asmi

- **Abaditam**
  - Not negated, contradicted by other Pramanam.
  - Never negated by any other Pramanam.

- **Sa Prayojana**
  - Useful
  - Jiva bava goes
  - Bramha bava comes = Moksha.

---

**Jnana Khanda – Fullfils 3 conditions:**

- **(1) Reveals**
  - Punya Papam, Svarga loka, which is not seen.

- **(2) Abaditam**
  - Should not be negated by other Pramanam.

- **(3) Sa Prayojana**
  - Gives Dharma Artha, Kama, Purusharthas.

---

**Karma Khanda negated by Jnana Khanda of Veda**

---

259
• Jnana Khanda Baditvat.

• Karma Khanda reveals duality – Karta, Karanam, Phalam – Sampradhanam – Plurality.

Jnana Khanda: Katho Upanishad & Brihadaranyaka Upanishad

By mind alone could this (Brahman) be obtained (realised) ; then there is no difference here at all. He, who sees any difference here, goes from death to death. [II – I – 11] & [IV – IV – 19]

• No plurality at all.

• What you call as plurality is Brahman.

Mundak Upanishad:

Verily, all this is the Immortal Brahman. He is everywhere – above, below, in front, at the back, on the right, on the left. All this world is indeed the Supreme Brahman. [II – II – 11]

• What about duality?

Where there is duality, seeming plurality exists. Then alone person sees plurality everywhere.
Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

Because when there is duality, as it were, then one smells something, one sees something, one hears something, one speaks something, one thinks something, one knows something. (but) when to the knower of Brahman everything has become the Self, then what should one smell and through what, what should one see and through what, what should one hear and through what, what should one speak and through what, what should one think and through what, what should one know and through what? Through what should one know that owing to which all this is known – through what, O Maitreyi, should one know the Knower? [II – IV – 14]

- When person remembers atma clearly – where is question of duality.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ajnana Kale</th>
<th>Jnana Kale</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Dvaitam</td>
<td>- Advaitam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Whatever obtains in Ajnana kale is invalid.</td>
<td>- Jnana Kale Rajju seen.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Snake seen in Agyana kale.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- At time of ignorance, we say here is a snake / jiva.</td>
<td>- There is Rope / Brahman.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Sarpa is Mithya.</td>
<td>- Jiva / Jagat / Ishvara is Mithya.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Karma Khanda reveals Duality which obtains at time of ignorance. Hence invalid.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Karma Khanda – Apramanam.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Anyaha asou aham iti – doesn’t know.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Saha devanam pashu.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Now Karma Khanda</th>
<th>Jnana Khanda</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Naru</td>
<td>- Flower</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Karma has to be associated with Jnana Khanda.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Apramanam but useful to get Sadhana</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chatushtaya Sampatti.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Karma Khanda – means to Jnana Khanda.
- Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti – Pradhanena – Karma Khanda useful to give Sadhana Chatushtaya Sampatti.
- Karma Khanda – not for Dharma / Artha / Kama Purushartha… these are all exalted Samsara. Politicians – A class prison.
- We tempt others by saying it is Purushartha.
- Karma Khanda + Upasana Khanda for only Vairagya Siddhi.
- Get kicks in life for Vairagyam alone. Svarga + Grihasta… people immature…
- Laxative with sugar candy.. Take it like chocolate.. Dharma Artha Kama – get Purusharta status – purges inside… child / husband wonderful…
- Ata = Karma Khanda Dwara.
- What is Pramana for proving Karma Khanda is stepping stone for Jnana Khanda?

**Mundak Upanishad:**

> परीक्ष्य लोकान् कर्मचिताम् ब्राह्मणो निर्वेदमायामान्स्वयं कृतेन।
> तद्विज्ञानार्थ स गुरुमेवाभिभिगच्छति समित्यापि श्रोतियिं ब्रह्मनिष्ठम् ॥ २॥

> Pariksysa lokan karma-citan brahmano nirvedam-ayan-nasty-akrtah krtena,
> tad-vijnan-artham sa guru-mevabhi-gacchet samit-panih srotriyaam brahma-nistham ॥ १२॥

Let a brahmana (an aspirant), after he has examined the worlds gained by Karma, acquire freedom from all desires, reflecting that nothing that is eternal can be gained by Karma. Let him, in order to obtain the knowledge of the eternal, take sacrificial fuel (Samit) in his hands and approach that preceptor alone who is well-versed in the Veda-s and is established in Brahman. [I – II – 12]
Having experienced, benefit of Karma + Upasana, upto Brahman Loka, by Pratyaksha, Anumana Upamana, Agama Pramana, realise that everything other than Moksha = Samsara – all to get Vairagyam.

• Increase dosage of Karma Khanda...

Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

That great, birthless Self which is identified with the intellect and is in the midst of the organs, lies in the ether that is within the heart. It is the controller of all, the lord of all, the ruler of all. It does not grow better through good work nor worse through bad work. It is the lord of all beings, It is the protector of all beings. It is the bank that serves as the boundary to keep the different worlds apart. The Brahmans seek to know It through the study of the Vedas, sacrifices, charity, and austerity consisting in a dispassionate enjoyment of sense-objects. Knowing It alone, one becomes a sage. Desiring this world (the Self) alone, monks renounce their homes. This is (the reason for it); The ancient sages, it is said, did not desire children (thinking), What shall we achieve through children, we who have attained this Self, this world (result). They, it is said, renounced their desire for sons, for wealth and for the worlds, and lived a mendicant’s life. That which is the desire for sons is the desire for wealth, and that which is the desire for wealth is the desire for worlds, for both these are but desires. This self is That which has been described as ‘Not this, not this.’ It is imperceptible, for It is never perceived; undecaying, for It never decays; unattached, for It is never attached; unfettered – It never feels pain, and never suffers injury. (It is but proper) that the sage is never overtaken by these two thoughts. I did an evil act for this, I did a good act for this. He conquers both of them. Things done or not done do not trouble him. [IV – IV – 22]
• Yajna = Karma.
• Tapas = Upasana.
• All Karmas + Upasanas meant for Vividisa Siddhartham.
• To create interest in Vedanta. Which is directly proportional to Vairagyam towards Samsara.
• With disease – goto temple + take Medicine

↓

When it doesn’t work intensity in prayer increases = Teevra Jingyasa.

• Rituals validated with Jnana Khanda.
• Jnana Khanda impossible without Karma Khanda + Upasana Khanda.
• Karma Khanda incomplete without Jnana Khanda.
• Puja, Tapas required.
• Ritualist will easily understand Vedanta.
• Purva Mimamsa Kandanam over – Prabakara + Bashta – Matams over.

Gita:

श्रेयान्तः ज्ञेयवावज्जाज्ञानयज्ञः परन्तप।
सवं कर्मांक्षिलं पार्थ जाने परिसमाप्यते॥ ४.३३॥

Superior is knowledge – sacrifice to sacrifice with objects, O Parantapa. All actions in their entirety, O Partha, culminate in Knowledge. [Chapter 4 – Verse 33]
Next:

- Vyakyanam and Bashyam – elaborate commentaries.
- Shankara – not 1st commentator.
- General names – Deva Datta, Yagya Datta, Vishnu Datta.
- Jnana Karma Samuchhaya vadi – very famous during Shankara’s time.
- Heavily discussed in Gita Bashyam Jnanam + Karma should be combined to get Moksha.
Different from Vedantin:

- Mere Brahman Jnanam can’t give Moksha.
- After Jnanam, Brahman Upasanam required for Moksha.
- Vedanta reveals Brahman and asks you to do Upasanam.
- From Upasanam, get Punyam and with Punyam get Moksha.

Quotes: Mimamsa Sutra of Jaimini:

The veda being for the sacrifice, the portion which is not for the sacrifice is useless therefore it can not be said to be eternal. [I – 2 – 1]

In Vedanta:

- No ritual, no Devata Upasana.

Vrittikara:

- Do Brahma upasana, then useful.
Through upasana of Brahman get moksha. What about upasana vakyam.

Atmavid shokam carati – knower of Brahman crosses over all sorrows.

Brahma veda brahmaiva bavati – by mere knowledge one becomes one with Brahman.

Every word indicating Jnanam has meaning of Upasana.

Taittiriya Upanishad: Siksha Valli

These are called ‘the great blendings’ he who understands them as expounded here, becomes united with progreny, cattle, food and the like and with the glory of the holy luster, wealth and heavenly joys. [I – III – 7]
The supreme resides in speech as ‘well-being’; in prana and apana as acquirer and preserver; in the hands as action, in the legs as movement, in the anus as the activity of excretion. Thus, is the meditation of Brahman in respect of man. [III – X – 2]

Om, the knower of Brahman attains the Supreme. With reference to that, is the following hymn recited: Brahman is the Truth, Knowledge and Infinity. He who knows It as existing in the cave of the heart in the transcendent akasa, realises all his desires along with omniscient Brahman. [II – I – 1]

- Atma upasakah shokam carati.

Vrittikara:
- Wherever Jnanam comes translate as upasanam.
- Take veda as upasanam.
**Isavashya Upanishad:**

When, to the knower, all beings have become one in his own Self (Atman), how shall he feel deluded thereafter? What grief can there be to him who sees oneness everywhere? [Verse 7]

- Vijanataha taken as upasaka.

**Mundak Upanishad:**

He who knows that Supreme Brahman becomes Brahman, and in his line (family), none who knows not the Brahman will ever be born. He crosses grief; crosses sin, and being free from the knots-of-the-heart, becomes immortal. [III – II – 9]

- Brahmaupasate Braheiva bavati. (Not Brahma Jnani)
- Brahma vitu aapnoti param. Not brahma jnani but brahma upasate aapnoti param.
- Atma vit shokam tarati
- Atma upasate shokam tarati.
Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

If a man knows the Self as “I am this,’ then desiring what and for whose sake will he suffer in the wake of the body? [IV – IV – 12]

- Take all 10 quotations and substitute Jnani by Upasaka.
- Upasana Dwara punya phalam. Punya phalam dvara moksha.

Advaitin:

- Exceptional problem of ignorance.

Purva Pakshi – Vrittikara:

- Brahma Jnanam does not come under exception.
- Brahman Jnanam comes under regular rule only.
- Sees vedantins with all upanishads by heart – not Mukta.
- Vedantins cryingly say Avasta traya sakshi.
- Brahman jnanam does not transform. All vedantin samsari – same as before.
- Vedantin educated samsari.
He said: “It is not for the sake of the husband, my dear, that he is loved, but for one’s own sake that he loved. It is not for the sake of the wife, my dear, that she is loved, but for one’s own sake that she is loved. It is not for the sake of the sons, my dear, that they are loved, but for one’s own sake that they are loved. It is not for the sake of wealth, my dear, that it is loved, but for one’s own sake that it is loved. It is not for the sake of the Brahmana, my dear, that he is loved, but for one’s own sake that he is loved. It is not for the sake of the Ksatriya, my dear, that he is loved, but for one’s own sake that he is loved. It is not for the sake of worlds, my dear, that they are loved, but for one’s own sake that they are loved. It is not for the sake of the gods, my dear, that they are loved, but for one’s own sake that they are loved. It is not for the sake of beings, my dear, that they are loved, but for one’s own sake that they are loved. It is not for the sake of all, my dear, that all is loved, but for one’s own sake that it is loved. The Self, my dear Maitreyi, should be realised—should be heard of, reflected on and meditated upon. By the realisation of the Self, my dear, through hearing, reflection and meditation, all this is known. [IV – V - 6]"
• Atma should be understood through Sravanam and Mananam. If these 2 enough – why Ninidhyasanam?
• Ninidhyasanam = Repeated dwelling = Upasana Dhyayati.
• Tavya = Compulsory action suffix indicates – action.

Purva Mimamsa didn’t accept:

\[
\begin{align*}
& \text{Brahma Jnanam} \\
\downarrow \\
& \text{Brahma Upasana}
\end{align*}
\]

Shankara:
• Takes nature of moksha from different angles.
• Mandukya criticises – upasana for moksha not for chitta ekagrata.
• Upasakas glorified – stomach ache / head ache gone. Got married.
• Upasana as means for moksha which comes after Jnanam criticised not totally
• Glorify upasana before Jnanam as means of mental refinement. Position important – for what.
• Here Vritikara criticised.
• Upasana as means for moksha.

Gita:

For him there is no interest whatever in what is done, or what is not done; nor does he depend upon any being for any object. [Chapter 3 – Verse 18]

For, verily (the true nature) of right action should be known; also (that) of forbidden (or unlawful) action and of inaction; imponderable is the nature (path) of action. [Chapter 4 – Verse 18]
Gita:

The Blessed Lord said: You have grieved for those that should not be grieved for; yet, you speak words of wisdom. The wise grieve neither for the living nor for the dead. [Chapter 2 – Verse 11]

Of one who is devoid of attachment, who is liberated, whose mind is established in knowledge, who acts for the sake of sacrifice, all his actions are dissolved. [Chapter 4 – Verse 23]


Definition of Moksha:

• Moksha = Freedom from sharira sambanda.
• “Asariratah moksah”
  Sarirataha Samsara.

Chandogya Upanishad:

Indra, this body is mortal. It has been captured by death. Yet it is the base of the Self, which is immortal and formless. One who has a body is subject to both happiness and unhappiness. In fact, there is no end to happiness and unhappiness so long as one has a body. But when person is free from the body, nothing good or bad can touch him. [8 – 12 – 1]
• As long as Sarira Sambanda is there, Sukha Dukha opposites can’t be avoided.
• Priya – Apriya will come and go.
• Priya Apriya gamanam agamanam = Samsara.
• When all priya comes... worry... about drishti...
• Moksha = Asariratah – Moksha.
• Karma + Upasana both actions.
• Kayikam + Manasam karma.
• Action means gradation, taratamyam, quantitative + qualitative gradation, both are there.
• 5% / 25% / 100% mind involved in any karma? Varieties of punyam will be there and varieties of bodies it can generate.
• Guruvayur elephant. Dog of cinema actress. Indra sariram – Prajapati sariram.
• Karma = Punaym = Sa sariratvam = Samsarah. Cycle of papa – punyam.
• Moksa – not going to some loka. Where god is residing – Kailasa / Vaikunta.
• Upasana phalam = Sa Sariratvam.

Taittiriya Upanishad:

The following is the enquiry concerning the Bliss (Brahmananda rasa). Suppose there be a youth, good, well versed in the scriptures, well disciplined, resolute and very strong; to him belongs all this earth full of wealth. This is one unit of human bliss. This (unit of Bliss) of man multiplied hundredfold is the bliss of human gandharvas – and this is also the bliss of one well versed in the Vedas and who is free from desires. [II – VIII – 2]
• Indra = Maximum Ananda.
• Brahaspati – More Ananda.
• Prajapati – More Ananda.
• Moksa = Asariratvam.
• Jnanamatrena Moksa – Natu Karamana

Purva Pakshi:

• Why can’t you say:
  Brahma Upasanam give asiraratvam.
LECTURE 32

Introduction:

- Tu: Tattu tu samanvayat.
- Shankara negates Purva Pakshi – Praabakara + Bashta mata nirakaranam.

Vartikara:

- Brahma upasana gives moksha... not brahma jnanam.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vartikara</th>
<th>Purva Mimamsa</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Accepts Brahman</td>
<td>- Does not accept existence of Brahman.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Brahman revealed by shastram by special punyam. (Adrishtam). Which is called Moksha.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Biggest portion of Samanvaya sutri is Nirakaranam of Vritikara.

Shankara: First Argument

- Brahma Upasana mokshaha na bavati.
- Any Upasana can’t give Moksha Phalam or Brahma Jnanam.

Definition of Moksha: Chandogya Upanishad

- Ashariratvam is Moksha
  Shariratvam is Samsara.
- Sharira bava sambandaha = Samsara.
- Sharira sambanda abava = Moksha.
- Moksha of Ashariratvam can’t be given by any upasana.
- Karma + Upasana can bring only gradation in obtaining better shariram in future births and retain status of sa-shariratvam.
Taittiriya Upanishad:

The following is the enquiry concerning the Bliss (Brahmananda rasa). Suppose there be a youth, good, well versed in the scriptures, well disciplined, resolute and very strong; to him belongs all this earth full of wealth. This is one unit of human bliss. This (unit of Bliss) of man multiplied hundredfold is the bliss of human gandharvas – and this is also the bliss of one well versed in the Vedas and who is free from desires. [II – VIII – 2]

- Good karmas give good body.
- Brahmajis status – better shariram.

Vrittikaras Question:
- Brahma upasana potent to get phalam of ashariratvam – no better shariram.

Shankara:
- Ashariratvam only result of Jnanam not Karma / Upasana.
- Intrinsic nature of a thing is always there – Nitya Siddham – Svarupam.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fire</th>
<th>Ice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Nitya Ushnaha eternally hot</td>
<td>- Eternally cold</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Nature = Nitya Siddatvam.
- Upasana + Karma phalam = Not available now.
- But later – not siddha phalam – Sadhyam.
Siddham and sadhyam can’t be equated.

**Why Ashariram is Svarupa of all Jivas?**

**a) Katho Upanishad :**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Asariratvam</th>
<th>Upasana</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| - Nitya siddham
- Why? Svarupam | - Sadhyam |

- Asariram sariresu anavasthesva-vasthitam,
- Mahantam vibhum atmanam matva dhiro na socati ॥ २२ ॥

The wise man, who knows the Atman as bodiless, seated firmly in perishable bodies, great and all-pervading, does never grieve. [I – II – 22]

**b) Mundak Upanishad :**

| Divyo hyamurtah purusah sabahya-bhyantaro hyajah,
aprano hyamanah subhro hy-aksarat paratah parah ॥ २ ॥ |

Self-resplendent, formless, unoriginated and pure, that all-pervading Being is both within and without, Anterior both to life and mind, He transcends even the transcendent, unmanifested, causal-state of the universe. [II – I – 2]

- Amurtah means Sthula Sharira Rahitaha.
- Aprana, Amanaha means Sukshma Sharira Rahitaha.
- Subra means Karana Sharira Rahitaha.
- Sharira traya varjitaha.
c) Mundak Upanishad:

That which is invisible, ungraspable, unoriginated and attributeless, that which has neither eyes nor ears nor hands nor legs – that is Eternal, full of manifestations, All-pervading, Subtlest of the subtle – that Imperishable Being is what the wise perceive as the Source of all Creation. [I – I – 6]

- No hands / legs....

d) Isavasya Upanishad:

8. He, the Atman, is all-pervading, bright, bodiless, scatheless, without muscles, pure, unpierced by evils, wise, omniscient, transcendent and self-existing. He alone allotted their respective functions (duties) to the various eternal years (Creators). [Verse 8]

- Akayam = Asariram.
- Asariram is not a goal to be accomplished but a fact to be recognised.
- Not a Phalam, Sadhyam, not a result in time. It is Nitya Sidda Svarupah.
- Moksha not result of Upasana, Siddhatvat – Chaitanyavatu.
Aside topic – Purva Pakshi:

- Advaitin can never define Moksha as Asariratvam – why?
- If so, he can’t accept Jeevan mukti.
- In Jeevan mukti, he is sa-sharira or Asariraha – Jeeva means alive, transacting, 1st qualification – should die to get Jeevan mukti.

Shankara:

- Jeevan mukta is Ashariraha. Others think he is sa-shariraha. Others problem, not Jnanis problem.
- Asariratvam is my svarupam.
- I am always, eternally Ashariram. Nitya – Asarirah means Sarira Sambandha Varjitaha.

Why Atma Asariram?

3 Reasons:

a) Svarupatvat: Nature

Pramanam: Atmabodha

摆慕徃gw白w shoppers m賅w 1
摆慕徃gw白w 障w 赀w 碩w i 赀w 賅w w 賅w 1 331
Amanastwaat Na me Dukha Raaga Dwesha Bhayaadayah I
Apraano Hi Amanaassubhra Ityaadi Sruti saasanaat II 33 II

"I am not Manas and hence I am not having sorrow, attachment, malice and fear". The commandment of the upanishads is that Atma is without breath and without mind and is pure. The atma does not have any features of the mind (manas). Manas only experiences happiness and sorrow. When we are in deep sleep, we are not experiencing any of the features of Manas. But Atma exists ever in deep sleep. Hence Atma is not Manas (mind). [Verse 33]
b) Asangatvat : Kaivalya Upanishad

I am without hands and legs, of incomprehensible power. I see without eyes, hear without ears. Devoid of all forms, I am knowing (everything) and there is none that knows me. I am ever Pure-Knowledge. [Verse 21]

c) Brihadaranyaka Upanishad :

After enjoying himself and roaming, and merely seeing (the results of) good and evil (in dream), he (stays) in a state of profound sleep, and comes back in the inverse order to his former condition, the dream state. He is untouched by whatever he sees in that state, for this infinite being is unattached. ‘It is just so, Yajnavalkya. I give you a thousand (cows), sir. Please instruct me further about liberation itself.’ [IV – III – 15]

- No relationship.
- Like Akasha.
Akasha
- Along with every object
- No sambanda

Fire
- Akasha is there where fire is.

- Akasha has no relationship – Sambandah.
- Akasha is not connected to any object.
- Akasha with fire, body, mike, table, tree... no sambanda.

Gita:

अच्छोद्रो यमदाहो यमक्ले शोषणे एव च।
नित्यं सर्वगतं: स्थापनच्चो जयं सनातन:॥ २.२४॥

This Self cannot be cut, nor burnt, nor moistened, nor dried up. It is eternal, all pervading, stable, immovable and ancient. [Chapter 2 – Verse 24]

- Fire can’t burn atma... because atma is not related to anything.

3 Arguments

Svarupatvat Nityam Asarirah

Asangatvat Nityam Asarirah

Nitya Akartrutvat

Nitya Akartrutvat:
- Sarira Sambandah comes as a result of Karma Phalam.
- Karma Phalam comes for a Karta.
- Karta only to do Karma.
- Atma being Nitya Akarta, where is question of doing Karma.
Purva Pakshi – question:

- If Atmanah Asariratvam is Nitya Siddham, where is question of Atmanah Sa-sariratvam?
- How you say:
  Sasariram – Samsarah.
  Asariram – Moksha.

Shankara:

- Atma cannot become Sa-sarirah.
- Atma mistaken as Sa-sarirah.
- What can go wrong – will go wrong.
- Sa-sariram is error, mistake, Adhyasa Siddham – Ajnana Siddham.
- How you get. A Sariratvam?
- Not by dying, but know the fact, Aham Atma – ever free from Sarira Sambandha.
- Waker is not connected to dream events.
- Jnani + Ajnani both Asariraha.
- Ajnani thinks he is Sa-sarirah.

Brihadaranyaka Upanisahd:

- “tad yatā ahinilvayānI vaṇī ke mṛtā pratyaktā śayita, evam eva idam śaṁrāgaṁ ete akāyaṁ aśaṁrāh bhavati”.
- Snake has no Abhimanam for the skin it has discarded.
- Body + Karma are related by Prarabda and hence Sukham – Dukham.

Gita:

- He, whose mind is not shaken up by adversity, and who, in prosperity does not hanker after pleasures, who is free from attachment, fear and anger is called a Sage of steady wisdom. [Chapter 2 – Verse 56]
2nd Argument:
- Moksha – not upasana phalam.

Definition of Moksha:
- Brahma bavah hi moksha.

Gita:

The enjoyments that are born of contacts are only generators of pain, for they have a beginning and an end. O son of Kunti, the wise do not rejoice in them. [Chapter 5 – Verse 22]

- To get out of mortality, all talk about Moksha.
- In all philosophies – Moksha is Nityah.

Tattwa Bodha:

- Nitya vastu ekam brahma tat vyatiriktam sarvam anityam ayam eva nitya anitya vastu viveka I viraga kah?
- Brahman of Upanishads = Ishvara of Puranas.
- Brahma Praptih = Ishvara Prapti.
- He has joined Bagawan Vishnu means they equate Moksha and Bagawan.
- From scriptures we know that there is one Nitya Vastu – Brahman.
What is Moksha?

- Brahma Prapti – is Moksha.

a) Brahman can’t be reached – “Aapti”.

- Brahman is Sarvagataha.
- All pervasiveness and travel by Shukla Gathi are contradictions.

b) Utpatti:

- By karma can produce Punyam and better Sariram.
- Nitya Siddhatvat – When will we attain Moksha?
- Kannu mai is white like turmeric powder.

c) Vikarah:

- Brahman not result of modification. Jivatma does not grow and grow like Anjaneyar.
- Brahman not end product of any process.
- Brahman Avikaratvat.
Gita:

This (Self) is said to be unmanifest, unthinkable and unchangeable, therefore, knowing this to be such, you should not grieve. [Chapter 2 – Verse 25]

d) Samskarah:

- Jiva by removing impurities does not become Paramatma.
- Brahma Nitya Siddatvat.

Mundak Upanishad:

Self-resplendent, formless, unoriginated and pure, that all-pervading Being is both within and without, Anterior both to life and mind, He transcends even the transcendent, unmanifested, causal-state of the universe. [II – I – 2]

Atma Bodha:

"I am not Manas and hence I am not having sorrow, attachment, malice and fear". The commandment of the upanishads is that Atma is without breath and without mind and is pure. The atma does not have any features of the mind (manas). Manas only experiences happiness and sorrow. When we are in deep sleep, we are not experiencing any of the features of Manas. But Atma exists ever in deep sleep. Hence Atma is not Manas (mind). [Verse 33]
Isavasya Upanishad:

8. He, the Atman, is all-pervading, bright, bodiless, scatheless, without muscles, pure, unpierced by evils, wise, omniscient, transcendent and self-existing. He alone allotted their respective functions (duties) to the various eternal years (Creators). [Verse 8]

- Brahman = Chatur vidha phala vilaksanah.
- Moksa – different from Karma and Upasana Phalam.
Fire can’t burn atma because Atma is not related to anything. Atma Nitya Asanga.

3rd Argument:

- Shariram = Punya Phalam.
- Punyam = Karma Phalam.
  
  Karta’s Phalam.


Purva Pakshi – Question:

- Shariram never comes – why you say:

  Sa Shariram = Samsara.
LECTURE 33

Introduction:
- TU – Nisheda = Negation of other Darshanams.
- Moksha intrinsic nature.
- Siddasya Svarupasya Upasana Sadhyatvam Nasti.
- Brahma Bavahi moksha.
- Upasana phalasm – Aapthi, Utpatti, Vikara, Samskara.
- Brahma – Na Aapti Vishaya – Sarvagatvat.
- Brahma – Na Utpatti Vishaya – Nitya Siddhatvat.
- Brahma – Na Vikara Vishaya – Avikaryatvat.
- Brahma – Na Samskara Vishaya – Nitya Shuddhatvat.
- Brahma = Chatur Vidha Phala Vilakshanam.
- Brahma = Moksha – hence Brahma – not upasana.
- Phalam = 1st Argument.

2nd Argument:
- Abyupethya vada.
- Suppose you say moksha is upasana phalam.
- What will be nature of Moksha?
- Moksha will have start date + end date.
- Before Upasana – No Moksha.
- Punyam generated, Moksha comes.
- Punyam gone, Moksha gone.
Gita:

Indeed, certain is death for the born, and certain is birth for the dead; therefore, over the inevitable, you should not grieve. [Chapter 2 – Verse 27]

- Moksha – becomes Anityam.

Mandukya Upanishad:

Anade-rantavat-tvam ca samsarasya na setsyati I
anantata ca-'dimato moksasya na bhavisyati II 30 II

If the world is admitted to be beginningless – as the disputants insist – then it cannot be non-eternal. Moksa or liberation cannot have a beginning and be eternal, too. [IV – K – 30]

- All philosophers agree – Moksha has to be Nitya.

Purpose of Moksha:

- Get out of samsara, mortality, anityatvam.

Chandogya Upanishad:

Tadyatho karmajito lokah ksiyata evamevamutra punyajito lokah:
ksiyate tadya ihatmanamanuvidy varjantyetamsca satyan kamamtesam
sarvesu lokesvaka macaro bhavatyatha ya ihatmanamanuvidy vrajantyetamsca
satyankamamtesam sarvesu lokesu kamacaro bhavati 6 I

Everything perishes, whether it is something you have acquired through hard work in this world or it is a place in the other world which you have acquired through meritorious deeds. Those who leave this world without knowing the Self and the truths which they should know are not free, no matter where they go. But those who leave this world after knowing the Self and the Truths which they should know are free, no matter where they are. [8 – 2 – 1]
• Whatever is acquired through Karma is destroyed here and whatever is acquired through punya in the other loka is also Anityam.

• You say, Upasana provides Punya Phalam, and Punyam produces Nitya Moksha.

• Phalam = Fruit – gets rotten and destroyed in time.

3rd Argument:

• Upasana can’t be there in Vedanta – only in Veda Purva.

a) Mimamsa Samanvaya shows through shad Lingas – Upasana not Tatparyam.

• Vedanta talks about owning up Moksha here and now.

• Not accomplishing in future. Mahavakyam central part of Vedanta says “Tat Tvam Asi” – present tense – Moksha in present – Nitya Mukta not Nitya Baddah.

Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

• By Putra – get Manushya Loka.

• By Karma – Pitru Loka / SVARGA.

• By Upasana – Brahma Loka / Deva Loka.

• Sanyasi doesn’t want Putra, Karma, Upasana, seeks Moksha.

• Indicates Moksha not Upasana Phalam.
Technical discussion:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Veda</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Purva</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karma Khanda + Upasana Khanda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Atato Dharma Jingyasa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Karma produces Dharma or Punyam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- If Moksha is Upasana Phalam, it should have been included in Veda Purva.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jnana Khanda</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Vyasa:
- Atato Brahma Jingyasa.
- Vedanta does not deal with Dharma.

Katho Upanishad:
- *Anyatra dharma...* [1 – 2 – 14]
- Vedanta has no Dharma, Adharma.

Katho Upanishad:

Naciketas said: “That which thou seest as other than virtue and vice – as right and ‘unright’, as other than cause and effect, as other than the past and future – tell me that.” [I – II – 14]
Mundak Upanishad:

When the seer realizes the self-effulgent Supreme Being – rule, maker and source of the Creator even – then that wise one, shaking off all deeds of merits and demerits, becomes stainless, and attains the Supreme state of Equipoise. [III – I – 3]

Gita:

Abandoning all dharmas, (of the body, mind and intellect), take refuge in Me alone; I will liberate thee, from all sins; grieve not. [Chapter 18 – Verse 66]

3rd Argument:

• Upasana not central teaching of vedanta.

4th Argument:

• Brahma Upasana not possible.
• Brahma is you and you yourself are Brahma.
• You – Brahma can never be objectified.
• It is svarupa, intrinsic nature of upasaka.
• Kartru karma virodhat.
• Drig eva Na Drishyate
Gita:

ॐ गीताय यशस्वीः

The Blessed Lord said: Many births of Mine have passed as well as yours, O Arjuna; I know them all but you know them not, O Parantapa (Scorcher of foes). [Chapter 4 – Verse 5]

Upanishads:

Kena Upanishad:

Yacchrotrena na srnoti yena srotram-idam srutam tadeva Brahma tvam viddhi nedam yadidam-upasate

What cannot be heard by the ear, but by which the ears are able to hear... know That as Brahman and not this, which people here do worship. [Chapter 1 – Verse 7]

Kena Upanishad: Chapter 1 – Verse 9

- Atma meditator is Brahman meditated Anatma not Brahman.

4th Argument:

- Brahmanaha Avisayatvat, Aprameyatvat Avijneyatvat Brahma Upasanam na Sambavati.

Purva Pakshi:

- If Brahman upasana not possible, Brahma Jnanam also not possible.

Kena Upanishad:

Yad vaca'nahyuyditaṁ yena vagabhyudyate
Tadeva Brahma tvam viddhi nedam yad-idam-upasate

What speech cannot reveal, but what reveals speech, know That alone as Brahman and not this, that people worship here. [Chapter 1 – Verse 4]
Kena Upanishad:

- Brahman not object of knowledge. Brahma Jnanam not possible.
- Sastra Yonitvat / Sastra is Pramanam will be in trouble.

Shankara:

- Brahman Jnanam not possible and not required.
- Brahman in the form of Consciousness is self evident, ever evident Svayam Siddah, Svayam Jyoti Bavati.

Brihadaranya Upanishad:

That man has only two abodes, this and the next world. The dream state, which is the third, is at the junction (of the two). Staying at that junction, he surveys the two abodes, this and the next world. Whatever outfit he may have for the next world, providing himself with that he sees both evils (sufferings) and joys. When he dreams, he takes away a little of (the impressions of) this all-embracing world (the waking state), himself puts the body aside and himself creates (a dream body in its place), revealing his own lustre by his own light – and dreams. In this state the man himself becomes the light. [IV – III – 9]
**Gita:**

That (Brahman), the Light-of-all lights, is said to be beyond darkness; (it is) knowledge, the Object-of-knowledge, seated in the hearts of all, to be reached by knowledge. [Chapter 13 – Verse 18]

**Mundak Upanishad:**

There the sun does not shine, nor the moon nor the stars; these lightning’s also do not shine – how then (can) this earthly fire? Verily, everything shines after Him reflecting His glory. This whole world is illumined with His light. [II – II – 10]

- Everything revealed by Consciousness Sastra need not reveal Consciousness.
- Sastra revealed, heard by Consciousness no need to infer – “Consciousness” listening to Brahma Sutra.

**Hastamalaka Stotram:**

Who is the cause for the activities of the mind and eyes, is devoid of all limiting adjuncts, like space, just as the sun is the cause for all worldly activities (but is the witness), I am of the nature of that ever-existing Atman. That, which is the cause for the activities of the mind and eyes.... [Verse 3]
Why go to Guru if self evident?

Mundak Upanishad:

Let a brahmana (an aspirant), after he has examined the worlds gained by Karma, acquire freedom from all desires, reflecting that nothing that is eternal can be gained by Karma. Let him, in order to obtain the knowledge of the eternal, take sacrificial fuel (Samit) in his hands and approach that preceptor alone who is well-versed in the Veda-s and is established in Brahman. [I – II – 12]

Shankara:

• Problem not of not knowing Brahman but misconception, misunderstanding of Atman. Which alone requires a correction.
• “Self evident I is mistaken and that mistake has to be corrected”.
• Mistaken I should go – body / Mind complex – Rope Snake should go.
• Unmistaken I should remain – Coniousness – Rope should remain.

Upadesa Sahasri:

Just as the idea of a snake is negated from a rope (in a rope-snake), so, everything of the nature of the non-self is negated from the eternally existing self implied by the word “I”, on the evidence of the Srutis “Thou art That’ etc., in which the implied meanings of the words have been ascertained by reasoning (and the scripture). [Chapter XVIII – Verse 4]
I

Atma
- Consciousness
- Self evident
- Shining by itself.

Mistake :
- Anatma dharma – properties of body / mind.
  I throw upon Consciousness by ignorance.

Example:
- Elephant throws mud upon itself after bath.
- We are unlocated limitless Consciousness enjoyed in sushupti.
- On waking up, I say, I am Sad, Angry, Father, Boss, Son.
- Sastram required not to reveal “Consciousness- I”, but to remove superimposed limitation.

Anatma
- Material Body / Mind also evident.
- Not self evident.
- Not shining by itself.

How do we remove limitation?

• By entertaining a Vritti :
  “Aham Brahma Asmi”
  In the Antahkaranam, thought should take place.

• In the mind, I do not know anything new, but I am free from limitations of body + mind.

• Dropping of limitation is the intellectual process called “Aham Jnanam”.
Atma Jnanam

- Not new experience

- It is in the form of intellectual elimination of limitation.
- Adhyasa Nivartaka Rupena Sastra Pramanam.
- Sastram is – Niseda Rupa Pramanam.
- Brahma Jnanam is possible in negative form – “Neti – Neti”.

Gita:
- Tam vidyad duhkhasamyoga viyogam... [6 – 23]

Gita:
तं विद्याद् दुःखसंयोगवियोगं योगसंज्ञितम्।
स निश्चयेन योक्तव्यो योगोऽनिर्विर्ण्यविचेतस॥ ६.२३॥

- Dvaita / Vikalpa / Paricheda / Triputi / Adyasa Nivritti = Atma Jnanam Nisheda Rupa Sastra Pramanam.
- 4th Argument over. Brahma Upasana impossible.
- Brahma Jnanam in Negatable form is acquired.
LECTURE 34

Introduction:

Vrittikara matam:

- Brahma Jnanena moksha na bavati; parantu brahma upasanena moksah.
- Brahma known only through upasana.

Shankara:

- Brahma known only through Niseda Rupa Jnanam.

Shankara’s own 4 Arguments:

a) Moksha = Asariratvam
   - Not Upsana Phalam = Brahma Bavah.
   - Not result of Upasana.

b) If Moksha is Upasana Phalam, it will have beginning – end, Anityam.
   - Anything produced in time will be perishable.

c) Samanvaya Virodha – If Upasana is central teaching it will be part of Veda Purva, Dharma Sastra.
   - It cannot be independent Sastram, part of Dharma Jingyasa.
   - Upasana Phala Tyaga done by Sanyasis – Nedam Yadidam Upasata.

d) Brahma Upasana impossible because it is not object of meditation.
   - Triputi Rahita Brahman.
   - Nedam Yadidam Upasate.

Refutation of Specific arguments of Purva Pakshi now (Vrittikara) 5 Arguments:

Question:

- Brahma Jnanam can’t give Moksha because Jnanam – alone can’t give any benefit.
- Jnanam should be followed by action. Similar to Bhashta / Prabhakara.
Shankara:

- Do you accept Niseda Vakyams in vedas – Vihitam and Pratishitam (Do-s & Don’t-s)
- Himsam na kuryat. Should not harm anyone.
- What action is involved in Niseda vakyam’s?
- Not harming – is it action?
  Avoidance = Inaction = Absence of action.
- I am doing nothing is not an action – retains actionlessness.
- Niseda Vakyas have no Kriya Sambandham.
- Without action you accept Niseda Vakyams as Pramanams.

6th Argument:

Purva Pakshi: Question

- After Brahma Jnanam, Upasana required to complete Jnanam. After 24 years, of Sravanam, student hesitant to declare I am Mukta.

Shankara:

- Listeners of Vedanta will not be free. Understanding / knower of Vedant is free.
- One who has understood Vedanta is free.
Imaginary dialogue with student:

Student:
- I am Sthula Suksma Karana Rahita Atma.
- My Nature is Sat Chit Ananda - Nature of Atma in Upanishad.

Gita:

He is not born, nor does He ever die; after having been, He again ceases not to be; unborn, eternal, changeless and ancient, He is not killed when the body is killed. [Chapter 2 – Verse 20]

- Atma is birthless... no question of 1st birth or next birth, I have nothing to do with Sariram, Ajah, Nitya.
- As long as I doubt my freedom, my knowledge is doubtful.
- Jnanam + Bandah can’t go together.
- I know I am Atma and I am free is a knower not a listener.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Knower</th>
<th>Listener</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- I am free eternal fact.</td>
<td>- “I am free“ is information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Birthless, Ashariri, Ajaha.</td>
<td>- Upanishads say I am free.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Few.</td>
<td>- Sharirams many.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Where there is Jnanam, no samsara.</td>
<td>- Where there is doubt, there is samsara.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- <strong>Mukta Purusa:</strong></td>
<td>- <strong>Badda Purusa:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sastra is talking about me.</td>
<td>Sastra is talking about me.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jnanat Kaivalyam, no upasana required after that.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
7th Argument:

Purva Pakshi:
- Why Ninidhyasanam after Sravanam? Atma va are Srotavyaha, Mantavyaha?
- Why Upasana required after Sravanam.

Shankara:
- All 3 meant for Jnanam.
- Sravanam is main sadhana which gives Jnanam. Sravanat Aparoksha Jnanam Bavati. Sravanam alone reveals my nature.
- Angi sadhana – Mukhya sadhana - consistent systematic study alone produces Jnanam. Jnanam has capacity.
- Obstacles obstruct Jnanam from giving moksa.

```
2 Obstacles
```

```
“Samasayah “ Is Aham Brahma Asmi a fact
```

```
Viparita Bavana
```

```
Doubt from
```

```
Own Intellect
```

```
Other Philosophies
```

```
Visista Advaitam:
```
- You can’t be Brahman. Can be only part of Brahman.

- Part cant be while. Whole can’t be part. Can’t be both.
Example:

- To go to street, you reject hall.
- To go to Advaitam you reject Visishta Advaitam.
- Being in both places will not happen at all.
- This Jnanam not Dridham.
- In Advaitam – Jeevan Mukti possible.
- In Visishta Advaitam – Jeevan Mukti not possible.
- Go to Sukla Gati and then moksa = Vaikunta, Kailasa
- Are you part of Brahman or full Brahman? Both not possible.

2nd obstacle: Viparita Bavana

- Atma something else, not me.
- Atma inside me.
- Inside me there is Atma.
- Doubt – Am I that Atma?
  Atma Birthless ok.
  I am Brahman, my wife not ok.

- Habitual notion:
  Taking Atma as a 3rd entity not me at Anatma level and complain.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sravanam</th>
<th>Mananam + Ninidhyasanam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Gives Jnanam</td>
<td>- Do not produce Jnanam, Punyam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Remove obstacles – doubts + habits.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Ninidhyasanam:

- To remove 2\textsuperscript{nd} obstacle.
- Looking Atma as 3\textsuperscript{rd} person.
- Ninidhyasanam = Imitating Sthiraprajna.
- Get used to saying – I am free birthless, get habit.
- Atma should be 1\textsuperscript{st} person.
- I am the Atma, which is liberated, never bound.
- Total reorientation of thinking.
- Mananam + Ninidhyasanam – Convert Sapratibandaka Jnanam into Apratibandaka Jnanam - obstacle free knowledge.
- All 3 – Sravanam / Mananam / Ninidhyasanam – meant for Dridha Jnanam. Total over hauling.
Can light remove darkness?

- Not sometimes it will, sometimes not.
• Lights capacity to remove darkness never affected, anytime.
• Remove 2 cloths, light automatically removes darkness.
• Removal of cloth = Removal of obstacle.
• Remove of darkness = Light alone removes darkness.
• Jnanam alone removes Samsara.
• Mananam + Ninidhyasanam – Remove 2 Doubts / Cloths – When both removed, Jnanam is unobstructed.
• Jnanam alone gives Moksha.
• Unobstructed knowledge gives Moksha.
• After knowledge, do nothing!
LECTURE 35

Introduction : 1 – 1 – 4 :

Purva Pakshi – Vrittikara :

• Brahma Upasanam to be done after gaining Brahma Jnanam. Upasanam is a karma which produces special Punyam capable of giving Moksa after Maranam.

Shankara refutes :

1) Moksa is Nitya Siddah – Eternally available.

If Moksa is produced, it will not be eternal.

2) Brahma Upasana not possible.

Brahman not object, not Upasya Visaya. It is nature.

Keno Upanishad :

What one cannot feel with the mind, but because of which they say that the mind feels... know That alone as Brahman and not this, which people do worship here. [Chapter 1 – Verse 5]
He said: “It is not for the sake of the husband, my dear, that he is loved, but for one’s own sake that he loved. It is not for the sake of the wife, my dear, that she is loved, but for one’s own sake that she is loved. It is not for the sake of the sons, my dear, that they are loved, but for one’s own sake that they are loved. It is not for the sake of worlds, my dear, that it is loved, but for one’s own sake that it is loved. It is not for the sake of the gods, my dear, that they are loved, but for one’s own sake that they are loved. It is not for the sake of beings, my dear, that they are loved, but for one’s own sake that they are loved. The Self, my dear Maitreyi, should be realised – should be heard of, reflected on and meditated upon. By the realisation of the Self, my dear, through hearing, reflection and meditation, all this is known. [IV – V - 6]
- Vrittikara claims and prescribes meditation after Sravanam and Mananam.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sravanam</th>
<th>Mananam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gives Jnanam</td>
<td>Gives doubtless knowledge</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Do not stop with knowledge. After Jnanam do Ninidhyasanam – Meditation / Upasanam.

**Shankara:**

**a) Differences:**

- Ninidhyasanam – Part of Jnanam process.
- It is for Jnanam only.

**b)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vrittikara</th>
<th>Shankara</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Upasana after Jnanam</td>
<td>- Ninidhyasanam for Jnanam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- A part of process of Jnanam.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

c)  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Upasana</th>
<th>Vedanta</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Drishta phalam, instantaneous, here &amp; now.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

d)  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vrittikara</th>
<th>Vedanta</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Through Upasana get Moksa in future.</td>
<td>- Knocks off expectation of Moksa.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Sravanam + Mananam + Ninidhyasanam – Put together gives Jnanam.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• Hence no karma involved in vedanta (Kayikam or Manasam).
• Karmana no moksha. Jnanena eva moksha.

e) Vrittikara:
• Is Jnanam also type of Karma only?
• Mental activity like upasana? How can vritti give Jnanam?

Shankara : Technical Answer
• Jnanam does not come under karma.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>“Ninidhyasanam” – Jnanam</th>
<th>Upasana – Vritti Karma</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>a) Vastu Tantram</strong></td>
<td>**a) “Kartru Tantram”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Depends on object of knowledge.</td>
<td>- Depends on Subject.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Example : In class Use</strong></td>
<td><strong>Example : In class Use</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Jnanaindriyam</td>
<td>- Karma indriyams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Hear through ears</td>
<td>- Write notes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>b) Moment you are hearer :</strong></td>
<td><strong>b) Depends on me – Subject (Karta)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- What you hear not in your hands, subject (Tamil / English / Russian)</td>
<td>- What I write.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- What you hear does not depend on the subject – hearer, but open the object of hearing vastu tantram.</td>
<td>- I may not write at all.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Vritti depends on what guru says.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Ninidhyasanam” – Jnanam</td>
<td>Upasana – Vritti Karma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Depends on Vastu Tantram:</strong></td>
<td><strong>Pramatru Tantram:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use Indriyam</td>
<td>- Karma – Ritual depends on Sastra Vidhi.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>World - Prapancha – I Experience</td>
<td>- Sadana Tantram.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Srotiyam</td>
<td>- Shastra vidhi decides karma.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Chaksur</td>
<td>- Seeing man as fire – is Sadhana Tantram.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Knowledge I get depends on Pramanam I use.</td>
<td>Chandogyo Upanishad:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Ears open – Ready to hear any noise.</td>
<td>- Chapter 5 – Section 7 &amp; 8.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Pramanam determines knowledge.</td>
<td>- Panchagni Vidya.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Seeing stone as stone is Jnanam</td>
<td>- Seeing stone as Vishnu.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- We have no choice, it’s a fact.</td>
<td>- Upasanam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- We have a choice Siva Linga – Siva.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>c) Jnanam reveals a thing as it is – no will involved</strong></td>
<td><strong>c) Karma produces 4 Results:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Do not reach – Himalayas</td>
<td>- Aptih – Reaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Knowing how mango grows – can’t produce mangoes.</td>
<td>- Utpattih – Producing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Knowledge reveals pure as pure and impure dusty room as dusty.</td>
<td>- Vikara – Modifying</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Never converts impure thing into pure thing.</td>
<td>- Samskara – Purifying</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Atma Nitya Suddah.</td>
<td>- Karma purifies mind, not produce knowledge.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Jnanam doesn’t modify my fatness into thinness.</td>
<td>- Chitta Shuddhi by Karmam.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Jananam and Karma not identical.
O Gautama, man is the [sacrificial] fire; speech is his fuel; prana is the smoke; the tongue is the flame; the eyes are the embers; and the ears are the sparks. [5 – 7 – 1]

The gods offer food as the oblation to the fire. Out of that oblation appears semen. [5 – 7 – 2]

O Gautama, woman is the [sacrificial] fire. The gods offer semen as the oblation to the fire. Out of that oblation appears the foetus. [5 – 8 – 1 & 2]
• Hence Atma Jnanam not karma – Mule Kutaram Nyaya – fundamental negated.
• Hence does Jnanam produce Moksha?

Jnanam reveals:
• I was, am, ever will be Mukta Purusha.
• Reveals Brahman as myself, a fact. Doesn’t produce, reach, modify, purify.
• Jnanam not Karma – After Jnanam no Karma required.
• Karma Khanda + Upasana Khanda – useful before Jnanam not for Jnanam.

Technical format of Sutra No : 4

a) Visayah:
• **Purva Pakshi**: Vedanta – Karma param.

b) Siddhanta:
• If Chitta Ekagrat does not there, do upasana.
• Brahma Param.
• Vedanta matter of recognition, clear understanding, not doing action.
• With purification + concentration, Jnanam is instantaneous.
• By rope knowledge – fear of snake gone.
• By vedanta knowledge – Samsara goes.
• Only teaching + recognition involved.
• No do’s / dont’s – like Jyotishtoma / Agnihotra.

c) Sangatih :
• Connection – between 3\textsuperscript{rd} + 4\textsuperscript{th} Sutra.
• 4\textsuperscript{th} answer to 3\textsuperscript{rd} : Sastra yonitvat – VC
• **Purva Pakshi** : Karma subject matter of Vedanta.
• Catuhsutri – 4 sutras over.

**Vedantin** :
• Sastra deals only with Brahman.
• Brahman not subject matter of vedanta.
LECTURE 36

Chatusutri – 4 topics:

1st Sutra:
• Jingyasa Adhikaranam.
• For Moksha gain Brahma Jnanam through Vedanta enquiry.

2nd Sutra:
• Janma Adhi Adikaranam.
• Brahman is Abinna nimitta upadana karanam of Universe.
• Intelligent Cause + Material Cause of universe = Brahman.
• This Jagat Karanam Brahman we have to know through Vedantic study.

3rd Sutra:
• Brahman shastra yoni Adhikaranam....
• Jagat Karanam Brahman is central theme of Vedanta. All other topics converge on this topic, subservient to this topic.

4th Sutra:
• Samanvaya Adhikaranam.
• Brahman consistently, focused by Shastram.
• Samanvaya = Consistency.
• 4 Sutras = Complete, comprehensive essence of Vedanta for entire study of Brahman Sutra.
• Rest – Magnification of Chatus sutri.
• Further study of other sutras required for clarity and conviction, and to negate other philosophers.
• Get thoroughness and answer all questions in Vedanta, from any angle.
Example:
- Learn to come to Astika Samajam from any route.
- We will be convinced and confidence to claim Aham Brahma Asmi.
- We learn new way of thinking.
- We think we know. Actually we don’t know. Can’t know when others are vague, meandering, illogical, forgetting central theme.
- Apasruti noted at every state.
- Deficiency in thinking, clear in day to day life.

Sutra 5:

The Pradhana of the Samkhyas is not the cause of the universe, because it is not mentioned in the Upanisads, which fact is clear from the fact of seeing (or thinking). [I – I – 5]

1) General Analysis:
- Verse 4 – Tattu Samanvayat.
- Brahman consistent topic of vedanta.
- Key sutra of Chapter 1 – hence chapter itself called Samanvaya Adhyasa.
- 5th – 134th sutras 35 Adhikaranams – 130 sutras are elaborate commentary on Sutra 4.
- Sutra 1 – 4 – Shankaras commentary handled.
Purva Mimamsa:

- World is generally there in this form. No creation. Na Kadachit Adrishya Jagat – No Srishti, beginningless Adrishya, endless, always like this. No Karanam.

Uniqueness of Vedanta:

- Chetana Brahman Karana Vada = Upadana Karanam.
- w.r.t. Vyavaharika Standpoint.
Vivekchhodamani:

That which, even though one Reality, is the cause for the many, the cause that refutes all other causes, which is distinct from causes and effects and self-existent --- That Brahman Thou Art .... Meditate on this in your mind. [Verse 260]

- From Paramartika Drishti – Brahman – Neither Karanam or Karyam.. Karya Karana Vilakshana – Ekam eva... Brahman Tattvam... Bavayatmani.. Not discussed here.
- From Vyavaharika Dirshiti Brahman is Chetana Jagat Karanam.

Sankhya:
- Main Purva Pakshi – inert material is Material Cause of world.

2nd Idea:
- Achetana Prakrti Karanavada Niraasa.
- Refutation of Sankhya that inert prakrti is Material Cause of World.

Vedanta:
- Chetana Brahman Sthapanam..

Central Theme of 1st Chapter:
- Achetana Prakrti Karana Nirasa Purvakam, Chetana Brahma Karana Sthapanam is Samanvaya Adhyaya.

Nirasa in 4th Chapter:
- Ta tu samanvaya.
- Shankara negated Mimamsa Purva Pakshi.
- Vyasa negated Sankhya and others and science.
Science:
- Big bang matter soup, by chance unicellular organism formed, everything by itself – matter.

Prathama Mallan Nyaya:
- Defeat current world champion – Caspro / Sankhya and claim world title.
- Mallan = Boxer.

1st Chapter:
- Sankya negated by saying no sruti support.
- Avaidika Matam.
- Veda Virudha Matam.

2nd Chapter:
- Sankhya negated by Vyasa by saying no yukti support.

Ayuktam:

Gita:
- 2 places Sankhya used.

This, which has been taught to thee, is wisdom concerning sankhya. Now listen to the wisdom concerning yoga, having know which, O Partha, you shall cast off the ‘bonds of action’. [Chapter 2 – Verse 39]

That place which is reached by the Sankhyas (jnis) is also reached by the yogins (Karma-yogins). He ‘sees’, who ‘sees’ Sankhya and yoga as one. [Chapter 5 – Verse 5]
• Sankhya in vedanta = Old Sankhya = Vedanta friendly.
• Samyak Jayate Atma – Tattvam Asmin tatu shastram = Sankhya.
• That Sastram where Atma tatvam is revealed = Sankhya = Siddhanta.
• Bagawatam Sankhya also Siddhanta. Kapila Muni = Bagawans Avatara.
• In Brahma sutra Sankhya is another Kapila Muni – Sankhya sutras – lost in history.

Main Purva Pakshi : Sankhya Karika

• 70 slokas – small book.

Sankhya Sutra – Main features :

a) 25 principles – Pancha Vimohati Tatvam.

• In the beginning 2 principles.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Purusha</th>
<th>Moola Prakrti</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Beginningless (Anaadi)</td>
<td>- Beginningless, endless, Pradhanam, Mukhyam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Anantham (Endless)</td>
<td>- Trigunatmika</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Asanga chaitanyam.</td>
<td>- 3 Guna not attribute, quality, property but substance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- 3 strands of rope intertwined.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Nyaya : 3 properties – qualities.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
25 Principles

Pradhanam / Prakrti (Karanam)
- Anaadi, Ananta, Nityam of everything.
- With 3 gunas constituents only Karanam.

1 Mahat

2 Ahankara

Prusha = Asanga Chaitanyam
- (Akarana – Karyam)
- Neither cause or effect Aprakriti Vikriti
- Anaadi – Anantha, Nityam doesn’t originate.
- Eternal Principle.

1 Mind

Final Product

10 Organs

Final Product

5 Subtle elements Tanmatras

5 Gross elements (Final product)

- 1 + 10 + 5 = 16 = Only Vikriti – No new products created.
- 1 – Only Aprakrti Vikriti
- 1 + 2 + 5 = 7 – Prakrti – Vikriti
- 1 – Only Prakrti
- 25
All evolution takes place because of disturbance in 3 gunas. Inequilibrium in Prakrti because of disturbance, creates Karya prapancha srishti.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Prakrti</th>
<th>Vikrti / Karyam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Only cause</td>
<td>Only effect / product</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Karana Karyam</th>
<th>Prakriti – Vikriti</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Both cause and effect (different angles)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Akarana Karyam</th>
<th>Karana Karya Vilakshana</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Neither cause or effect</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LECTURE 37

Introduction:

- 4th Sutra = Main
- Sutras 5 to 134 = Commentary.
- Chetana Brahman = Jagat Karanam.
- “Janmadasya Yataha”.

a) First goal:

- Chetana Karana Vadi Sthapanam by Sruti statements.
- 1st Chapter: Sruti based Arguments / support.
- 2nd Chapter: Yukti Pradhanam.

b) Second goal:

- Purusha not born out of Pradhanam. Pradhanam not born out of Purusha.
- No Karana Karya Sambanda.

Gita:

Arjuna said: Prakrti (Matter) and Purusa (Spirit), also the Ksetra (the field) and Ksetrajna (the Knower-of-the-Field), Knowledge and that which ought to be known – these, I wish to learn, O Kesava. [Chapter 13 – Verse 1]

Mahat = 2nd State:

- Samya Avasta converts to Vaishamya Avasta = Creation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Samya Avasta</th>
<th>Vaishamya Avasta</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3 Gunas in equilibrium</td>
<td>3 Gunas Disturbed</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3rd Stage:

- Cosmic Ahankara – Not individual

1. Purusha
2. Matter / Prakrti
3. Mahat
4. Ahamkara

1. 3 Gunas equilibrium
2. Guna Disturbed

5. Mind
6. 10 Sense Organs
7. 5 Gross elements
8. Sukshma Butas
9. 5 Subtle elements
10. Only Karyam not Karanam

- No Prana separately
- Prana = Shakti / Energy behind all organs

- Only Karyam not Karanam
Gold is Prakriti of ornaments.
Wood is Prakriti of Furniture.

\[ \text{Material Cause} \quad \text{Vikriti} \]

**Prakrti Definition:**
- Prakarshena krti yogatvat.
- Any Karanam which is available for moulding into various forms – Vikriti.
- Purusha – neither product or cause of anything.
- All bodies born of Prakrti.
- Mahat, Ahankara, 5 subtle elements = Intermediate category both Prakrti – Vikriti
  
  \[ = \text{Father and Son.} \]
The Primal Nature is non-evolute. The group of seven beginning with the Great Principle (Buddhi) and the rest are both evolvents and evolutes. But the sixteen (five organs of sense, five of action, the mind and the five gross elements) are only evolutes. The Spirit is neither the evolvent nor the evolute. [Verse 3]

Main feature to note in Sankhya:

- Creation born out of Jada, Achetana pradhanam.

Vedantin: Taittirya Upanishad

To him (Bhrgu) he (varuna) again said: “that from which these beings are born; that by which, having been born, these beings live and continue to exist; and that into which, when departing, they all enter; that seekest thou to know. That is Brahman”. He, (Bhrgu) performed penance; and after having done penance.... [3 – 1 – 3]
Om, the knower of Brahman attains the Supreme. With reference to that, is the following hymn recited: Brahman is the Truth, Knowledge and Infinity. He who knows It as existing in the cave of the heart in the transcendent akasa, realises all his desires along with omniscient Brahman. [II – I – 1]

- Chetana Brahman – Jagat Upadana Karanam.

**Both Accept:**

- Chaitanyam Asangam, Trigunatmikateeta, Akarta, not agent of action.

**Main Difference:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sankhya</th>
<th>Vedanta</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Purusha Bokta</td>
<td>- Purusha – Akarta / Abokta.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Karta – Bokta different in Sankhya</td>
<td>- Karta alone becomes Bokta.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Purusha – Bokta</td>
<td>- Hungry man – eats.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Dvaita philosophy</td>
<td>- Ekam Purusha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Every Purusha – Samsari jiva.</td>
<td>- Plurality – unreal / mistake</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Purusha – Jnanata – knower Pramata</td>
<td>- Advaita philosophy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Purusha suffering Samsara. Due to ignorance.</td>
<td>Seeming Samsari. Not really.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prakrti will withdraw from Purusha.</td>
<td>- Purusha – not Pramata.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Purusha Avivekata – Samsari</td>
<td>- Pramatrutvam = Adhyastam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Purusha Vivekatas – Moksha</td>
<td>- Prakrti eternal. Where can it go?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
No differences at Prakrti level:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pradhanam – Sankhya</th>
<th>Prakrti – Vedanta</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Jadam, trigunatmakam evolves into universe.</td>
<td>- Jadam, Trigunatmakam evolves into universe</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Svetasvatara Upanishad**:
- Mayam tu prakritim..... [4 – 10]  

**Gita**:
- Prakritim purusha cheiva... [13 – 20]
- Prakrti evolves into universe.

**Svetasvatara Upanishad**:

मायाः तु प्रकृतिः विद्यान्यायिनं च महेश्वरम् ।
tasvayavyabhūttān vuṣṭ quarry सर्वं जगति जगति

Know then that Nature is Maya, and that the great God is the Lord of Maya. The whole world is filled with beings who form His parts. [Chapter 4 – Verse 10]

**Gita**:

प्रकृतिः पूर्वं चैव विद्यान्यादि उभावपि।
विकारांश्च गुणां चैव विद्धि प्रकृतिसंभवान्॥ १३.२० ॥

Know you that Matter (Prakrti) and Spirit (Purusa) are both beginningless; and know you also that all modifications and qualities are born of Prakrti. [Chapter 13 – Verse 20]
**Important difference:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pradhanam – Sankhya</th>
<th>Prakrti – Vedanta</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Prakrti is independent – Real existence separate from purusha.</td>
<td>- Prakrti is dependent unreal entity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Prakrti is dependent unreal entity.</td>
<td>- Prakrti not separate substance. Has no satta of its own.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Purusha:</td>
<td><strong>Purusha:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Svatantram.</td>
<td>- Clay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Dvaita philosophy both real, exist separately.</td>
<td>- Pot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Nonexistence of its own.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Pot is – Belongs to clay only.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- substantiality belongs to Purusha.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Prakrti:**

- Shakti of Purusha.
- Doesn’t exist separately from Shakta Purusha.
- Speaking power / hearing power / can’t exist separate from me.

```
Who speaks?
```

```
Speaking power alone speaks       Can’t exist without me
```

- I can say – I am speaking.
- Speaking power dependent on me.
- Writing power, hearing power dependent on me.
- Prakrti – creative power of Purusha.
- Purusha alone creates into the world – thru creative power called PRAKRTI.
- Prakrti – Upadana Karanam. Upadana Karanam alone lends existence to Karyam.
Vedanta:
- Prakriti can’t lend existence because Prakriti has borrowed existence from Brahman.
- Brahman lends existence to Prakriti. Prakriti lends existence to world.
- Brahman thru Prakriti lends existence to world.

What is Upadana Karanam
- Prakriti or Brahman
- Alone Upadana Karanam
- Being lender of existence.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sankhya</th>
<th>Vedanta</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Prakriti, Jadam, Material Cause of universe.</td>
<td>- Material cause alone not sufficient need Intelligent cause – Ishvara / carpenter / pot maker.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Clay – Material cause of Pot.</td>
<td>- What is Nimitta Karanam?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- No Nimitta Karanam.</td>
<td>- Nimitta Karanam = Chetana vastu to convert Prakrti into world.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Don’t accept Ishvara.</td>
<td>- Ishvara = Nimitta Karanam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Nirishvara vadi.</td>
<td>- Vyavaharika Satyam different from Nirguna Brahman.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Purusha = Jiva – Bokta Samsari.</td>
<td>- Real as Jiva + world.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Jiva – can’t have omniscience to be Nimitta</td>
<td>- Pradhana depends on Saguna omniscient, omnipotent Ishvara to become creation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karanam of world.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Struggling Samsari – Bokta.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Prakrti becomes universe naturally.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Gold becomes Mala naturally.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- 1st Pradhanam exists independently.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- 2nd Pradhanam becomes world – independent of creator.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Pradhana Svatrantram.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Difference in order of Srishti:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sankhya</th>
<th>Vedanta</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- From Ahamkara, sense organs + mind created.</td>
<td>- Mind + sense organs from subtle elements (Satvic Amsha).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Bagawatam, full of sankhya srishti.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Avaidikam, teaching against veda.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Not Nastika – accepts Veda but teaching against Veda – contradictory.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LECTURE 38

Vedantin:

- Refutes Achetana karana vada – (Matter – as Basic stuff of universe) – Sankhya vadi.
- Sruti vakyam used.
- Nirguna Brahman neither Karanam or Karyam. Karya – Karana Vilakshana.
- Anyatra dharma – Adharma....
- Brahman not Nirgunam but Maya Upadikam Brahman, Saguna Brahman = Ishvara.
- Brahman Karana vadi = Ishvara Karana Vadi.
- Brahman = Ishvara = Brahman with clothes of Maya.
- Dressed Maya = Ishvara.
- Clothed Brahman = Ishvara.
- Undressed Ishvara = Brahman.
- Brahman + Ishvara not 2 separate entities.

1st Topic:

- Ishvara + Brahman are both Karanam.
- Ishvara Karana Vada.
- Chetanam is Upadana Karanam (UK).

2nd topic:

- Ishvara is Nimitta Karanam (NK).
Sankhya:
- Doesn’t accept Ishvara as Nimitta Karanam.
- Accepts Jiva + Jagat as Prakrti. Matter alone evolves as Jagat.

Vedantin:
- No furniture without Carpenter.
- No ornament without goldsmith.
- No Prakrti without Nimitta Karanam Ishvara.

**Diagram:**

```
  Sankhya
     / \
  Upadana Karanam  Nimitta karanam
     /           /  \
   - Prakriti is Upadana Karanam.  - Not there / not required.
   - Ishvara not Upadana Karanam.  - Matter naturally evolves by chemical + physical laws.
```

Vedantin:
- Brahman = Abinna Nimitta, Upadana Karanam.

**Diagram (continued):**

```
  2 Vishaya Vakhyani – 2 topics in 1st Chapter
     /  \
  Spashta Brahma Ling Vakyani  Aspashta Brahma Linga Vakyani
     /           /  \
   - Clear indication.  - Not clear indicator.
   - 1st Chapter – 1st section (Pada).  - 1st Chapter – 2nd and 3rd section (Pada).
```
Ikshati Adhikaranam: 5 to 11 (7 Sutras)

5th Sutra:
- Ikshati – Adhikaranam
- Ikshate Na shabdam

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sutra</th>
<th>Adhikaranam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1st</td>
<td>Jingyasa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2nd</td>
<td>Janmadasya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd</td>
<td>Shastra Yoni</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4th</td>
<td>Samanvaya</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

General Analysis:
- Vishaya Vakyam = Sruti statement.
- Chandogya Upanishad = Tat Tvam Asi Prakaranam.

Chandogya Upanishad:

Somya, before this world was manifest there was only existence, one without a second. On this subject, some maintain that before this world was manifest there was only non-existence, one without a second. Out of that non-existence, existence emerged. [6 – 2 – 1]
Chandogya Upanishad:

That existence decided: ‘I shall be many. I shall be born.’ He then created fire. That fire also decided. ‘I shall be many. I shall be born.’ Then fire produced water. That is why whenever or wherever a person mourns or perspires, he produces water. [6 – 2 – 3]

• Before creation, there was sat alone existent.

Confusion:

• Upanishad Says:
  Sat was existent...

• Is Sat matter or Brahman – Consciousness?

• Sat – Thought, visualised, perceived, saw, Aikshata, let me become many (Sentient being – conscious being) became Agni, Jalam, Prithvi... (No Akasha / Vayu).

• Sat – Brahman – is Karanam – Chetana.

• Is it Nimittam or Upadanam?

• Normally Nimitta Karanam – Intelligent Cause – never becomes product. Carpenter doesn’t become Upadana Karanam.

• Upadana Karanam (Material Cause) becomes product.
  Gold – becomes Ornament.
  Wood – becomes Furniture.
• Becomes is a verb, normally only for Material Cause.
• Chandogya Upanishad – Chapter 6 – Section 2 – Verse 1 & 3 – Sat is Upadana Karanam.

Controversy:

Controversy:

- Not Achetana vastu
- but Brahman / Ishvara = Upadana Karanam.

- Sat = Pradhanam
- Became Agni, Jalam, Prithvi
- Achetanam Karana Vada

2 staged Nyaya – logic – argument by vyasa

Stage 1

- Sankhya – Pradhanam not talked in this portion.
- Its your imagination
- Shabda Pramana Rahitam = Avaidikam.

Stage 2

- Ikshate not by insentient matter.
That existence decided: 'I shall be many. I shall be born.' He then created fire. That fire also decided. 'I shall be many. I shall be born.' Then fire produced water. That is why whenever or wherever a person mourns or perspires, he produces water. [6 – 2 – 3]

2 inferences:

a) Pradhanam not Jagat Karanam Ashabdat, Aveidakavatu, Param Anuvatu.
b) Sat does not talk. Taittriya – Sokamayata Vatu.
• Karanam desired to produce and became creation.
• Desire function of Chetana Karanam (Ikshanam, Kamayan, Jnanam).

**Word for word Analysis:**
• Ikshate Na Ashabdam.
• Pradhanam Na Jagat Karnaam.
• Tat Satcha Vachyam

**Grammar:**

**Ikshate:**
• Verb with Visarga.
• Gachhati → Goes
• Patati → Reads
• Janati → Knows

Vyasa:
• Because of visualisation function, it is not inert Pradhanam.

Sankhya:
• Why Pradhanam can’t visualise?
• It has 3 Gunas.
• Chetana dharma possible for Pradhanam Samashti Satwa Gunatvat.
• Karanam Sarvagyatvam can be explained by Pradhanam also.

Vyasa:
• According to you Sattwa / Rajas / Tamas – Achetanam.
• Can’t visualise.

Sankhya:
• By itself Achetanam but with association with Purusha, Pradhanam gets creativity to Visualise.

Vyasa:
• Your Purusha Asanga.

When, through every gate (sense) in this body, the light-of-intelligence shines, then it may be known that ‘Sattva’ is predominant. [Chapter 14 – Verse 11]

Knowledge arises from Sattva, greed from Rajas, heedlessness, delusion and also ignorance arise from Tamas. [Chapter 14 – Verse 17]
Introduction:

5th Sutra:

The Pradhaṇa of the Samkhyaś is not the cause of the universe, because it is not mentioned in the Upanisads, which fact is clear from the fact of seeing (or thinking). [I – I – 5]

Chandogya Upanishad:

That existence decided: ‘I shall be many. I shall be born.’ He then created fire. That fire also decided. ‘I shall be many. I shall be born.’ Then fire produced water. That is why whenever or wherever a person mourns or perspires, he produces water. [6 – 2 – 3]

- Jagat Karanam sat visualised before becoming world.

- Ikshanam, Kamayam, Sarvagyam only of chetana vastu.
Sankhya:
- Pradhanam full of satwa can be omniscient.

Gita:

Knowledge arises from Sattva, greed from Rajas, heedlessness, delusion and also ignorance arise from Tamas. [Chapter 14 – Verse 17]

Vyasa:
- Satwa guna is achetanam.
- Can’t make it sarvagyam. 3 gunas constitute prakrti – how can it be sarvagyam
- Sankhya – Satwa guna itself achetanam but in association with purusha, chetanam.

Vyasa:
- Your purusha asanga.
- Can’t bless.
- Your prakrti svatantram independently capable of functioning... big weakness of Sankhya.

Sankhya:
- Brihadaranyaka Upanishad: Your Chaitanyam also “Asangoham Purushaha”.

Gita:

Under Me as her supervisor, prakrti (nature) produces the moving and the unmoving; because of this, O Kaunteya, the world revolves? [Chapter 9 – Verse 10]

- In presence of me (Purusha), Prakrti is producing creation.
- Purusha is blessing prakrti.
- Sunlight blesses activities. Fire blesses with light.
• No blessing without relationship. Purusha – Sasangaha and at the same time Asangaha.
• How contradiction resolved in Vedanta?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sankhya</th>
<th>Vedanta</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Purusha, Prakrti same order of Reality.</td>
<td>- Satyam Asangatva</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Sasanga + Asanga not possible.</td>
<td>- Paramartikam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Both Satyam.</td>
<td>- Sleep in dark room and dream light bright.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Light + Darkness can’t coexist mutually opposed.</td>
<td>- Pratibasikam Svapna.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Mithya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Lower order of reality.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Vyavaharika</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Adhyasa Sambanda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Room dark.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Vyavaharikam Jagat.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Both coexist in same place.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gita:</td>
<td>- Mastani sarva butani.....</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Vyasa:

1\textsuperscript{st} Argument:
• Prakrti Sarvagya – because of blessing Purusha.

2\textsuperscript{nd} Argument:
Assume:
• By blessing assume Pradhanam becomes Chetanam, because of Purusha Sambada.
• If Pradhanam visualises because of Purusha Sambanda, credit of visualisation should go to Purusha.

All this world (universe) is pervaded by Me in My unmanifest form (aspect); all beings exist in Me, but I do not dwell in them. [Chapter 9 – Verse 4]
Example:
- Ayoho – Dahati
- Ironball burns hands.
- Hot water burns hands.
- By itself ironball cold but with sambanda of fire burns, Pervaded by blessed by, Iron ball burns.
- Agni – Nimittam.
- If Prakrti visualises because of Purusha, visualisation belongs to purusha.

Example:
- Pen is writing because of me, blessed by me.
- Blessed by sunlight all life exists.
- Svarupam of Sunlight.
- Achetanam subservient to chetanam. Purusha visualises through prakrti.
- I am going with help of scooter.
- Chetanam visualises. Dushyatu Durjanam Nyaya.

Sankhya:
- Convinced – Pradhanam can’t desire, not omniscient.
- Your Brahman can’t have desire, be omniscient.
- Brahman can’t be sarvagyam. All knower to become sarvagyam brahman must be knower.
- Brahman never knower because of 3 reasons.

a) Nirvikararatvat:
- Knowing is a process, involving mental activity. Mind receives word, vritti parinama takes place. If mind is kootasta, doesn’t change no use. Some come to class + do dhyanam.. No use.
- For Jnana Kriya, Parinama involved.
This (Self) is said to be unmanifest, unthinkable and unchangeable, therefore, knowing this to be such, you should not grieve. [Chapter 2 – Verse 25]

- Not alpagya, no question of sarvagya.

b) Karana Abavat:
- Knowledge requires karanam – instruments physical action – Karma Indriyam
- Knowing action – Jnana Indriyam (Sense organs, Mind).
- Apranoyoham aprana subhra yaksharat paratpara.
- Brahman – free from all Karanam.
- Adreshyam, Agrahyam, Agocharam… Brahman has no legs, nose, eyes / ears…. Sat Brahman before Srishti, instruments not born, visualisation before Srishti without mind. Karana Abavat…

c) Vishaya Abavat:
- Before Srishti, no object to know. Vishaya abavat, sarvagyavam na sambavati. Nothing to be known, how knowership without object?

3 Reasons

Nirvikaratvat   Karana Abavat   Vishaya Abavat

- Sarvagya neiva bavati.

Vyasa: 2 Answers
- Brahman is all knowing, all knower not Jnana kriya but Jnana Svarupam.
### 2 Types of Jnanam:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vishaya Jnanam</th>
<th>Svarupa Jnanam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Vritti Janyam</td>
<td>- No Vritti involved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Kriya Activity</td>
<td>- Knowledge is Nature.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Mind involved, knowledge is action.</td>
<td>- Rig Veda – Aitareya Pragyanam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Brihadaranyaka Upanishad – Chaitanyam Brahman.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a) Process Required

a) No Process Required.

- Hence Nirvikaratvat Jnanam.

b) **Karana Bavat:**

- Jnanam Kriya, Process required

b) **Karana Abavat:**

- When Jnana is nature no process required.

**Kaivalya Upanishad:**

- *Apanipado.... [Verse 21]*
- Atma Sees without eyes / Hears without ears / Knows without Mind.
- Atma doesn’t require instrument for Jnanam, because Jnanam is Svarupam.

---

**Kaivalya Upanishad:**

![Verse 21](image)

I am without hands and legs, of incomprehensible power. I see without eyes, hear without ears. Devoid of all forms, I am knowing (everything) and there is none that knows me. I am ever Pure-Knowledge. [Verse 21]
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vishaya Jnanam</th>
<th>Svarupa Jnanam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>c) Vishaya Abavat:</strong>&lt;br&gt; - Before Srishti – Brahman not all knowing – no all to know.</td>
<td><strong>c) Vishaya Abavat:</strong>&lt;br&gt; - Can’t say objects absent before creation, if totally absent, then creation can’t come from nonexistence.&lt;br&gt; - From Abava – No creation.&lt;br&gt; - Before Srishti, objects were there in Avyakta rupam.&lt;br&gt; - Avyakrita Rupena Asit.&lt;br&gt; - Avyakta Jagat is object of knowledge as in sleep.&lt;br&gt; - Brahman – Sarvasya Avyatra Rupam Jnantam.&lt;br&gt; - Brahman Sarvajnatum Iti Marhati.&lt;br&gt; - Knower of everything in potential form.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Sankhya:**<br>**Question:**<br> - Brahma Svarupam, no change required, no instrument required, object is there – Omniscient, Jnanam not process – Svarupa Jnanam.<br> - If Jnanam no process, you should not use verb, w.r.t. Brahman.<br> - To use verb – indicates action + process.<br> - Tad Aikshata Saha Akamayaha Janati iti “Jnaya – Sarvagsnya”.

**Shankara:**<br> - When no process involved, using verb in figurative sense.<br> - Suryaha Prakashate / Prakashati.<br> - Agni Dahati.<br> - No action involved.<br> - Fire is burning.<br> - Sun lighting up, lighting up nature of sun.<br> - Anything in front gets lighted up.<br> - Anything in front of fire burns.<br> - Nature of fire – not action.<br> - If action, it will be temporary.<br> - All actions anityam.<br> - Speaking, walking, talking, running, lifting, not eternal.<br> - Swamiji talks least in private visit.<br> - Maximum talking in class.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vishaya Jnanam</th>
<th>Svarupa Jnanam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Yatu Kriya Rupam, Tatu Anityam</td>
<td>- Yatu Svarupa Rupam Tatu Nityam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- What is Action = Anityam</td>
<td>- What is Nature = Nityam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Sun is light not lighting Surya Prakashate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Agni is heat itself. Does not do burning action.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Agni Dahati, Figurative expressions not process.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**1st Argument:**
- Bramanaha Sarvagyatvam.

**2nd Argument:**
- Brahman by itself Nirvikaram can’t know anything.
- Not knower.
- With Maya, becomes Sarvagya Ishvara (Knower).
- Maya Sahitatvat, Upadhikatvat, Brahman as instrument, Maya instrument Sarvagataha.

**1st Inference:**
- Shabdatkam – Na Pradhanam – because of Visualisation.

**2nd Inference:**
- Ikshate.

**3rd World:**
- Ashabdham – Clue for 2nd reasoning – Aveidikam – no support of vedas.
Chandogya Upanishad:

Somya, before this world was manifest there was only existence, one without a second. On this subject, some maintain that before this world was manifest there was only non-existence, one without a second. Out of that non-existence, existence emerged. [6 – 2 – 1]

- Sat eva Soumya idam agre asit.
  ↑
  Pradhanam or Chit?
- Since Aveidikam, it is not Jagat Karanam.
- Pradhanam has no Vedic support.
- Like Paramanu of Neiyayika / Nyaya philosophy.
Conclusion:

- Vedanta talks of Chetana Brahman alone as Jagat Karanam.
- Subject of Vedas is Jagat Karanam Brahman.
- That Brahman is Shastra Yoni.
- Sankhya takes up objection for Sutra 5.
LECTURE 40

Ikshater Adhikaranam : Sutras 5 – 11 (7 Sutras)

Subject :

- What is meaning of ‘Sat’ in 6th chapter of Chandogyo Upanishad?
- Sat = Jagat Karanam and Chetanam.
- Because of Ikshanam, visualisation not possible by Jada Pradhanam.
- Ikshatru has to be Chetanam.
- How Nirvikara Brahman perceiver?

2 References :

Upadesha Sahashri :

- Ikshititra Prakaranam.
This (self) was indeed Brahman in the beginning. It knew only Itself as, ‘I am Brahman.’ Therefore It became all. And whoever among the gods knew It also became That; and the same with sages and men. The sage Vamadeva, while realising this (self) as That, knew, ‘I was Manu, and the sun.’ And to this day whoever in like manner knows It as, ‘I am Brahman,’ becomes all this (universe). Even the gods cannot prevail against him, for he becomes their self. While he who worships another god thinking, ‘He is one, and I am another,’ does not know. He is like an animal to the gods. As many animals serve a man, so does each man serve the gods. Even if one animal is taken away, it causes anguish, what should one say of many animals? Therefore it is not like by them that men should know this. [I – IV – 10]

Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

This (self) was indeed Brahman in the beginning. It knew only Itself as, ‘I am Brahman.’ Therefore It became all. And whoever among the gods knew It also became That; and the same with sages and men. The sage Vamadeva, while realising this (self) as That, knew, ‘I was Manu, and the sun.’ And to this day whoever in like manner knows It as, ‘I am Brahman,’ becomes all this (universe). Even the gods cannot prevail against him, for he becomes their self. While he who worships another god thinking, ‘He is one, and I am another,’ does not know. He is like an animal to the gods. As many animals serve a man, so does each man serve the gods. Even if one animal is taken away, it causes anguish, what should one say of many animals? Therefore it is not like by them that men should know this. [I – IV – 10]
If it be argued that the seeing is in a secondary sense, we say, not so, owing to the use of the word Self. [I – I – 6]

- Brahman – Jagat Karanam because of Visualisation.
- **Clue**: Jagat Karanam is Chetana Vastu.

**Sankhyas objection:**

- Visualisation can be connected to Achetana Pradhanam also.
- I say Pradhanam Aikshyata.

---

**Word**

- **Mukhya Artha**
  - Vachyartha
  - Primary

- **Gouna Artha**
  - Figurative
  - Secondary

---

**Example:**

- He is a Lion / Pillar.
- Simhaha Manavataha.

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Secondary Meaning</th>
<th>Primary Meaning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Majesty, Strength, Leadership.</td>
<td>- Man doesn’t walk on 4 legs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Support</td>
<td>- Not round made of Bricks.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Why Teacher came to class with cooling glass?

- All children were Bright.

↓

Not like Sun Glaring but Brilliant in Intellect.

- Ikshanam – Figurative.

Sankhya:

- Any Chetana vastu uses visualisation before systematic planned action.
- Without Visualisation, action not systematic... welcome rehearsal done is visualisation.
- 23 items in Pradhanam come in systematic manner.
- Sat – as though visualised creation before. Gauna Ikshanam Symbolic – figurative.
- 1st element created is Tejaha.
- Sat Visualised and created Tejaha – Fire.
- Fire Visualised and created Jalam – Water.
- Water Visualised and created Earth.
- As though visualised, Gauna Ikshanam.
- 6th Chapter – Sat Vidya Prakaranam.
- Sat also matter – Achetanam.
He desired, ‘I shall become many and be born. He performed tapas; having performed tapas, He created all this whatsoever (we perceive). Having created it, He entered into it. Having entered it. He became the manifest and the unmanifest, the defined and undefined, the housed and the houseless, knowledge and ignorance, truth and falsehood, and all this whatsoever that exists. Therefore, it is called existence. In this sense, there is the following Vaidika verse.’ [2 – 6 – 2]

- Jagat karanam ‘Sat’ after creating world says:
  
  I – Jagat Karanam will enter into the world as Jivatma.

- Monologue – says to itself.

Chandogya Upanishad : Section 8 to 12

That which is the subtlest of all is the Self of all this. It is the Truth. It is the Self. That thou art, O Svetaketu. [Svetaketu then said], ‘Sir, please explain this to me again.’ ‘Yes, Somya, I will explain again,’ replied his father. [6 – 8 – 7]
Vyasa’s Argument:

• Jivatma refers to Chetana Vastu. In Sankhya also Atma = Chetana.
• You address Chetana Vastu Purusha. Never to Achetana Vastu – wall.
• Ikshanam not Gaunam.
• Agni + Jalam Visualisation is figurative. Sat Visualisation is not figurative.
• It is equated to Atma – Chetanam.
• It is essence, Mukhya Eva Ikshanam.

2 Anumana Vakyams:

a) Purva Pakshi : Anumanam

• Ikshati shabdaha gaunaha, gauna shabda sannidhyatvat.
• Occurring near abtejo...

b) Siddanta Anumanam :

• Ikshati Shabdaha na gaunaha, mukhyaha – primary.
• Visualisation of chetana Brahman – Primary.

Hetu:

• Atma shabdat, word atma invariably for chetana vastu.
• Drishtanta vyatirekena abtejo ikshatvat – Unlike fire / water.
• Only chetana atma can use – my self / I.
• Atma = Crucial word.
• Visualisation – primary, not figurative. That Jagat karanam ‘sat’ is chetana vastu not achetana vastu.
Word Analysis:
- Gaunaha – Figurative used by Sankhya.
- Gauna Samanyat Prayuktaha.
- He is Lion / Pillar.

If Purva Pakshi Argues that:
- Ikshati is figurative.

We say:
- Ikshati is not figurative, because there is usage of Atma.
- Visualisation makes it Chetana Vastu.
- 6th Sutra over. It strengthens 5th sutra by saying Visualisation mentioned is primary not figurative.
- Must read 5th + 6th sutras together.
- Sat is Chetana Brahman not Achetana Brahman.

Sutra 7:

\[
\text{तत्त्वीर्व्यः मोक्षोपदेशांत्} \quad \text{Tannishthasya mokshopadesat}
\]

(Pradhana is not the meaning of the word “Self”), because liberation is promised for one who holds on to That. [I – I – 7]

- Tan Nishtasya moksho upadesa.
- Here reason given not of visualisation.

Chandogya Upanishad: Chapter 6
- Sat – Jagat Karanam – Substratum of Universe = Atma – Purusha – you are that whoever is established in that karanam. Brahman is liberated.
• Who knows I am Sat – Jagat Karana Brahman will enjoy Jeevan Mukti till Prarabda is over and then Videha Mukti.

Vyasa: 2nd Reason

• If Sat Brahman refers to inert matter – Tat tvam Asi – will mean you are inert.
• Moksha means recognising you are inert entity.
• All want to go from Alpagya to Sarvagya not to Jada.
• Purusha – not inert Achetana.
• Not mud – Better be Jiva.
• Since Moksha promised for Sat Nishta, Sat has to be Chetanam.
LECTURE 41

1 – 7 – 3:

Ikshati Adhikaranam:

General Analysis:
- Sad Eva Soumya Analysis.
- Sad – Chetanam or Achetanam – 6 Reasons.

Aim of Student:
- Gather more reasons for all conclusions of vedanta, in Brahma sutra text.

What is Benefit?

a) Better understanding, clarity in Gita / Upanishad.
b) Every conclusion connected with self knowledge.
- Clarity in scriptural knowledge = Clarity in Self knowledge.
- Clarity in face in the mirror depends on clarity in mirror.
- Scriptural Rub through Gita, Brahma Sutra, Upanishad study.
- Eliminate present doubt and future possibility of doubt by mind and challenges by others.
- Therefore knowledge becomes conviction. Have enough reasons to convince others doubt.

Conclusion of Adhikaranam:
- Sat is chetana entity.

1st Reason:

- Visualisation is primary meaning not figurative.
2nd Reason:

- Easier.
- Shankara interprets in 2 ways.

**Chandogyo Upanishad**: 6 Chapter – 16 Sections

**Section 1 – 7**:
- Sections deal with Srishti – creation Adhyaropa Pramana.

**Section 8 – 16**:
- Main teaching... you are Sat – Jagat Karanam.

**Chandogya Upanishad**:

![Mantra](image)

That which is the subtlest of all is the Self of all this. It is the Truth. It is the Self. That thou art, O Svetaketu. [Svetaketu then said], ‘Sir, please explain this to me again.’ ‘Yes, Somya, I will explain again,’ replied his father. [6 – 8 – 7]

- In all sections same mantra.
- That Jagat Karana Brahman you are = Purusha.
- Pradhanam – not listening, can’t listen.
- Listener = Chetana Purusha.
- Addresses Chetana Purusha and says “You are that Sat Karanam”.
- You – Purusha are Chetanam – Consciousness Awareness.
- One established in this knowledge is Mukta.
- I am Jagat Karana Chetana Purusha, not miserable Chetana Abhasa. This knowledge he gains.
Chandogya Upanishad:

- Once established in this knowledge, gain Moksha.
- Videha Mukti after exhaustion of Prarabda.
- Jeevam Mukti duration varies individual to individual.
- Once established in Jagat Karanam Purusha, will get liberated.

Sankhyas interpretation:

- Jagat Karana sat = Achetana Pradhana. You - Svetaketo is none other than Achetana Pradhanam.
- If you are established in Jagat Karanam Svarupa – Achetanam Pradhana – ends in Absurdity.
- In Moksha Pramata has to go away, Prakrti state has to go away from me Purusha.
- Moksha, establishment should be in Chetana Purusha not Achetana Prakrti.
- In this verse Moksha promised for being established in Sat.
- If Sat is Brahman it tallys with moksha. With Pradhanam will not tally.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1st Argument</th>
<th>2nd Argument</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sat Chetanam because of Visualisation</td>
<td>Establishment in Sat is Moksha Karanam</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
8th Sutra:

Heyatvavachanaccha

(Pradhana has not been spoken of even indirectly), because there is no subsequent mention of its rejection, and (because that militates against the assertion at the beginning. [I – I – 8]

General Analysis:

- Atma – subtle entity Vyawahara – in gross intellect.

Journey: Gross to Subtle

- In Upanishad – Arundati Darshana Nyaya.

Taittriya Upanishad:

- Couple see Arundati Vasishta. Model couple.
- 1st show – Big Star
- Next – Small.
- By Pancha Kosha Viveka, show Ananda Maya Kosha = Atma.
- Reveals Achetanam first and at last Chetanam Brahman – This is standard process in Upanishad.

Sankhya:

- Negates Sat Karanam & goes to Purusha.
- Intermediary – negated, Negation = Heyatvam.
- Nishedyatva Nirakriya Manatvam.
Chandogya Upanishad:

That which is the subtlest of all is the Self of all this. It is the Truth. It is the Self. That thou art, O Svetaketu. [Svetaketu then said,] ‘Sir, please explain this to me again.’ ‘Yes, Somya, I will explain again,’ replied his father.

6 – 8 – 1, 6 – 9 – 4, 6 – 10 – 3, 6 – 11 – 3, 6 – 12 – 3, 6 – 13 – 3, 6 – 14 – 3, 6 – 15 – 3, 6 – 16 - 3

- Section 8 to 16 – 9 times teaching.
- Repeated - Sat = Jagat Karanam.
  - That Sat you are.
- If Sat was intermediate it should have negated ‘Sat’. Sruti doesn’t negate. Takes it as final step.

Anumanam:

- Heyatva Avachanat..
- Tad Satcha Vakyam Na Pradhanam. Sad used in Chandogya Upanishad is not Pradhanam because it is not negated.

Previous Sutra:

(Pradhana is not the meaning of the word “Self”), because liberation is promised for one who holds on to That. [I – I – 7]
Taittiriya Upanishad:

ॐ ्brahmavidapnoñi param, tadesa'bhyuktah,
satyam jnanamanatam brahma,
yo veda nietam guhayam parme vyoman,
so'snute sarvan kaman saja brahmana vipasciteti ॥ 1 ॥

Om, the knower of Brahman attains the Supreme. With reference to that, is the following hymn recited: Brahman is the Truth, Knowledge and Infinity. He who knows It as existing in the cave of the heart in the transcendent akasa, realises all his desires along with omniscient Brahman. [II – I – 1]

7th Reason:

• “Chakara” added, therefore Sat word not Pradhanam.

Chanodgya Upanishad:

Sa ha dvadasavarsa upetya caturvimsatihisvarah sarvanvedanadhitya
mahamana anucanamani stabdha eyaya tam ha pitovaca svetaketo yannu
somyedam mahamana anucanamani stabdho'syuta tamadesamapraeksah ॥ 2 ॥

Svetaketu went to his teacher’s house at the age of twelve. After studying all the Vedas, he returned home when he was twenty-four, having become very serious and vain, and thinking himself to be a great scholar. [Noticing this,] his father said to him: ‘O Svetaketu, you have now become very serious and vain, and you think you are a great scholar. But did you ask your teacher for that teaching [about Brahman]. [6 – 1 – 2]

Yenasrutm srutam bhavatyamatam matamavijnatam vijnatamiti
katham nu bhagah sa adesu bhavatiti ॥ 3 ॥

‘That teaching by which what is never heard becomes heard, what is never thought of becomes thought of, what is never known becomes known?’ [Svetaketu asked] ‘Sir, what is that teaching?’. [6 – 1 – 3]
Questions:

• What is that by which everything is known.
• Ena Ashrutam – Srutam.
• Ena Amatam – Matam.
• Ena Avigyatvam – Vigyatvam.
• Same Question in Mundak Upanishad.

Mundak Upanishad:

The great householder Saunaka duly approaching Angira in the prescribed manner asked. “What is That, my Lord, having known which all these become known?” [I – I – 3]

Answer:

• Karana Vigyanena Sarva Karyam Vigyatum Bavati.
• By knowing cause all effects known.
• Effect = Cause with different Name + form.
• Gold + Name + Form = Ornaments
• Clay + Name + Form = Pots.
• Jagat Karanam Vigyanam – Jagat Sarvam Vigyatum Bavati.

Sankhya:

• From Pradhanam – 23 Tatvams born (Mahat, Ahankara, Manaha, Dasha Indriyas, Sukshma, Sthula Butani).
Vyasa :

• Purusha not product of Pradhanam.
• Countless Atmas, Purushas are there. Will know inert things.
• Achetana Jivas not known.
• Brahman = Jagat Karanam.
• All Jivas are that Brahman.

Gita :

Oh Arjuna! Moreover, know that Ksetrajna to be Myself, obtaining in all bodies. That knowledge which deals with Ksetram and Ksetrajna is (true) knowledge. This is My teaching. [Chapter 13 – Verse 3]

- Achetana Prapancha also, known by Brahman Jnanam.
- Chetana Jiva + Achetana Prapancha known.
- Achetana Prapancha is product of Brahman.
- “Chakara” indicates Eka Vigyanena Sarva Vigyana Pratigya.
LECTURE 42

I–I–8:

- Ikshati – Adhikaranam = 7 Sutras.
- 4 Over.

Subject:

Chandogya Upanishad:

Somya, before this world was manifest there was only existence, one without a second. On this subject, some maintain that before this world was manifest there was only non-existence, one without a second. Out of that non-existence, existence emerged. [6 – 2 – 1]
Reasons for Sat to be Chetanam

1. Sutra 5
   - Sat visualises creation before creation emerges.

2. Sutra 6
   - Sat is cause of Moksha.

3. Sutra 7
   - Sat not intermediary step negated before going to Purusha.
     - Sat = Final Purusha = Highest step

4. Sutra 8
   - Cha Shabda in Sutra
     - Eka vigyanena Sarva Vigyanams Pratigya Bavati.
     - Knowledge of Brahman leads to knowledge of everything.
     - Purusha not effect of Pradhanam.

5. Sutra 9
   - Locus of Jiva in Sushupti.
   - Resolution in Sushupti

6. Sutra 10
   - Gathi Samanyam
     - Chetanam has concurrence in other Upanishads.

7. Sutra 11
   - Because it is heard.
Sutra 9:

Because of the merger of the individual into his own Self. [I–I–9]

- Svapyata.

General Analysis:

Chandogya Upanishad:

‘That which is the subtlest of all is the Self of all this. It is the Truth. It is the Self. That thou art, O Svetaketu.’ [Svetaketu then said,] ‘Sir, please explain this to me again.’ ‘Yes, Somya, I will explain again,’ replied his father. [6–8–1]

- Sushupti Avastha – individual given name Svapiti. Why sleeper named Svapiti?
- In sleep Jiva resolves into its own original nature.

```
Sva  
\downarrow
Svapnya
```

```
Piti
```

```
Apyaya
```

Resolution, Dissolution, Layaha

- Resolution into own nature = Sat Karanam Brahman.
- Svarupa Layaha.
• Nature of Jiva = Sat Karanam.
• 1st = Jiva resolves into Sat.
• 2nd = Jiva resolves into its nature.
• Therefore Sat = Svam. Svam = Sat.
• Sat Karanam alone is Svarupam.
• Svarupam alone is Sat Karanam.

Question:
• Is Sat Karanam Chetanam or Achetanam.

Sankhya:
• Achetanam Sat
• Achetanam = Nature of Jiva.

Vedanta:
• Sat = Chetanam
• Chetanam = Nature of Jiva.

Question:
• Is your nature Chetanam?
• Achetanam can’t hear or reply anything.
• To say Achetanam, you have to be Chetanam. No Jiva is Achetanam.

Sankhya:
• Purusha + Pradhanam – 2.
• In his philosophy Chetanam + Achetanam mixed up.
Anumanam:

- Tat Satcha Vachyam, not Prodhanam because Sat is Locus of Jiva in Sushupti – resolution in Sushupti.
- It can’t be Achetana Pradhanam.

\[
\begin{array}{c|c}
\text{Svam} & \text{Apyaya} \\
\downarrow & \\
\text{Svarupam in Sushupti} & \\
\end{array}
\]

- Jiva resolves into Svam – Svarupam. When a thing resolves, it resolves into its nature alone.

| Resolves into  |  
|----------------|---
| Ornament       | Gold |
| Pot            | Clay |
| Wave           | Water|
| Dreamer        | Waker|

- All active now... Nature = Svam.

Next word:

Apyaya: Gita

The origin and destruction of beings, verily, have been heard by me in detail from You, O Lotus-eyed Krsna, and also Your inexhaustible greatness. [Chapter 11 – Verse 2]

Mandukya Upanishad:

- Pravayayaiapi Butanam – ehsa – Apyaya = Dissolution.
- Svapya = During Sushupti there is Sat Layaha also.
- Svarupa = Sat. Therefore Sat should be Chetanam.
- Inference = Tat Satcha Vakyam Na Pradhanam Svapyaaya.
10th Sutra:

गतिसामान्यायः广泛的相等

On account of the uniformity of view (of the Vedanta texts, Brahman is to be taken as that cause). [I – I – 10]

General Analysis:

- Sat = Jagat Karana – Doesn’t say Chetanam / Achetanam – Vague. Therefore doubt.
- Vagueness clarified by Parallel ideas in other Upanishads.

1st Internal Evidence:

- 2nd similar srishti statement in other Upanishads.
- See Karanam there as Chetanam or Achetanam.

Srishti:

1) Taittiriya Upanishad:

Om brahmavidapnoti param, tadesa'bhuyukta,
satyam jnanamanatam brahma,
yo veda nihitam guhayam parame vyoman,
so'snute sarvan kaman saha brahmaṇa vipascitē. II 1 II

Om, the knower of Brahman attains the Supreme. With reference to that, is the following hymn recited: Brahman is the Truth, Knowledge and Infinity. He who knows It as existing in the cave of the heart in the transcendent akasa, realises all his desires along with omniscient Brahman. [II – I – 1]

- Brahman = Jnana Svarupam.
- From Chetana Brahman – Akasha was born Akasha sambutaha.. Used to indicate material cause – Upadana Karanam..
He desired, “I shall become many and be born. He performed tapas; having performed tapas, He created all this whatsoever (we perceive). Having created it, He entered into it. Having entered it, He became the manifest and the unmanifest, the defined and undefined, the housed and the houseless, knowledge and ignorance, truth and falsehood, and all this whatsoever that exists. Therefore, it is called Existence. In this sense, there is the following Vaidika verse.” [II – VI – 3]

- Brahmanda Valli – Brahma Putcham pratishtam.
- Brahman desired and became creation.

**Taittiriya Upanishad : Brigu Valli**

To him (Bhrgu) he (varuna) a gain said : “that from which these beings are born ; that by which, having been born, these beings live and continue to exist ; and that into which, when departing, they all enter ; that seekest thou to know. That is Brahman”. He, (Bhrgu) performed penance ; and after having done penance.... [3 – 1 – 2]

- Brahman = Chetanam = Srishti, Sthiti, Laya Upadana Karanam.
• Yah – Sarva Sarva vitu Jnanam – Jayate.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jiva</th>
<th>Brahman</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Alpiscient</td>
<td>- Omniscient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Jagat Karanam.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Mundak Upanishad:**
- Tasmad... Annam Jayante... [I – I – 9]
- From that Brahman – Nama / Rupa Annam Born.

**Mundak Upanishad**

| यः सर्वज्ञः सर्वविद्याय ज्ञानमयं तापः । ।
|-------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| तस्मादेतत्तत्त्वाः नाम रूपमच्छ च जायते ॥ ६ ॥

Yah sarvajnah sarva-vid yasya jnana-mayam tapah ।
Tasmad-etad brahma nama rupam-annam ca jayate ॥ 9 ॥

From the Brahman (the Supreme Reality) – who not only is aware of the total happenings in the world but is equally in the know of all the details of happenings every minute, whose very thought is of the nature of Knowledge – are all these produced: the Creator, names and forms, and nourishment for all. [I – I – 9]

**Mundak Upanishad [II – I – 3] / Kaivalya Upanishad [Verse 15]:**

| एतस्माज्ञाते प्रणो मनः सर्वद्रियाणि च ।
|-------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| खं वायुर्ज्योतिराप: पृथ्वी विश्वस्य धारिणि ॥ ३ ॥

Etasmaj-jayate prano manah sarvendriyanī ca ।
kham vayur-jiotir-apah prthivi visvasya dharini ॥ 3 ॥

From Him are born the Prana (life), the mind, all the organs, the sky (Akasa), the wind (Vayu), the fire (Jyotih), the water (Apah) and the earth (Prthivi) which supports all.

• Brahman = Upadana Karanam.
Aitareya Upanishad:

In the beginning, verily, Atman (Self) alone was this (the Universe)... nothing else active whatsoever... [Verse 1 (a)]

- Atma – Chetana Vastu – from which Jagat born..

Prasno Upanishad:

This Prana is born of the Atman. As shadow is born of the man, so is the Prana of the Self. By the action of the mind it enters into this body. [Chapter III – Verse 3]

- Prana + creation is born just as a shadow is born.
- Shadow unreal. Unreal creation born out of Brahman.

Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

- Yatha Vispulingaha Prabavanti, from Atma creation born.
- Gathi samanya nayaya - wherever vagueness, replace by explicit statements from other Upanishads.

Anumanam:

- Tatsatcha Vachyam na pradhana Braheiva gathi samanyat.

Word Meaning:

- One compound word.
Jnanam – in Vedanta – supported by all Upanishads.

Sankhya:
- Achetana Karana – not supported by other Upanishads.
- Samanyam = Identity, commonness, concurrence, majority vote.

11th Sutra:

Gathi | Samanyam
---|---
- Jnanam | - Chetana Karana Jnanam
- Avagatihi

Svetasvatara Upanishad:

No one in the world is His master, no one has anybody any control over Him. There is no sign by which He can be inferred. He is the cause of all, and the ruler of individual souls. He has no parent, nor is there any one who is His lord. [Chapter 6 – Verse 9]

- Saha Karanam... That is Karanam – Atma Vatu.
10th Sutra:

- Chetanam Brahman = Karanam.
- Sankhya Philosophy based more on Tarqa, less on veda.

Anumanam:

- Tat Satcha Vakyam Chetanam, Braheiva Srutvat.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Srutvat</th>
<th>Cha</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Because it is heard</td>
<td>- Indicates conclusion of 7 reasons.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Learn veda by hearing.</td>
<td>- Sat = Chetanam Karanam Brahman.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hence called Sruti.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Ikshati Adhikaranam over.

Upasamhara – Conclusion:

- Controversial subject matter – doubt – opinion of Purva Pakshi, our conclusion.

Subject – Vishaya:

Chandogya Upanishad:

सदेव सोम्येदमग्र आसीदेकमेवाद्वितियिम्।
तद्येक आहुरस्देह वेदमग्र आसीदेकमेवाद्वितियिम्।
तस्मादाद्यत सज्जायए ॥ १ ॥

Sadeva somyedamagra asidekamevadvitiyam;
Taddhaika ahurasadevedamagra asidekamevadvitiyam
tasmadasath sajjayata [1]

Somya, before this world was manifest there was only existence, one without a second. On this subject, some maintain that before this world was manifest there was only non-existence, one without a second. Out of that non-existence, existence emerged. [6 – 2 – 1]
Chandogya Upanishad:

Kutastu khalu somaivam syaditi hovaca kathamasatah sajjayeteti:
Satteva somyedamagra asidekamevadvitiyam II 2 II

The father said: O Somya, what proof is there for this – that from nothing something has emerged? Rather, before this world came into being, O Somya, there was only existence, one without a second. [6 – 2 – 2]

Tadaiksata bahu syam prajayeyeti tattejo'srijata aiksata bahu syam prajayeyeti tadapo'srijara tasmadyatra kvaca socati svedate va purusastejasa eva tadadhypo jayante II 3 II

That existence decided: ‘I shall be many. I shall be born.’ He then created fire. That fire also decided: ‘I shall be many. I shall be born.’ Then fire produced water. That is why whenever or wherever a person mourns or perspires, he produces water. [6 – 2 – 3]

Samshaya – Doubt:

- Sruti doesn’t mention.
- Taittriya Upanishad – no doubt... Satyam, Jnanam.
Sankhya:

- Material Cause has to be material.
- All Material Cause are material, inert, born out of matter.
- Cause + effect similar.

Om, the knower of Brahman attains the Supreme. With reference to that, is the following hymn recited: Brahman is the Truth, Knowledge and Infinity. He who knows It as existing in the cave of the heart in the transcendent akasa, realises all his desires along with omniscient Brahman. [II – I – 1]

Siddhanta – Conclusion:

- Sat refers to Chetana Karanam 7 reasons.

Sangatihi – Connection:

- Previous Sutra – Samanvaya – Ikshati.
Akshepa Sangatihi:
- 4th Adhikaranam – Brahman = Subject matter Tattu Samanvayat.

Sankhya Objection:
- Pradhanam alone Jagat karanam.

Answering objection in this Sutra:
- Akshepa Sangatihi.
Lecture 43

Topics

- Topic 1 to 4
  - 1 Sutra each
- Topic 5
  - 7 Sutras

Justify:
- Why topic Ikshati Adhikaranam in Brahman Sutra.

Technical:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jaimini Sutra</th>
<th>Brahma Sutra / Uttara Mimamsa Sutra</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Purva Mimamsa Karma Khanda Vachya.</td>
<td>- Analyse Vedanta Vakya.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Why in 1st Chapter – not in 2 / 3 / 4 Chapter:
- 1st Chapter – Proves Samanvaya – consistency harmony.

1st Pada (Section):
- Spashta Brahma Linga Vakya pada.
- Analysis statements which have clear clues, indications to reveal Brahman.
- Sat – clear clues to prove Sat = Brahman.
- Ikshatihi – means clues.

2nd Chapter:
- Aspashta Brahma Linga Vakhyam.
- Not clear clues, Sruti Sangatihi.
• Shastra / Adyaya sangatih / Pada Sangatihi.

• Seeing connection between Ikshati and Samanvaya – is Akshepa Sangatihi.

• 5th Adhikaranam answers objection raised on 4th Adhikaranam.

• 5 out of 192 topics done.

6th Topic:

12th Sutra:

अनन्दमयोऽभ्यासात् || Anandamayo‘bhyasat ||

Anandamaya means Para Brahman on account of the repetition (of the word ‘bliss’ as denoting the Highest Self). [I – I – 12]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>8 Sutras</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Adikaranam</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 to 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sankhya</th>
<th>Vedanta</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| - Speculative philosophy  
- Proposed, founded by Acharya. | - Philosophy out of Upanishad.  
- Analyses sutras in vedanta. |
From that (which is) this Atman, is space born; from akasa, air; from air, fire; from fire, water; from water, earth; from earth, herbs; from herbs, food; and from food, man. [II – I – 2]

- Knowing 5 Koshas – no Moksha.
- Why it is introduced?

Om, the knower of Brahman attains the Supreme. With reference to that, is the following hymn recited: Brahman is the Truth, Knowledge and Infinity. He who knows It as existing in the cave of the heart in the transcendent akasa, realises all his desires along with omniscient Brahman. [II – I – 1]

- Brahma Jnanam will give liberation.
- Sruti can’t reveal Brahman directly.
- To go from ground to 5th level need steps.
- To go from grosser to subtler level need 5 koshas steps.
- Annamaya Kosha / Pranamaya Kosha / Manomaya Kosha / Vigyanamaya Kosha / Anandamaya Kosha.
• Eyes needs Acclimatisation to go from sunlight to darkness.
• Mind needs acclimatisation to go from gross to subtle.
• All upasana to train the mind to see.. Brahman.

Katho Upanishad:
• Drishyatu Agrayaya…. Sukshmaya Sukshma taram darshibihi.

Some commentators:
• Ananda maya not Kosha but Brahman.
• Visihta Advaitam and Vrittikara matam also claims this.

Shankara:
• Initially accepts Anandamaya as Brahman and in 20th Sutra – says Anandamaya can’t be Brahman. Reinterprets sutras advaita interpretation in end.

3 Stages of Interpretation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vyakyanam</th>
<th>Khandanam</th>
<th>Advaitik</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vrittikara</td>
<td>Vrittikara Refutation</td>
<td>Reinterpretation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Each Kosha introduced as Atma.
• Anyontara atma Pranamaya, Manomaya, Vigyanamaya, Anandamaya. Hence Annamaya and others are koshas, dresses.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Anya</th>
<th>Antara</th>
<th>Previous One</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Another</td>
<td>Interior</td>
<td>Exterior</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Sankhya 1st Reason:
- After Anandamaya – Anyontara not mentioned. Hence Brahman only 4 koshas.
- Get taittriya by heart and jump up + down to see philosophy.

Taittriya Upanishad:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>यतो वाचो निवर्तते । अप्राप्य मनसा सह । आनंद्य ब्रह्मणो विद्वान् । न विभेदित कदाचनेति ।</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>तस्येष एव शारीर आत्मा । यः पूर्वस्य ॥ १ ॥</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

yato vaco nivartante, aprapya manasa saha, anandam brahmano vidvan, na bibhete kadacaneti, tasyaisa eva sarira atma yah purvasya ॥ 1 ॥

Whence all the speech turns back with the mind without reaching It (the eternal Truth, the Brahman), He who knows the bliss of eternal Truth, the Brahman, fears not at any time. This mind is the embodied soul of the pranamaya. Of this (pranamaya) the manomaya is the Self. [II – IV – 1]

- Yato vaco nivartante... Manomaya.

2nd Reason:
- Rig – sloka – talks about Brahman after Ananda maya. Culmination of internal journey.

Shankara:
- Refutes and gives 5 Arguments of Brahman sutra + 1 of Taittriya upanishad.

1st Argument:
- Ananda maya has gradation – Priya, moda, pramoda – experiential happiness.
- Nonexperiential happiness – no gradation.
- Where Ananda means Anantha.
- Ananda Atma is inner essence core pith is atma.
- Ananda is Atma of Ananda maya.
- In Anandamaya kosha, Ananda becomes Atma.
**1st Reason:**
- Anadasye antar atmane yuktatvat = Anandamaya Antaratmani bavati.
- Ananda is inner self of Ananda, Ananda maya becomes experiential Ananda kosha.

**2nd Argument:**
- At end Rig mantra doesn’t refer to Anandamaya. Talks of Brahman putcham... Asanneva...

**Taittiriya Upanishad:**

| असंभव संभवति । असाध्वस्तं बेद चेतः । अस्ति प्रभृतिष्ठुं चेदाद । सन्तमेन ततो विदुरिति । तस्यैष एवं शारीर आत्मा । य: पूर्वस्य ॥ ॥ | asanneva sa bhavati, asadbrahmeti veda cet । asti brahmeti cedveda, santamenam tato viduriti । tasyaisa eva sarira atma yah purvasya ॥ ॥ |

If he knows Brahman as non-existent, he becomes himself non-existent. If he knows Brahman as existent, then (they) the world knows him to be existent. Of the former (anandamaya kosa), the Self is the essence. [II – VI – 1]
Lecture 44

- Argument in Taittriya Upanishad.
- 1st Argument of Vrittikara.

Taittriya Upanishad:

Of that, of the former, this one verily is the embodied self, different from this self made up of intellect (vijnanamaya) is another self within, formed of bliss (anandamaya). By this, that is filled (by anandamaya the vijnanamaya is full). It also has the shape of man. According to the human form of that is the human form of this. Of it, joy (priya) is the right side, rejoicing (moda) is the left side, and bliss (pramoda) is the trunk. Brahman is the tail support. There is this following Vaidika verse about it. [II – V – 2]

- Tasya Priya me shiraha...after Anandamaya Kosha, Ananda Atma introduced.
- Hence Ananda Maya = Kosha.
- Ananda without Maya = Atma.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Anandamaya Kosha</th>
<th>Ananda Atma</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Experiential Ananda fluctuating, Pratibimba Ananda.</td>
<td>- Non experiential Ananda.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Fullness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Poornatvam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- No fluctuation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- No tara tamyam – Manushya, Deva, Ghandharva.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Bimba Ananda.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Antar Atma.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2nd Argument:
- At end of Anandamaya, Rig mantra talks of Brahman.
- Ananda Atma = Brahman.

Shankara:
- Brahman in Rig does not refer to Anananmaya Kosha but to Brahman = Ananda Atma.
- Not Priya, Moda, Pramoda of Ananda.
- Nigamana Sloka.

3rd Argument: Grammatical
- Maya indicates kosha not Brahman.
- Suffix:
  - Ananda – Maya / Mayat
  - Svarga – Maya
  - Vishnu – Maya.

- Modification
  - Vikara
  - Svarnamayam (Gold) – Abarnam
  - Rajatamaya (Silver) – Abarnam
  - Darumaya (Wood) - Peetham

- Abundance
  - Prayuretam
  - Saturation
• Golden – “en” = Modification
• Wooden – “en” = Modification

Maya indicates Vikarta:
• Changing object, not changeless.
• Anandamaya = Vikara / Savikara can’t be Brahman.
• Na Brahman – Savikaratvat Annamaya vatu.
• Body = Annamaya – modification of Annam metabolism / digestion.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Karanam</th>
<th>Karyam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Prana</td>
<td>- Pranamaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Brahman</td>
<td>- Anandamaya / Savikaram</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• No experiential happiness in Brahman. Experiential Ananda = Fake Ananda = Kosha.
• Subject to fluctuation.
• I am happy / happier / happiest / sorrowfuller...
• Tara Tama bava.
• Suffix – 2nd meaning – Abundance or saturated Ananda.
• Predominance of Ananda – some Dukham in it.
• Mostly happy / Dukha Lesam.
• Brahman = Embodiment of Ananda.
  = Mayat Rahita Ananda.

3rd Argument:
• Mayat Antardvena – Savikaratvat, subject to modification like Annamayavat prana Kriyatvat.
4th Argument:

- Priyadi Avayatvat.

Taittriya Upanishad:

Of that, of the former, this one verily is the embodied self, different from this self made up of intellect (vijnanamaya) is another self within, formed of bliss (anandamaya). By this, that is filled (by anandamaya the vijnanamaya is full). It also has the shape of man. According to the human form of that is the human form of this. Of it, joy (priya) is the right side, rejoicing (moda) is the left side, and bliss (pramoda) is the trunk. Brahman is the tail support. There is this following Vaidika verse about it. [II – V – 2]

- Anyontara Atma... Priya / Moda / Pramoda.
- Anandamaya has parts, Limbs, Avayavam.
- Anandamaya has head, legs, hands.
- Pranamaya / Manomaya / Vigyana Maya has head, legs, hands
- Anything with part is product, contraction / modification / expansion / limitation → Parichinantvam
- Yatu Savayava, tatu karyam, savikaram, ghatavatu.
- Anandamaya Savayavam, limited product, Kosha.
- Brahman = Niravayavam / Nishkalam.

Free from parts, eternal, not karyam not parichinnam.
• 4th Argument = Priyadi Avayavatu.
• 5th Argument = Prithak prithakvena uchhatvat.
• Brahman separately mentioned – as Ananda Maya Putcham – Aadhara, support of Anandamaya.
• Desk is support of clock.
  ↓ ↓
  Supporter Supported
• Supporter / supported – not identical.
• Anandamaya – supported by Brahman.
• Ananda Atma Brahman Putcham Pratishta.
• Brahman is separately enumerated.

6th Argument:

**Taittriya Sutra Bashyam:**

- Brahmanda valli – at end talks of benefit of Jnanam.

| Tasyaisa eva sarira atma, yah purvasya, tasmadva etasmadvijnanamayat, anyo’ntara atmanandamayah, tenaisa purnah, sa va esa purusavidha eva, tasya purusavidhatam, avayam purusavidhah, tasya priyameva sirah, modo daksinah paksah, pramoda uttarah paksah, ananda atma, brahma puccham pratistha, tadapyesa sloko bhavati II 2 II |

Of that, of the former, this one verily is the embodied self, different from this self made up of intellect (vijnanamaya) is another self within, formed of bliss (anandamaya). By this, that is filled (by anandamaya the vijnanamaya is full). It also has the shape of man. According to the human form of that is the human form of this. Of it, joy (priya) is the right side, rejoicing (moda) is the left side, and bliss (pramoda) is the trunk. Brahman is the tail support. There is this following Vaidika verse about it. [II – V – 2]

- Jnani crosses over all Koshas Upasankramati – transcends means disidentifies will all 5 koshas.
- Transcend Annamaya means – I no more look upon myself as Annamaya but external dress of mine.
- Coat / Shirt / Banyan....
• Suppose Ananda maya is Brahman... then I must disidentify with Brahman also. If Brahman dropped, then Shunyavada then Madhyantara Buddhism.
• We are going to study all sutras based on Advaita Vyakya.

General Analysis:
Taittiriya Upanishad: Anandamaya

Of that, of the former, this one verily is the embodied self, different from this self made up of intellect (vijnanamaya) is another self within, formed of bliss (anandamaya). By this, that is filled (by anandamaya the vijnanamaya is full). It also has the shape of man. According to the human form of that is the human form of this. Of it, joy (priya) is the right side, rejoicing (moda) is the left side, and bliss (pramoda) is the trunk. Brahman is the tail support. There is this following Vaidika verse about it. [II – V – 2]

- Tail – part – Avayavam (limb).
- Any part is Subsidiary to whole – secondary to whole, Amukhyam, Paratantram.
- Part depends on whole for survival. Every state depends on centre.
• Amsha – Amsham Ashrayat
• Part – whole.
• Avayava – Avayavi.
• Brahman introduced as tail of Ananda Maya Kosha – Prishta Baga.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Brahman</th>
<th>Anandamaya</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Avayava</td>
<td>- Avayavi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Tail</td>
<td>- Whole.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Amukhya</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Subservient</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Secondary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Paratantram not Svatantram</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Dependent</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Is Brahman secondary, Paratantram, to Anandamaya – dependent on Anandamaya?
• Brahman not secondary to Anandamaya – even though it is tail of Anandamaya.
• Brahman not dependent on Anandamaya, independent, even though presented as tail Putcham of Ananda Maya.
• Brahman = Primary + Independent as tail of Anandamaya.
• Anandamaya – Putcha Rupam Brahman Abhyasat.
• Abyasat – 1st reason to establish. All argument say Brahman is Svatantram.
• Prachuryat – Tadetu Vyapadeshat.

And because he is declared to be the cause of it (i.e. of bliss; therefore ‘maya’ denotes abundance or fullness). [I – I – 14]
13th Sutra:

विकारशब्दन्नेति चेत न प्रचुरयात् | Vikarasabdanneti chet na prachuryat |

If (it be objected that the term Anandamaya consisting of bliss can) not (denote the Supreme Self) because of its being a word denoting a modification or transformation or product (we say that the objection is) not (valid) on account of abundance, (which is denoted by the suffix ‘maya’). [I – I – 13]

2nd Argument:

- Na prachuryat.

General Analysis:

Purva Pakshi:

- Brahman Svatnam – can’t accept.
- Gives indirect reason.
- Putcham – tail – portion – dependent on whole.
- Kerala depends on India for survival.
- Hair part of Body.
- Avayava means Paratantram, not Svatnam.

Sutra 13

Purva Pakshi Baga

Siddanta Baga

Vikara Shabdat Na Prachuryat

Etichet Na Prachuryat
Vyasa:

- Putcham – not used in literal sense at all.
- Not avayavarthe used as Lakshyartha – implied meaning Adhara Arthe. Brahman is Adhara tail supports bird in its flight.
- Why Putcham used by Upanishad?

5 items for Upasana for 5 Koshas

- Shira
- Right Paksha
- Left Paksha
- Madhya
- Putcham

- Brahman introduced as Putcham. If Anandamaya is missed, Brahman can never be introduced independently because:

Taittriya Upanishad:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>यतो वाचो निवर्तन्ते । अप्राप्य भ्रानस सह । आनन्दं व्रह्मणो विद्वान् । न विभेदित कदाचनेति । तत्स्येष एव शारीर आत्मा । यः पूर्वस्य ॥ १॥</th>
<th>यतो वाचो निवर्तन्ते, अप्राप्य भ्रानस सह, आनन्दं व्रह्मणो विद्वान, न विभेदित कदाचनेति, तत्स्येष एव शारीर आत्मा, यः पूर्वस्य ॥ १॥</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Whence all the speech turns back with the mind without reaching It (the eternal Truth, the Brahman), He who knows the bliss of eternal Truth, the Brahman, fears not at any time. This mind is the embodied soul of the pranamaya. Of this (pranamaya) the manomaya is the Self. [II – IV – 1]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Brahman revealed with Upadhi alone. Without Upadhi, Naiva vache.
- Last Upadhi available is Putcham 2 Anumanams here.
**Purva Pakshi**:

- Vikara Shabdat - Anandamayastham Brahma.
  - Avayava – limb.
  - Na Svatantram.
- Brahma Na Svatantram.

**Hetu**:

- Vikara Shabdat.
- Dog wags tail, tail can’t wag dog.

**Siddanta**:

- Etichet – if Purva Pakshi argues like that Brahma Na Paratantram – Prachuryat – predominant for Agreement. Putcham used here not to indicate Avayava but to agree with Putcha Shabda in previous cases (Annamaya, Pranamaya).

**Siddanta**:

- Putcha here = Adhara.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Purva Pakshi</th>
<th>Siddantin</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Vachyartham</td>
<td>- Lakshyartham</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Tail / Limb / Avayava</td>
<td>- Adharam implied meaning of siddantin suits better keeping in context.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Tail also not limb, hands, legs also limbs.</td>
<td>2nd Reason Anumanam:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Tail as limb also Lakshyartha.</td>
<td>- Anandamayastham Brahma na apradhanam prachuryat.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Vachyartha powerful direct meaning.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Car hits directly – Powerful</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Car hits indirectly – Weaker.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Both taking implied meaning.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Anumanam**:

- Anandamayastham Brahma na Pradhanam, Vikara Shabdat.
Sutra 14:

\[
\begin{tabular}{l}
\text{तद्बृहत्तुव्यपदेशाच्छ।} \\
\text{Taddhetuvyapadesaccha।}
\end{tabular}
\]

And because he is declared to be the cause of it (i.e. of bliss; therefore ‘maya’ denotes abundance or fulness). [I – I – 14]

3rd Reason:

General Analysis:

- Brahman is Svatantram, Brahman introduced at end of Anandamaya.
- Last portion focused on tail of Anandamaya.

Taittiriya Upanishad:

If he knows Brahman as non-existent, he becomes himself non-existent. If he knows Brahman as existent, then (they) the world knows him to be existent. Of the former (anandamaya kosa), the Self is the essence. [II – VI – 1]

1st:

- Brahman = Srishti Karanam = Satyam Jnanam....

Om, the knower of Brahman attains the Supreme. With reference to that, is the following hymn recited: Brahman is the Truth, Knowledge and Infinity. He who knows It as existing in the cave of the heart in the transcendent akasa, realises all his desires along with omniscient Brahman. [II – I – 1]
He desired, “I shall become many and be born. He performed tapas; having performed tapas, He created all this whatsoever (we perceive). Having created it, He entered into it. Having entered it, He became the manifest and the unmanifest, the defined and undefined, the housed and the houseless, knowledge and ignorance, truth and falsehood, and all this whatsoever that exists. Therefore, it is called Existence. In this sense, there is the following Vaidika verse.” [II – VI – 3]

Question:

Saha refers to

- Anandamaya becomes jagat karanam.
- Anandamaya is limited entity – can’t be Jagat Karanam

Brahman?

Siddantin

Purva Pakshi

Ananda Maya?
Taittiriya Upanishad:

Of that, of the former, this one verily is the embodied self, different from this self made up of intellect (vijnanamaya) is another self within, formed of bliss (anandamaya). By this, that is filled (by anandamaya the vijnanamaya is full). It also has the shape of man. According to the human form of that is the human form of this. Of it, joy (priya) is the right side, rejoicing (moda) is the left side, and bliss (pramoda) is the trunk. Brahman is the tail support. There is this following Vaidika verse about it. [II – V – 2]

- Limited, Savayava Ananda Maya not Jagat Karanam.
- That Brahma akamayata, is Svatantram because it is Jagat Karanam.
Lecture 46

Question:
- Brahman in Ananda maya Prakaranam is Svatantram or Paratantram?
- Putcham – part – Dependent?

Siddantin:
- Brahman = Svatantram, not Avayavam, Paratantram.

Reason:
1) Abhyasat.
2) Prachuryat.
3) Desha Vyapadeshat.

General Analysis:
- Brahman revealed as Jagat Karanam (Including Pancha Kosha).
- Brahman presented as Anandamaya putcham.
- Anandamaya Kosha = Has Limbs Priya, Moda, Avayava Visishta (with Gradation).

Rule:
- Yatu Savayavam Tatu Karyam.

Who is

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dependent</th>
<th>Independent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Karyam</td>
<td>- Karanam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Anandamaya</td>
<td>- Brahman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Depends on Brahman</td>
<td>- Supporter of Anandamaya not part of Anandamaya.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Paratantram</td>
<td>- Hetu of Creation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Svatantram</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Anumanam:
  • Brahma Svatantram, Jagat Karanam Vyapadeshat Annavatu, Vyatirakena – Ghatavatu.

Saha Akamayatu:
  • He desired + created
    ↓
    Pronoun – Saha refers to Noun
    ↓
    Brahman which is introduced as Putcham in Anandamaya.
  • Brahman = Neuter gender.
  • Pronoun should agree with gender.
  • Rama went – not she went to forest – not they went to forest but he went to forest.
  • Saha = Masculine gender.

Purva Pakshi:
  • Anandamaya – Masculine.
  • Saha refers to Masculine.
  • Therefore Anandamaya = Jagat Karanam = Pradhanam = Saha
  • Pronoun refers to immediately preceding noun – Anandamaya.
  • Story of Dasharatha + Rama – He should refer to Rama not Dasharatha, even though both Masculine.
Taittiriya Upanishad:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tasyaisa eva sarira atma, yah purvasya, tasmadva etasmadvijnavamamasyat, anyo'ntara atmanandamayah, tenaisa purnah, sa va esa purusavidha eva, tasya purusavidhatam, anvayam purusavidhah, tasya priyameva sirah, modo daksinah paksah, pramoda uttarah paksah, ananda atma, brahma puchham pratistha, tadapyesa sloko bhavati II 2 II</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Of that, of the former, this one verily is the embodied self, different from this self made up of intellect (vijnanamaya) is another self within, formed of bliss (anandamaya). By this, that is filled (by anandamaya the vijnanamaya is full). It also has the shape of man. According to the human form of that is the human form of this. Of it, joy (priya) is the right side, rejoicing (moda) is the left side, and bliss (pramoda) is the trunk. Brahman is the tail support. There is this following Vaidika verse about it. [II – V – 2]

- After Anandamaya – Putcham used not after Brahman.
- Saha refers to Anandamaya.

**Question:**

- How gender refers to Brahman – without gender Agreement?

**Siddantin:**

- Upanishad does not want to make any difference between Brahman and Atma.
- Atma = Masculine.
- Sometimes uses neuter / masculine pronoun to show Pronoun mixed up.
- Brahman + Atma identical. Clear when we study beginning portion of Brahmanda valli – Chapter 2.
Taittiriya Upanishad:

Om, the knower of Brahman attains the Supreme. With reference to that, is the following hymn recited: Brahman is the Truth, Knowledge and Infinity. He who knows It as existing in the cave of the heart in the transcendent akasa, realises all his desires along with omniscient Brahman. [II – I – 1]

- Tasmata va etasmat – refers to Brahman which is defined as Satyam, Jnanam, Anantham.
- From that Brahman which is none other than this Ananda Atma, Brahman Putcham Pratishtam...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Brahmananda Valli – Chapter 2</th>
<th>Brigu Valli – Chapter 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Anandamaya Atma</td>
<td>- Ananda Atma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Ananda Maya = Brahman</td>
<td>- Anando Brahmo Divya Janat [III – VI – 1]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Saha Atma</td>
<td>- Atma = Brahman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Tatu Brahman.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Taittiriya Upanishad:

He knew that Bliss was Brahman, for, from Bliss all these beings are produced, by Bliss do these beings live. They go to Bliss on departing and become one with it – this is the knowledge learnt by Bhrgu and taught by Varuna. This is established in the supreme space – in the excellent cavity of the heart. He who knows thus becomes one with Brahman. He becomes the possessor (assimilator) of food and the eater (enjoyer) of it. He becomes great in progeny, cattle and gains the splendor of true brahmana-hood. Indeed, he becomes great through fame and renown. [III – VI – 1]
Sokamayata = Saha Brahma Binna Atma.

**Purva Pakshi:**
- Is Anandamaya Jagat Karanam or Brahma – Jagat – Karanam.

**Siddantin:**
- Brahma alone Jagat karanam, it is Svatrtram not Paratantram.

**Word Analysis:**
- Hetu = Tad Detu Vyapadeshatu cha.
- Brahman is presented as Jagat Karanam supply 2 words to complete Anumanam.
- Putchem Brahman = Paksha
- Svatrtram = Sadhyam.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tatu</th>
<th>Hetu</th>
<th>Vyapadeshat</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brahman</td>
<td>Jagat Karanam</td>
<td>Mentioned in Veda</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- This is reason to establish Brahman is Svatrtram.

**Purva Pakshi:**

**Cha:**
- Brahman is Paratantram because it is presented as tail part not whole.

**Siddantin:**
- Look at Putchem in Vigyanamaya Pramanam where Putchem is Hiranyakarba.
- Tasmat va etasmat.. Vigyanamaya.. Yajur vedas Parayamanam develops memory.
- Tasya Purusha Vidatam Anya Purusham comes....
- Sraddha – faith – head of Vigyanamaya.
- Ritham – Shastric knowledge – Right side of Vigyanamaya.
- Satyam = Truthfulness – left side of Vigyanamaya.
- Yoga Atma = Concentration – Central part of Vigyanamaya.
- Ritham = Tail = Samashti Sukshma Sharira or Hiranyagarbha.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vigyanamaya</th>
<th>Hiranyagarbha = Tail</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Vyashti</td>
<td>- Samashti</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Small existing</td>
<td>- Macrocosm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Within Annamaya, Pranamaya, Manomaya</td>
<td>- Adhara Lakshana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Not physical limb Avayava – part.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Putcham – 2 meanings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Avayava</th>
<th>Adhara</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Limb</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- In Annamaya, it is Avayavam.
- In Pranamaya, Prithvi = Putcham, Adharam.
- In Manomaya – Avayavam.
- In Vigyanamaya – Adharam.
- See context and fix meaning appropriately.
Example:

a) Government puts ceiling on all houses.
   - Not roof but limit.

b) 

   ![Diagram]
   
   - Inflation
     - Balloon
     - Economy

c) 

   ![Diagram]
   
   - Reduction
     - Oxidation in chemistry
     - Prices

d) 

   ![Diagram]
   
   - Anandamaya
     - Avayavam
       - Does not fit
     - Adharam
       - Chakara Indicates Adhara
Sutra 15:

Moreover that very Brahman which has been re-referred to in the Mantra portion is sung (i.e. proclaimed in the Brahmana passage as the Anandamaya). [I – I – 15]

- 4th Sutra of Anandamaya Adhikaranam.
- Reason to establish Putcham Brahman as Svatantram not Paratantram.

General Analysis:

- Look at Brahmananda Valli – Birds eye vision.
- Pradhana Vastu = Brahman = Mukhyam = Svatantram.

Beginning:

Taittiriya Upanishad:

Om, the knower of Brahman attains the Supreme. With reference to that, is the following hymn recited: Brahman is the Truth, Knowledge and Infinity. He who knows It as existing in the cave of the heart in the transcendent akasa, realises all his desires along with omniscient Brahman. [II – I – 1]

- Knower of Brahman attains Brahman.
- If Brahman is Paratantram, dependent, by reaching it, I can’t get freedom slave not free by another slave but by a free person.
- Yajur veda Brahmana takes support of Rig Veda support.
- Bahmana Baga = Commentary on Mantra Baga.
Tadesha Yukta, Satyam Jnanam Anantam Brahma.

- Arundati Darshana Nyayena Upanishad reveals Brahma through Pancha Koshas.
- Tasmat Va Etasmat = Brahman is Jagat karanam Kosha Karanam.
- Prithvya, Oshadaya.. Upto Annamaya is Karyam. Annamaya is last creation.
- Then goes backwards:
  Annamaya – Pranamaya – Manomaya – Vigyanamaya.
  Infinite – Satyam, Jnanam, Anantham.
- Brahman of Ananda Maya Prakaranam is Brahman of Rig Mantra as it is commentary on it.
- Because brahmavitv Aapnoti param, Brahman Njanena Moksha Bavati.
- Anandamaya Brahman is Putcham Brahman called by Vyasa as Mantra Varnikam.
- It is that independent infinite Brahman mentioned in Mantra Varnam.

Anumanam:
- Putcha Brahma Svatantram, Mantra Varnikatvat Atmavatu.
Om, the knower of Brahman attains the Supreme. With reference to that, is the following hymn recited: Brahman is the Truth, Knowledge and Infinity. He who knows It as existing in the cave of the heart in the transcendent akasa, realises all his desires along with omniscient Brahman. [II – I – 1]

- Vyatirikena Ghatu vatu – unlike a pot.

**Word Meaning:**

- Mantra varnikam eva liyate.
- That Brahman which is mentioned in Rig mantra Satyam Jnanam Anantam brahma eva – that alone is talked about, not new Brahman.
- If Brahmans are different, what is Damage?
- By knowing Brahman, Moksha to be gained.
- By knowing Mind – Brahman and Paramatma – Brahman – No Moksha – Brahman’s can’t be different.

**Chakara:**

- Conjunction.
- Because of 4 reasons – Sutras 12, 13, 14, 15.
- Brahman is Pradhanam, Svatantram not Paratantram.
- Why doubt?
- Brahman presented as part of Anandamaya.
- If anandamaya is whole, it will become Svatantram and Brahman will become part, paratantram – Brahman will become tail of Anandamaya.

**We reverse:**

- Anandamaya is Paratantram. Brahman is Svatantram (4 Sutras).
- Next 2 Sutras – we establish Ananda maya is Paratntram.
Lecture 47

Anandamayadhikaranam

8 Sutras

4 Sutras

Why there is doubt in Putcham Brahman is Svatantram, Pradhanam

2 Sutras

Anandamaya is not Pradhanam, Paratantram, Asvatantram

Literal meaning / superficial meaning :

Brahman

- Part
- Tail
- Avayavam
- Apradhanam

Putcham of Anandamaya

- Whole
- Avayavi
- Pradhanam

Vyasa :

- 4 reasons Brahman is Svapradhanam Svatantram.
- Abyasat, Prachuryat, Tad Vyapadesat, mantra Varnikatvat.
Next 2 Sutras:
- Anandamaya Apradhanam – secondary, not important.
- As Paratantram – not independent, dependent.
- What is dependent is Unimportant.

16th Sutra:

Netaro’nupapatteh

(Brahman and) not the other (i.e. the individual soul is meant here) on account of the impossibility (of the latter assumption). [I – I – 16]

General Analysis:
Main Topic:
- Anandamaya – Na Pradhanam.

Brahmanda Valli:
- Brahma Jnanam leads to liberation for Mumukshu.
- **Brahman introduced as:**
  - Satyam – Nirvikara, Changeless
  - Jnanam – Consciousness.
  - Anantham – Not limited.
- Brahman = Jagat Karanam.

Taittiriya Upanishad:

From that (which is) this Atman, is space born; from akasa, air; from air, fire; from fire, water; from water, earth; from earth, herbs; from herbs, food; and from food, man. [II – 1 – 2]
He desired, ‘I shall become many and be born. He performed tapas; having performed tapas, He created all this whatsoever (we perceive). Having created it, He entered into it. Having entered it. He became the manifest and the unmanifest, the defined and undefined, the housed and the houseless, knowledge and ignorance, truth and falsehood, and all this whatsoever that exists. Therefore, it is called existence. In this sense, there is the following Vaidika verse.’ [II – VI – 2]

- That Brahman is Jagat Karanam – desired.

3rd time repeated: Taittriya Upanishad

In the beginning was verily this non-existence. From that the existent was born. That created Itself by itself. Therefore, it is called the self-made or the well made. [II – VII – 1]

- 3 times Brahman repeated as Jagat Karanam.

Conclusion:
- Anando Brahma Vidwan... Emphasises Brahman = Satyam, Jnanam Anantham.
- Anandamaya can’t be Satyam.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Satyam</th>
<th>Anandamaya – Apradhanam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Changeless</td>
<td>- Experiential pleasure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Seed, Karanam</td>
<td>- Changing – Priya, Moda, Pramoda.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Can’t see part, (Trunk, fruits, Branches).</td>
<td>- Savikara</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Niravayavam.</td>
<td>- Mithya – Not Satyam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Not infinite, not Anantham, not Svatantram, Anavayavam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Endowed with parts, boundary, limitation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- What has Avayavam is Karyam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Tree with parts.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Anumanam:**
- Anandamaya na svatantraha, napradhanam tasmat – Anupapatehe.
- It is impossible for Anandamaya to become independent, important, because it is not Satyam, Anantam, karanam.

**Word Analysis:**
- Na itaraha anupapate Svatantraha.

**Read As:**
- Itaraha na svatantraha Anupapatte
  - Other one Anandamaya
  - Kataraha?
  - Not Brahman – 4 Sutras talked about it.
  - Anandamaya not central theme of Brahmananda Valli, not tatparyam.

**Anupapatte:**
- Because it is not logical, proper, reasonable, fitting, deserving to be central theme.
- Because it is not Moksha hetuhu.
Sutra 17 : (6th Sutra of Anandamaya)

And on account of the declaration of the difference (between the two i.e. the one referred to in the passage ‘The Self consisting of bliss’ etc. and the individual soul, the latter cannot be the one referred to in the passage). [I – I – 17]

General Analysis :
• Brahma focused as Jagat Karanam.

Taittiriya Upanishad :

From that (which is) this Atman, is space born; from akasa, air; from air, fire; from fire, water; from water, earth; from earth, herbs; from herbs, food; and from food, man. [II – 1 – 2]

• Brahman = Ananda Svarupa – Raso vai saha.
• Brahman Binna Atma = Eka Rasa.
• In this sutra concentrate on Raso vai saha.
• Brahman is nature of Ananda.
• Having attained Brahman, this Ananda maya kosha becomes happy.
• Ayam – Anandamaya kosha.
• Anandi Bavati – becomes happy through priya, moda, pramoda vrittis.
• Anandamaya is reflection, receiver of Brahma ananda – Labdva – having aquired.
Brahman is Pradhanam proved – source of Moksha – in beginning + end of Brahma Ananda Valli.
Satyam, Jnanam, Anantham is moksha hetu.

Logic:
- Anandamaya – Apradhanam, secondary, because it is different from Adharam Brahman.
- Rasam Labdva Anandi Bavati
  ↓  ↓
  Received  Anandamaya
- Pradhana – Brahman Hetav Upadeshat.

Word Analysis:
- Bhedav Vyapadeshat cha
  ↓  ↓  ↓
  Sruti Vakyat
  Different, Distinct from Pradhanam Brahman.
Shankara reinterprets only 1\textsuperscript{st} three sutras:

- Rest our home work.
- Vrittikara matam – reinterpretation.
- 8 Sutras – 2 Sutras of Advaitin.
- Subcommentators Bashyam are there...

Cha:
- To connect with previous sutra.
- Brahma = Svapradhanam.

7\textsuperscript{th} Sutra to 18\textsuperscript{th} Sutra:

Because of wishing or willing in the scriptural passage we cannot say even inferentially that Anandamaya means Pradhana. [I – I – 18]
Last 2 Sutras:

- Anandamaya is not Brahman.
- If Anandamaya and Brahman are identical then 2 Pradhanams, limitations occur.

General Analysis:

Purva Pakshi:

- Anandamaya = Brahman = VIP status.

Logic:

- When something controversial, take similar topic from another upanishad.

Example:

```
ईक्षणेनोःशब्दम् ।  लक्ष्यतेनाशाब्दम।
```

The Pradhana of the Samkhya is not the cause of the universe, because it is not mentioned in the Upanisads, which fact is clear from the fact of seeing (or thinking).

[1 – I – 5]

- Sat used as Jagat Karanam.
- Is Sat Chetanam or Achetanam.
- See other Upanishads and see where Atma / Brahman taken as Jagat Karanam.
- Brahman = Chetanam.
- Therefore Sat has to be chetanam.
- Go to Brigu Valli : Chapter 3 Taittriya Upanishad Kosha Viveka Done.
- Annam Brahmeti Divya Janat
- Prano / Mano / Vigyana / Ananda Brahmeti Divya Janet.
- Anandamaya is said as Brahman in Brigu Valli.
Mistake:
- 1st: Annam taken as Brahman.
- 2nd: Prano / Mano / Vigyana / Ananda taken as Brahman.

In Brigu Valli:
- Take 5th = Ananda as Brahman and doesn’t come back.
- Upanishad ends – Taisa Bargavi Vidya / Varuni Vidya.
- 5th one of Brahma Ananda valli – 2nd Chapter should be Brahman.

Purva Pakshi – Anumanam:
- Anandamaya Brahman – why?
- Panchakatvat Anandavatu.

Siddantin:
- Such Anumanam should not done by you.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Anandamaya</th>
<th>Ananda</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brahmanda Valli 5th</td>
<td>Brighu Valli 5th</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Can’t be identical because both are 5th.
- Suffix Maya in Grammar reveals modification – Change “Mayad Vikarante” – Anandamaya = Savikara Padarte.
- Ananda = Nirvikara Padartha.
- Nirvikara not equal to Savikara.
Lecture 48

Anandadikaranam:

Taittirya Upanishad:
- Anyontra atma – Anandamaya Brahma putcham pratishtam.

Purva Pakshi:
- Brahman = Part of anandamaya.
- How infinite Brahman becomes part of finite kosha?

Brahman:
- Not tail but Adhara of 5 Koshas.
- Pancha kosha Adhishtana buta brahma.
- Brahman not part of anything. Independent is essence, Sara of Brahmanda valli.

Presented in 3 ways

- Sutra 1 – 4
  - Brahman = Svatatram, independent, Pradhanam – Prominent.

- Sutra 5 – 6
  - Anandamaya – Paratantram dependant Apradhanam secondary, subsidiary.

- Sutra 7 – 8
  - Apradhana Anandamaya not Brahman.
Sutra 18 : (7th Sutra of Ananda)

Because of wishing or willing in the scriptural passage we cannot say even inferentially that Anandamaya means Pradhana. [I – I – 18]

Argument of Purva Pakshi:

- Because it is 5th of Brahmananda valli – 2nd Chapter of Taittriya Upanishad it is same as 5th in Brigu valli – Chapter 3.
- In both chapters Pancha Kosha Viveka done.

Advantage:

- Vagueness in 2 Chapter – therefore see 3rd Chapter.

Controversy:

- Is Ananda maya Brahman or not?

Taittriya Upanishad:

He knew that bliss was Brahman, for, from Bliss all these beings are produced, by Bliss do these beings live. They go to Bliss on departing and become one with it – this is the knowledge learnt by Bhrgu and taught by Varuna. This is established in the supreme space – in the excellent cavity of the heart. He who knows thus becomes one with Brahman. He becomes the possessor (assimilator) of food and the eater (enjoyer) of it. He becomes great in progeny, cattle and gains the splendor of true brahmana-hood. Indeed, he becomes great through fame and renown. [III – VI – 1]
Anumanam:

- Anandamaya Panchavat Brigu valli stha anandavat.

Vyasa's Answer:

- Such inference not correct.
- Na Anumana Apeksha.

Word Analysis:

How Purva Pakshi does Anumanam?

Takes Example:

- Kamaha = Ananda – Karma Vitpatti Kamayate it kama.
- That which is desired by all.
- That which is desired is Ananda.

Na:

- Not there, non-existent.
Meaning of Sutra:
- There is impossibility.
- Purva Pakshi example is wrong.

Why Purva Pakshi Anumanam wrong?
- Anandamaya of Brahmananda valli not Ananda of Brigu valli.
- Both 5th one – Both come after Vigyanamaya.
- Drishtanta Vishamaha – wrong example.
- Why they can’t be educated?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Anandamaya - Brahmanda Valli</th>
<th>Ananda - Brigu Valli</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Savikara Padartha</td>
<td>- Nirvikara Chaitanyam / Padartha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Moda / pramoda</td>
<td>- Universally present</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- More / most happiness</td>
<td>- Atma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Increases / decreases.</td>
<td>- Changeless consciousness.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Kosha</td>
<td>- Not subject to arrival, departure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Exaperiential pleasure</td>
<td>- Ananda has special meaning in Brigu valli translate as Anantam, limitless, wholeness, fullness, infinitude.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Ordinary / mystical pleasure in Samadhi.</td>
<td>- Non fluctuating entity, eternal bliss.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Only in Samadhi, not before or after.</td>
<td>- Satyam, Jnanam – refers to nonfluctuating principle.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Sate of mind, subject to fluctuation.</td>
<td>- Translate as infinite here + now.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Pleasure / ecstasy</td>
<td>- Siddham.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Sadhyam</td>
<td>- Poorna eka rupena vastu.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Happiness</td>
<td>- Desha kala Aparichina rupena buma.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Wholeness / poorna vastu.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Siddantin:
- Anandamaya na Brahman savikaravatu, maya Dantavatu like Anna / Prana / Mano / Vigyanamaya.
Chakara:

- **In Ikshadikaranam – Chakara:**
  - Is Jagat Karanam Chetanam / Achetanam.

Chandogya Upanishad:

| सदेव सोम्येद्मग्न आसीदेकमेवाव्दितीयम् ।
| तद्वैक आहरसदे- वद्मग्न आसीदेकमेवाव्दितीयं
| तस्मादसत: सजायत ॥ १ ॥ । |

*Sadeva somyedamagra asidekamevadvitiyam; Taddhaika ahurasadevedamagra asidekamevadvitiyam
tasmadasatah sajjayata* [1]

Somya, before this world was manifest there was only existence, one without a second. On this subject, some maintain that before this world was manifest there was only non-existence, one without a second. Out of that non-existence, existence emerged. [6 – 2 – 1]

Conclusion:

- Sad Vastu is chetanam pradhanam not matter.
- Main reason it is chetanam because upanishad talks about “Visualisation” before creation.

Anumanam:

- Tat satcha vakyam, na pradhanam Ikshitvat.
- Visualisation by chetanam Brahman only.
- This sutra is 2nd interpretation and supports Ikshadhi Adhikaranam. This is 8th Reason.

Reason:

- Kamanscha – desiring Sad Vastu creates world by desiring not visualisation.
**Taittiriya Upanishad:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sanskrit</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>सो’कामयत्। बहु स्या प्रजायेति। स तपो’लप्यत्। स तपस्तज्ञस्। इद सर्वमसुज्जत। यदिं किंवच। तत्वुप्यव। तद्वानुप्रविष्ट। तदनु प्रविष्ट। सच्च त्यदाभवत। निर्मक्त चानिर्मक्तं। निलयनं चानिलयनं। विज्ञ चाविज्ञानं। सत्यं चावृतं। सत्यमभवत। यदिं किंवच। तत्तत्त्वमित्त्वाचक्षुब्ते। तदनुष्ठ श्लोको भवति।</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Sanskrit Text:**

So'kamayata, bahu syam prajayeyeti, sa tapo'tapyata,
sa tapastaptva idagm sarvamasrajata yadidam kinca,
tatsrstva tadevanupravisat,
tadanupravisya sacca tyaccabhavat,
niruktam caniruktam ca, nilayanam canilayanam ca,
vijnanam cavijnanam ca, satyam canrtam ca satyamabhavat,
yadidam kinca, tatsatyamityacaksate,
tadapyesa sloko bhavati II 3 II

**Translation:**

He desired, ‘I shall become many and be born. He performed tapas; having performed tapas, He created all this whatsoever (we perceive). Having created it, He entered into it. Having entered it. He became the manifest and the unmanifest, the defined and undefined, the housed and the houseless, knowledge and ignorance, truth and falsehood, and all this whatsoever that exists. Therefore, it is called existence. In this sense, there is the following Vaidika verse.’ [II – VI – 2]

- Jagat Karanam Brahman desired to create world so that Jivas punya papam is exhausted.
- Sad vastu pradhanat – Kamaat.
- Because of presence of desire.
- Pradhanam called Anumanam here technical – meaning in Sankhya + Vedantin.
- Normal meaning – inference.
- Sankhya establishes Pradhanam only through inference.
- Karma Vit patti.
Sutra 19:

And moreover it, i.e., the scripture, teaches the joining of this, i.e., the individual soul, with that, i.e., consisting of bliss (Anandamaya) when knowledge is attained.[I–I–19]

• Anandamaya not Brahman.

General Analysis:

• Anandamaya resolved into Brahman knowledge.

Aim of Upanishad:

• Brahman is Advaitam.
• Advaita Brahma Pratipadanam.

Why Advaitam?

• Because Dvitiyai Bayam Bavati.
• As long as there is Dvaitam there is Bayam, limitation, mortality, samsara.
• In Advaita alone there is Moksha. Advaitam Brahman Upanishad has to reveal.

Method:

1. Reveals Brahman.
2. Resolves whole creation into that Brahman.
Verily, all this is the Immortal Brahman. He is everywhere – above, below, in front, at the back, on the right, on the left. All this world is indeed the Supreme Brahman. [II – II – 11]

- Taitriya Upanishad resolves everything into Brahman.
- Anandamaya also resolved into Brahman.
- Hence they are one – identical.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Brahman</th>
<th>Anandamaya</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Resolver</td>
<td>Resolved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Destroyer</td>
<td>Destroyed</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Hence they are different is Purva Pakshi view.
Lecture 49

9th Sutra:

- Last sutra of Anandadhikaranam.

18th Mantra – Reason:

- Anandamaya is not Savikaram, because of suffix maya.
- Brahman Nirvikara – Not identical.
Sutra 19: 8th Sutra reason

And moreover it, i.e., the scripture, teaches the joining of this, i.e., the individual soul, with that, i.e., consisting of bliss (Anandamaya) when knowledge is attained. [I–I–19]

General Analysis:

• In Taittriya Upanishad – resolution of Universe into Brahman.
• Samashtascha Brahmani Pravilaapanam.

Taittriya Upanishad: Brahmanda Valli

When this seeker attains the fearless oneness with Brahman who is invisible, incorporeal, inexplicable and unsupported, then he becomes free from fear. When however, he makes even the slightest distinction in Brahman, then there is danger for him. That very same Brahman Himself becomes the source of fear for him who makes a difference and who reflects not. To the same effect, there is the following Vaidika verse. [II–VII–3]

• Jnani resolves whole universe into Brahman. Mentally, so that Advaita Nirguna Brahman alone remains.
• Not physical resolution but through understanding.
• How to understand?
By Knowing:

- Pots – resolve into clay.
- Clay is essence of pot. There is no substance called pot.
- Pot is name for particular form.
- Pot = Nama + rupa.
- World = Nama + Rupa.
- Name and form has only nominal, verbal existence, no substantial existence.
- Negation of substantial existence of Pot = Dissolution of pot. Ghatasya Vastika satta nasti.
- Resolution of pot into clay is nothing but understanding that there is not pot other than clay.
- Similarly, resolution of world into Brahman is understanding that world has only nominal significance, verbal existence, Vacharambanam.
- If world resolved, what type of Brahman will remain.

Taittiriya Upanishad:

When this seeker attains the fearless oneness with Brahman who is invisible, incorporeal, inexplicable and unsupported, then he becomes free from fear. When however, he makes even the slightest distinction in Brahman, then there is danger for him. That very same Brahman Himself becomes the source of fear for him who makes a difference and who reflects not. To the same effect, there is the following Vaidika verse. [II – VII – 3]

- Adrishye, Analikaye... formless, propertyless, borderless supportless Brahman left out.
• Sajatiya, vijatiya svagata bheda rahita Brahman avasishyate.
• Once person established in that Brahman Abayam vindate...
• He will attain Nirbayatvam.
• No second thing to frighten him.
• Upanishad shows contrast.

**Taittiriya Upanishad**

When this seeker attains the fearless oneness with Brahman who is invisible, incorporeal, inexplicable and unsupported, then he becomes free from fear. When however, he makes even the slightest distinction in Brahman, then there is danger for him. That very same Brahman Himself becomes the source of fear for him who makes a difference and who reflects not. To the same effect, there is the following Vaidika verse. [II – VII – 3]

- If person accepts slightest difference between world + Jiva, even part whole difference, Alpam also gives Bayam, Samsara – Udara Mantaram kurute.
- There should be no world different from me. No God other than me.
- **Only when**:
  - Dissolution of world includes dissolution of Pancha Koshas eta Annamayam Upasamkrata.
  - Eta Prana / Mano / Vigyana / Ananda Upasamkrata.
Taittiriya Upanishad:

The reality in the core of man and the Reality which is in the sun are one. He who knows this, on leaving this world, first attains this Atman made of food, next attains this Atman made of prana, next this Atman made of mind, next this Atman made of buddhi and lastly, this Atman made of Bliss. And, thereafter, eating what he likes and assuming any form according to his wishes, he roams upon the face of this globe and sits singing the following sama song of joy. [III – X – 5]

- Anandamaya resolution relevant here. It is also resolved into Brahman.
- What we achieve by this?

\[
\begin{array}{c|c|c}
\text{Anandamaya} & \text{Brahman} & \text{Therefore different} \\
\downarrow & \downarrow & \text{(Pravilapanam)} \\
\text{Dissolved} & \text{Dissolver} & \\
\downarrow & \downarrow & \\
\text{Object of Dissolution} & \text{Locus of Dissolution} & \\
\downarrow & \downarrow & \\
\text{Salt} & \text{Water} & \\
\end{array}
\]

\text{In Brahman – No Kosha, no world}
• Anandamaya na brahma, Brahmaṇi pravilapitvat, like Anna + 4 koshas.

Sutra word Analysis :
• Asmin Asya cha tat yogam shasti.

Asmin Prakarane :
• In this context, Taittriya Upanishad, Brahmaṇanda Valli – Prakarana eva (Anandamaya used only in Brahmaṇanda Valli).

Asya :
• Anandamaya asya – of Sashti Vibakti.

Cha :
• And, not only Anna / Prana.. Ananda maya also.

Sat Yogam :
• Brahma Layaha – united, merger yoga = Dissolution / resolution in this context.
• Not in Karma Yoga – Dissolve all Karmas
  Jnana Yoga – Dissolve all Jnanam.
• Yoga = Dissolution in Brahman.
• Upanishad Shasti = Upanishad teaches.

Final Meaning :
• In this chapter itself, Upanishad teaches dissolution into Brahman of anandamaya. Hence Anandamaya dissolver and Brahman dissolver are different.
• Sugar – Coffee
• Salt – Buttermilk

3 Ideas conveyed :
1) Brahman is Pradhanam – Primary.
2) Anandamaya is Apradhanam – Secondary
3) Anandamaya is not Brahman.
• Primary Brahman not identical with secondary Anandamaya.
Conclusion:

Hence (is to be undertaken) thereafter a deliberation on Brahman. [I – I – 1]

- Brahman is to be known.
- Brahman is Jagat Karanam.
- Brahman known only through Shastram.
- Brahman alone central theme of all Upanishads.
- Later Chandogya Upanishad creates doubt:
  - Sat used
  - Is Brahman or Sat central theme.

Vyasa:

- Sat = Brahman.
- Purva Pakshi – Sat = Prakrti.

Chandogya Upanishad:

Somya, before this world was manifest there was only existence, one without a second. On this subject, some maintain that before this world was manifest there was only non-existence, one without a second. Out of that non-existence, existence emerged. [6 – 2 – 1]
5th Sutra:
- Sat = Brahman established.

6th Sutra:
- Taittiriya Upanishad – Anandamaya – mischief by Upanishad and says Brahman is tail of Anandamaya, not important, hanging elsewhere.
- Brahman seems to be secondary because of putcham.
- Putcham not tail but support Sarva Adharam, Vishwadharam gagana Sadrushyam.
- Tail supporting Bird in flight. Monkey hangs to tree with tail (support).
- Person pillar – not stone, round, tall, inert.
- Adhara Guna Samanyat.

Adhikaranam in 5 Technical Steps:

a) Vishaya – subject (Kshanmukham – ksha)
- Putcham Brahman occurring in Priya, moda...

b) Samshaya:
- Siva – sha... Vishaya
- Putcham Brahman is Svatantram, Pradhanam primary, independent or Paratantram, Apradhanam, secondary.

c) Poorva Paksha:
- Opponents view doesn’t accept vedanta.
- Sankhya / Yoga / Purva mimamsa / Baudha hold wrong view.
- Putcham Brahman secondary – Paratantram Kasmat?
- Goh Putchavatu.
- 3rd Ghataka / factor.
d) Siddantin / Uttaram – Conclusion of Vedantin:

- Asmat – Paksha / Asmat view.
- Putcha Brahman Pradhanam, Svatantarman.
- Abhyasat, tad hetu vyapadeshat.
- Sarva Adharavatu Vyatirekena (unlike) Annamaya, Pranamaya, Manomaya, Vigyanamaya, Anandamaya.
- 4 statements crystalised ideas floating all over.
- Should be able to say it in 2 ways Vistara / Sankshepa way.
- Essence of Vedanta in 2 minutes 1 – 1 – 19 & 1 – 1 – 20.
- Give 4 statements – Putcham Brahma is topic

**Doubt:**

Primary or secondary.

**Opponent:**

Putcham – Tail – secondary.

**Our view:**

Primary – Adhara – understand.

**Jnanam – Definition:**

- Sankshepa Vistabhyam Jnanam – only if you can present in both ways elaborately succinctly. Like precis writing. Comprehend and present in your own language.

**Sangatihi : Technical**

- Prove why this sutra here in this Adhikaranam / Brahma Sutra after Ikshate justify position and existence.
- Technical not important, skipped just know, it is justified.
7th Adhikaranam:

Antar Adhikaranam:

Sutra 20:

The being within (the Sun and the eye) is Brahman, because His attributes are taught therein. [I – I – 20]

General Introduction:

- 5th Adhikaranam = Ikshate Adhikaranam (Visualised)
  
  = Sad Eva Soumya

Chandogya Upanishad:

Somya, before this world was manifest there was only existence, one without a second. On this subject, some maintain that before this world was manifest there was only non-existence, one without a second. Out of that non-existence, existence emerged. [6 – 2 – 1]

6th Adhikaranam:

- Anandamaya – Brahma Putcham.
- Sruti – Vishaya Vakyam.
Chandogya Upanishad : 2 Statements

Then, [Worship of the effulgent being in the sun’ : The white glow of the sun is sa, and the dark bluish-black glow is ama. These two together make up the word Sama. There I a deity within the orb of the sun, who is seen by yogis. His whole body glitters like gold, even to his toe-nails. He has a bright golden beard and bright golden hair. [1 – 6 – 6]

The person seen in the eye is the Rk, the Sama, the uktha [a part of the Sama], and the Yajus. He is also the three Vedas. The person who is in the sun and the person who is in the eye are the same. The same two singers [i.e., the Rk and the Sama] sing in praise of each of them, and they have the same names. [1 – 7 – 5]

Subject :

- Saguna Brahma Upasana in 2 sections Ishvara Upasana in 2 locuses.

2 Locus

Adideivata Saguna Brahma Upasana

- External
- 6th Section

Adibautika Saguna Brahma Upasana

- Internal in body
- 7th Section

• Brahman endowed with Kalyana Guna Sagunam, not Nirgunam.
• What are Sapta Kalyana Guna Visishta Saguna Brahma Upasana?
• Attributes – can be Good / Bad.
• Ishvara has no Negative attributes.
• Has Auspicious attributes.
• Object of Upasana = Ishvara.
• Locus – different.

7 Gunas – Adideivita Ishvara:

1) Aditya Purushatvam:
   • Ishvara as located in sun orb.
   • Surya Mandalam = Aditya Mandalam
   • Visualise Ishvara upon Aditya Mandalam – Located in Sun.

2) Hiranmayatvam:
   • Golden coloured skin / hair – in face (Mashru) – moustache, body upto nail – including nail.

3) Pundarikasham:
   • Kamalanayanam – Lotus eye.
   • Large, sharp long – petal eyed – as depicted in dance.
   • Eyes upto ears

Gita Dhyana Sloka:

नमोःते व्यास विशालबुद्धे फुल्लारविन्दायविदिन्तपत्रनेत्र ।
येन तत्वं भास्तेलेपूर्णः प्रज्वालितो ज्ञानमयः प्रदीपः ॥ २॥

नमोःते व्यास विशालबुद्धे फुल्लारविन्दायतपत्रनेत्र ।
येन त्वया भारततालिपूर्णः प्रज्वालितो ज्ञानमयः प्रदीपः ॥ २॥

Salutations unto thee, O Vyasa! Of mighty intellect, who has eyes like the petals of a full-blown lotus-tree, by whom was lighted the Lamp of Knowledge, filled with the Mahabharata oil. [Verse 2]

• Lalita Sahasranamam, Soundarya Lahari.
• Govinda Pundarikaksham....
Lecture 50

Pundarikaksham:

- Rakta Amboja Akshaha - Like red lotus Lords eyes – red – shining.

4) Oordva Loka Kama Ishvaratvam:

- Sense objects and pleasures obtaining in 7 higher Lokas - Buh, Buar, Suar, Maha, Jana, Tapa, Satya.
- Ishvaraa rules over higher Lokas and lord can give pleasures by mere Sankalpa = Kama Ishvara.

5) Sarva Papa Rahitatvam Tasya uti iti nama:

- Special name – “Ud” beyond, beyond Papam.
- Beyond Ishvara = Ud.

6) Sarvatmakatvam:

- Rig / Yajur / Sama / Atharvana = 4 Limbs of Lord.
- Shabda, Artha, Vak Prapanchatasya = Sarvam.

Vishnu Sahasranam – Dhyana Sloka:

I bow to Lord Vishnu who has the three worlds as His body. The Earth is His feet, and the sky His navel. Wind is His breath, and the Sun and the Moon are His eyes. Directions are His ears, and the Heaven is His head. Fire is His face and ocean His abdomen. In Him is situated the universe with diverse kinds of Gods, men, birds, cattle, serpents, Gandharvas and Daityas (demons)- all sporting in a charming way. [Verse 2]
7) Yad yad vibhuti mat satvam:

Gita:

यदेवदृष्टिमत्तस्तवं श्रीमद्वृजितके मेव वा।
तत्रदेवार्गच्छ तव मम तेजोऽशसंभवम्॥ ५०.४१॥

- All glories of creation belongs to Lord.

Mundak Upanishad:

य: सर्वज्ञ: सर्वविद्य्य ज्ञानमयं तपः।
तस्मादेदद्राह नाम रूपमचन च ज्ञायते॥ ९॥

Yah sarvajnah sarva-vid yasya jnana-mayam tapah I
Tasmad-etad brahma nama rupam-anam ca jayate II 9 II

From the Brahman (the Supreme Reality) – who not only is aware of the total happenings in the world but is equally in the know of all the details of happenings every minute, whose very thought is of the nature of Knowledge – are all these produced: the Creator, names and forms, and nourishment for all. [I – I – 9]

Upanishad:

- Poet sings glory of king & gets reward.
- Poet accepts it as Ishvaras glory.

Gita:

यो यो या या तनुभक्तश्रुद्यार्धितुमिच्छिति।
तस्य तस्याचलां श्रुद्यं तामेव विद्याम्यहम्॥ ७.२॥

- Whichever diety we worship, all go to one Ishvara.
- Akasha, Pitru, Puja, Guru Namaskara’s goes to Ishvara. Benefit from Ishvara…. Sarva vibuti Matvam.

Lord says, “Whatever that is glorious, prosperous or powerful in any being, that know you to be a manifestation of a part of My splendour”. [Chapter 10 – Verse 41]
7 Glories of Adhyatma Upasana:

1) Akshi Purushatvam:
   • Lord not seen outside but imagined to be present in our own eyes.

2) Hiranmayatvam:
   • Golden color.

3) Pundarikaksha:
   • Raktambuja Nayanaha.
   • Full blossomed red lotus petal eye.
   • Govinda pundarika.

4) Adho Loka Kama Ishvaratvam: (Before Urdva Loka)
   • Lower worlds also have Alpa small percentage of Sense pleasures. Meeting old friends in Naraka, percentage of pain more in lower Lokas.

5, 6, 7 – Common:
   • Sarva Papa Rahitatvam
   • Sarva Atmakatvam
   • Sarva Vibhuti Matkam
   • Analysis of Saguna Brahma in Brahma Sutra also done, not only Nirguna Brahma.

Our Orientation:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Brahman</th>
<th>Ishvara</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Nirgunam</td>
<td>- Upasyam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Jneyam</td>
<td>- Sagunam Brahma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- 5&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt; Adhikaranam – Ikshatadhikaranam</td>
<td>- 7&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt; Adhikaranam -</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What is Controversy?

- Word used in Upanishad is Purusha which can mean Jiva or Saguna Brahman.
- Adideiva Upasana – Aditya Antha Purusha.
- Adhyatma Upasana – Akshi Antah Purusha.
- If Brahman used, no controversy.
- Purusha used for Jeeva and Brahman also.

Question:

- Is Purusha – Jiva or Ishvara?

Conclusion:

- God alone is Upasya Devata – object of meditation and worship not Jeeva.
- Aditya + Akasha Antah Purushe – Jeeva or Ishvara?

Logic:

- Tad Dharma Upadeshat.
- Because all Virtues mentioned belong to Ishvara.
- Jeeva has no Virtues.

Anumanam:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Antaha</th>
<th>Purushaha</th>
<th>Ishvara</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aditya – Aksho</td>
<td>Paksha</td>
<td>Lord alone</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Tad Dharma Upadeshat
- Ishvara Guna Kathanat.
- Purusha inside Surya + Akshi is one.
Chandogya Upanishad:

Then, [Worship of the effulgent being in the sun’ : The white glow of the sun is sa, and the dark bluish-black glow is ama. These two together make up the word Sama. There I a deity within the orb of the sun, who is seen by yogis. His whole body glitters like gold, even to his toe-nails. He has a bright golden beard and bright golden hair. [1 – 6 – 6]

The person seen in the eye is the Rk, the Sama, the uktha [a part of the Sama], and the Yajus. He is also the three Vedas. The person who is in the sun and the person who is in the eye are the same. The same two singers [i.e., the Rk and the Sama] sing in praise of each of them, and they have the same names. [1 – 7 – 5]

- Tad Dharmaha = Divine Virtues, properties, attributes.
- Out of 7 – see last 3 attributes.

a) Sarva Papa Rahitaha : (UD – Nama)
- Vyasa – freedom from all sins is attribute of Ishvara.
- Jiva – Embodiment of Papa Sankalpam in Aavani Attam...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Akshi Purusha</th>
<th>Aditya Purusha</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Jiva with sins</td>
<td>- Exalted Jiva 99% Punyam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Paramatma</td>
<td>- Indra / Varuna / Agni, Aditya.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Presiding deity status.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• Devata also has Nashaha.
• Hiranyagarba Devata – Highest Padam.
• Attain status lost by Papa karma.

b) Sarva Atmakatvam :
• One in form of whole creation – is Virtue of Ishvara alone.
• Ishvara = Jagat Karanam.
• Sarva Jiva, Devata, Jagat Rupena Vartate.
• Aditya Devata – limited – not Vayu Devata, weapons – Puja – Asana different.

c) Sarva Vibhuti Matkam :
• All vibhutis belong to Ishvara. No Devata has all Vibhutis.
• Vibhuti = Symbol / indication to show my living is because of glory of Lord.

Gita :

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Lord dwells in the hearts of all beings, O Arjuna, causing all beings, by His illusive power, to resolve, as if mounted on a machine. [Chapter 18 – Verse 61]</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| ईश्वर: सर्वभूतानां हृदेषुज्ञ तिष्ठति।
| भ्राम्यन्तर्वभूतानि यन्त्रारूढानि मायाय् ॥ १५.६९ ॥ |

• Who is Ishvara?
• He is making me function in this Body – waking, talking etc., It is Ishvara Mahima.

Purva Pakshi :
• Aditya + Akshi Purusha – not Ishvara. Has to be Jeeva or Devata.

1 – 4 Virtues :
• Enumerated for Ishvara can’t belong to him.

a) Aditya Purushatvam
  Akshi Purushatvam

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Upanishad gives Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Location means limitation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am here... means limited – not there. Not Sarvagatvam but Parichinatvam.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• Location means it supports only Jiva not Sarvagata Ishvara.
• Jiva takes Janma, goes to Loka, limited entity.

b) Hiranmayatvam:
• Upanishad talks about Body, Dadi, Kesha, Smashrusaha. Indicates Shariram, belongs to Jeeva / Devata.
• Ishvara – all pervading has to be body less.

Gita:

मया तत्मिदं सर्वं जगद्व्यक्तमूर्तिना।
मत्स्थानी सर्वभूतानि न चाहें तेष्वस्थितः॥ ९.४ ॥

• Ishvara is Avyakta – invisible / formless.

c) Pundarikaksham:
• Refers to eyes. If Purusha has eyes, ears, indriyas not all pervading.
• To have color, organs, location, complexion is to be limited.

d) Urdva Loka Kama Ikshitatvam
• Sarva Loka kama Ikshitatvam
• 2 distinct Purusha – and each Purusha has limited area of Power / Function.
• Aditya Purusha – only in higher lokas.
• Akshi Purusha – only in lower lokas.
• Ishvara has to be omnipotent, Sarva Loka Kama Ikshita.
• Location / complexion / organ / limited powers indicate Jiva not Ishvara.
The being within (the Sun and the eye) is Brahman, because His attributes are taught therein. [I – I – 20]

Subject:
- Adideivita and Adyatma Upasana.
- Aditya Purusha and Akshi Purusha.

3 Virtues:
- Belongs to Ishvara.
  - Sarva Papa Rahitatvam – Free from Papam.
  - Sarvatmakatvam – Being everything.
  - Sarvagyatvam – Repository of all Gunas.

Purva Pakshi:
- 4 Other Virtues do not belong to Ishvara but Jiva / Devata – Because they are with limitations.

a) Adharatvam:
- Purusha located in Sukshma / Akshi
- Limitation located in one place. Absent in other place.
- Ataha – Located within – not outside.

b) Hiranmayatvam:
- Golden body, Hair, face, nails, complexion, negating other qualities.
c) Pundari Kakshatvam:

- Purusha has eyes like Jiva... Must be embodiment.
- Body and Consciousness. Rupavatvam and Avayavatvam of Ishvara Purusha with form and Organs will be limited.

d) Additive ruler of Higher Loka not lower:

- Akshi Devata – Ruler of Lower Loka not higher
- Aishawarya Maryada – Limited power.
- Therefore Purusha not Ishvara.
- Everything should be located in him.

Shankara:

- Ishvara has no limitation of form / location / powers.
- Ishvara can assume any form for the sake of Upasana of devotee.
- 3 Limitations can be prescribed. Limitless can’t be conceived by Upasaka.
- For Upasana, Shastra prescribes form, color, complexion, location.
- Upasanarthisam Sarvam Bavati, Natu Vastavam (Not factual).
- With Maya power, Ishvara able to assume any form / Color / Location which is called Avataram not imagination of Devotee.
- With Maya, Ishvara creates whole universe – Hiranmaya, Jyotir Maya, Krishna, Rama...
- Mayavasat Sarvam Sambavati

Gita:

Though I am unborn and am of imperishable nature, and though I am the lord of all beings, yet, ruling over my own nature, I take birth by my own Maya [Chapter 4 – Verse 6]
Some Appearances

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Society</th>
<th>Devotee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

- 7 Virtues possible for Ishvara / taken as Purusha in Upanishad.
- If Purusha is Jiva, can explain 1 – 4 Virtues not last 3, Last 3 are innate Virtues of Lord. (Papa Rahitatvam, Sarvatmakatvam, Sarvagyatvam)
- Mayika Virtues Assumed by lord for Upasana, or for Devotee.
- 20th Sutra Over.

Sutra 21:

Sanskrit: भेदभावपदेशाच्चाचान्य: ।
Translation: Bhedavyapadesacchanyah

And there is another one (i.e. the Lord who is different from the individual souls animating the Sun etc.) on account of the declaration of distinction. [1 – 1 – 21]

Sanskrit: अंतस्तद्दृष्टौपदेशात् ।
Translation: Antastaddharmopadesat

The being within (the Sun and the eye) is Brahman, because His attributes are taught therein. [1 – 1 – 20]

General observation throughout study of Vedanta:
- Our attitude towards Ishvara, Sometimes appears contradictory.
Ishvara – 2 Drishtis

Paramartikam

- Other than Nirguna Brahman everything (Jiva / Jagat / Ishvara) else is Mithya / Appearance
- Nisheda

**Advaita Makarata:**
- Upashanta Jiva, Jagat, Ishvara Acharya, Sishya - 5 Brahmas

Vyavaharikam

- Establish Ishvara consciously, Vehemently
- Ishvara Astitvam
- Jiva and Jagat Karyam
- Ishvara Karanam
- 3 Tatvams
- Each one different

---

**Advaita Makarata:**

उपाचान्तजागज्जीवं शिष्याचार्येश्वरभ्रमं \\ स्वतः सिद्धमनायन्तं परिपूर्णमहां महां || २७ ||

That Effulgent Consciousness am I, which is Self-established, all-full, without beginning and end, and in which the illusory ideas of the worlds, the individual, the disciple, the teacher and God, are all extinct. [Verse 27]

- Establishes Bras Sat Chit Ananda Tatvam and also Jiva / Ishvara – Aikyam.
- No Real Jiva / Ishvara separate from Brahman.
- Jiva = Brahman, Ishvara = Brahman, Jiva = Ishvara Nisheda.
- Jiva / Ishvara – Abheda = Brahman.
- Advaitin Vehemently argues for 2 things:
• In Brahma sutra both Drishti Discussed. In Every Sutra, See what is Discussed.
• This Adhikaranam – Vyavaharika Drishti.

Corollary To Tat Tvam Asi:
• Since we accept Vyavaharikaly Ishvara, our attitude to Ishvara should not be casual.
• Negate Paramartikaly, hence should not have inferior – condescending attitude.
### Dwell on Mithya word

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pratibasika</th>
<th>Vyavaharika</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Dream, Mental projection, Imagination</td>
<td>- Not Mental projection, real world not like Svapna, Ishvara has reality like me and the world</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Take my mother - Person object in the world</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Ask:**
- How real is this person to me?
- Mentally Visualise person

- Dearest, I am going to loose tomorrow but I don’t want to loose.
- Look upon person – Object real to me, important to me.
- Replace Ishvara with that object. Give same importance to Ishvara.
- I Can’t brush aside wife, mother, children, world, Ishvara.
- Are you ready to loose knowledge? Can’t loose knowledge.
- Is knowledge Satyam or Mithya?

**From Brahma Drishti:**
- Knowledge also is Mithya. Knowledge is enjoyed in Mithya mind with Vritti.
- No Question of AntahKarana, Vritti Jnanam being Satyam.
- Mithya Jnanam Originated from Whom?

**Guru Stotram:**

Om Narayanan padmabhavam Vasishtam, Shakthim, cha thath putra parasaram cha.
Vyasam shukam gowdpatham mahantham, Govinda yogendhra madhasya sishyam

To Narayana, to lotus-born Brahma, to Vasishta, to Shakti and his son, Parashara, to Vyasa, to Shukadeva, to the great Gaudapada, to Govinda, to Yogindra his disciple. [Verse 20]
Jnanam from Ishvara alone. For preservation of Mithya Jnanam need, Mithya grace of Mithya Ishvara.
If You have Mithya Kama, Virodha obstacle need Mithya grace of Mithya Ishvara.
For their elimination, class important. For Advaitin Ishvara very important like Shastra and Guru.
To have conducive condition at home and class surrender to Ishvara.
Distinct from Material Cause, require Jnanam, Jnana Nishta and Pratibimba Nivritti.

21st Sutra:
Vyasa and Shankara establish existence of Vyavaharika Ishvara to study and bless Jiva / Ishvara - Paramartika Aikyam.
Bheda Vyapadeshat – Sutra.
Jiva and Ishvara have Bheda as per Shastram.

Example:
Student sees Guru putting Poonal, on Right side for Pitru and Deva...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bheda Vada</th>
<th>Abheda Vada</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>For:</strong></td>
<td><strong>For:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Bandha</td>
<td>- Yoga Nisheda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Charvaka</td>
<td>- Nyaya Nisheda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Purva Mimamsa</td>
<td>- Visishta Advaitam Nisheda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Sankhya</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Veiseshika</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
And there is another one (i.e. the Lord who is different from the individual souls animating the Sun etc.) on account of the declaration of distinction.

- Saguna Brahman and Jiva - Bheda

  Aditya Akshi Antah Purusha

  Saguna Brahman Upasya Brahman
  Ishvara

  Nirgunam Brahman

  Paramartika Leval

  Vyavaharika Level

- In Addition to Vyavaharika Jiva and Jagat, there is a 3\textsuperscript{rd} entity called Vyavaharika Ishvara.

  Purva Pakshi

  - Only Vyavaharika
  - Jiva = Purusha
  - Jagat = Prakrti

  - Don’t accept Vyavaharika ‘Ishvara’ is different from Vyavaharika Jagat

- If Jiva and Ishvara equated, we have only Jagat and Jiva – no 3\textsuperscript{rd} entity.
- Have to establish Jiva / Ishvara – Bheda in Sutra 21 through Sruti Pramanam.
- Vehemently Vedantin establishes.
- Bheda in Vyavaharikam and Abheda in Paramartikam no Contradiction.
Wave and Ocean

Vyavaharically

- Bheda
  Wave:
  - Karyam, Small

Ocean:
  - Karanam, Big

Paramatrically

- Oneness, Abheda
- Water
- Essential identity w.r.t their nature

Vedanta

Vyavahara

- Jiva – Ishvara
- Upasana possible

Paramartikaha

- One - Essential Brahman / Consciousness, in Svarupam
- Jnanam context
- Adharam

Sruti: Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

य आदित्ये तिष्ठन्नादित्यादान्तरः, यमादित्यो न वेद, यस्यादित्यः शरीरम्, य आदित्यमन्तरो यमयति, एष ता आत्मान्तर्याम्यमृतः || 9 ||

He who inhabits the sun, but is within it, whom the sun does not know, whose body is the sun, and who controls the sun from within, is the internal ruler, your own immortal self. [3 – 7 – 9]

- Ishvara – Inner essence, controller present everywhere.
• Yami – Means controller
  - Present in Surya Mandalam also
• Knowing always with Chetana Vastu, Surya Devata does not know Antaryami means.
• Aditya Devata and Antaryami different.

Mundak Upanishad:

Two birds bound to each other in close friendship, perch on the self-same tree. One of them eats the fruits of the tree with relish, while the other (just) looks on, without eating. [III – I – 1]

Aditya has 2 Chetanams

- Jivaha
- Ishvara Antaryami

Purusha – Refers to

- Aditya Jiva / Devata?
- Antaryami Ishvara?

Here in this Sutra:

Does Purusha refer to

- Akshi Aditya
- Antaryami
- Which Devata does not know

Why Devata not Antaryami?

3 Reasons / 3 glories - belong to Ishvara only:

• Sarva Papa Rahitaha, Sarva Atmaka Sarvagnyaya.
• Bhedav Vyapadesha – Purusha in Chandogyo Upanishad: Chapter 1 – 6 - 6 is different from Aditya Devata why?
Then, [Worship of the effulgent being in the sun] the white glow of the sun is Sa, and the dark Bluish-black glow is Ama. These two together make up the word Sama. There is a deity within the orb of the sun, who is seen by yogis. His whole body glitters like gold, even to his toe-nails. He has a bright golden beard and bright golden hair. [1 – 6 – 6]

- Aditya Purusha Antaryami is different from Aditya Devata in Brihadaranyaka Upanishad – Chapter 3 – 7 – 9
- Chandogyo Upanishad refers to Antaryami because difference is mentioned in Brihadaranyaka Upanishad.

Anumanam:

a) Paksha:

- Aditya Akshi Purusha in Chandogyo Upanishad:

The white glow of the sun is the RK, and its deep blue glow is the Sama. The black glow called the Sama is based on the white. Glow called the RK. That is why the Sama is sung based on the RK. [1 – 6 – 5]

The person seen in the eye is the RK, the Sama, the Uktha [a part of the Sama], and the Yajus. He is also the three Vedas. The person who is in the sun and the person who is in the eye are the same. The same two singers [i.e., the RK and the Sama] sing in praise of each of them, and they have the same names. [1 – 7 – 5]
b) Sadyam:
- Ishvara = Saguna Brahman Upasyam Brahman.

c) Reason: Hetu:
- Bhedav Vyapadeshat referred in Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

He who inhabits the sun, but is within it, whom the sun does not know, whose body is the sun, and who controls the sun from within, is the internal ruler, your own immortal self. [3 – 7 – 9]

- Ishvara located in solar disc is different from Aditya Devata.
Sandhyavandanam:
- Heyas Hrida Savi Mandala Vardi Narayana...

Tattwa Bodha:
- Aditya Devata is presiding deity of eye. Not worshipping sun but presiding deity of eye.
- Ishvara - controller, lord of Presiding Deities.

Shanthi Mantra:

Om bhadram karnebhih srunuyama devah
Bhadram pasyemaksabhiryajatrah
Sthirair angaistustuvagmsastanubhiih
Vyasema devahitam yadayuuh
Svasti na indro vṛddhasravah
Svasti nah pusa visvavedah
Svasti nastarksyo aristanehih
Svasti no brhaspatirdhatu
Om santih santih santih

Om, O worshipful ones, may our ears hear what is good and auspicious! May we see what is auspicious! May we sing your praise, live our allotted span of life in perfect health and strength! May Indra (who is) extolled in the scriptures, Pushan, the all-knowing Trakshya, who saves from all harm, and Brihaspati who protects our spiritual lustre, vouchsafe prosperity in our study of the scriptures and the practice of the truths contained therein! Om peace, peace, peace!
Conclusion:

a) Vishaya:

- Aditya Akshi Purusha, Mentioned in Chandogyo Upanishad:

> His eyes are like lotuses blossomed by the sun. He is called Ut because he is above all weakness. He who knows this truth is also above all weakness. [1-6-7]

> The person seen in the eye is the RK, the Sama, the Uktha [a part of the Sama], and the Yajus. He is also the three Vedas. The person who is in the sun and the person who is in the eye are the same. The same two singers [i.e., the RK and the Sama] sing in praise of each of them, and they have the same names. [1–7–5]

b) Samshaya – Controversy:

- Aditya Akshi Purusha – is he Jiva – Devata – Ishvara.

c) Purva Pakshi:

- Claim of opponent, Aditya Purusha is Jiva or Devata only.

d) Hetu:

- Parichinnatvat. With Limitation - Location in eye, sun only, with Hiranmaya color.
e) Pundarikaksha:

- One lord presides over higher world. One lord presides over lower world.

f) Siddanta – Conclusion:

- Purusha refers to Ishvara, Saguna Brahman different from Jiva / Devata / Jagat. Virtues of Total Purity belongs to Ishvara.
- All limitations mentioned are for sake of Upasana – limited manifestations of Limitless.
- Limited Virtues for Upasana, Limited manifestation of limited lord for blessing others.
- I Imagine, my projections – Limitations imagined by Upasaknas or Limitations Assumed by Ishvara himself as Avatara both possible.
- We have Imaginative powers and lord has Maya Shakti.

Gita:

- Though I am unborn and am of imperishable nature, and though I am the lord of all beings, yet, ruling over my own nature, I take birth by my own Maya [ Chapter 4 – Verse 6]
- We must assume Ishvara different from Jiva and Jagat is Vyavaharika Drishti.

g) Sangatihi: Technical –

- Position of topic appropriate comes after 6th, before 8th Adhikaranam 1st Pada, 1st Chapter Brahma Sutra.

Sutra 22:

- The word Akasa i.e., ether here is Brahman on account of characteristic marks (of that i.e. Brahman being mentioned). [1 – 1 – 22]
Silaka Salavatya asked Pravahana, ‘What is the end of this earth?’ Pravahana said: ‘Space, for everything that exists arises from space and also goes back into space. Space is superior to everything. Space is the highest goal.’

**Context:**

- 8th and 9th Section of 1st Chapter should be taken.
- Ishvara Upasana endowed – “Paro Variyatvam” – Greatest, Mostexhalted, Mahatva Guna Visishta Ishvara.
- Ishvara invoked on Ohmkara in Samaveda called Udgeeta – (Chanted in High Pitch) Uchaihi Geeyate...

### Alambaman / Support

| - Shiva | - Shiva Linga |
| - Vinayaka | - Turmeric |
| - Devi | - Flame |
| - Parovariya Guna Visishta | - Udgeeta on Ohmkara |

### Story:

- **Dalbya**
  - Brahmanahaha
  - Teachers of Society

- **Tilakaha**

- **Javili**
  - Kshatriya
  - Humble
  - Svarga – intermediate
  - Bumi - Great
Greatest:
- Sama mantra, Svaraha, Prana, Annam, Aapaha, Svarga.
- What is great, Greater, Greatest, Mahan, Mahattara, Mahataram.

Javili:
- Bumi great – because, Pitrus – Devatas – Boktas – Depend on offerings from Manushyas - Indraya Svahaha...
- Can’t do anything.

8th Section:
- Bumi Greatest

Jaivili: 9th Section:
- Bhu Loka not ultimate.
- Parovariyaha Ishvara meditated on Udgeeta Ohmkara Sarva – Greatest.
- Ishvara introduced as “Akasha” Hence confusion.

Akasha

- Phenomenal
- Buta - Element

- Ishvara
- Here – Tan Lingaat
General Meaning:

- In Brahma Sutra, Brahman loosely refers to both Sagunam and Nirgunam.
- Ishvara Non different from Brahman, Dressed Ishvara = Brahman.
- Brahman endowed with dress of Maya, Maya Upadhi Sahitam Brahman = Ishvara
- When Ishvara removes dress called Maya, it is called Brahman.
- Brahman and Maya = Ishvara.
- Ishvara – Maya = Brahman.

- How to know which meaning to take?
- Vyavaharika Drishtya(For Upasana) - Brahman = Saguna Ishvara
- Paramartika Drishtya (For Jnana) - Brahman = Nirguna Brahman.
- Drishti Bheda - Artha Bheda.
Upasya Brahman  
Saguna Ishvara  
Akasha  
Not Butakasha  
Jnanam - Jneyam Brahman  
Nirguna Brahman

- Because there are sufficient clues, indicators, Tan Lingaat.

Anumana Vakyam:

Word Analysis:
a) Akashaha:
- in Chandogyo Upanishad:

Silaka Salavatya asked Pravahana, ‘What is the end of this earth?’ Pravahana said: ‘Space, for everything that exists arises from space and also goes back into space. Space is superior to everything. Space is the highest goal.’  

b) Saguna Brahman: Ishvara

c)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tal</th>
<th>Lingaat</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tat(Brahman / Ishvara)</td>
<td>Indicator, Clues, are there in this Upanishad</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• Jaivali said, Akasha should be invoked in Omkara because.

a) All beings are born of Akasha, Akasha = Sarva Buta Srishti Karanam.

b) All beings resolve into Akasha Sarva Buta Laya Karanam.

c) Parayanam – Sthiti Karanam, Cause for existence of all beings

d) Akasha is superior to all things in creation, “Jayan” / Mahatvam – Greatest.

e) Anantam – Chandogyo Upanishad:

Sa esa parovariyanudghitah sa eso’nantarh
Parovariyo hasya bhavati parovariyaso ha
Lokanjayati ya etadevam vidvam
Parovariyamsamudgithamupaste

Earlier, mention was made of the Udgitha being the best as also endless. He who is aware of this and worships the Udgitha as such keeps attaining higher and higher worlds, and he becomes increasingly a better individual. [ 1 – 9 – 2]

• Infinite - Parovariyatvam superior most.

• 6 Lingas to show Akasha is Ishvara not Bhutakasha.

Purva Pakshi:

• Akasha Braheiva Bavati.

General:

• Not Sankhya, Purva Mimamsa Eka Deshi here - One Reason.

• Akasha must be taken as space above.

Rule:

• Every word has got one primary meaning, most powerful taken by all in general.

• Paricheda, Mukhya Vachyarthartha, secondary meaning also possible.
Primary Meaning Bird:
- Sun and we also move, hence we are also Kagaha – Secondary.

Example:
- Tailum – Primary meaning – Oil more powerful – Majority know.
  - Secondary Powerful - Nalla Nai
    - Gingily Oil
    - Yogartha (Derived Meaning)

Rule:
- Rudhi Yogat Balayati
- Primary, Prasiddha.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Primary</th>
<th>Secondary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kagaha</td>
<td>Bird</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jalajam</td>
<td>Lotus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Akasha</td>
<td>Element Space</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chidambaram</td>
<td>Ambavam = Akasha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Anything in Sky</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fish – Born out of Water</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ishvara</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chaitanyam</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Ishvara

| All Pervading Sarvagataha – Everywhere | All Pervading |
| Samantat Sarvagataha |

Space

a) Kasha - To shine
   - Kashate iti Prakashate
   - Effulgent

AA - Kashaha

Sarvatra Prasidda

Evident Everywhere

Brahman ever evident - in form of:

- Sat - Existence
- Chit - Consciousness
- Derived meaning of Akasha = Sarvatra, Prakashamanaha Ishvara.

Rule:

- Rudhi Lakshanat Baliyasi, Primary meaning superior to secondary.

Purva Pakshi:

- Akasha as element Rudhi Arthaha.
- Later portion also can be explained, Buta Akasha = Srishti, Sthiti, Laya Karanam.

Taittriya Upanishad:

- Space accommodates everyone, everything resolves into space greatest, Parovariyam – Superior to other 4 Elements.
- Akasha – Srishti, Sthithi, Laya Karanam, Mahan Parovariyam, Invoke Akasha upon Ishvara.
Siddantin:

- Aksha = Brahman, problem if we take primary meaning.
- Akashat Sarva Butani Jayante.
- All beings born out of Akasha element, Everything born out of space - Restrictive meaning.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Saguna Brahman = Ishvara</th>
<th>Space</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Everything including Akasha born out of Ishvara</td>
<td>- Everything except Akasha born out of Space</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- No restriction</td>
<td>- All except space born in Space</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- 6 Adjectives - Secondary - 1 Noun - Sacrificed primary</td>
<td>- 1 Noun – Primary - Fits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Sarva Srishti, Sthiti, Laya Karanam, Mahatvam, Parovariyatam, Anantam fits</td>
<td>- 6 Adjectives – Sacrificed, 6 Doesn’t fit – Secondary meaning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Athyantika – Karanam Absolute cause</td>
<td>- Apekshika – Karanam relative cause</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Do amputation person survives</td>
<td>- Person dies, no Amputation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Part dies, whole survives</td>
<td>- Part survives, whole loss</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Small loss better</td>
<td>- Big loss worse</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Introduction:

- 8th Adhikaranam - Sutra 22:

The word Akasa i.e., ether here is Brahman on account of characteristic marks (of that i.e. Brahman being mentioned). [1 – 1 – 22]

Sruti: Chandogyo Upanishad:

Silaka Salavatya asked Pravahana, ‘What is the end of this earth?’ Pravahana said: ‘Space, for everything that exists arises from space and also goes back into space. Space is superior to everything. Space is the highest goal.’ [1 – 9 – 1]
Controversy:
- Akasha – Sagunam Brahman or Buta Akasha.
- Relative Vs Absolute Karanam.
- Primary Vs Secondary meaning.

One Addition Reason: Siddantin:
- Akasha as Ishvara not secondary meaning but primary Shastric meaning.
- Secondary meaning in Abyupethya, Vada temporarily accepted.
- Aksha as Ishvara, Shastra Prasiddaha not Laukika Prasiddaha, 3 examples form Shatra.

a) Chandogyo Upanishad:

That which is described as space manifests names and forms. These names and forms are within Brahman. Brahman is immortal; it is the Self. May I attend the court of Prajapati. May I attain the fame of a brahmin, and also of a prince and a merchant. I wish to have real fame. I want to be famous among all famous people. May I not have to be born again and have a body covered with blood and dirt, which is toothless and at the same time always wanting to eat. [8–14–1]

- Tatu Brahman – It Introduces Akasha in beginning and says it is Brahman in the end.
- Substratum of Nama Rupa, Prapancha is Brahman.

b) Chandogyo Upanishad:

Tadbrhma tadamrtam sa atma prajapateh sabham vesma
prpadye yasoham bhavami brahmananam yaso rajnam yaso
visam yaso'hamanuprapatsi sa haham yasasam yasah
syetamadatkamadatkam syetam lindu mabhigam lindu mabhigam II 1 II

Sa hovaca vijanamyaham yatprano brahma kam ca tu kham ca
na vijanamiti te hocuryadvava kam tadeva kham yadeva kham
tadeva kamiti pranam ca hasmai tadakasam cocuh II 5 II
Upakosala said: I know that prana is Brahman. But that ka and kha are Brahman I do not know. The fires replied, that which is ka is kha, and that which is kha is also ka. Then the fires taught him that Brahman was both prana and akasa [space]. [4 – 10 – 5]

- Kham Brahma = Akasha, kam Brahma = Ananda, Akasham Sagunam Brahman = Ananda.

c) Rig Veda:

Richo akshare parame vyomam yasmin deva adhi vishve nisheduh,
Yastanna veda kim richa karishyatiya it tad vidus ta ime samasate.

"The verses of Veda exist in the collapse of fullness in the transcendental field, in which reside all the impulses of creative intelligence, the laws of Nature, responsible for the whole manifest universe. He whose awareness is not open to this field, what can the verses accomplish for him? Those who know this level of reality are established in evenness, in wholeness of life."

- All Veda born, Sustained, resolve into Brahman.
- Srishti Sthiti Laya Karanam of Vedas is Vyanam (Ishvara)
- Akasha = Adjective of Aksharam Brahman.

Conclusion:

- Akasha as Ishvara is Primary meaning, not primary in world (Laukika) but in Shastra.
- Natu Loka Rudihi Prasidda Parantu Shastra Prasiddah.

5 Factors:

a) Vishaya:

- Subject word – Akasha in Chandogyo Upanishad: Chapter 1 – 9 – 1

b) Samshaya:

- Akasha is Bhuta Akasha or Saguna Brahma Ishvara.
c) Purva Pakshi :
• Akasha is Buta Akasha

d) Hetu :
• Primary meaning (Laukika) more powerful than secondary Shastric Meaning.

e) Siddantin :
• Akasha = Brahman, It is primary meaning from Shastric Angle.
• Akasha is Ishvara from Shastric, Angle – Primary meaning.
• 6 Later Descriptions tally with Brahman alone.
• Akasha Brahman – Tal Lingaat

6) Sangatihi :
• Appropriate position of Adhikaranam.
• Should occur in Brahma Sutra, 1st Chapter, 1st Pada / Qtr, after 7th Topic, before 9th Topic.
• 9th Prana Adhikaranam (1 Sutra only )

Sutra 23 :

अत एव प्राणः ।

Ata eva Pranah

For the same reason the breath also refers to Brahman. [1 – 1 – 23]

Vishaya Shastra Vakyam : Chandogyo Upanishad :

प्राण इति होवाच सर्वाणि ह वा हमानि भूतानि भ्रामेवाभिसंविशिष्ठति प्राणभ्रामुज्जिते सेषा देवता प्रस्तावमनावयता ततो चेदविद्याप्रास्तोष्यो मूर्धाते व्यपतिष्यतःताक्षतस्य मयेति ॥ २ ॥

Prana iti hovaca sarvani ha va imani bhutani pranamevabhisamvisanti pranamabhyujjihate saisa devata prastavamanvayayatta tam cedavidvanprastosyo murdha te vyapatisyattathoktasya mayeti ॥ ५ ॥
Usasti said: It is prana [the vital force]. In prana all things that we see around us [moving or unmoving], disappear [at the time of their destruction]. And at the time of their appearance, they appear from prana. Prana is that deity to whom the prastava is addressed. If you had sung the hymn not knowing the deity to whom it is addressed, in spite of being warned by me, your head would surely have fallen. [1 – 11 – 5]

- Topic refers to 10th and 11th Sections

10th Section:
- Raja doing Yaga, 4 Vedas, 4 Priests.
- Chakrayana - Ushasti, Rahihi – Priest, Poor Brahmin – Supervisor of Priests.
- Cyclone in village, famine, crops destroyed.
- Chakrayana goes to 4 - Sama Veda, Priests – Udgata, Prastotat, Pratiharta, Subramanya.

Asks 3 Question to 3 Priests:
- Udgata, Prastotat, Pratiharta, Sama mantra Chanted with 5 Divisions / 7 Divisions – Parts.
- Each Divisions - Called Baktihi.

- If you Chant without Devata – Head will burst Murdate Vipatishyati.
### Teaching – corresponds to Chanting.

#### Remember:
- Rishi / Matra / Devata and Get benefit.
- Here focus on Prastava Bakti – “Prana” Devata.
- Vishaya Vakyam – Chapter 1 – 11 – 5 – All beings exist in Prana.

#### Shankara:
- Prana = Saguna Brahman = Ishvara = Prastava Bakti Devata.
- 8th Adhikaranam – Akasha Adhikaranam.
- Akasha = Ishvara = Sarva Srishti, Sthithi Laya Karanam.
- All Beings exist in Prana, Here Prana = Saguna Brahman = Ishvara = Prastava Bakti Devata.
- Previous Adhikaranam – 8th, Akasha = Ishvara = Sarva Srishti Laya Karanam.
- All things and beings resolve into Ishvara only.
- Born out of Prana, Arise out of Prana(Ishvara)
- 1st Laya – Then Srishti Karanam, That Prana = Ishvara.
- If Upanishad had used Ishvara, no Controversy.

#### Controversy:
- Prana = Pancha Prana / Vayu Tatvam or Ishvara
- Prana = Sukshma Shariram = Avayaya = Karyam. Prana = Sayeks Karana Bueita
General Analysis:

- Ata Eva Pranaha Ishvaraha or Sagunam Brahma.
- Prana in Chapter 1 – 11 – 5 – Chandogyo, Refers to Ishvara not to Sukshma Shariram, Vayu Vikara - Pancha Prana.
- Vaya Karana Buta Ishvara, because Tal Lingaat, Srishti, Sthithi, Laya Karanam – They are Brahman lingams / Chies, Ata Eva Tal Lingaat.

Word Analysis:

- 3 Words

a) Ataha:
- Asmat Karanat, Because of this reason.
- Because of Ishvara’s description, Being given – Sushupti and Laya Karana Description.

b) Eva:
- Only – Tal Lingaat, Same Argument as in Akasha Tal Lingaat.
- Conclusion different – Argument same.

c) Prana – in Chandogyo Upanishad: Chapter 1 – 11 – 5

Mundak Upanishad:

एतस्माज्जायते प्रणो मनः सर्वेन्द्रियाणि च ||
खं वायुज्योतिरिपातः पृथ्वी विश्वस्य धारिणी || 3 ||

etasmājjayate prāno manah sarvendriyāṇi ca
kham vāyurjyotirāpah prthivī viśvasya dhāriniḥ || 3 ||

From him are born the Prana (life), the mind, all the organs, the sky (Akasa), the wind (Vayu), the fire (Jyotih), the water (Apah) And the earth (Prthivi) which supports all. [ 2 – 1 – 3 ]

- Etasmat Jayate Pramaha(Not Ishvara goes)
- Context different.

d) Brahma: Anumanam:
- Pranaha Brahma Akasha Eva Tal Lingaat.
9th Prana Adhikaranam – Sutra 23:

For the same reason the breath also refers to Brahman. [1 – 1 – 23]

- Extension of Akashadhikaranam.

Chandogyo Upanishad:

Usasti said: It is prana [the vital force]. In prana all things that we see around us [moving or unmoving], disappear [at the time of their destruction. And at the time of their appearance], they appear from prana. Prana is that deity to whom the prastava is addressed. If you had sung the hymn not knowing the deity to whom it is addressed, in spite of being warned by me, your head would surely have fallen. [1 – 11 – 5]

- All things and beings resolve into Prana, Prana = Srishti Karanam of (Abyujhite) Laya Karanam.
- If Prana = Pancha Prana Vayu, Creation can't resolve, into Pancha Prana - Samashti Prana - Vayu.
- In Vayu only – Things born out of Vayu – Agni, Apaha, Prithvi can resolve, not Akasha.
- If They have to be justified, Prana should be Brahman alone.

Chandogyo Upanishad:

Uddalako harunih svetaketum putramuvaca svapnantom me somya vijanihiti yatraitatpurusah svapiti nama sata somya tada sampanno bhavati svampito bhavati tasmadenam svapititvacaksate svam hyapito bhavati [1]
Uddalaka Aruni said to his son Svetaketu: ‘O Somya, let me explain to you the concept of deep sleep. When a person is said to be sleeping, O Somya, he becomes one with Sat [Existence], and he attains his real Self. That is why people say about him, “He is sleeping.” He is then in his Self.’ [6 – 8 – 1]

- When person sleeps, Vag Indriyam resolves into Prana.
- Chakshu - Eyes resolves into Prana, Srotram - Manaha resolves into Prana.
- All Karanam’s, organs resolve into Prana in sleep.
- Prana functions in sleep, Unmanifest condition called Prana in Shastra.
- Sushupti Avasta = Unmanifest condition = Prana Avyakruta Avasta.

**Reason:**
- All Organs resolved but Prana is functioning.

**Chatapata Brahmanam:**
- On waking up, all organs rise out of Prana.
- Prana Presented as Sarva Laya and Srishti Karanam.

**Purva Pakshi:**
- Prana itself – Not go Upto Brahman, Why not Prana – As Srishti – Laya Karanam.

**Shankara:**
- Read both Mantras clearly.

**Example: In training Course:**
- 20 Items given read all 20, complete reasoning and do.
- 20: Don’t do any of Above 19 instructions not patient enough.
- Read Shatapatana Mantra and Chandogyo Mantra.
- Prana = Samashti Prapancha Srishti / Laya Karanam.
Shatapatna Brahmana:

- My Organs and Speech resolves into my Prana when I go to sleep.
- This Prana = Vyashti Prana - Vyashti Srishti / Laya Karanam in Vachyartha.
- When I sleep, your Karanam not resolved. Therefore not Pancha Buta Laya...
- Hence your quotation inappropriate.

Kaushitaki Upanishad:

- Manaha everything including resolves in Sushupti.

Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

> taddhēdam tarhy avyākṛtam āśīt, tan nāma-rūpābhyām 
> eva vyākriyate, asau nāma, ayam idāṁ rūpa iti, tad idam 
> api etarhi nāma-rūpābhyām eva vyākriyate, asau nāma, 
> ayam idāṁ rūpa iti. sa esa iha praviṣṭa ānakhāgrebhyaḥ 
> yathā, kṣuraḥ kṣuradhāne' vahitāḥ syāt, viśvam-bharo vā 
> viśvam-bhara-kulāye, taṁ na paśyanti. a-krītsno hi saḥ, 
> prāṇann eva prāṇo nāma bhavati, vadan vāk, paśyāṁ caksuḥ, 
> śṛṇvau śrotām, manvāno mahāh, tāṁ asyaṁtān karma-nāmāṁny eva. 
> sa yo'ta ekaikam upāste, na sa veda, akṛtsno hy eṣo'ta ekaikena bhavati, 
> ātmety evopāśita, atra hi ete sarva ekam bhavanti. tad etat padanīyam 
> asya sarvasya yaḥ ayam ātmā, anena hy etat sarvarṁ veda, yathā ha vai 
> padenānuvindet. evam kīrtim ślokaṁ vindate ya evam veda II 7 II
This (universe) was then undifferentiated. It differentiated only into name and form – it was called such and such, and was of such and such form. So to this day it is differentiated only into name and form – it is called such and such, and is of such and such form. This self has entered into these bodies up to the tip of the nails – as a razor may be put in its case, or as fire, which sustains the world, may be in it source. People do not see It, for (viewed in Its aspects) It is incomplete. When It does the function of living, It is called the vital force; when It speaks, the organ of speech; when It sees, the eye; when It hears, the ear; and when It thinks, the mind. These are merely Its names according to functions. He who meditates upon each of this totality of aspects does not know, for It is incomplete, (being divided) from this totality by possessing a single characteristic. The Self alone is to be meditated upon, for all these are unified in It. Of all these, this Self alone should be realised, for one knows all these through It, just as one may get (an animal) through its foot-prints. He who knows It as such obtains fame and association (with his relatives). [I – IV – 7]

- All organs resolve into Prana (Vak Indriya and Objects of names resolve).
- Chakshu and Chakshu Vishaya, Srotram and Srotra Vishaya.
- Objects of Creation = Whole Prapancha.
- Karanam and corresponding objective universe resolve.
- Prana = Sarva Buta Srishti Karanam. In Kaustika Upanishad Prana = Brahman.
- In Sushupti if everything resolved into Prana means Brahman.
- In Chandogyo, Prana = Brahman.
- Sarva Buta, Srishti, Sthithi Laya Karanam.

Brihadaranyaka Upanishad :

General Rule : 

Prana - Used 2 ways

- Pancha Prana
  - Sarva Karana, Srishti, Sthithi, Laya Karanam
  - Not Absolute, Why Pancha Prana not Absolute?
- Brahman
  - Prapancha Srishti, Sthiti Laya karanam
• They themselves are Karyam. They can’t be resolving ground for other Karanam.
• Pot can’t be resolving ground of Clay.
• Bangle not resolving ground of Chain. Prana – Karyam, not resolving ground of Universe.
• Brahman alone is absolute resolving, ground because Brahman is not Karanam never Karyam.

Final Question:
• If Prana is Brahman because of Sarva Srishti Laya Karanam as clue / Indicator, aren't you giving up primary meaning of Prana and taking secondary meaning.
• In Shastra, secondary meaning weaker than primary meaning.

2 Arguments - Same as in Akasha:

a) If majority of indications are referring to secondary meaning, Sarva Srishti, Sthithi, Laya Karanam, we can sacrifice primary meaning in favour of majority.
• Nyaya = Tyajas Deham Kulas Yarthe
• Sacrifice one Member for sake of whole family, one family for village, Village for country.
• Sacrifice one primary meaning to justify 6 secondary meanings.

b) Prana = Vayu Vikara = Breath, taken by Lay people as Brahman.
• Prana as Brahman has primary meaning in Shastram - Prasiddam.
• Pranasya Brahmatvam Loreel Na Prasiddaya, Not local Rudhihi but Shastra Rudhihi, Prana = Brahman in Shastra.

Keno Upanishad : To Define Atma:

Preceptor: It is the Ear of the Ear, the Mind of the Mind, the Tongue of the Tongue (Speech of the Speech) and also the Life of the Life and the Eye of the Eye. Having abandoned the sense of Self or I-ness in these and rising above sense-life, the wise become Immortal. [Chapter 1 – Verse 2]
Pranasya | Pranaha = Brahma
---|---
Sashti Prana 6th Case | Pramanata Prana
---|---
| 2nd Nominative case (Atma = Brahman)

**Mundak Upanishad:**

Knowing Him – the Prana, revelling in all beings, the wise man stops all his blabberings. Sporting in Self, delighted in self and doing acts (Enjoined), this man is the best of those who know the Brahman [3 – 1 – 4]

- Prana Appears in form of total creation.

**2nd Chapter:**

- Brahman alone appears in form of whole creation.
- Prana appears as whole creation. If 2 have to be reconciled.

**Mundak Upanishad:**

Verily, all this is the immortal Brahman. He is everywhere – Above, below, in front, at the back, on the right, on the left. All this world is indeed the supreme Brahman. [2 – 2 – 11]

- Brahman is creation.

**Later:**

- Prana alone is in form of whole creation. One who Realises Prana is Liberated. Prana = Brahman.
This (universe) was then undifferentiated. It differentiated only into name and form – it was called such and such, and was of such and such form. So to this day it is differentiated only into name and form – it is called such and such, and is of such and such form. This self has entered into these bodies up to the tip of the nails – as a razor may be put in its case, or as fire, which sustains the world, may be in its source. People do not see It, for (viewed in Its aspects) It is incomplete.

When It does the function of living, It is called the vital force; when It speaks, the organ of speech; when It sees, the eye; when It hears, the ear; and when It thinks, the mind. These are merely Its names according to functions. He who meditates upon each of this totality of aspects does not know, for It is incomplete, (being divided) from this totality by possessing a single characteristic. The Self alone is to be meditated upon, for all these are unified in It. Of all these, this Self alone should be realised, for one knows all these through It, just as one may get (an animal) through its foot – prints. He who knows It as such obtains fame and association (with his relatives). [I – IV – 7]

- Brahman enters everybody who is breathing and when individual is breathing, Atma itself gets Nama of Prana. Because Prana Adhishtanatvat Brahma Bavati.
- Keno, Mundak, Brihadaranyaka Upanishad – Say Prana = Brahman not secondary meaning but Shastra Drishtya... Primary meaning.
Conclusion:

- Prana = Devata of Prastava Bakti, Aditya = Udigita Bakti Devata, Annam = Pratihara Bakti Devata.

Purva Pakshi:

- Udigita, Pratyahara Bakti Devatas only Aditya, Annam, Local Devatas how Prana = Ishvara?
- Prastava Bakti Devata = Parichinnam Devata Can’t be Brahman.
- It is near 2 Other Devatas - Aditya And Annam.

Shankara:

- Sannidhya Marena, you conclude Prana = Parichinnam.

- Sannidhya Argument weakened if indicatory words stronger.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Siddantin</th>
<th>Purva Pakshi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Lingam more powerful</td>
<td>- Sannidhyam Story</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Than Sannidhyam</td>
<td>- Argument</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Because of proximity, Prana not Small Devata.
- If you take small Devata, can’t explain Sarva Srishti, Laya Karanam = Lingam – it is Stronger than, proximity Argument.
- Prana = Ishvara - Tal Lingaat.

Conclusion:

- Technical Format.
Vishaya:
a) Subject - Prana Shabda of Chandogyo Upanishad:

Usasti said: It is prana [the vital force]. In prana all things that we see around us [moving or unmoving], disappear [at the time of their destruction. And at the time of their appearance], they appear from prana. Prana is that deity to whom the prastava is addressed. If you had sung the hymn not knowing the deity to whom it is addressed, in spite of being warned by me, your head would surely have fallen. [1 – 11 – 5]

b) Samshaya:

• Refers to Vayu Vikara, Prana = Life breath = Pancha Prana or Saguna Brahma – Maya Sahitam Brahman because it is in Upasana section.

• Prana = Vayu or Brahman.

c) Purva Pakshi:

• Prana = Vayu Vikara Eva

d) Hetu:

• Prana as Vayu Vikara Primary - Well known meaning.

• Prana = Srishti, Sthithi, Laya, Karanam of our Organs Also.

• Therefore Prana = Vayu Vikara.

e) Siddantin:

• Pranaha Brahma
Reason:

- Tal Lingaat, Sarva Buta Srishti, Sthithi, Laya Karantvat – Possible if Prana = Brahman.
- Prana = Srishti, Sthithi, Laya Karanam of Individual in Sushupti not Samashti Prapancha – Not Laya Karana of Akasha.
- Saguna Brahman – As Jagat Srishti, Sthithi, Laya Karanam is established in Brahma Sutra.
- Ishvara as Material cause is unique aspect of Vedanta – Which is not in Sankhya, Nyaya...
- Ishvara = Nimitta Karanam – Intelligent Cause in other philosophies.
- In Material Cause – is Controversy.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sankhya / Yoga</th>
<th>Nyāya</th>
<th>Realisation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Pradhanam = Matter = Material Cause</td>
<td>- Material cause = Matter</td>
<td>- Conscious being as Material Cause of Universe is unique feature of Vedanta</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Vyasa interested to refute Sankhya, Ishvara as Upadana Karanam has to be Admitted.
- Nirguna Brahman never Upadana Karanam it will not refute Sankhya.
- Sankhya = Primary Purva Pakshi of Brahma Sutra.
- Visishta Advaitin / Dvaitin, Advaitin all Vedantin.

Visishta Advaitin:

- Saguna Brahman, Nirguna Brahman, Split question comes.
- Ishvara Kevala Nimitta or Upadanam Karanam?
- Akasha Adhikaranam = Ishvara = Upadana Karanam.
- Prana Adhikaranam = Ishvara = Upadana Karanam, Srishti, Sthithi, Laya Karanam = Ishvara.
- 9th Adhikaranam over, Sankhya Refuted.
Prana Adhikarana – Chandogyo Upanishad:

Usasti said: It is prana [the vital force]. In prana all things that we see around us [moving or unmoving], disappear [at the time of their destruction. And at the time of their appearance], they appear from prana. Prana is that deity to whom the prastava is addressed. If you had sung the hymn not knowing the deity to whom it is addressed, in spite of being warned by me, your head would surely have fallen. [1 – 11 – 5]

- Prana = Sagunam Brahman = Ishvara over.

10th Adhikaranam – Sutra 24:

The ‘light’ is Brahman, on account of the mention of feet in a passage which is connected with the passage about the light. [1 – 1 – 24]

- Jyotihi – Charana Bhidanat 4 Sutras.
- Sutra “24, 25, 26, 27” – Sutras.
General Analysis:

Chandogyo Upanishad:

Then, higher than this heaven, above the world, higher than everything, in the highest world, higher than which nothing exists – the light that shines there is the same light that is in a human being. [3 – 13 – 7]

- 12th / 13th / 14th Sections Analysed, Actual mantra - 13th Section.
- Saguna Brahman Upasanam = Gayithri.

**Vedic Metre / Chandaha**

**In Sandhyavadanam:**
- Ushnik, Anushtup, Trishtup, Metres

**Metre:**
- In which mantra composed

**No of lines:**
- 3, 4, 5 – Each line has may syllables
- Gayithri – 3 lines – 8 Syllables / line = 24 Syllables

**Mantra**

**1 Line:**
- Tat Savitur Varenyam – 8

**2nd Line:**
- Bargo Devas Dimahi – 8

**3rd line:**
- Dhiyo Yona Prachodayat – 8
- Om Burbua Svaha... Not Part of Gayithri Metre
- Added in Beginning to remember
- Essence of Gayithri mantra
Gayathri Mantra:

Om, (that Divine Illumination which Pervades the) Bhu Loka (Physical Plane, Consciousness of the Physical Plane), Bhuvar Loka (Antariksha or Intermediate Space, Consciousness of the Prana) and Swar Loka (Swarga, Heaven, Consciousness of the Divine Mind), On that Savitur (Divine Illumination) which is the Most Adorable (Varenyam), and which is of the nature of Divine Effulgence (Bhargo Devasya), I meditate, May that Divine Intelligence (Dhiyah) Awaken (Pracodyat) our (Spiritual Consciousness).

Gayathri Mantra:

- Most repeated mantra. Brahman used in Gayathri Rupa Upasana is Presented in Hridayam – Abode of Gayathri - in Section 13 - Anga Upasana.

a) Brahma Purusha Upasana Hridayam:

Brahman / King:

- Palace / City / Ayatanam. With 5 gates / Doors.
- Each door has Devata guard, Brahma Purusha attendant.
- Complimentary Upasana.

a) Section 12:

- Gayathri Rupa Brahman Upasana = Angi Upasana = Primary Upasana.

b) Section 13 – 2nd Upasana:

- Jyoti Rupena Brahma Upasana, Teja Prakasha Rupena Brahma Upasana.
- Chandilya Vidya. Sartvatmaka Brahma Upasana.
Then, higher than this heaven, above the world, higher than everything, in the highest world, higher than which nothing exists – the light that shines there is the same light that is in a human being. [3 – 13 – 7]

- Brahma Jyoti is all pervading in all Lokas – All within individual Shariram.
- Because of Jyoti Chaitanyam, body is warm and conscious, live.
- Without Chaitanyam, Body has no life. Life expressed in Body is manifestation of Brahman.
- Meditate on That Jyoti in the Body.
- How you feel / Recognise presence of Brahman in the Body?
2 Clues:

a) Touch:
- Feel warmth of life.
- Outside temperature low but inside high.
- In Dead Body - Tanda ho Gaya.
- Aushnaya Rupena Brahman Jyoti.

b) Same Jyoti - is Jatar Agni in Stomach:
- All the time can hear sound of inner fire by closing ears, in silent place.
  
  Brahman Jyoti
  - Heat
  - Sound Blasing fire
  - Bellowing Bull

  • In Heaven and in this Body.

Sound:
- Samanyam – All the time. Visesha – Bur Bur if hungry.

Samshaya:
- What is Controversy
  
  Jyoti
  - Brahman
  - Secondary Meaning
  - Chetana Praksha, Karana Jyoti
  - Like Akasha, Prana = Ishvara,
  Jyoti = Ishvara
  - Normal light
  - Surya, Chandra, Agni,
  Nakshatra, Vidyut Prakasha
  - Primary Meaning
  - Achetana Prakasha
  - Inert effulgent principle
  - Karya Jyoti
Above is General Analysis of all 4 Sutras in Adhikaranam.
Now general Analysis of 1\textsuperscript{st} Sutra.

Previous:
- Akasha = Brahman - Tal Lingaat
- Prana = Brahman – Tal Lingaat
- Here in 13\textsuperscript{th} Section – No Qualities mentioned.
- Hence indirect method Used.

12\textsuperscript{th} Section:
- Establish Gayithri Upasana = Brahman Upasana.
- Gayithri Brahma - Tal Lingaat Qualities mentioned.

13\textsuperscript{th} Section:
- Jyoti = Brahman – Same object of Meditation.

12\textsuperscript{th} Section : Chandogyo Upanishad:

\begin{quote}
All that exists in this world, whatever there is, is Gayatri. It is the word that is Gayatri, for the word gives names to all things and it also tells them not to fear. [ 3 – 12 – 1 ]
\end{quote}

\begin{quote}
Its glory is like this. Nut the Glory of the Purusha [i.e., Brahman, who fills the whole world] is still greater. All Creatures constitute one quarter of him. The remaining three quarters are nectar in heaven. [ 3 – 12 – 6 ]
\end{quote}
Infinite - Gayithri – 4 Quarters

1st Quarter - Pradhana Pada
- Cosmos
- Lower / Upper / Middle Lokas
- Samastha Prapancha
- Saguna Svarupam

3 / 4 Quarters beyond time / Space
- Universe
- Nirguna Svarupam

Gita:

He who in truth knows these manifold manifestations of My being (macrocosm) and (this) Yoga power of Mine (Microcosm) Becomes established in the Tremorless – Yoga; there is no doubt it. [Chapter 10 – Verse 7]

• One infinitesimal part is universe.

How vast am I?
• Entire universe occupies a small portion of me.

Gita Chapter 10:
- Vishtabyam - Jagat
- Eka Amsha – Jagat.

One infinitesimal part is universe.

Entire universe occupies a small portion of me.

Gita Chapter 10:
- Vishtabyam - Jagat
- Eka Amsha – Jagat.

= Chatuspath, Sarvatmakam, Idagum Sarvam

492
Gayithri

- Not Vedic Metre
- Not 3 lines / 8 Syllables Per line
- Not Trishtup Mantra

- But Brahman – Tal Lingaat
- Sarvatmakatvam, being everything, Allness and Chatuspath

Mandukya Upanishad:

सर्वं भवेतद् ब्रह्मायमात्मा ब्रह्म सोऽयमात्मा चतुष्पात् ॥ ॥

Sarvam hyetad Brahma, ayam-atma Brahma, so'yam-atma catuspat ॥ ॥

All this is verily Brahman. This Atman is Brahman. This Atman has four quarters (parts). [Mantra 2]

- Pragya = Whole universe, Turiyam = Beyond.
- Anga Upasana – Argument in introduction in 13th Section – 1st Portion.
- Gayithri Brahman is abiding in Hridayam with 5 door ways – Security Guards called Brahma Purusha.
- If Gayithri not Brahman why it Should support Devatas in Anga Upasana.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Angi Upasana</th>
<th>Anga Upasana</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Gayithri Upasana</td>
<td>- Brahman Purusha Upasana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Brahman Upasana</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Connecting Angi and Anga, Gayithri must be Brahman.

To Reach Minister

Give Dakshina to Minister

Angi - Primary

Give Dakshina to asst

Anga - Secondary

- Shivalaya Dakshana Krama, worship Nandi first.
Section 12 + 13:

- Object of Gayithri Upasana - Brahman
- Object of Jyoti Upasana - Brahman

Same Upasyam
The ‘light’ is Brahman, on account of the mention of feet in a passage which is connected with the passage about the light. [1 – 1 – 24]

Argument:

1st Sutra - 13th Section:
- No direct clue for proving Jyoti = Brahman.
- Hence forced to take indirect, method of going to section 12 and 14.

12th Section:
- Gayithri Vidya.
- 1st task - Gayithri = Brahman

2nd Task:
- Same Brahman in section 13, Gayithri = Jyoti.

3rd Step:
- Brahman = Jyoti, how we prove Gayithri = Brahman.
- Charama Abhidanaat, Upanishad talks about 4 Padas of Gayithri to prove, Gayithri is infinite.
Chandogyo Upanishad:

Its glory is like this. Nut the Glory of the Purusha [i.e., Brahman, who fills the whole world] is still greater. All Creatures constitute one quarter of him. The remaining three quarters are nectar in heaven. [3 – 12 – 6]

- All things and beings of universe ¼ of Gayithri.
- 3 / 4 - Beyond Universe = Diwi.

Purusha Suktam – Rig Veda:

The Purusha (Universal Being) has Thousand Heads, Thousand Eyes and Thousand Feet (Thousand signifies innumerable which points to the omnipresence of the Universal Being), He envelops the World from all sides (i.e. He pervades each part of the Creation), and extends beyond in the Ten Directions (represented by Ten Fingers). [Verse 1]

- 1 / 4 – Universe in time and space.
- 3 / 4 – Beyond time and Space.

Charama Abhidanat – 4 Padas of Gayithri - Encompass

- Charama – Chatushpavatm.
- Abhidanat – kathanat, Uktatvat, Bhidanat.
Chandogyo Upanishad:

All that exists in this world, whatever there is, is Gayatri. It is the word that is Gayatri, for the word gives names to all things and it also tells them not to fear. [3 – 12 – 1]

2nd Part:
- Gayithri of 12th section = Jyoti of 13th Section.
- Topic of 12th and 13th Section identical Upasya Abhidanaat.

Shankara gives 3 Reasons:
a) Ata - Beginning of new Upasana:
- Yatu – Pronoun
- Can be used to indicate, Noun talked before.
- That effulgent principle.
Then, higher than this heaven, above the world, higher than everything, in the highest world, higher than which nothing exists – the light that shines there is the same light that is in a human being. [3 – 13 – 7]

- Reminds of Upasyam.
- 1st Reason – Shows topic of 12th and 13th same.

2nd Reason:
- Tavan Asya Mahima, Divi = Svarga Loka.
- Brahman associated with Svarga Loka, indicated in 12th Section.
- Brahman of 12th Sloka has Svarga loka connection.

13th Section:
- Ata Yatha Paraha Divaha association of Brahman with Svarga in Divaha.
- Hence Gayithri and Jyoti refer to same Brahman whose light reaches Svarga.

Pratyabigya Argument:
- Association argument when you go to place you are, reminded about person who lives there, Diwaha = Gayithri.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1st Argument</th>
<th>2nd Argument</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sarva Nama Prayogat</td>
<td>Svarda Loka Sambandat</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3rd Argument:
- Charama Abidat, Doubt only in 13th Section.

Shankara:
- Go to 14th Section.
- Chandilya Vidya = Brahman Upasana.
For Example: Ishvara:

1\textsuperscript{st}:
- Ishvara = Parithraya Sadhunam.

3\textsuperscript{rd}:
- Srishti Karta.

2\textsuperscript{nd}:
- Ishvara – Not my Neighbour uncle who has a problem.
- Former, middle, later – Must be same.

Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:
- Sush Dun Shan – Nyaya.

Tong:
- 12\textsuperscript{th} Top – of Tong - Gayithri Vidya Upasana.
- 13\textsuperscript{th} – Middle of Tong caught – Jyoti.
- 14\textsuperscript{th} – Lower tong – Chandilya Vidya.

All 3 Refer to Brahman:
- Symbols different – Symbolised same.
- Alambanam different – Upasyam same.
- Jyotih Charama Abidanat.
- Jyoti Non – Different from Gayithri, is referring to Brahman alone.
- Because of Charam Abidanaat, because of mention of 4 Padas in previous section.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Universe</th>
<th>Beyond Universe</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Padam</td>
<td>3 Padams</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Word Analysis:**

- Jyoti Charanadhi

**a) Jyoti:**

- Light mentioned in Chandogyo Upanishad:

```
अथ यदातः परो दिवो ज्योतिर्दिप्यते विश्रातः पुष्पे
सर्वतः पुष्पश्रुणुतमेपूर्ण-मेघु लोकेष्विराब्राह्म
तद्यदिदमस्मिन्नतः पुरुषे ज्योति ॥ ७ ॥
```

**Atha yadatah paro divo jyotirdipyate visvatah prasthesu
sarvatah prsthavanuttamesuttamesu lokesvidam vava
tadyadidamasminnantaḥ puruse jyotih ॥ ७ ॥**

- Is Non different from Gayithri of 3 – 12.

**b) Paksha:**

- Point of Controversy Gayithri Abinnam Jyoti Brahma Bavati.

**Conclusion:**

- Shankara does not differentiate, Saguna – Nirguna Brahman.
- Upasana Pramanam = Saguna – Maya Sahita Brahman Ishvara.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Charama</th>
<th>Abidanaat</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Pada / Quarters</td>
<td>- Because of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Chatushpatvam</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Gayithri happens to be Jyoti also.
- Lingam of 12th Section supplied in 13th Section.
Purva Pakshi:

- Don’t accept your conclusion.
- Brahman – Not Brahman Jyoti, not Chetana Jyoti.

We Say:

- Karana Jyoti as 3rd Argument, he gives 6 Arguments.

a) Prasidatvat:

- Aditya Jyoti – Achetana Rudham – Not Chetana, Karana Jyoti.

b) Deepyate iti Vachanaat:

- Bright and Shining to eye. Not Shining Consciousness.
- Nobody experiences consciousness Shining, if consciousness were shining.
- We wont need external light (Min Mina Putchi)

c) Maryada Vachanaat:

- Boundary, Seema, limit = Maryada.
- Jyoti Shining beyond heavens – Diwahaparaha beyond heavens.
- Beyond the hall, means on this side he is not. Brahman has no limit.
d) Aadhara Sravanat:
- Location for Jyoti mentioned.
- Adhara Saptami – “Shu”.
- Sarvada Pratishteshu – Light is in the Higher Lokas Brahman unallocated.

In:
- Locus, 7th Case.

Shankara:
- (Everything Located in Brahman Vishwadharam).

e) Sharira Jyotir Sampyat:
- Jyoti of Higher, Lokas can’t be meditated within Body.
- In Body Available is Tejaha Agni, warmth of Life.
- If can be felt within – Close ears hear sound.
- Drishta, Srishta Rupena Upasana Uktam.
- Stomach fire is warmth of life, experienced.
- If warmth taken as Symbol, then Jyoti Should be Achetana Agni Prakasha Karyam Jyoti in Higher world – Heaven also.
- Upasana possible in Similarity only - Sadrushyam only.
- Similarity between Alambanam and Upasyam.
- Destructive Diety – Tooth pervading, Mala of Rakshashas, Kali - Karali.
- Constructive protective diety = Smiling, Vishnu. Sun not in warm Stomach.
- Alambana Samanyat, Karya Jyotishtavam.
- Sharira – Jyoti Samanyat.
f) Parichinna Phalam of meditation:

- Srute Rupena Upasanam – Sound.
- Upasaka will become Darshana and Sravana Yogyaha.
- Chakshushaya Bavati – Will look handsome / Presentable.
- Jyoti = Sound - His name Sounded all over, will become famous, Srutaha Prasiddam Bavati.
- Beauty and fame are Upasana Phalam.

Gita:

The worshippers of the Deva’s or gods go to the Deva’s to the Pitr’s or Ancestors go to the ancestor worshippers; to the Bhuta’s or the elements go worshippers of the Bhuta’s; But My Worshippers come to Me. [Chapter 9 – Verse 25]

Kano Upanishad:

The eye does not go there, not speech, nor mind. We do not know That. We do not know how to instruct one about it. It is distinct from the known and above the unknown. We have heard it, so stated the preceptors who taught us That.

- Shankara refutes all 6 Arguments.
Lecture 58

10th Adhikaranam - 24th Sutra:

The ‘light’ is Brahman, on account of the mention of feet in a passage which is connected with the passage about the light. [1–1–24]

- Gayithri Bhinna Jyotihi Brahma Charanabhidhanat.
- Chapter 3 – Section 13 – Jyoti = Brahman.

Purva Pakshi:
- 6 Reasons.

Shankaras Answer:
a) Prasidda:
- Light – External, Visible primary Meaning.

2 Answers

- Primary Meaning can be sacrificed if other factors favorable
  - Jyoti pervades universe and beyond
  - Sarvatmakam Karana Jayoti Brahman

- Jyoti has meaning of Consciousness in primary sense
  - Shastra Prasiddah

Mundak Upanishad:
a) Tat Shubram, Jyotisham Jyotih – Tat Atma Vido Vido Vihu.
b) Hiranmaye Pare Koshe Virajam Vishudam.
The stainless, indivisible Brahman, the pure, the light of all lights, is in the innermost sheath of the golden hue—the highest. That is what the knowers of the Atman know. [II – II – 9]

There the sun does not shine, nor the moon nor the stars; these lightning's also do not shine - how then (can) this earthly fire? Verily, everything shines after Him reflecting His glory. This whole world is illumined with His light. [II – II – 10]

- Light, in whose presence, things become evident.
- Ultimate light of Consciousness in Presence of whose Shabda, Rupa, Spansha, evident.
- Jyoti – is primary meaning in Shastra Prasidda Arthaha.

d) Kaivalyo Upanishad:

"That which illumines the world of relative experiences lived in the waking, dream and deep - sleep conditions, that Brahman am I" – and realising thus, one is liberated from all shackles. [Verse 17]
e) **Gita**

That (Brahman), the Light-of-all lights, is said to be beyond darkness; (it is) Knowledge, the Object-of-Knowledge, seated in the hearts of all, to be reached by Knowledge. [Chapter 13 – Verse 18]

**Dakshinamurthy Stotram**

(Salutations to Sri Dakshinamurthy Who Awakens the Glory of the Atman within us through His Profound Silence) Just Like the Sun and the Moon are Eclipsed by Rahu, the Pure Consciousness is Eclipsed by Maya (for a spiritually ignorant person), A Spiritually Elevated Soul can enter that state of Unborn Deep Sleep (i.e. Pure Consciousness) by Withdrawing His Sense Organs to such an extent that Only the Real Essence remains, That state (i.e. Pure Consciousness) is experienced during Spiritual Awakening whereby one clearly Perceives that "Before I was Sleeping" (by being eclipsed by Maya), Salutations to Him, the Personification of Our Inner Guru Who Awakens This Knowledge through His Profound Silence; Salutation to Sri Dakshinamurthy. [Verse 6]

3) **Maryada**

- How Brahman can have boundary?

**Shankara**

- This is Saguna Brahman Upasana section / Ishvara.
- All pervading Ishvara taken with limitation for save of Upasanam.
- We confine Ishvara to idol even, though we know Ishvara is all pervading.
- We invoke in temple, idol, consciously imposed, for Upasana.
4) Aadhara vachanat :
• How Brahman located? Upasanartham Adhara Doshaha Bavati, Invoke Ishvara in Turmeric.

5) Ishvara Visualised in Warmth of Body :

Purva Pakshi :
• If Alambanam Jadam, Upasyam must be also Jadam.

Shankara :
• No Such rule, if Jada Alambanam for Jada Upasyam, then we can’t do any Puja, Ritual.
• All Vedic rituals on Jada Vastu. Alambanam must be Visible.
• Upasyam = Invisible Devata, All worldly objects only Jadam, Alambanams are worldly objects.

Gita : Chapter 10 :
• Vibhuti Yoga – Meditate upon Ganga, Himalaya Agni.
• No Rule symbol and Devata Should be similar.

• Limited Devata gives limited results.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agni / Apaha – One with Rs 10</th>
<th>Ishvara one with Rs 100</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Can Donate Rs 10</td>
<td>- Can Donate 10, 20, 50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- 100 not included in 10</td>
<td>- 10 included in 100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Can give Dharma, Artha, Kama</td>
<td>- Can give Moksha also and Dharma, Artha, Kama.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Gita :
Whatsoever form any devotee desires to worship with faith – That (Same) faith of his I make (Firm and Unflinching. [ Chapter 7 – Verse 23 ]

यो यो यां यां तनुः भक्तः श्रद्धयाचिंतिमिच्छति ।
तस्य तस्याचलां श्रद्धां तामेव विद्याम्यहम् ॥७-२१॥

507
Vishnu Sahasranamam : Phala Shruthi :

He who seeks Dharma, He who seeks wealth, He who seeks pleasures, He who seeks children, Will all without fail, Get what they want. [Verse 4]

• Go to Ishvara and can ask attractive, Personality – Parichinna Phalam.

25th Sutra :

If it be said that Brahman is not denoted on account of the Metre Gayatri being denoted, we reply not so, because thus i.e. by means of the Metre the application of the mind on Brahman is declared; because thus it is seen (in other passages also). [1 – 1 – 25]

• This Sutra long - Bahu Aksharam

Topic :

• Jyoti = Chandogyo Upanishad – 3rd Chapter – 13th Section.  
  = Brahman same as Gayithri of 12th Section.

Purva Pakshi :

• I don't accept previous section also.
• Prasiddah Arthaha of Gayithri Chandaha Abhidanat.
• Vedic Metre = Vachyartha, Mukhyartha, Prasidyartha.
• Lakshyartha = Brahman = Secondary Meaning.
• Primary Meaning given up if Unfitting, illogical.
**Upanishad : Chandogyo Upanishad :**

```
गायत्री वा इदं सर्वं भूतं यदिदं किंच
वाग्ये गायत्री वाग्वा इदं सर्वं भूतं गायति च त्रायते ॥
```

Gayatri va idam sarvam bhutam yad idam kinca vag vai gayatri vag va idam sarvam bhutam gayati ca trayate ca.

All that exists in this world, whatever there is, is Gayatri. It is the word that is Gayatri, for the word gives names to all things and it also tells them not to fear. [ 3 – 12 – 1 ]

- Gayithri is infinite, Anantham, Sarva Adhishtanam, Sarva Karanam, Sarva Sara, Sarva Vyapakam.
- Gold = All Ornaments, pervades ornaments, cause.

**Gayithri :**

```
ॐ भूर्भुवः स्वः तत्सवितुर्वरेण्यं ॥
भर्गो देवस्य धीमहि धियो यो न: प्रणोदयात् ॥
```

Om Bhuur-Bhuvah Svah Tat-Savitur-Varennyam |
Bhargo Devasya Dhiimahi Dhiyo Yo Nah Pracodayaat ॥

Om, (that Divine Illumination which Pervades the) Bhu Loka (Physical Plane, Consciousness of the Physical Plane), Bhuvar Loka (Antariksha or Intermediate Space, Consciousness of the Prana) and Swar Loka (Swarga, Heaven, Consciousness of the Divine Mind), On that Savitur (Divine Illumination) which is the Most Adorable (Varenyam), and which is of the nature of Divine Effulgence (Bhargo Devasya), I meditate, May that Divine Intelligence (Dhiyah) Awaken (Pracodyat) our (Spiritual Consciousness).

- Primary Meaning – Vachyartha = Chandaha 3 lines – 8 Letters each = 24 letters.
- Not even all Vedic letters / Alphabets.
- Gayithri Devata presides one aspect of Creation. Like Indra, Vanna, Agni.
- No Devata is everything.

**Secondary meaning / Lakshyarthaha :** Brahman

- Gayithri = Maya Sahita Karanam Brahman.
  = Ishvara, Idagum Sarvam
Observe rule in Secondary Meaning:

- It should be closely connected to primary meaning.

b) Supreme can’t Bench – Passed Statement:

- Chetana Purusha – Not inert table.
- Not Next door neighbor.

- Lakshyartha must be connected with Vachyartha.
- What is Connection between Brahman and Gayithri?
- Brahman = Sarva Karanam and Sarvam.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Everything</th>
<th>Brahman</th>
<th>Karya</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Effect / Karyam</td>
<td>Karanam</td>
<td>Karana Rupa Sambanda</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Sarva Anugatam - Inherent, Upahitam, Adharam, Adhishtanam, Karanam.
- Gold in every ornament – Can invoke Brahman is any object of World.
- Can invoke gold in Any ornament.
- Karya Gayithri Dvara, Karana Brahman Upasate.
- Karya Shaligrama Dvara Karana, Karya Shivalinga Turmeric powder Vishnu Upasate, Mother / Teacher / father.

Gita:

```
चतुष्टिभूतिमत्स्यं श्रीमदूर्जितं वा ।
तत्तद्वावगच्छ बं मम तेजोंशसंभवम् ॥ १०-४१ ॥
```

- Whatever that is glorious, prosperous or powerful in any being, that know you to be a manifestation of a part of my splendor. [Chapter 10 – Verse 41]
- Infinite form – Not infinite gods, Symbolically one god.
Taitriya Upanishad:

**Bhūrīti vā ayaṁ lokaḥ | bhūva ityantarikṣam | suvārityasau lokaḥ | maha ityādityah | ādityena vāva sarve lokā mahīyante || 4 ||**

Bhuh is the Rk. Bhuvah is the Saman. Suvah is the yajus. Mahah is the Brahman (As represented by the syllable Om). It is by the Brahman, indeed, that the Vedas thrive. [1 – 5 – 4]

- Gayathri Albanaka – Brahman Lakshana worship lord thru Shaligrama, Ganges, H2o - inert - can’t know you are worshipping.
- Ganga Alambana Dvara – Brahman Puja.
- Hindus not idol worshipper but ideal worshippers.

**Word Analysis:**

**a) Purva Pakshi - Portion:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chandobinat</th>
<th>Na Etichet</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Siddanta Portion</td>
<td>Suppose</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**b) Siddanta Portion:**

- Na Tata Sheto Arpana Nigadad Tata Hi Darshanam... This is example in support of Siddanta.

**Purva Pakshi:**

- Vedic Metre = Gayithri – Purva Pakshi.
- Object of meditation in previous section 12
Sutra 25:

If it be said that Brahman is not denoted on account of the Metre Gayatri being denoted, we reply not so, because thus i.e. by means of the Metre the application of the mind on Brahman is declared; because thus it is seen (in other passages also). [1–1–25]

Siddantin:

a) Na:
- Not correct to say previous section talks of Gayithri mantra.

b) Thata:
- Through Gayithri symbol Brahman meditated.
- Shaligram / Linga – Alambanam Natu Upasyam.
- Brahman = Upasyam = Fixing mind on Brahman = Upasana.
- Object of Meditation in section 12 is not Gayithri Metre because, Brahman Upasanam prescribed through symbol of Vedic Metre.

Example:
- Veda mantras are used as Alambanam object of meditation, for Saguna Brahma Upasanam.
- Now idols, Shaligrama, Lingams.
Siksha Valli:
- Vyavrhuti Upasana, Taittriya Upanishad:

Bhūriti vā ayaṁ lokaḥ | bhūva ityantarakṣam | suvārtyasau lokaḥ | maha ityādityaḥ | ādityena vāva sarve lokā mahāyante || 4 ||

Bhuh is the Rk. Bhuvah is the Saman. Suvah is the yajus. Mahah is the Brahman (As represented by the syllable Om). It is by the Brahman, indeed, that the Vedas thrive. [1 – 5 – 4]

- Vedic Letters / Alphabets / Words / Gap between 2 Words.

Why Such Symbols?
- Popularly known respected, mind goes naturally to that symbol.
- Students mind Soaked in mantras, Now Alambanam is 3 Stumps = Brahma Vishnu Shiva.
- Bail – Common – Chaitanyam.
- Raaga = Alambanam for Music students.

Aitareya Aranyakam:
- Meditate on rig Veda mantra, Gayithri Common to all Vedas therefore symbol.

Sutra 26:

Bhūtadipadavyapadesopapatteschaivam

And thus also (we must conclude, viz., that Brahman is the subject or topic of the previous passage, where Gayatri occurs) because (thus only) the declaration as to the beings etc. being the feet is possible. [1 – 1 – 26]

Topic:
- 13th Section – Jyoti.
- Gayithri = Brahman – Object of meditation.
**Chandogyo Upanishad:**

The Gayatri has four quarters, each being six fold. This is what is stated in a Rk mantra. [3 – 12 – 5]

- Gayithri has 4 Padas indicates Gayithri is not 3 Padas as Mentioned in Mahanarayani Upanishad.

**Tripada Gayithri Metre**

- Tat Savitur Varenyam
- Bargo Devasya Dhimahi
- Dhiyo Yo Naha Prachodayat

**Gayithri Mantra:**

Om, (that Divine Illumination which Pervades the) Bhu Loka (Physical Plane, Consciousness of the Physical Plane), Bhuvar Loka (Antariksha or Intermediate Space, Consciousness of the Prana) and Swar Loka (Swarga, Heaven, Consciousness of the Divine Mind), On that Savitur (Divine Illumination) which is the Most Adorable (Varenyam), and which is of the nature of Divine Effulgence (Bhargo Devasya), I meditate, May that Divine Intelligence (Dhiyah) Awaken (Pracodyat) our (Spiritual Consciousness).

**Chatvara – 4 Padas of Gayithri as Sarvatma Brahma**

- Butani
- Prithvi
- Shariram
- Hridayam

- All living Beings of Creation
- Whole earth World
- Physical individual Body
- Heart Individual
515

- Bahya Prapancha
- External

- Aantara Prapancha
- Internal

Microcosm

Macrocosm

- Whole put together = Gayithri = Brahman.
- Essence of Meditation - Sarvam Khalu, Idam Brahman = Gayithri Rupam Brahman.

4 Padas explained in 2 Different ways in 12th section

Chandogyo Upanishad / Sama Veda based

- Living beings
- World
- Body
- Hridayam

Quotes Rig mantra

- Tadetat Richak Hridayam
- Padosya Vishwa Butani

- 1 Pada world
- Saguna

- 3 Padas beyond world
- Nirguna

Purusha Sukta:

पुरुष एवेदं सर्वं यद्भूतं यत्र भव्यम्।
उत्तमरूत्वस्तेषशानो यद्धन्नेतितरोहति॥
एतावानस्य महिमातो ज्यायाँ श्च पूरुषः।
पादोपयस्य विश्वा भूतानि त्रिपादस्याम्स्तं दिवि॥

puรุ莎 ेvedaम sarvaम yadbhūtाम yacca bhavyam,
utāmrतattvasyeśāno yadannenātirohati.
etāvānasa mahimā ato jyāyāigesca pūrusāḥ,
pādo'sya viśvā bhūtāni tripādasyā'ṃrtam divi.

All this (manifestation) is the Purusha alone—whatever was and whatever will be. He is the Lord of Immortality, for He transcends all in His Form as food (the universe). Such is His Glory; but greater still is the Purusha. One-fourth of Him all beings are, (while) three-fourth of Him rises above as the Immortal Being. [Verse 2]
• Essence – Brahman = Everything = Sarvatma Brahman.

**Chandogyo Upanishad:**

- Chandogyo Upanishad:
  - All this is Brahman. Everything comes from Brahman, everything goes back to Brahman, and everything is sustained by Brahman. One should therefore quietly meditate on Brahman. Each person has a mind of his own. What a person wills in his present life, he becomes when he leaves this world. One should bear this in mind and meditate accordingly. [3–14–1]

- Mundak Upanishad:
  - Mundak Upanishad:
    - Verily, all this is the immortal Brahman. He is everywhere – Above, below, in front, at the back, on the right, on the left. All this world is indeed the supreme Brahman. [2 – 2 – 11]

**Word Analysis:**

- Butadhi Padav Vyapadehe Upapapatte Cha Evam.
  - a) Buta:
    - All living beings not 5 elements.
  - b) Aadhi:
    - Extra other 3 Padas, Prithvi, Sharira, Hridayam.
  - c) Pada:
    - 4 Quarters
  - d) Vyapadesha Upapatte:
    - Because of mention of living being etc as 4 Quarters of Gayithri.
e) Cha = Also
f) Evam:
   - Same Conclusion. Purva Prakana Upasyam Na Gayithri Chandaha.
   - Butadi Padav Vyapadesha Oppadeshascha world - Part of Brahman = Object of meditation.
   - 3rd Sutra over.

Sutra 27:

If it be said (that Brahman of the Gayatri passage cannot be Recognised in the passage treating of ‘light’) on account of the difference of designation or the specification (we reply) no, because in either (designation) there is nothing contrary (to the recognition). [ 1 – 1 – 27 ]

General Analysis:

1) 12th Section Analysed:
   - Establishes Gayithri = Brahman.

2) 13th Section Analysed:
   - Establishes Jyoti = Gayithri = Brahman.

Purva Pakshi:

- How topic of 12th and 13th section same.

Chandogyo Upanishad – Siddantin:

Tavan asya mahima tato jyayamsca purusah pado 'syar sarva bhutani tripadasyamrtam diviti
Its glory is like this. Not the Glory of the Purusha [i.e., Brahman, who fills the whole world] is still greater. All Creatures constitute one quarter of him. The remaining three quarters are nectar in heaven. [3 – 12 – 6]

- *Divi* = Svarga Loka – in heaven Chandogyo Upanishad:

> प्रथ यदत् परे दिवो ज्योतिर्दीप्यते विश्वत् पृष्ठेषु सर्वत् पृष्ठेष्वनुतंत्रेषु मेषु लोकेष्विदं वावतः तद्विद्मणिवर्तनत् पुरुषे ज्योति || 7 ||

> अथ यदात्परे दिवो ज्योतिर्दीप्यते विश्वतः प्रस्तेषु सर्वतः पृष्ठेष्वनुतंत्रेषु मेषु लोकेष्विदं वाव तद्यदिदमस्मिन्नातं पुरुषे ज्योति || 7 ||

Then, higher than this heaven, above the world, higher than everything, in the highest world, higher than which nothing exists – the light that shines there is the same light that is in a human being. [3 – 13 – 7]

- Divo – Jyotihi = Common word Divi = Svarga Loka.
- Therefore 13th is Svaragaloka Jyoti Pratyabigya – Reminds us of Same topic.
- Thru Divo – Remember Divi = Brahman Upasanam.

**Purva Pakshi:**

- You can’t say same word is repeated in 2 sections.
- 12th Section - Divi – 7th case – (Locative in the heaven).
- 13th Section – Divo – 5th Case – Divaha Paraha (Beyond the heaven) cases different, topics different.

**Siddantin:**

- Topic same even though cases different – Even though prepositions different.

**12th Section:**

- In / On the heaven.

**13th Section:**

- Beyond heaven.
### 3rd Case
- By Means of 2 fact he is coming
- Padabyam Gachhati
- Instrumental Case
- Jnanena Moksha by Means of Jnanam liberation

### 5th Case
- From
- Padabyam Agachhati
- Gramado Aagachhati
- He is Coming from Village
- Jnanat Moksha
- Liberation from Knowledge

### English

#### Hotel on the sea / River
- Hotel beyond the sea / River
  - Near the sea / off sea
  - Sampya Saptami

#### Divi

#### 12th Section
- 7th Case
- Not location
- Beyond heaven
- Divaha Paraha

#### 13th Section
- 5th Case in the heaven

### English

- There is clock over the table
- Located on the table
- Location

- Boy Jumped over the table
- Beyond the table
- Not Location
1st Argument:
- Preposition have different meanings or common meaning.

2nd Argument:
- Repetition of same word is not repetition of cases.
- In / on / Beyond not talking of same word.
- Repetition of word enough to communicate same topic.
- Don’t require case ending / Preposition technique.
- Prakrti common, Pratyaya – Bheda Api – Not Common.
Lecture 60

Jyotish Charanadhikaranam 2 parts:

- Object of meditation connected with heaven in 12th and 13th Section.
- Divi loka Sambanda gives Pratya Vigyanam.
- Meditation – Same in 12th and 13th Section, because Divi Loka Sambanda indicated in 12th and 13th Section.

12th Section - Chandogyo Upanishad:

*Tavan asya mahima tato jyayamsca purusah pado 'syas sarva bhutani tripadasyamrtam diviti*T

Its glory is like this. Nut the Glory of the Purusha [i.e., Brahman, who fills the whole world] is still greater. All Creatures constitute one quarter of him. The remaining three quarters are nectar in heaven. [3 – 12 – 6]

13th Section:

*Atha yadatvah paro divo jyotirdipate visvatah prasthesu sarvatah prsthavanuttamesuttamesu lokesvidam vava tadyadidamsminnantah puruse jyotih*T

Then, higher than this heaven, above the world, higher than everything, in the highest world, higher than which nothing exists – the light that shines there is the same light that is in a human being. [3 – 13 – 7]
Purva Pakshi:

- Words repeated.
- 12th Section – in the Heaven – 7th case
- 13th Section - Beyond heaven – 5th case
- 12th Section - Object of meditation in the heaven, 13th Section - Object of meditation beyond heaven.

How objects same?

- Person in Madras different from person beyond Madras.

How both Same?

- In 2 Different cases – 2 Vibaktis (Prepositions) are there, Above is 1st Argument.

2nd Argument:

- Our conclusion based on word repetition.
- Not prepositional Pratyabigyame, not recognition of Preposition.
- Repetition of word heaven, therefore topic same.

Example:

- 1st Book – Ramayana – Volume 1
- 2nd Book – Volume 2
- We look at Similar characters in the Book, Rama, Sita, Bharata.. Not Particular case ending but repetition of name and conclude.
- Natu Pratyaya Pratyabigya, Parantu Prakruteya(Word) Pratyabigya.
- Beyond heaven = Brahman – In 12th and 13th Section in Chapter 3 – Chandogyo Upanishad.
**Word Analysis:**

a) Upadesha Bheda
b) Na
c) Iti
d) Chet
e) Na
f) Ubayasmin
g) Api
h) Avirodat.

- Purva Prakarana Upasyam – Object of meditation in Section 12th = Brahman.

**Purva Pakshi Anumanam:**

- Purva Prakarana Upasyam, Na Brahman Upadesha Bhedat (Words different).
- Divi – 12 – Divaha – 13 – Padas different.
- Not different in words but case endings different – Panchami – 5, saptami – 7.

**Prepositional Difference:**

i) Na – Not Brahman.

j) Iti Chet – If such Argument is given by Purva Pakshi, then Siddantin’s answer.

- Purva Prakruta Upasyam iti – Na Ubayasmin Na Avirodat.

**Siddantin:**

- Ubayasmin Api Avirodat, in both Usages – ideas same.

**12th Section:**

- Tavaan – Amrutam Divi, Rig Veda mantra and Purusha Suktam say.
Creation

1/4
- Things and beings
- Bhu and 14 Lokas
- Vishva Butani, Saguna Prapancha (Divi = Not in the heaven)
- Iha and Para Loka

3/4
- Beyond Heaven
- Divi = beyond Heaven
- Nirguna Brahman

Divi = Beyond only:
- 4th Sutra of 10th Jyotish Charama Adhikaranam over in 27th Sutra

Summary of Adhikaranam:

a) Unique Adhikaranam as reasons not mentioned.
b) Makes 2 Conclusions:
- 1st – 12th Section – Gayithri = Brahman.
  - 13th Section – Jyoti = Brahman, for both conclusion 3 reasons.

Given:
  b) Gayithri Brahma Chandabhidanat, Chandobidanat Netichet, Butadhi pada Vyapadesha Eva.

Conclusion:
- Gayithri = Brahman.
  c) Gayithri Abinnam Jyoti Brahman – Chandobhidanat...
  d) Take Brahman lingam from 12th Section and Apply reason in 13th Section.
Technical Format:

a) Vishaya:
- Jyoti in Chandogyo Upanishad: is Subject.

Then, higher than this heaven, above the world, higher than everything, in the highest world, higher than which nothing exists – the light that shines there is the same light that is in a human being. [3 – 13 – 7]

b) Samshaya:

Doubt - Jyoti

Achetana Jyoti
- Surya / Moon / Fire material Jyoti

Chetana Jyoti
- Brahman / Consciousness / Spiritual
- Tat Shubram, Jyotisham Jyotihi

People sit in Meditation and wait for Brahman lingam to Appear ring, yellow, flooding lights – Did Pradikabhinam of Ramana, Guru and went at 3.39 AM.
- Jyoti – Not karya Jyoti, Pradakshina Kuruvat Jyoti but karana Jyoti.
- It is I the consciousness which never comes or goes, ever present. Pratibodha Viditam Matam.

Samshaya:
- Jyoti – Chetana / Achetana Jyoti Va?

3) Purva Pakshi:
- Achetana Jyoti – Aditya.
- Prasidatvat – Promary – Well known meaning.
4) Siddantin:

- Saguna Brahman – Ishvara – Prakaranam, Sankhya does not believe in Ishvara.

Reasons:

- Charanabhidanat... 3 Reasons as in Sutra – 24, 25, 26 Jyoti = Brahman.

Incidental Conclusion:

- Gayithri in 12th Section is also Brahman.

5) Sangatihi:

- Adhikaranam is appropriate to be in Brahma Sutra – 1st Chapter – 1 Pada – Before 11th – After 9th Adhikarana
- Positional Justification.

Sutra 28th:

Prana is Brahman, that being so understood from a connected consideration (of the passage referring to Prana). [1 – 1 – 28]

- Sutra – 23 - 9th Adhikaranam, already called Prana Adhikarana.
- Adhikarana taken for Debate, Shastra Yoni / Jingyasa / Prana Adhikarana.

Sruti – Vishaya Vakyam:

- Kaushitaki Upanishad – Rig Veda Chapter – 3 – Verse 2 (Total 4Chapters - Large size mantras ).
Indra said: 'I am prāṇa, meditate on me as the conscious self (pragñātman), as life, as immortality. Life is prāṇa, prāṇa is life. Immortality is prāṇa, prāṇa is immortality. As long as prāṇa dwells in this body, so long surely there is life. By prāṇa he obtains immortality in the other world, by knowledge true conception. He who meditates on me as life and immortality, gains his full life in this world, and obtains in the Svarga world immortality and indestructibility.' (Pratardana said): 'Some maintain here, that the prāṇas become one, for (otherwise) no one could at the same time make known a name by speech, see a form with the eye, hear a sound with the car, think a thought with the mind. After having become one, the prāṇas perceive all these together, one by one. While speech speaks, all prāṇas speak after it. While the eye sees, all prāṇas see after it. While the car hears, all prāṇas hear after it. While the mind thinks, all prāṇas think after it. While the prāṇa breathes, all prāṇas breathe after it.'

'Thus it is indeed,' said Indra, 'but nevertheless there is a pre-eminence among the prāṇas.' [Chapter 3 – Verse 2]
Lecture 61

Sutra 28th – 11th Pratardhana Adhikaranam:

Pranasthathanugamam ।

Prana is Brahman, that being so understood from a connected consideration (of the passage referring to Prana). [ 1 – 1 – 28]

- 4 Sutras 1st Chapter – 1st Pada last Adhikarana.

Kaushitaki Upanishad – Rig-Veda:

sa hovacha prano.asmi praj~natma tam
mamayurama^itamityupasvayuh
pranah prano va ayuh prana uvachamr^ita.n
yavaddhyasmi'ncharire prano vasati tavadayuh pranena
hyevamushmi.nlloke.amr^itvatvamapnoti
praj~naya satyasa~nkalpa.n sa yo ma ayuram^itamityupaste
sarvamayurasmi.nlloka evapnotyamr^itvatvamakshit.n svarge loke
taddhaika ahurekabhuya.n vai prana gachchhantiti na hi kashchana
shaknu^atsakr^dvacha nama praj~napayitu.n chakshusha rupa.n
shr^otrena shabdham manasa dhyanamityekabhuya.n vai prana bhutva
ekaika.n sarvaneyaitani praj~napayanti vacha.n vadati.n sarve
prana anuvadanti chakshuh pashyatvarsve prana anupashyanti shrotra.n
shr^invatsarve prana anushr^invanti mano dhyayatsarve prana
anudhyayanti pranam prananta.n sarve prana
anupranantityevamuhaitaditi hendra uvachastityeva pranana.n
nihshreyasadanamiti || 2 ||
Indra said: 'I am prâna, meditate on me as the conscious self (pragñâtman), as life, as immortality. Life is prâna, prâna is life. Immortality is prâna, prâna is immortality. As long as prâna dwells in this body, so long surely there is life. By prâna he obtains immortality in the other world, by knowledge true conception. He who meditates on me as life and immortality, gains his full life in this world, and obtains in the Svarga world immortality and indestructibility.'

(Pratardana said): 'Some maintain here, that the prânas become one, for (otherwise) no one could at the same time make known a name by speech, see a form with the eye, hear a sound with the ear, think a thought with the mind. After having become one, the prânas perceive all these together, one by one. While speech speaks, all prânas speak after it. While the eye sees, all prânas see after it. While the ear hears, all prânas hear after it. While the mind thinks, all prânas think after it. While the prâna breathes, all prânas breathe after it.'

'Thus it is indeed,' said Indra, 'but nevertheless there is a pre-eminence among the prânas. [Chapter 3 – Verse 2]

Teacher:
- King of heavens – Adhipati of Balavan – Indra.

Disciple:
- King on earth – Pratardhana.
- Devata of Hand. Gave one Boon, Naciketas – Got 4 Boons from Yama.

King Asked:
- Whatever is best Purushartha for human being – 4 Give me that Boon.
- Dharma, Artha, Kama – Aparam Parichinnam.
- Already ours for getting - Getting Moksha Purushartha is claiming.
- Claiming Moksha Purusha is knowing it as a fact my Svarupam.

2nd Teaching in Upanishad:
- Teacher = Ajatashatru
- Disciple = Gargya
- Same as in Brihadaranyaka Upanishad
- 9th Adhikaranam – Prana Adhikaranam.
This Adhikaranam named after Sishya – Indra said – You should know me as Brahman.

Gita:
- Mr. Krishna Friend
- Sake ti Matra
- Vasudeva Putra

- Saguna Ishvara
- Avatara
- Mayasanitam Brahman
- Yoga, Yokta Puratana
- I Have taken Avatara to revive teaching
- I = Bhagawan Vishnu
- I Mam Vivastave Yogam Proktavan

- Nirguna Brahman Gita Chapter 18 – Verse 66
- Mam Ekam Sharanam Vraja
- Sajatiya Vijatiya Svagata Bheda Rahita
- Nishkalam, Turiyam Brahman
- Maya Tatamidam Sarvam, Jagrat Avyaktu Mastami..
- Nama Rupa Rahitam Brahman
- Behind Krishna Rupam

Gita:

सर्वेऽति मन्वा प्रसमं यहुर्न हे कृष्ण हे यादव हे सर्वेऽति 
अजानता महिमान्तः तवेऽदं 
मया प्रमादात्मणयेन वापि || ११-४१ ||

सर्वधर्मान्यपरियज्ञ मामेकं शरणं ब्रज 
अहं वा सर्वपापेभ्यो मोक्षयिष्यामि मा शुचः || १८-६६ ||

मया ततमिदं सर्वं जगद्व्यक्तमूर्तिना 
मत्स्थानं सर्वभूतानि न चाहं तेष्ववस्थित: || ९-४ ||

Whatever I have rashly said from carelessness or love, Addressing you as ‘O Krishna, O Yadava, O Friend,” And regarding you merely as a friend, unknowing of this greatness of yours [Chapter 11 – Verse 41]

Abandoning all dharma-s (of the body, mind, and intellect), take refuge in me alone; I will liberate three from all sins; grieve not. [Chapter 18 – Verse 66]

All this world (Universe) is pervaded by Me in My Unmanifest form (Aspect); All beings exist in Me, but I do not dwell in them. [Chapter 9 – Verse 4]
Visishta Advaitin:
- Narayana takes Avatara.

Indra: Uses

a) Aham – Ajaraha:
- Amrutaha Asmi – Immortal, eternal Brahman.

b) Pranaha Asmi:
- Pragyatma Asmi – Chetana Rupa, Chaitanya Rupaha Asmi.

Kaushitaki Upanishad:

sa hovacha prano.asmi praj~natma tam
mamayurama^itamityupasyayuh
pranah prano va ayuh prana uvachamr^ita.n
yavaddhyasmi'ncharire prano vasati tavadayuh pranena
hyevamushhi.nlloke.amr^itvatvamapnoti
praj~naya satyasa~nkalpa.n sa yo ma ayurm+r^itamityupaste
sarvamayurasmi.nlloka evapnotyamr^itvatvamakshiti.n sarge loke
taddhaika ahurekabhuya.n vai prana gachchantiti na hi kashchana
shaknyatsakr^idvacha nama praj~napayitu.n chakshusha rupa.n
shrotrena shabdam manasa dhyanamityekabhuya.n vai prana bhutva
ekaika.n sarvanyevaitani praj~napayanti vacha.n vadati.n sarve
prana anuvadanti chakshuh pashyatsarve prana anupashyanti shrotra.n
shr^invatsarve prana anushr^invanti mano dhyayatsarve prana
anudhyayanti pranam prananta.n sarve prana
anupranantityevamuhvaaitaditi hendra uvachastityeva pranana.n
nihshreyasadanamiti || 2 ||
Indra said: 'I am prâna, meditate on me as the conscious self (pragñâtman), as life, as immortality. Life is prâna, prâna is life. Immortality is prâna, prâna is immortality. As long as prâna dwells in this body, so long surely there is life. By prâna he obtains immortality in the other world, by knowledge true conception. He who meditates on me as life and immortality, gains his full life in this world, and obtains in the Svarga world immortality and indestructibility.'

(Pratardana said): 'Some maintain here, that the prânas become one, for (otherwise) no one could at the same time make known a name by speech, see a form with the eye, hear a sound with the ear, think a thought with the mind. After having become one, the prânas perceive all these together, one by one. While speech speaks, all prânas speak after it. While the eye sees, all prânas see after it. While the ear hears, all prânas hear after it. While the mind thinks, all prânas think after it. While the prâna breathes, all prânas breathe after it.'

'Thus it is indeed,' said Indra, 'but nevertheless there is a pre-eminence among the prânas.' [Chapter 3 – Verse 2]

- Indra told Pradhardhana. Aham Pranaha Asmi, Aham Pragyatma Asmi, Aham Chaitanya Rupaha Asmi.
- May you know me as immortal one, life of everyone I am.
- Prana – Life Principle iti Upasyam

**Is Prana**

| Indra | Jiva | Vayu Devata | Brahman |

- Prana = Brahman established here.

**General Analysis of 1st Sutra:**

- Main Sutra / Main Argument, other 3 Sutras clear doubts / Objections Pranaha = Brahman.

**Tattu Samanvayat**

But that (Brahman is to be known only from the Scriptures and not independently by any other means is established), because it is the main purpose (of all Vedantic texts). [1 – 1 – 4]

- Because of law of Consistency, harmony.
Gita: What is main teaching?

- Karma – Tasmat Yuddasva Bharata?
- Bakti, Upasana, Jnanam?
- Mimamsa Shatra – Shad Linga, Vichara – Samanvaya.
- Finding consistency, harmony – Done in 4th Sutra - Samanvaya Adhikaranam.
- Applying law of consistency, we know it is dealing with Brahman.
- What are Lingas to Prove Brahman – is Consistently discussed?

a) Hitatmatvam:

- Best Purushartha asked in Kaushitaki Upanishad:

\[
\text{pratardano ha vai daivodasirindrasya priyan dhamopajagama yuddhena paurushena cha tan hendra uvacha pratardana varan te dadaniti sa hovacha pratardanastvameva vrinishva ya n tvan manushaya hitatamam manyasa iti tan hendra uvacha na vai varam parasmai vrinite tvameva vrinishvetyavaro vaitarhi kila ma iti hovacha pratardanoatho khalvindrah satyadeva neyaya satyam hindrah sa hovacha nameva vijanihyetadvaham manushya hitatamam manye yanman. vijaniyan trishirshanah tvashramahanamavamayakhyatinah vishakhyebhav prayachcham bahvih sandha atikramya divi prahladatrainahamantairikshe paulomanprithivyan kalakshyanastasya me tatra na loma cha namiyate sa yo man vijaniyannasya kena cha karmanaloko miyate na mattrivadhena na pitrivaradhena na steyena na bhrunahataya nasya papan cha na chakrisho mukhannilan vettiti \| 1\|}

Pratardana, forsooth, the son of Divodâsa (king of Kâsî), came by means of fighting and strength to the beloved abode of Indra. Indra said to him 'Pratardana, let me give you a boon to choose.' And Pratardana answered: 'Do you yourself choose that boon for me which you deem most beneficial for a man.' Indra said to him: 'No one who chooses, chooses for another; choose thyself,' Then Pratardana replied: 'Then that boon to choose is no boon for me.' Then, however, Indra did not swerve from the truth, for Indra is truth. Indra said to him: 'Know me only; that is what I deem most beneficial for man, that he should know me. I slew the three-headed son of Tvâshtri; I delivered the Arunmukhas, the devotees, to the wolves (sâlâvrika); breaking many treaties, I killed the people of Prahlâda in heaven, the people of Puloma in the sky, the people of Kâlakaṅga on earth. And not one hair of me was harmed there. And he who knows me thus, by no deed of his is his life harmed, not by the murder of his mother, not by the murder of his father, not by theft, not by the killing of a Brahman. If he is going to commit a sin, the bloom does not depart from his face.' [Chapter 3 – Verse 1]

- Brahman Jnanam alone is best Purushartha, Prana Jnanam / Upasana has utility not Hita Tamam - Superlatively good.
- Vayu Devata Jnanam – Prana Jnanam, Indra, Jiva Jnanam not Hitatmanam.

b) Sarva Karma Nasha Phalam :
- Because of this Jnanam person is freed from all Karma Chapter 3 – Verse 1(Above) indicated.
- One who knows me is no more afflicted by Punya Papam.
- This is possible only by Brahman / Jnanam not Vayu / Prana Jnanam.

c) Amrutatvam, Anantatvam :
- Parana = Ajara, Ananda, Amrutam Svarupa.
- Punya Karma Doesn't improve / Increase with Brahman Jnanam, Papa Karma Doesn’t decrease with Brahman.
- Because it is infinity – Anantatvam, Eva – Poornaha - Belongs to only Brahman.
- Prana not Anantha – Don’t take Vachyartha.
- Take Lakshyartha – Pranasya Prana Brahma.
d) Pragyatvam:

- Chaitanya Rupavatvam possible only for Brahman.
- Regular Prana Achetana – Born of Samashti Rajo Guna of 5 elements, elements inert.
- Prana here is Chetana Prana – Not Bautika.
- Anugamet – Consistently refers to Brahman’s Nature alone.

Word Analysis: 3 words

- Prana Tata Anugamet.

a) Paksha – Prana: Kaustika Upanishad:

```
म होवाच प्राणोदिरिम प्रजातमा तं मामायुसमृतमित्युपार्वायुः
प्राण: प्राणो वा आयु: प्राण उच्चार्बृत्या पावद्धश्रिरिः न च जीविते
प्राणो वसति तावदात्: प्राणे इत्यहारुणामिन्तलोकमृतत्वमापनोति
प्रजायाः मत्यस्तैः कथं म यो म आयुरमृतत्वमापस्ते
सर्वायामासुरिंद्रलोके एवंत्योमात्मृतत्वास्मक्षितिः सर्वो तोऽसे
तदिक्स आदेश्क्षुर्यः वो प्राणा गच्छन्ति ति न हि कर्भन
श्रीनुयात्सक्त्राहः नाम प्रजापतिः चक्षुष्या रूपः
श्रीन्तेन श्रवं मनसा ध्यानामितयेक्षुर्यः वो प्राणा भूत्वा
एवंकैं मृयोत्योतात्ती ज्ञाप्विनित वाचं वदति सर्वे
प्राणा अनुववतिति चक्षु: पश्यतसः प्राणा अनुपश्यति श्रीन्तेन
श्रवं तस्ये प्राणा अनुकृप्तिति मनो ध्यायतसः प्राणा
अनुश्यायिति प्राण प्राणान्तः सर्वे प्राणा
अनुप्राणान्तितीतमुश्चितिदि हृदं उच्चारस्वति त्येव प्राणाः
लिङ्गेयसादान्तिमति || 2 ||
```

Indra said: 'I am prâna, meditate on me as the conscious self (pragñâtman), as life, as immortality. Life is prâna, prâna is life. Immortality is prâna, prâna is immortality. As long as prâna dwells in this body, so long surely there is life. By prâna he obtains immortality in the other world, by knowledge true conception. He who meditates on me as life and immortality, gains his full life in this world, and obtains in the Svarga world immortality and indestructibility.'

(Pratardana said): 'Some maintain here, that the prânas become one, for (otherwise) no one could at the same time make known a name by speech, see a form with the eye, hear a sound with the car, think a thought with the mind. After having become one, the prânas perceive all these together, one by one. While speech speaks, all prânas speak after it. While the eye sees, all prânas see after it. While the car hears, all prânas hear after it. While the mind thinks, all prânas think after it. While the prâna breathes, all prânas breathe after it.'

'Thus it is indeed,' said Indra, 'but nevertheless there is a pre-eminence among the prânas.' [Chapter 3 – Verse 2]

b) Sadhya:
   • That Prana is Brahman.

c) Hetu:
   • Tata - In Such manner, conclusion.
   • Anugamat – Samanvayat, Because of law of Consistency harmony.

Technically:
   • Upakramat Upasamsahara shad Lingaihi.
   • Tata Tatparya Anugamet, by law of consistency arrive at this conclusion.
   • Prana = Brahman – By law of consistency.

e) Purva Pakshi – Objection:
   • Samashti Prana Devata / Hiranyagarbha / Vayu Tatvam.
   • Individual Level = Prana Vayu glorified in Upanishads.

Om Shamno Mitrah Sham Varunah:

नमो ब्रह्माणे | नमस्ते वायो |
तवमेव प्रत्यक्षं ब्रह्मासि |
तवामेव प्रत्यक्षं ब्रह्म वदिष्याति |
| ज्ञातं वदिष्याति | सत्यं वदिष्याति |

Namo Brahma | Namaste Vaaya |
Tvam Iva Pratyakssam Brahmasi |
Tvaaam Iva Pratyakssam Brahama Vadissyami |
Rrtam Vadissyyami | Satyam Vadissyyami |
Salutations to Brahman, Salutations to Vayu (the Breath of Purusha), You Indeed are the Visible Brahman, I Proclaim, You Indeed are the Visible Brahman, I Speak about the Divine Truth, I Speak about the Absolute Truth, [ Mantra 2]

- Vayu is infinite, Pratyaksham, eternal.

**Brihadaranyaka Upanishad :**
- Taisha Anastamanam, No destruction.
- Surya Astamanam = Disappearance of Surya, Samashti Vayu = Eternal, does not end, therefore Prana = Vayu.

**b) Primary Meaning :**
- Prasiddatvat – Life Breath – Prana Vayu = Oxygen in Sanskrit.
- Vachyartha – Rudhi Artha – Primary Meaning more powerful.

**Shankara :**
- Prana Vayuhu Na Bavati.
- Primary Meaning can be given up if other statements support our conclusion.
- Given up primary meaning in Favour of secondary meaning.

**a) Hitatmatvam :**
- No use studying Oxygen.

**b) Not Sarva karma Nasha Phalam :**
- If Prana = Vayu not literal eternity of Vayu in Scriptures.
- In Comparison – Relative, only – Apekshikam, Swallowed by / Resolution ground.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>For</th>
<th>Cause is</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Bhumi</td>
<td>- Jalam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Jalam</td>
<td>- Agni</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Agni</td>
<td>- Vayu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Vayu</td>
<td>- Akasha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Space</td>
<td>- Brahman</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Akasha not eternal.
c) Vayu:
- Not Anandam Anantham, Ajaram etc.

d) Pranom Pragyatma:
- Here Prana = Chetana, Vayu = Achetanam.
- 1st Sutra – 28th Sutra over.

2nd Sutra of Adhikaranam – Sutra 29th:

न वक्तुरतमोपदेशादिति
चेद्यात्मसम्बन्धभूमा ह्यसमिन्।

Na vakturatejopadesaditi chet
adyatmasambandhabhuma hyasmin

If it be said that (Brahman is) not (denoted or referred in these passages on account of) the speaker’s instruction about himself, we reply not so, because there is abundance of reference to the Inner Self in this (chapter or Upanishad). [1 – 1 – 29]

General Analysis:

2nd Objection : Kaushitaki Upanishad:

Sa hovache prano.asmi praj~natma tam
mamayurama~itamityupasvayuh
pranah prano va ayuh prana uvacham~ita.n
yavaddhyasmi' ncharire prano vasati tavadayuh pranena
hyevamushmi.nlloke.am~itavamapnoti
praj~naya satyasa~nkalpa.n sa yo ma ayuram~itamityupaste
sarvamayurasm.nlloka evapnotyam~itavamakshiti.n svarge loke
taddhaika ahurekabhuya.n vai prana gachchanti ti na hi kashchana
shaknuyatsakr~idvacha nama praj~napayituu.n chakshusha rupa.n
shrotrena shabadam manasa dhyanamityekabhuya.n vai prana bhutva
ekaika.n sarvanyevaitani praj~napayanti vaca.n vadati.n sarve
prana anuvadanti chakshuh pashyatsarve prana anupashyanti shrotra.n
shr~invatsarve prana anushr~invanti mano dhayatsarve prana
anudhyayanti pranam prananta.n sarve prana
anuprannantyeyavamhuvaityaditi hendra uvachastityeva pranana.n
nihshreyasadanamiti || 2 ||
Indra said: 'I am prâna, meditate on me as the conscious self (pragñâtman), as life, as immortality. Life is prâna, prâna is life. Immortality is prâna, prâna is immortality. As long as prâna dwells in this body, so long surely there is life. By prâna he obtains immortality in the other world, by knowledge true conception. He who meditates on me as life and immortality, gains his full life in this world, and obtains in the Svarga world immortality and indestructibility.'

(Pratardana said): 'Some maintain here, that the prânas become one, for (otherwise) no one could at the same time make known a name by speech, see a form with the eye, hear a sound with the car, think a thought with the mind. After having become one, the prânas perceive all these together, one by one. While speech speaks, all prânas speak after it. While the eye sees, all prânas see after it. While the car hears, all prânas hear after it. While the mind thinks, all prânas think after it. While the prâna breathes, all prânas breathe after it.'

'Thus it is indeed,' said Indra, 'but nevertheless there is a pre-eminence among the prânas.' [Chapter 3 – Verse 2]

Siddantin – Vyasa's Answer:

- No Scope for Devata here, entire Chapter dealing with Adhyatma subject, individual not Adideivam.

3rd Chapter: Kaushitaki Upanishad:

- Contextual Argument – Predominant references in this Chapter is Adhyatmam.
Example:

- Space station has reached critical state
- Indian President is Critical
  - Ready for launch Good news
  - Bad News

- Prakarena Pramana important supporting clues - Refer to Adhyatmam Prakaranam.

Word Analysis:

**Purva Pakshi – Portion / View of Purva Pakshi:**
- 1) Na  2) Vaktuhu  3) Atmo Upadeshat  4) Iti  5) Chet

**Siddantin:**

**a) Pranaha - Na Brahma:**
- Prana Cannot be Brahman why?

**b) Vaktuhu Atmo Upadeshat:**
- Prana Revealed as Atma – Self of Speaker(Vaktuhu)
If it be said that (Brahman is) not (denoted or referred in these passages on account of) the speaker’s instruction about himself, we reply not so, because there is abundance of reference to the Inner Self in this (chapter or Upanishad). [1 – 1 – 29]

Kaushitaki Upanishad:

sa hovacha prano.asmi praj~natma tam
mamayurama~itamityupasvayuh
pranah prano va ayuh prana uvachamr^ita.n
yavaddhyasmi^ncharire prano vasati tavadayuh pranena
hyevamushmi.nlloke.amr^itavamapnoti
praj~naya satyasa~nkalpa.n sa yo ma ayuramar^itamityupaste
sarvamayurasmi.nlloka evapnotyamar^itavamakshiti.n svarge loke
taddhaika ahurekabhuya.n vai prana gachchanti na hi kashchana
shaknuyatsakr^idvacha nama praj~napayitu.n chakshusha rupa.n
shrotrena shabdam manasa dhyanamityekabhuya.n vai prana bhutva
ekai.n sarvanyevaitani praj~napayanti vacha.n vadati.n sarve
prana anuvadanti chakshu pashyatsarve prana anupashyanti shrotra.n
shr^invatsarve prana anushr^invanti mano dhayat sarve prana
anudhyayanti pranam prananya.n sarve prana
anupranantityevamuhaitaditi hendra uvachastityeva pranana.n
nihshreyasadanamiti || 2 ||
Indra said: 'I am prâna, meditate on me as the conscious self (pragñâtman), as life, as immortality. Life is prâna, prâna is life. Immortality is prâna, prâna is immortality. As long as prâna dwells in this body, so long surely there is life. By prâna he obtains immortality in the other world, by knowledge true conception. He who meditates on me as life and immortality, gains his full life in this world, and obtains in the Svarga world immortality and indestructibility.'

(Pratardana said): 'Some maintain here, that the prânas become one, for (otherwise) no one could at the same time make known a name by speech, see a form with the eye, hear a sound with the car, think a thought with the mind. After having become one, the prânas perceive all these together, one by one. While speech speaks, all prânas speak after it. While the eye sees, all prânas see after it. While the car hears, all prânas hear after it. While the mind thinks, all prânas think after it. While the prâna breathes, all prânas breathe after it.'

'Thus it is indeed,' said Indra, 'but nevertheless there is a pre-eminence among the prânas. [Chapter 3 – Verse 2]

Reason:

- Pranaha Tatta Anugamaat, Na Vaktuhu Atma Upadeshat Itichet, Adhyatma Sambanda Buma Hyasmin.

Reasons for consistency:

- Hitatmatvam
  - Best / Greatest goal of life
- Sarva Karma Nashatvam
- Amrutatvam Ajara, Anandaha
- Pragyatmam

- Refers not to perishable Prana but to Brahman is conclusion of 1st Sutra (Prana as Vayu is refuted)

2nd Sutra:

- Refutes other interpretation of Prana as Devata.
- Prana = Indra Devata alone as he is the speaker talking to Pratardhana, Me in apposition to Prana.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1st Place</th>
<th>2nd Place</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- You should know Prana</td>
<td>- You should Know me / Mam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Reflexive Pronoun</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Vaktuhu Atmo Upadeshat, 1st Person – Singular always speaker = Indra Devata.
General Analysis:

Siddantin:
- Accept argument of reflexive Pronoun – Mam Vijanahi.
- When we study entire chapter, no scope for Devata discussion.
- Predominate teaching – Adhyatma individual not Adideiva.

Example: a)

- Inflation – 2 Contextual Meanings
  - Football
  - Economy

b) Isavasya Upanishad:

\[ \text{Aneja-dekam manaso javiyo nainad-deva apnuvan-purva-marsa,} \]
\[ \text{tad-dhavato-’nyana-tyeti tisath tasmin-napo matarisva dadhati} \[4] \]

The Self is the motionless one, swifter than the mind. The devas (senses) could not overtake; It ran before them. Sitting, It goes faster than those who run after It. By It, Matarisva (the element Air) supports the activity of all living beings. [Verse 4]

- Deva
  - Sense Organ
    - In Upanishad it means sense organs can’t objectify Atma
  - Devata
    - Can never objectify Atma

- Similarly Kaushitaki Upanishad – 3rd Chapter deals only with sense organs / Prana / Travel after Death – Maranam, All Centred on Adhyatmam.
- Can’t give Adideiva Meaning.
a) Pranaha Na Brahma :
   - Prana refers to Indra Devata - Purva Pakshi.

b) Vaktuhu Atma Upadeshat :
   - Speaker - Indra - Self - Teaches reflexive pronoun - Not Sat Chit Ananda Atma.

c) Upadeshat :
   - Prana – Devata, reveals / Teaches / Presents as himself.

d) Samanvaya – Atmo Upadeshaaat :
   - Tritiya Vibakti – Atmatvena Upadeshat.
   - Reveals - As Himself.
     - In the manner of Himself
     - In the form of Himself.
   - Vaktuhu - 5th Case - Kartari Sashti, going with revelation.

e) Iti Chet :
   - Suppose such argument is given – By Purva Pakshi – Devatma vadi.

f) :

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Adhyatma</th>
<th>Sambanda</th>
<th>Buma Yasmin</th>
<th>Hi</th>
<th>Asmin</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Subject individual</td>
<td>Related</td>
<td>Predominance</td>
<td>Adhyatma</td>
<td>Because</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Because predominant discussion is related to the individual subject, not celestial Devata.
- Asmin – in this section - 3rd Chapter – Verse 2 Kaushitaki Upanishad
Indra said: 'I am prâna, meditate on me as the conscious self (pragñâtman), as life, as immortality. Life is prâna, prâna is life. Immortality is prâna, prâna is immortality. As long as prâna dwells in this body, so long surely there is life. By prâna he obtains immortality in the other world, by knowledge true conception. He who meditates on me as life and immortality, gains his full life in this world, and obtains in the Svarga world immortality and indestructibility.'

(Pratardana said): 'Some maintain here, that the prânâs become one, for (otherwise) no one could at the same time make known a name by speech, see a form with the eye, hear a sound with the car, think a thought with the mind. After having become one, the prânâs perceive all these together, one by one. While speech speaks, all prânâs speak after it. While the eye sees, all prânâs see after it. While the car hears, all prânâs hear after it. While the mind thinks, all prânâs think after it. While the prâna breathes, all prânas breathe after it.'

'Thus it is indeed,' said Indra, 'but nevertheless there is a pre-eminence among the prânâs. [Chapter 3 – Verse 2]
Similar to Gita

**An eternal portion of Myself, having become a living soul in the world of life, abiding in Prakrti, draws (to itself) the (Five) Senses, with mind as the sixth. [Chapter 15 – Verse 7]**

**When the lord obtains a body and when he leaves it, He takes these and goes (with them) as the wind takes the scents from their seats (The flowers). [Chapter 15 – Verse 8]**

- Sense organs pulled at time of death.
- Prana – Na Indra is Siddantin’s answer, because this is Adhyatmam Chapter.

**Sutra 30:**

**Sastradrishtya tupadeso vamadevavat**

The declaration (made by Indra about himself, viz., that he is and with Brahman) is possible through intuition as attested by Sruti, as in the case of Vamadeva. [1 – 1 – 30]

**General Analysis:**
- Devata Vadi Negated.
- Circumstantial factor does not support Indra.
- Purva Pakshi not satisfied, Devata Vadi Raises another question.

**Purva Pakshi:**
- I gave reason Prana is Indra you never answer that / Didn’t refute my reason.
- You gave another reason to establish your front.

**My Reason:**
- Usage of mama in Mam Vijanihi... 1st person singular.
• You give circumstantial evidence, I have direct evidence – Indra uses word I and Me.
• Mam Eva Vijanihi, 3rd Chapter - Mantra 1 Begins teaching.
• “Know Me” to get highest Purushartha Hitatnature Hitaya, Sastra Deva Upadesa – Vamadeva Cha

I – Me – 1st Person – Singular has 2 Meanings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vachyartha</th>
<th>Lakshyartha</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Primary, Direct, universal I</td>
<td>- Secondary, implied, Shastric Drishti Artha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Used in Vyavahara</td>
<td>- Refers to Panchakosha Vilakshana, Shariratraya Vilakshana, Satchitananda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Refers to Sthula / Sukshma / Karana</td>
<td>Svarupa Atma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shariram = Anatma</td>
<td>- Atma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- I am son of, I can’t understand, have Papam</td>
<td>- Consciousness in Body</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Not taught by Scriptures – Known by All</td>
<td>- Immortal, eternal, Najayate, Nahanyate, Natvegam...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Mortal</td>
<td>- You and I are not mortal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Laukika Drishti Artha</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Krishna – Frequently uses:

• Aham, Mama, Maya, Mattaha, Mayi.

• You are my friend...

### Gita:

मया तत्तमिदं सर्वं जगद्व्यक्तमूर्तिना।
मस्तत्रानि सर्वभूतानि न चाहं तेष्ववस्थितः॥ ९.४॥

All this world (universe) is pervaded by Me in My Unmanifest form (aspect) ; all beings exist in Me, but I do not dwell in them. [Chapter 9 – Verse 4]

• I Pervade whole world.. Not legs, hand, As person, he can’t pervade who creation.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mastani Sarva Butani</th>
<th>Na Cha Mastani Sarvani</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- All beings in Me</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Whole world supported by me</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Krishna consciousness people complain:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- You have destroyed our dear Krishna</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- I don’t support anyone</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Krishna Sthula Shariram</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Vaktuhu Atma Upadeshat said is Gita.

**Gita:**

This is the lower prakrti; different from it, know thou, O mighty-armed, My higher prakrti, the very life element, by which this world is upheld. [Chapter 7 – Verse 5]

- Life element by which world is upheld = Higher nature – Consciousness.
  
  = Para Prakrti

- Indra = used 1st person singular, Mam – Not Vachyartha here – Not Laukika Drishti, But Shastriya Lakshyarth Drishti Upadesaha.

**Example:**

a) | Gita - Uses |
--- | --- |
| Laukika | Shastriya Drishti Frequently |
b) Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

This (universe) was then undifferentiated. It differentiated only into name and form – it was called such and such, and was of such and such form. So to this day it is differentiated only into name and form – it is called such and such, and is of such and such form. This self has entered into these bodies up to the tip of the nails – as a razor may be put in its case, or as fire, which sustains the world, may be in its source. People do not see It, for (viewed in Its aspects) It is incomplete.

When It does the function of living, It is called the vital force; when It speaks, the organ of speech; when It sees, the eye; when It hears, the ear; and when It thinks, the mind. These are merely Its names according to functions. He who meditates upon each of this totality of aspects does not know, for It is incomplete, (being divided) from this totality by possessing a single characteristic. The Self alone is to be meditated upon, for all these are unified in It. Of all these, this Self alone should be realised, for one knows all these through It, just as one may get (an animal) through its foot – prints. He who knows It as such obtains fame and association (with his relatives). [I – IV – 7]

• Whoever knows I am Brahman, he can say, I am everything.

Sarvatma Bava:

• Vamadeva Rishi said in Garba – Got Brahma Jnanam and Declared.
• Aham Manuhu, Suryaha, Moon, stars.
• Aham Eva Idagum Sarvam.
Oh! Oh! Oh! I am the food, I am the food, I am the food. I am the eater of food, I am the eater of the food, I am the eater of food. I am the author of the Sloka, I am the author of Sloka, I am the author of Sloka I the am the first born (Hiranyagarbha) of the True (of the Eternal and the immortal) I am the centre of immortality, prior to the Gods. Whoever gives me, he surely does save thus. I am the food that eats him who eats food. I have conquered all, in this world. I am luminous like the sun. He who knows thus (also attains the aforesaid results). This is the Upanishad. [III – X – 6]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jnani</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- I am all</td>
<td>- But Shastriya Drishtya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Not Sharira Drishtya</td>
<td>- Maya Tatam Idam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Rishi not Annam</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**c) Aitareya Upanishad:**

**Tad-uktam-rsina -**

garbe nu sann-anvesam-avedam-aham devanam janimani visva I
satam ma pura ayasir-araksan-adhah syeno javasa niradiya-miti I
garba evaitac-chayano vamadeva evam-uvaca II 5 II
As to this, it has been said by a Rsi – Being yet in embryo, I knew well, all the births of these gods! A hundred iron citadels confined me down, And yet, like a hawk with swiftness, forth I flew! Thus spoke Vamadeva even while lying in the womb. [II–I – 5]

- In Garba, got knowledge.
- Tu = Shastra Drishtya, Upadesha Vama Deva Vatu.
- Teaching given from scriptural Angle not Loka Drishtya.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Shastra Drishtya</th>
<th>Laukika Drishtya</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lakshyartha</td>
<td>Vachyartha</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tu : Unlike Loka Drishtि :

d) Indriya Upadesa :
- Teaching from Shastriya Drishti. Kaushitaki Upanishad – 3£ Chapter.
- Vamadeva vatu... Like Vamadeva said from Shastra Drishti, Indra also said from Shastra Drishti.

Brihadaranyaka Upanishad :

brahma vā idam agra āsīt, tad ātmānām evēvet, aham brahmāsmiśti:
tasmāt tat sarvam abhavat, tad yo yo devānām pratyabubhyata,

sa eva tad abhavat, tathā rṣīṇām, tathā manusyāṇām. taddhātāt paśyan

rṣir vāma-devaḥ pratipede, aham manur abhavaṁ sûryas ceti,
tad idam api etarhi ya evaṁ veda, aham brahmāsmiśti sa idam sarvam bhavati;
tasya ha na devās ca nābhuṭyā īsate, ātmā hy eśāṁ sa bhavati.

atha yo anyāṁ devatām upāśe, anyo'sau anyo' ham asmīti, na sa veda;

yathā paśur, evam sa devānām; yathā ha vai bahavaḥ paśavo manusyām

bhuuḥjyuḥ, evam ekaikaḥ puruṣo devān bhunakti; ekasmin eva paśāv

ādiyamāne'priyam bhavati, kirñ u bahuṣu? tasmād eśāṁ tan na priyam

yad etan manusyā vidyuyā II 10 II
This (self) was indeed Brahman in the beginning. It knew only Itslf as, ‘I am Brahman.’ Therefore It became all. And whoever among the gods knew It also became That; and the same with sages and men. The sage Vamadeva, while realising this (self) as That, knew, ‘I was Manu, and the sun.’ And to this day whoever in like manner knows It as, ‘I am Brahman,’ becomes all this (universe). Even the gods cannot prevail against him, for he becomes their self. While he who worships another god thinking, ‘He is one, and I am another,’ does not know. He is like an animal to the gods. As many animals serve a man, so does each man serve the gods. Even if one animal is taken away, it causes anguish, what should one say of many animals? Therefore it is not like by them that men should know this. [I – IV – 10]

**Mahavakya:**
- Aham Brahma Asmi, Body – Not Brahman.

**Another ‘Question’ by Devata Vadi:**

**Indra Says:**
- You know me - I have killed Asura Tvashtra 3 headed Moister.

**Run Mukha:**
- Talks about Spirituality all the time.

**Arun Mukha:**
- No Vak Tapas Non Vedantic Sanyasi.
- Words should be readable / Writeable / Publishable.

**Gita:**

For the protection of the good, for the destruction of the Wicked and for the establishment of Righteousness, I am born in every age. [Chapter 4 – Verse 8]

- From Devata Drishti – Killed Asura not Brahman Drishti – Akarta, Abokta, Aprana, Amanaha, Achakshu, Asrotriyam...
- Therefore don’t accept Prana = Brahman.
Sutra 30:

The declaration (made by Indra about himself, viz., that he is and with Brahman) is possible through intuition as attested by Sruti, as in the case of Vamadeva. [1 – 1 – 30]

- Pratardhana – Adhikaranam.

Kaushitaki Upanishad: 4 Opinions negated
Indra said: 'I am prâna, meditate on me as the conscious self (pragñâtman), as life, as immortality. Life is prâna, prâna is life. Immortality is prâna, prâna is immortality. As long as prâna dwells in this body, so long surely there is life. By prâna he obtains immortality in the other world, by knowledge true conception. He who meditates on me as life and immortality, gains his full life in this world, and obtains in the Svarga world immortality and indestructibility.'

(Pratardana said): 'Some maintain here, that the prânas become one, for (otherwise) no one could at the same time make known a name by speech, see a form with the eye, hear a sound with the ear, think a thought with the mind. After having become one, the prânas perceive all these together, one by one. While speech speaks, all prânas speak after it. While the eye sees, all prânas see after it. While the ear hears, all prânas hear after it. While the mind thinks, all prânas think after it. While the prâna breathes, all prânas breathe after it.'

'Thus it is indeed,' said Indra, 'but nevertheless there is a pre-eminence among the prânas.' [Chapter 3 – Verse 2]
Aham

Laukika Drishtya
- Common meaning
- Vachyartha
- Deviko Putra born / killed by hunter / Went to Svarga

Gita : Chapter 9 – Verse 21
- Tetam Buktva Svarga Lokam Vishalam
- Indra as Indra Mortal

Shastra Drishtya
- Indicative meaning
- Lakshyartha
- Jagat Adharam
- Brahman Svarupam

Gita : a) Chapter 9 – Verse 4 :
- Maya Tatamidam Sarvam
b) Aham Sarvasya Prabavaha

Rule :
- When Vachyartha does not work, use Shastric Drishti
- Pranosmi Pragyasmi, Aham Brahman Asmi.
- Mam Amrutam Ye Hi Meditate – I am immortal one
- By knowing me you will attain liberation

Reasons :
- Hitatmatvam Upadesa
- Sarva papa Nasha, Vasudeva Vatu

Brihadaranyaka Upanishad :
- Aham Suryaha, Manuhu, idagam Sarvam I am everything.

Gita :

They, having enjoyed the Vast heaven-world, when their merits are exhausted, enter the world-of-the-mortals; thus abiding by the injunctions of the three Veda-s, desiring (Objects of ) Desires, they attain to the state of “Going-and-returning” (Samsara). [Chapter 9 – Verse 21]
Gita:

मया तत्सत्तिदं सर्वं जगद्व्यक्तमूर्तिना।
मत्स्थानि सर्वभूतानि न चाहं तेषवस्थित: || ९.४ ||

अहं सर्वस्य प्रभो मतः सर्वं प्रवत्तिते।
इति मबा भजन्ते मा बुधा भावसमान्यता: || १०-८ ||

All this world (universe) is pervaded by Me in My Unmanifest form (aspect); all beings exist in Me, but I do not dwell in them. [Chapter 9 – Verse 4]

I am the source of all; from Me everything evolves; understanding thus, the wise, endowed with ‘loving consciousness’, worship me. [Chapter 10 – Verse 8]

Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

taddhedaṁ tarhy avyākṛtam āsit, tan nāma-rūpāhyām
eva vyākriyata, asau nāma, ayam idam rūpa iti, tad idam
apy etarhi nāma-rūpāhyām eva vyākriyate, asau nāma,
ayam idam rūpa iti. sa esa iha praviṣṭa ānakhāgrebhyaḥ
yathā, kṣurāḥ kṣuradḥāne' vahitaḥ syāt, viśvam-bharo vā
viśvam-bhara-kulāye, tāṁ na paśyanti. a-kṛtsno hi saḥ,
prāṇann eva prāṇo nāma bhavati, vadan vāk, paśyanti caksuḥ,
śrīvan śrotam, manvāno manaḥ, tāṁ asaytāṁ karma-nāmāṁ eva.
sa yo'.ta ekaikam upāste, na sa veda, a-kṛtsno hy eṣo'.ta ekaikena bhavati,
ātmyevopāśita, atra hi ete sarva ekam bhavanti. tad etat padanīyam
asya sarvasya yad ayam ātmā, anena hy etat sarvarām veda, yathā ha vai
padenānuvindet. evam kīrtim ślokaṁ vindate ya evam veda || ७ ||
This (universe) was then undifferentiated. It differentiated only into name and form – it was called such and such, and was of such and such form. So to this day it is differentiated only into name and form – it is called such and such, and is of such and such form. This self has entered into these bodies up to the tip of the nails – as a razor may be put in its case, or as fire, which sustains the world, may be in it source. People do not see It, for (viewed in Its aspects) It is incomplete. When It does the function of living, It is called the vital force; when It speaks, the organ of speech; when It sees, the eye; when It hears, the ear; and when It thinks, the mind. These are merely Its names according to functions. He who meditates upon each of this totality of aspects does not know, for It is incomplete, (being divided) from this totality by possessing a single characteristic. The Self alone is to be meditated upon, for all these are unified in It. Of all these, this Self alone should be realised, for one knows all these through It, just as one may get (an animal) through its foot – prints. He who knows It as such obtains fame and association (with his relatives). [I – IV – 7]

Purva Pakshi : Question :
• Indra uses Aham as Indra, Devata here in Kaushitaki Upanishad killed demon with 3 heads, Brahman = Apani Pada.

Shankara :
• Read after exploits
• Tasya Me... Extreme Karmas do not, affect Atma Svarupam.

Gita :

The fourfold-caste has been created by me according to the differentiation of Guna and Karma; though I am the author thereof, know me as non-doer and immutable. [Chapter 4 – Verse 13 ]

• Name Karmani Limpanti. Iti Manaso Bhi Janeti.
• Karmas introduced not to focus on Karta but to focus on Asanga, Atma Svarupa.

Gita :

I do nothing at all,” Thus would the Harmonised knower of truth think-seeing, hearing, touching, smelling, eating, going, sleeping, breathing.. [ Chapter 5 – Verse 8 ]
But he who knows the truth, O Mighty armed, about the divisions of the qualities and (their) functions, and he who knows that Gunas as senses move amidst Gunas as objects, is not attached. [ Chapter 3 – Verse 28 ]

Speaking, letting go, sizing, opening and closing the eyes—convinced that the senses move among the sense objects. [Chapter 5 – Verse 9]

- Aham Indra = Shastriya Drishti Upadesha Papam does not touch even the hair, skin, Sthula, Sukshma Shariram.
- Hence will not touch Atma, Vamadeva uses Aham in terms of Lakshyartha.

Sutra 31:

If it be said that (Brahman is) not (meant) on account of characteristic marks of the individual soul and the chief vital air (being mentioned); we say no, because (such an interpretation) would enjoin threefold meditation (Upasana), because Prana has been accepted (elsewhere in the Sruti in the sense of Brahman) and because here also (words denoting Brahman) are mentioned with reference to Prana. [ 1 – 1 – 31 ]

Purva Pakshi:

Siddantin:

- 2 Contentions negated.

Jivamukhyapranaḥlingaṃ neti chet na
upasatraividhyat asiritatvadiha tadyogat
Pravna - Confections

(1) Vayu
Sutra 28

(2) Devata
Sutra 29 + 30

(3) Jeeva
Sutra 31

(4) Mukhya Prana
Pancha Prana

Purva Pakshi:
- We have clues to take Prana = Jeeva.
- Jeeva Lingam - References / Clues / Indicators are there.

Prana – 2 Meanings
- Indriyas
  - Sense organs

Mundak Upanishad:
- Sapta Prana Prabavanti
- Lakshyartha

Mundak Upanishad:
\[
\text{Sapta pranah prabhavanti tasmat saptarcisah samidhah sapta homah}\\
\text{sapta ime loka yesu caranti prana guhasaya nihitah sapta sapta}\\
\text{II 8 II}
\]

From him are born seven Prana-s, the seven flames, seven-fold fuel, the seven-fold oblations, as also the seven worlds where the Prana-s move in the cave of living creatures; seven and seven. [2 – 1 – 8]  

Kaushitaki Upanishad: Chapter 3 – 8th Mantra
- Not Vachyartha.
Kaushitaki Upanishad:

Let no man try to find out what speech is, let him know the speaker. Let no man try to find out what odour is, let him know who smells. Let no man try to find out what form is, let him know the seer. Let no man try to find out what sound is, let him know the hearer. Let no man try to find out the tastes of food, let him know the knower of tastes. Let no man try to find out what action is, let him know the agent. Let no man try to find out what pleasure and pain are, let him know the knower of pleasure and pain. Let no man try to find out what happiness, joy, and offspring are, let him know the knower of happiness, joy, and offspring. Let no man try to find out what movement is, let him know the mover. Let no man try to find out what mind is, let him know the thinker. These ten objects (what is spoken, smelled, seen, &c.) have reference to prâgñā (self-consciousness), the ten subjects (speech, the senses, mind) have reference to objects. If there were no objects, there would be no subjects; and if there were no subjects, there would be no objects. For on either side alone nothing could be achieved. But that (the self of prâgñā, consciousness, and prâna, life) is not many, (but one.) For as in a car the circumference of a wheel is placed on the spokes, and the spokes on the nave, thus are these objects (circumference) placed on the subjects (spokes), and the subjects on the prâna. And that prâna (breath, the living and breathing power) indeed is the self of prâgñā (the self-conscious self), blessed, imperishable, immortal. He does not increase by a good action, nor decrease by a bad action. For he (the self of prâna and prâgñā) makes him, whom he wishes to lead up from these worlds, do a good deed; and the same makes him, whom he wishes to lead down from these worlds, do a bad deed. And he is the guardian of the world, he is the king of the world, he is the lord of the universe,—and he is my (Indra's) self, thus let it be known, yea, thus let it be known! [Chapter 3 – Verse 8]
Vaktaram Vigyat:

Indra:
- Don’t concentrate on organs – “Prana” – Vak Indriyam.
- All instruments Karanam – Not real You.
- Know one who is behind or using the Karanam.
- Vaktararam = Speaker, Hearer, Taster.
- Kartaram Vidyaat, not Karanam Vidyaat.
- Know Karta = Jeeva – Alone, Prana refers to Jeeva alone in 1st Chapter, Not in 8th Mantra.

Kaushitaki Upanishad:

Sa hovacha prano.asmi praj~natma tam
mamayurama^ityupasvayah
pranah prano va ayuh prana uvachamar^ita.n
yavaddhyasmi ncharire prano vasati tavadayuh pranena
hyevamushmi.nlke.amr^itavamapnoti
praj~naya satyasa^nkalpa.n sa yo ma ayuram^ityupaste
sarvamayurasmi.nlloka evapnotyamar^itavamakshiti.n svarge loke
taddhaika ahurekabhuya.n vai prana gachchantiti na hi kashchana
shaknuyatsakr^idvacha nama praj~napayitu.n chakshusha rupa.n
shrotrena shabdam manasa dhyanamityekabhuya.n vai prana bhutva
ekaika.n sarvanyevaitani praj~napayanti vacha.n vadati.n serve
prana anuvadanti chakshuh pashyatsarve prana anupashyanti shrotra.n
shr^invatsarve prana anushr^invanti mano dhyayatsarve prana
anudhyayanti pranam prananta.n serve prana
anuprana/ntityevamuhaitaditi hendra uvachastityeva pranana.n
nihshreyasadanamiti || 2 ||
Indra said: 'I am prâna, meditate on me as the conscious self (pragñâtman), as life, as immortality. Life is prâna, prâna is life. Immortality is prâna, prâna is immortality. As long as prâna dwells in this body, so long surely there is life. By prâna he obtains immortality in the other world, by knowledge true conception. He who meditates on me as life and immortality, gains his full life in this world, and obtains in the Svarga world immortality and indestructibility.'

(Pratardana said): 'Some maintain here, that the prânas become one, for (otherwise) no one could at the same time make known a name by speech, see a form with the eye, hear a sound with the car, think a thought with the mind. After having become one, the prânas perceive all these together, one by one. While speech speaks, all prânas speak after it. While the eye sees, all prânas see after it. While the car hears, all prânas hear after it. While the mind thinks, all prânas think after it. While the prâna breathes, all prânas breathe after it.'

'Thus it is indeed,' said Indra, 'but nevertheless there is a pre-eminence among the prânas.' [Chapter 3 – Verse 2]

- Prana = Explained in all mantras, 8th mantra – Focus on Vakta – Jiva – Speaker.
- Hence with Jiva lingam – Take Prana = Jeeva.

4th Reason:
- Mukya Prana = Life Breath = Brahman lingam – Clue, Reference.

3rd Chapter : 2 + 3rd Mantra:
- Prana Va Ayuhu... Prana = Life of Person... 2nd Mantra.
- Pranaha Idam Sharoram Ulpayati – 3rd Mantra
- Prana Sustains, holds body together supports body.
- Weak plant supported by Stick.
- Stick = Prana, Body = Plant
- When Prana goes – Body disintegrates, Prana holds and supports body together, Pancha Vrittika Prana.

At Death:
- Don’t say Indriyam, Mind, intellect has gone, Prana has gone.
- Therefore Prana – Not Brahman.
1st Chapter – 11th Adhikaranam – 1st Pada - Sutra 31:

If it be said that (Brahman is) not (meant) on account of characteristic marks of the individual soul and the chief vital air (being mentioned); we say no, because (such an interpretation) would enjoin threefold meditation (Upasana), because Prana has been accepted (elsewhere in the Sruti in the sense of Brahman) and because here also (words denoting Brahman) are mentioned with reference to Prana. [1–1–31]

Siddantin: 3 Reasons:

• Mimamsa – 1st Chapter: 1 theme
• Vedanta – 1st Chapter: 3 Themes
• Vakya Bheda Dhosa – 3 Topics can’t be central Theme.
• Tatparyam – One – Others – Artha Vada supporting portion.
• Thinking head is one - if 2… One will say – Go to class, another Gym...

3rd Chapter: Topics:

Lingams:

• Jiva
• Brahman
• Mukhya Prana
• Devata.
• Upasat Trividyat Dosha... in one Prakaranam 3 Topics.
• Reduce all 3 to 1 and make others subservient to main – Mukhya one.
Pratardana:

- Wanted highest goal of life – Moksha... Not attainable by knowing Vayu, Jiva, Mukhya Prana.
- Therefore Brahman alone is topic.
- Ajara, Amara, Anatham – Immortal, infinite.
- Vaktaram - Interpret as Brahman.
- Vak = Brahman, Idam Shariram.... Prana Supports Body. Therefore Prana = Brahman.

Keno Upanishad:

Srotasya Srotam manaso mano yad vaco ha vacam sa u pranasya pranah
caksusas - caksur - atimucya dhiraḥ pretya-smalokad-amarta bhavanti

Preceptor: It is the Ear of the Ear, the Mind of the Mind, the Tongue of the Tongue (Speech of the Speech) and also the Life of the Life and the Eye of the Eye. Having abandoned the sense of Self or I-ness in these and rising above sense-life, the wise become Immortal. [Chapter 1 – Verse 2]

- Vak Principle Behind Vak = Atma.
- 1st Vak – Vak Indriyam, 2nd Vak – Atma Chaitanyam.
- Real Speaker = Covetousness alone, Prana is Prana because of Chaitanyam Principle.

Ordinary Prana | All Living beings
--- | ---
Jadam | Because of Local Prana

Because of Consciousness, Prana is able to enliven Body.

Katho Upanishad:

Na pranena na apanena, martyo jivati kascana,
Itarena tu jivanti, yasminn etav upasritau II 5 II
Not by Prana, not by Apana does any mortal live; but it is by some other, on which these two depend, that men live. [II – II – 5]

- No human survives because of Prana.
- Prana Jadam in Nature does not enliven person.
- Behind Prana There is Chaitanyam, which is Pranasya Pranaha.

**What is Glory of Prana?**

- Prana Borrows sentiency, Chaitanyam from Atma, having borrowed Chaitanyam (100), it lends 10 to Manaha, 10 to Indriyas to function... Sthula and Sukshma Shariram.
- Real glory belongs to Atma, not Prana.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Atma</th>
<th>Prana</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Vaktuhu</td>
<td>- Vakta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Pranasya</td>
<td>- Prana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Drishter</td>
<td>- Drishta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Sruter</td>
<td>- Srota</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Mater</td>
<td>- Manta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Vignyate</td>
<td>- Vignyata</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Idam Shariram Parigrihyate, real supporter not Prana but Brahman.
- Ashritatvat – Interpretation in Shastra.
- Don’t take literal meaning but indicative meaning.
- Tatu Tvam Asi, Jiva is Brahman only.
- Jiva Lingam = Brahman Lingam  
- Prana Lingam = Brahman Lingam  

**Where context Warrant**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bring water</th>
<th>Prana = Brahman</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Laukika Drishti</td>
<td>Shastriya Drishti</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Word Meaning:

a) Purva Pakshi:

- Pranaha – Na Brahma.
- Jeeva Mukhya Prana Lingaat, Pranaha Na Brahma.
- Jiva Lingaat - Kaushitaki Upanishad:

```
न वाचं विज्ञासीत वक्तारं विद्यात्र गन्धे विज्ञासीत
प्रातारं विद्यां रूपं विज्ञासीतं रूपविदं विद्यात्रं
शब्दं विज्ञासीतं श्रोतारं विद्यान्त्वारं विज्ञासीतं
विज्ञासीतात्वायं विज्ञासीतं कर्मं विज्ञासीतं
कर्तारं विद्यात्रं सुखदं से विज्ञासीतं
सुखदं ख्यायित्वातारं
विद्यात्रानन्दं रति प्रजाति विज्ञासीतानन्दस्य रते:
प्रजातेर्विज्ञातारं विद्यान्त्रित्यां विज्ञासीतेतारं
विद्यात्रं
मनो विज्ञासीतं मन्तारं विद्यात्रा वा एता दशोव
भूतमात्रा
अधिन्गं दशं प्रज्ञामात्रा अधिभूतं यद्वृः भूतमात्रा न
स्थुरं प्रज्ञामात्रा: स्थुर्भेद्वा प्रज्ञामात्रा न स्थुरं
भूतमात्रा: स्थुः ॥ ८ ॥
```

```
na vAchaM vijijnAsI ta vaktAraM vidyaAnna gandhaM
vijijnAsI ta
ghrAtAraM vidyaAnna rUpaM vijijnAsI ta rUpavidA M vidyaAnna
shabdaM vijijnAsI ta shrota rAraM vidyaAnnAnnara saM
vijijnAsI tAnnarasavi nAtAraM vidyaAnna karma vijijnAsI ta
kartAraM vidyaAnna sukhaduHkhe vijijnAsI ta
sukhaduhkhayorvijAt A raM
vidyaAnnAnandaM ratIM prajAtIM vijijnAsI tAnandasya rateH
prajAt evijAtA raM vidyaAnnetyAM vijijnAsI taitA raM
vidyaAnna
mano vijijnAsI ta mantAraM vidyaAttA vA etA dashaiva
bhUtaM Atra
adhiprajnaM dasha prajnA M AtraM adhibhu taM yaddhi
bhUtaM A tra na
syurna prajnA M A traH syuryadvA prajnA M A tra na syurna
bhUtaM A traH
syuH ॥ ८ ॥
```
Let no man try to find out what speech is, let him know the speaker. Let no man try to find out what odour is, let him know him who smells. Let no man try to find out what form is, let him know the seer. Let no man try to find out what sound is, let him know the hearer. Let no man try to find out the tastes of food, let him know the knower of tastes. Let no man try to find out what action is, let him know the agent. Let no man try to find out what movement is, let him know the mover. Let no man try to find out what pleasure and pain are, let him know the knower of pleasure and pain. Let no man try to find out what happiness, joy, and offspring are, let him know the knower of happiness, joy, and offspring. Let no man try to find out what sound is, let him know the seer. Let no man try to find out what sight is, let him know the seer. Let no man try to find out what form is, let him know the seer. Let no man try to find out what sound is, let him know the seer.

These ten objects (what is spoken, smelled, seen, &c.) have reference to praṇāṇa (self-consciousness), the ten subjects (speech, the senses, mind) have reference to objects. If there were no objects, there would be no subjects; and if there were no subjects, there would be no objects. For on either side alone nothing could be achieved. But that (the self of praṇāṇa, consciousness, and prâna, life) is not many, (but one.) For as in a car the circumference of a wheel is placed on the spokes, and the spokes on the nave, thus are these objects (circumference) placed on the subjects (spokes), and the subjects on the prâna. And that prâna (breath, the living and breathing power) indeed is the self of praṇāṇa (the self-conscious self), blessed, imperishable, immortal. He does not increase by a good action, nor decrease by a bad action. For he (the self of prâna and praṇāṇa) makes him, whom he wishes to lead up from these worlds, do a good deed; and the same makes him, whom he wishes to lead down from these worlds, do a bad deed. And he is the guardian of the world, he is the king of the world, he is the lord of the universe,--and he is my (Indra's) self, thus let it be known, yea, thus let it be known! [Chapter 3 – Verse 8]

स होवचा प्राणोऽधिरिम प्रज्ञातमा तं मामयुर्मून्तिमित्युपासवयायः प्राण: प्राणोऽ वा आयु: प्राण: उवाचामृत्य वायुदेश्यरिम नण्डीरे प्राणो वस्तितावतायुः प्राणेण होमामुणितोकसुमृतमापन्तित प्राणायाः मत्युदक्ष्यलं स यो म आयुरमून्तिमित्युपासवयायः सर्वमामुणितोकसुप्राणोत्मृतमापन्तित रङो तोके तदाक्रेष्टबूः वै प्राण: महत्ततित्व इह कक्ष्य श्रवन्यात्स्तक्षुद्वाचा नाम प्रज्ञाप्रितः क्रमपरिक्त रूपाः श्रीराश्म श्रवं मनसा ध्यानित्येत्यक्षुद्वाः वै प्राण: भूतत्वा एकाक्षरप्रायायति प्रज्ञाप्रितं वचन बदनी सर्व प्राणा अनुवादनित्व चक्षुः पयायत्वें प्राणा अनुवादानि श्रीराश्म श्र्वेर्तिमें प्राणा अनुवादानि मनो ध्यात्मसः प्राणा अनुव्यायित च प्राणान्तः सर्व प्राणा अनुवादानित्व येन उवाचास्तित्वेः प्राणाः निःश्रेयसादानितिः ॥ ॥

sa hovacha praṇāṇaē prajñatamā tām māmayurāṁ ā八十ityupasvayuh
mahanah prāna va ayuh prāna uvachāmrāṁ ita.n
yavaddhyāsīṁ ncharire prāna vasati tavadayuh pranena
hyevamushini.nlkoe.amrāṁ itatvamapnoti
prajñānaya satyasaṁ nkalpa.n sa yo ma ayurāṁ ā八十ityupaste
sarvamayurāsīṁ nlkoe evapnotyamāṁ itatvamakshī.īn sverge loke
taddhaika ahurekabhuya.n vai prana gachchantii na hi kashchana
shakunyatsakrāndvāca nama praṇāṇitāḥ nāma praṇāṇitāḥ nāma prakṛtaḥ.
shrōtrena shabdān manasa dhyanamātyekebhuya.n vai prana bhutva
ekākā.ī sarvanvēvānti prajñāṇapayant vach.n vadvati.n sarve
prana anuvadanti chakshuḥ pashyatsarve prana anupashyanti shrotre.n
shrō invatsarve prana anuṣhrō invanti mano dhyaṇyatsarve prana
anudityayanti pramān pranānta.n sarve prana
anuprānantaityayavahaitaditi hendha uvachastityeva pranana.n
nihshreyasadānimiti || 2 ||
Indra said: 'I am prâna, meditate on me as the conscious self (pragñâtman), as life, as immortality. Life is prâna, prâna is life. Immortality is prâna, prâna is immortality. As long as prâna dwells in this body, so long surely there is life. By prâna he obtains immortality in the other world, by knowledge true conception. He who meditates on me as life and immortality, gains his full life in this world, and obtains in the Svarga world immortality and indestructibility.'

(Pratardana said): 'Some maintain here, that the prânas become one, for (otherwise) no one could at the same time make known a name by speech, see a form with the eye, hear a sound with the ear, think a thought with the mind. After having become one, the prânas perceive all these together, one by one. While speech speaks, all prânas speak after it. While the eye sees, all prânas see after it. While the ear hears, all prânas hear after it. While the mind thinks, all prânas think after it. While the prâna breathes, all prânas breathe after it.'

'Thus it is indeed,' said Indra, 'but nevertheless there is a pre-eminence among the prânas. [Chapter 3 – Verse 2]

If this is Doubt of Purva Pakshi:

- Answer = Upasaiat Trividyat
  - No Central theme – 3 Themes will be there in one Prakaranam.
- Defect of 3 Central Themes in one topic.

Siddantin:

- Brahman = Prana = Mukhya Lingam.
- 2nd Purva Pakshi : Jiva 3rd Purva Pakshi : Mukhya Prana
- 3 Themes defective = Vakya Bheda Dosha interpret Jiva, Mukhya Prana as Brahman Lingam to Avoid this Defect.
- Vakta = Brahman = Ultimate speaker, Behind Jiva Speaker there is Brahman.
- Supporter = Prana – Ultimate Supporter = Brahman.
- Therefore Mukhya Prana / Vakta = Brahman.

Any Precedent?

Vyasa:

- Ashritatvat – Such interpretations resorted to in Shastra.
Keno Upanishad:

Preceptor: It is the Ear of the Ear, the Mind of the Mind, the Tongue of the Tongue (Speech of the Speech) and also the Life of the Life and the Eye of the Eye. Having abandoned the sense of Self or I-ness in these and rising above sense-life, the wise become Immortal. [Chapter 1 – Verse 2]

Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

As a spider moves along the thread (it produces), and as from a fire tiny sparks fly in all directions, so from this Self emanate all organs, all worlds, all gods and all beings. Its secret name (Upanisad) is 'the Truth of truth.' The vital force is truth, and It is the truth of that. [2 – 1 – 20]
Uṣasta, the son of Cakra, said, ‘You have indicated it as one may say that a cow is such and such, or a horse is such and such. Explain to me the Brahman that is immediate and direct—the self that is within all.’ ‘This is your self that is within all.’ ‘Which is within all, Yājñavalkya?’ ‘You cannot see that which is the witness of vision; you cannot hear that which is the hearer of hearing; you cannot think that which is the thinker of thought; you cannot know that which is the knower of knowledge. This is your self that is within all; everything else but this is perishable.’ Thereupon Uṣasta, the son of Cakra, kept silent. [3 – 4 – 2]

- 9th Adhikaranam – Prana Adhikaranam Prana = Brahman.

**Kaushitaki Upanishad**: Tat Yogat

- Brahman lingam being Prominent, should overcome Jiva lingam and Mukhya Prana Lingam.
- When different Lingams, powerful Lingam overpowers weaker Lingams.

**Conclusion**:

- Prana = Brahman. Iticeht Na – Your objection is not correct.
- Upasaat Trividyat... Ashritatvam..
- 31st Sutra Over.
- 3 / 4 Contentions Negated, Vayu, Devata, Jiva, Mukhya Prana – Negated.

**Conclusion**: Prana = Brahman

**Summary of Adhikaranam**:

a) Vishaya:

- Prana in Kaushitaki Upanishad Chapter 3 – Verse 2
Indra said: 'I am prâna, meditate on me as the conscious self (prâgnâtman), as life, as immortality. Life is prâna, prâna is life. Immortality is prâna, prâna is immortality. As long as prâna dwells in this body, so long surely there is life. By prâna he obtains immortality in the other world, by knowledge true conception. He who meditates on me as life and immortality, gains his full life in this world, and obtains in the Svarga world immortality and indestructibility.'

(Pratardana said): 'Some maintain here, that the prânas become one, for (otherwise) no one could at the same time make known a name by speech, see a form with the eye, hear a sound with the car, think a thought with the mind. After having become one, the prânas perceive all these together, one by one. While speech speaks, all prânas speak after it. While the eye sees, all prânas see after it. While the car hears, all prânas hear after it. While the mind thinks, all prânas think after it. While the prâna breathes, all prânas breathe after it.'

'Thus it is indeed,' said Indra, 'but nevertheless there is a pre-eminence among the prânas . [Chapter 3 – Verse 2]

b) Samshaya :

- Prana = Brahman or Abrahman – Jiva, Devata, Mukhya Prana.

Why Samshaya - ?

- Because different clues indicating many things.
c) 4 Purva Pakshi:

- Vayu – Samashti Prana – Laukika Meaning.
- Devata – Indra using “Mama” Know me
- Jiva – Vaktaram Vidyat
- Mukhya Prana – Shastram Utstapayati, All Lingas are there but not Brahman.

d) Siddanta:

- Pranaha – Brahman, Prabala Brahman Lingaat.
- Strong – Prominent, Lingams support all.

Prominent Because:

- Hitamatvam, Papa Nashatvam, Amrutatvam, Chetanatvam – Overrides all clues.

e) Sangatihi:

- It is Adhikaranam in appropriate place.
- In 9th Adhikaranam – Prana = Brahman
- In 11th Adhikaranam – Prana = Brahman
- In 9th Adhikaranam, Brahman Linga was there and not obstructed by other Lingam.
- Unopposed elected MP… Give name and Get Elected.

11th Adhikaranam:

- Brahman Linga is the Truth - Obstructed by Jiva, Devata, Mukhya Prana Lingams, it is Prabalam – Stronger Prabala Brahman Lingat, knocks out other Lingas.
- 31st Sutra, 11th Adhikaranam, 1st Pada Over.