NAISHKARMAKMYASIDDHI

By Suresvaracharya

Volume 2
# Chapter 1 – Topicwise Index

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No.</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page No.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>19.</td>
<td>The course of bondage : Verse 42 – 44</td>
<td>170 – 182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21.</td>
<td>Jnana, the direct means to liberation without the help of karma as the principal, or subsidiary, or equal : Verse 54 – 66</td>
<td>210 – 263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22.</td>
<td>The refutation of the views of Brahmadatta and Mandana : no scope for bhavana or jnana-karma-samuccaya after the rise of knowledge : Verse 67</td>
<td>264 – 282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.</td>
<td>No scope for Jnana-karma-samuccaya even if one were to accept bhedabheda : Verse 68 – 78</td>
<td>283 – 356</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## INDEX

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No.</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page No.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>Chapter 1 : Topic 19 to 23</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>Verse 42</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>Verse 43</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>Verse 44</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>Verse 45</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>Verse 46</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>Verse 47</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>Verse 48</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>Verse 49</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>Verse 50</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>Verse 51</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td>Verse 52</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td>Verse 53</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td>Verse 54</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. No.</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Page No.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54</td>
<td>Verse 55</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td>Verse 56</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td>Verse 57</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57</td>
<td>Verse 58</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58</td>
<td>Verse 59</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59</td>
<td>Verse 60</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60</td>
<td>Verse 61</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61</td>
<td>Verse 62</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>62</td>
<td>Verse 63</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>63</td>
<td>Verse 64</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64</td>
<td>Verse 65</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65</td>
<td>Verse 66</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>66</td>
<td>Verse 67</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>67</td>
<td>Verse 68</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>68</td>
<td>Verse 69</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. No.</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Page No.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>69</td>
<td>Verse 70</td>
<td>296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70</td>
<td>Verse 71</td>
<td>302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71</td>
<td>Verse 72</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>72</td>
<td>Verse 73</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73</td>
<td>Verse 74</td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>74</td>
<td>Verse 75</td>
<td>325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75</td>
<td>Verse 76</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>76</td>
<td>Verse 77</td>
<td>339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>77</td>
<td>Verse 78</td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TOPIC 19 TO 23

Verse 42 to 78
Verse 42 – Introduction:

Taking different births - high, low, and middle - which provide lightning-like momentary pleasure, pain, and delusion, moving up and down like a water-wheel in the ocean of sorrow which comprises all beings from Brahma down to the clump of grass, he revolves being propelled by the wind of good, bad, and mixed deeds in the same way as a dry gourd placed in mid-ocean is tossed about by the speed of the fierce stormy wind. [Introduction – Verse 42]

• Travel of Jeeva in this body or body to body, merry go round or sorry go around (Samsara).

• Situations decided by past Karmas both for Jnani and Ajnani.
Example:

- Pot going down and coming up fetching pail of water driven by a wheel.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mohohaha</th>
<th>Dukham</th>
<th>Sukham</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Tamo Guna</td>
<td>- Rajo Guna</td>
<td>- Satwa Guna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Intellect stultified</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Moha comes like a lightening flash and goes, fleeting, worse than Rajo Guna Dukham.
- Remove ignorance and get out of Samsara problems is solution given by Sureshvarachyarya.
Question:

- Why is Vedanta pessimistic?
- Veda is final part, Raja Vidya, Raja Guhyam.
- If happy, Veda Purva Baga alone should be given.
- Veda Purva Baga promotes Kartrutvam, Boktrutvam if people enjoy different lokas.
- Karma Khanda can order future Sukham, and Sukham here.
- Person sandwiched between 2 painful pleasures.
- Some want to transcend relative pain and interested in absolute Ananda like Nachiketa.

2 choices in the world

Accept both Pain and Pleasure

Reject both Pain and Pleasure

- In Jnana Khanda, Vedanta, Veda criticises relative pain + pleasure.

Example:

- Experience compared to dried fruit – Chorakai – Ghourd, floating in middle of ocean drawn by force of wind hither and thither.
- Jiva floating pops up and down with Prarabda, fierce winds.
- No Prayaschita can stop cyclone.
- Transcend both or Vedanta is Academic to get Phd.
Verse 42:

Perpetually revolving in this way, the man of desire takes birth, being bound by ignorance, desire, and deeds, and dies full of misery. [Verse 42]

- Ahamkara and Mamakara means relationship and individuality.
- Individuality and relationship born out of Avidya.
- Atma has no relationship – Asango hi Ayam Purushaha.

Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

After enjoying himself and roaming, and merely seeing (the results of) good and evil (in dreams), he (stays) in a state of profound sleep, and comes back in the inverse order to his former condition, the dream state. He is untouched by whatever he sees in that state, for this infinite being is unattached. ‘It is just so, Yājñavalkya. I give you a thousand (cows), sir. Please instruct me further about liberation itself.’[IV – III – 15]
• Once Avidya, Kama, Karma cyclone entraps Jiva, he becomes Kami with program and Agenda either for himself (ahamkara) or for relations (Mamakara).
• Sense of want – called Kama once he is Kami, Karma comes, he violently moves about.
• Don’t know where my real home is, slipped from Atma Svarupam, can’t see house.
• Journey doesn’t end in death, reborn again.
• If happy go to Karma Khanda, if not come to Vedanta.
• 1st Chapter – Preparation.
• 2nd Chapter – Vedanta.
Verse 43 – Introduction:

With a view to show respect to what has been said above, the [scriptural] authority will be cited. [Introduction - Verse 43]

Kama:

- Struggle to be different from what I am now.
- Jnani has Shuddha Kama.

Taittriya Upanishad:

He desired, “I shall become many and be born. He performed tapas; having performed tapas, He created all this whatsoever (we perceive). Having created it, He entered into it. Having entered it, He became the manifest and the unmanifest, the defined and undefined, the housed and the houseless, knowledge and ignorance, truth and falsehood, and all this whatsoever that exists. Therefore, it is called Existence. In this sense, there is the following Vaidika verse.” [II – VI –3]
• Bagawan has Srishti – Sthithi – Laya Kama.
• Desire born out of ignorance causes Shubha and Ashuba Kamas.
• Self ignorance triggered Kama.

Diagram:

```
  Agyanam - Avidya
    ↓
  Kama
    ↓
Samsara
```

Verse 43:

Since desire is the root of bondage, Sruti also conveys this teaching for the purpose of the cessation of desire. Its destruction arises from the destruction of ignorance. [Verse 43]

• I will give Sruti Support.
Verse 44 - Introduction:

If it be asked, “What is that Sruti text?” [we reply]. [Introduction – Verse 44]

- What is Sruti support for Avidya – Kama – Karma – Samsari.

Verse 44:

The Brhadaranyaka says: “When all desires are destroyed” and “Thus the man who desires [transmigrates]...”Vyasa also says repeatedly that this [life] is a bondage due to desire alone. [Verse 44]

Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

tadēṣa śloko bhavati

yadā sarve pramucyante kāmā ye'sya hṛdi śrītāḥ

atha martyo'mṛto bhavatyatra brahma samaśnuta || iti ||
tadyathāhinirvayanī valmike mṛtā pratyastā śayita,
evamevedaṃ śārīraṃ śete, athāyamaśariro'mṛtaḥ prāno brahmaiva teja eva;
sō'haṃ bhagavate sahasraṃ dadāmini hovāca janako vaidehāḥ || 7 ||
Regarding this there is this verse: ‘When all the desires that dwell in his heart (mind) are gone, then he, having been mortal, becomes immortal, and attains Brahman in this very body.’ Just as the lifeless slough of a snake is cast off and lies in the ant-hill, so does this body lie. Then the self becomes disembodied and immortal, (becomes) the Prāṇa (Supreme Self), Brahman, the Light. ‘I give you a thousand (cows), sir,’ said Janaka, Emperor of Videha. [IV – IV – 7]

**Katho Upanishad:**

> मृत्यु-प्रक्तम् नचिकेतोऽथ लभ्या विद्यमा योगविधिः च कृत्तम्।
> ब्रह्माप्राप्तो विरंजो भूद्रिमृत्यु-रन्योपयेव यो विद्व्यालयमेव।
> इति काठकोपनिषदि द्वितीयाध्याये तृतीया वल्ली।

> Mṛtyu-proktam Nachiketo-'tha labdhva vidyam etam yoga-vidhim-ca kṛtsnam,
> Brahma-prapto viragjo-'bhud vimṛtyuh anyo-'pyevam yo vid adhyatma meva II 18 II
> Iti Kathakopanisadi dvitiyadhaye sasthi valli.

Naciketas, having been so instructed by Lord Death in this knowledge and in the whole process of Yoga, became free from all impurities and death, and attained Brahman; and so will attain any other too who knows thus the Inner Self. (Thus ends the Sixth valli in the Second Chapter) [II – III – 18]

- As long as desires are there, finitude will be there.
- As long as finitude is there, Punarapi Jananam, Maranam.
- Next Birth influenced by Kama.
- **Example:** Jada Baratha.
- Kama – Root cause for rebirth.
- When desires gone, including Moksha desire, Samsara cycle ends.
- Kama Nasha Eva Samsara Nasha.
Regarding this there is the following verse: ‘Being attached, he, together with the work, attains that result to which his subtle body or mind is attached. Exhausting the results of whatever work he did in this life, he returns from that world to this for (fresh) work.’ Thus does the man who desires (transmigrate). But the man who does not desire (never transmigrates). Of him who is without desires, who is free from desires, the objects of whose desire have been attained, and to whom all objects of desire are but the Self—the organs do not depart. Being but Brahman, he is merged in Brahman. [IV – IV – 6]

- Vajinaha – Vajasnehi Samhita – Shukla Yajur Veda – Vajasnehi is name of Yagnavalkya – Surya.
- Sishya – Vajasnihi = Anna Dhata – Through Rain Bagawan gives food.
Verse 44:
- Samsara + Karma coexist.
- Karma + Moksha can never coexist.

Chamakam:

Om agna visnu sajoasemavardhantuvam girah |
dyumnairvejebhiragatam vaajaśca me prasaśvaśca me |
prayatiśca me prasitiśca me dhitiśca me kratuśca me |
svaraśca me slokaśca me sāvāśca me śrutisha me |
jyotiśca me suvaśca me pānaśca me vyānaśca me'suśca me |
čittaṁ ca ma ādhitarī ca me vākca me manaśa ca me |
caksūśca me śrotam ca me dakṣaśa ca me |
barāṁ ca ma ojaśca me sahaśca ma āyuśca me |
jarā ca ma āmā ca me taniśca me śarma ca me |
varma ca me ngāni ca me śthāni ca me parugansi ca me śarirāni ca me ||11||

O Gods, Agni and Vishnu! May both of you bear goodwill to me. Let these words of praise of mine magnify you. Approach me together bearing riches and food. I pray to you to grant me food and permission to give and eat food. May the food that I eat be pure. Let me have good appetite and relish the food and digest the food that I eat. May I perform the sacrifices that would procure me food. Let me recite all the vedic mantras with proper intonations and a compelling and captivating voice. Grant me the capacity to discriminate what to hear and what not to hear. May my mind be lit up with clarity to understand things properly. May I attain the heavens of Gods. Let the life forces and vital airs of Prana, Apana and Vyana function properly in me. May my mind deserve the right knowledge through incisive grasping. May you grant me the gift of eloquent speech and a sane and healthy mind. Let me have well functioning sense organs with clear eye sight and keen hearing. Let my organs of action be strong and virile. Grant me the might to put down my enemies and to lead a long and vigorous life.

- Chamakam – 1st sloka – give me food.
b) Vyasa:

**Mahabharatha : Moksha Dharma [Chapter 251 – Verse 7]**

| इमे वै मानवा: सर्वे धर्म परति विशाङ्किता: | इमे वै मानवा: सर्वे धर्म परति विशांकिताः |
| को स्यं धर्मः कुतो धर्मस तन मे बसूहि पितामहम ||1|| | को 'याम धर्माः कुतो धर्मस तन मे बरूहि पितामहः ||1|| |

• Kama Bandane meva idam jagat world bound by Kama.
• Desire shackles entire world.
• Wherever Kama is there, there is Karma + Samsara.

**Sloka:**

• “Kama Bandane Me Vedam Vanyat Asti Iha Bandanam
  Kama Bandhana Muktihi Neya Bayobhi Jayate”
• World shackled by desire.
• Ajnanis Ashudha Kama = Desire prompted by, triggered by ignorance.
• Jnanis Shudha Kama = Non-binding.
• Person free from Kama is free within himself.
• Atma Rati, Atma Tushtaha, Atman eva Santushtaha. He is free from cycles of birth + death.
**Gita:**

**Conclusion:**

- Therefore Karma can’t give liberation.
Verse 45 – Introduction:

Thus the way to bondage has been explained. Now for the purpose of destroying it, the manner in which actions, as remote aid, are the means to liberation will be explained. [Introduction – Verse 45]

- Chain of Samsara has been elaborately explained by me so that we can understand nature, cause of Samsara, consequence of Karma.
- When Samsara is understood, we can work for Moksha in the right direction.

- Samsara Chakram 6 fold chain.
- **Wants to add a Note:**
  Criticism of Karma is conditional.
Condition:

- When person wants Moksha, liberation, Karma criticised.

Purva Mimamsaka:

- Hopes to get Moksha by remaining in Karma life long.
- Karma for Chitta Shudhi encouraged.
- From now onwards glorification of Karma (Stuti).
- For Moksha – Karma is indirect contributor for liberation.
- After Chitta Shudhi, Karma can be given up.
- Mahavakya Vichara – Direct cause of liberation handled in Chapter 2, 3, 4.

Verse 45: [Divertion topic – Role of Karma]

Thus the way to bondage has been explained. Now for the purpose of destroying it, the manner in which actions, as remote aid, are the means to liberation will be explained. [Introduction – Verse 45]

- Samsari can’t do Mahavakya Vichara.
- Veda Purva and Karma Khanda has to be introduced.
1st Stage:
- Kamya Karma Pradhana Samsari asked to receive Phalam as Ishvara Prasada.
- Which is Karma Yoga, mind become purer, refinement of desire takes place.

2nd Stage:
- Replace Kamya Karma by Nitya Naimitta (NN) Karma – Pancha Mahayagya for fitness for Moksha.
- Moksha Ichha not enough, Yogyata required.
- Mumukshu has to be Karma Yogi for acquiring Sadhana Chatustaya Sampatti.
- What Vairagyam I have acquired is determined by number of things I am ready to loose indication of Vairagyam – our worries becomes less.
Verse 46 – Introduction:

To the question, "What kind of dispassion arises?" the answer is given. [Introduction – Verse 46]

- What type of Vairagya is generated.
- For Moksha can lose even my body is the height of Vairagya indicated by Nachiketa.

**Toughest qualification:**

- Sanyasi mind.
- All objects should become source of detachment and fear.
- Punyam also cause of Samsara and needs to be dropped.

Verse 46:

Just as he was afraid of hell, even so he is afraid of the fruits of desire-prompted actions, as a result of knowing their real nature. Therefore, he desires to perform obligatory deeds. [Verse 46]

- Dependent object is source of fear.
- Independent object is not source of Samsara.
- Use things, not emotionally lean on them.
- **Example**: Use walking stick not lean, be dependent.
- Mumukshus perform Pancha Maha Yagya.
Thus, as a result of the performance of daily and occasional obligatory duties: [Introduction - Verse 47]

The mind, purified by deeds dedicated to the Lord, develops faultless dispassion towards objects such as the world of Brahma. [Verse 47]

- Mahavakya Vichara requires new mind set developed by Pancha Maha yagya.
- We are Advaitam by nature, Mukta by Nature, Vairagyam natural to us.
- Vairagyam increases as we draw emotional strength from Atma.
- Enforced detachment is suppressive, dangerous.
- Sunirmalam = Strength born of Vairagyam towards all Anatma upto Brahma Loka.
- I don’t want to depend on entire Anatma Prapancha.

**Goal:**

I want to be secure, full with myself.

- I discover love, care, joy within Atma.
• By increase of Pancha Maha Yagya, mind becomes purer.
• What is indication of purification?
• Detachment from possessions, world increases.
• Expecting support from them is a problem.

**Unique idea of Sureshvaracharya:**
• Vairagyam is natural state of mind.
• Raaga is unnatural.
• By Practicing Nithya Naimitta Karma our natural Vairagyam comes to manifestation, “Vyanakti.”
• Tyaga, Sanyasa is natural.
• Why are we holding now?
• Because of ill health called ignorance.
• What type of Vairagyam comes from Nithya Naimitta Karma or doing Pancha Maha Yagya?

• “Su Nirmalam” – Pure Vairagyam comes from myself without external pressure.

Gita:

कर्मेन्द्रियाणि संयम्य य आस्ते मनसा स्मरन।
इन्द्रियार्थोन्निमूढात्मा मिथ्याचारः स उच्यते ॥ ३-६ ॥

He who, restraining the organs of action, sits thinking in his mind of the sense objects, he, of deluded understanding, is called a hypocrite. [Chapter 3 – Verse 6]
Verse 48 – Introduction:

Since the mind is tainted by the impurities of rajas and tamas, it is attracted by the bait of desire and is placed in the slaughter-house of countless sense-objects, but it becomes pure and tranquil like a well-washed crystal stone when it is cleansed by the performance of daily and obligatory deeds and the impurities of rajas and tamas are removed from it. Then, being free from all impurities, it is not attracted by the powerful bait of desire and aversion, which are caused by external objects, and remains like a clean mirror, inclined only towards the inward Self. Hence the following is stated. [Introduction – Verse 48]

Vairagyam has 2 conditions:

a) No more under control of external sense objects and people.
   - Mind with Raaga – Dvesha is under grip of external objects and people.
   - They should not occupy mind, when I am alone for sometime.

yasmād rajas-tamo-malopasāmrṣṭam eva cittaṁ
kāma-bhādiśenākṛṣṭya viśaya-duranta-sūnāsthāneṣu
nikṣipyate tasmān nitya-naimittika-karmānuṣṭhāna-
parimārjanenāpaviddha-rajas-tamo-malaṁ prasannam
anākulaṁ saṁmārjita-sphaṭika-śilā-kalpaṁ
bāhya-visaya-hetukena ca rāga-dveṣātmakenā
atigraha-bhaṭṭenānākṛṣyamānaṁ
vidhūtāśeṣa-kalmaśaṁ pratyān-mātra-pravaṇaṁ
citta-darpaṇaṁ avatiṣṭhate. ata idam abhidhiyate
- Object which can pre-occupy mind is an enslaving object.
- Object enslaves pure me – Chaitanyam, I become a slave of the mind under grip of sense objects.

Releasing my mind from pre-occupation with objects and people is called Vairagyam.

b) Mind should be naturally interested in Atma Jnanam.
- Internal Kashaya Vastram required, not external.
• Mind is dragged outside its Atma Home.
• Himsa Sthanam = Torture centre.
• Where is fish taken?
• Every object of attachment is cause for Anxiety, concern, pain, torture centre (Suna Sthanam).

Gita:

The enjoyments that are born of contacts are only generators of pain, for they have a beginning and an end. O son of Kunti, the wise do not rejoice in them. [Chapter 5 – Verse 22]

Aim:

• Don’t get into the hook.
• How to get released from the hook?
• By Nithya Naimitta Karma.
• Normal mind is Rajasic and Tamasic (Deluded).

Normal Mind:

• Interested in Sense pleasures, Human relationships, attachments, afraid of Sanyasa, contaminated, tainted.
• Sense objects do not allow mind to go inside seeking Atma (Paranchi Khani – dragged outside by Kama).
Katho Upanishad:

The self-existent (Brahma) created the senses with outgoing tendencies; therefore, man beholds the external universe and not the internal Self (Atman). But only some wise man desirous of Immortality, with eyes averted (turned within and with his senses turned away) from sensual objects, sees the Atman within. [II – I – 1]

- When objects leave, intense sorrow comes, future source of pain.
- How do they disturb me?
- When I have quiet time, mind not allowed to remain quiet within itself.
- Mind, ever preoccupied, no time for Sravanam.

Gita:

The Vedas deal with the three attributes; be you above these three attributes (gunas), O Arjuna, free yourself from the pairs of opposites, and ever remain in the sattva (goodness), freed from all thoughts of acquisition and preservation, and be established in the Self. [Chapter 2 – Verse 45]
• If you become Satvic, you don’t worry about Yoga and Kshema, acquisition and preservation.
• Mind relaxed, sit without anxiety, stress, worry, available for Puja, Japa, Parayanam, undisturbed, like clear crystal.

Kalidasa:
• Manasarovar – Calm like the mind of wise man.
• This verse summary of Chapter 2 – Verse 45.

The Vedas deal with the three attributes; be you above these three attributes (gunas), O Arjuna, free yourself from the pairs of opposites, and ever remain in the sattva (goodness), freed from all thoughts of acquisition and preservation, and be established in the Self. [Chapter 2 – Verse 45]

• One should be alert to avoid Vulnerability and being unsusceptible to future attachment – Hook ups.

Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

• mano vai grahaḥ, sa kāmenātigrāheṇa gṛhitāḥ, manasā hi kāmāṅkāmayaṃ | | 7 | |
The mind indeed is the Graha; it is controlled by the Atigraha, desire, for one wishes desires through the mind. [III – II – 7]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sense Organ</th>
<th>Sense Objects</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Graha</td>
<td>- Ati Graha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Control Jiva</td>
<td>- Enslaver of sense organs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Enslaver of Mind</td>
<td>- Raaga, Dvesha, Desire, caused by external sense objects.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Here, Kama, Krodha, Raaga, Dvesha are the impurities in the mind – Hookers, draws mind again and again, Makes the mind Vulnerable.
- Jiva enslaved again and again.
3 Enslavers:

Gita:

When your intellect crosses the mire of delusion, you shall attain to indifference as to what has been heard and what is yet to be heard. [Chapter 2 – Verse 52]

• What is the Advantage of free mind without preoccupation?
• In the mirror of mind see awareness Atma principle. Not Raaga, Dvesha, Kama.
• Mind extremely quiet, enjoyable, contented, peaceful, detached, enjoys Atma Ananda even without Vedanta.

Conclusion:

• Therefore Karma important for purification of mind, preparation for Jnana Yoga.
• In a clear mind alone, self knowledge takes place.
Verse 48:

When the intellect remains bereft of all desires, then alone it is inclined of its own accord to enter the inward Self. [Verse 48]

- Cause of stress is Kama, Krodha, Lobha...
- Mind transcends grip of desires and becomes tranquil, then becomes fit to abide in Atma.
- Bahir Mukham mind becomes Antar Mukham, becomes contemplative.
Verse 49 – Introduction:

Thereafter, actions [disappear] - having done their work [of the removal of desire] and having achieved their goal by entrusting their work to the intellect in which inclination towards the Self has arisen. [Introduction – Verse 49]

- Karmas have complete their role once they have generated Jingyasa – interest in self knowledge.
- Karmas are obstacle for a contemplative mind, rituals make mind extrovert.

Example:
- Like aged father hands over his Sandhya Vandhanam duty to son, Karma hands over to Jnana Yoga.
Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

Verse 49:

There are indeed three worlds, the world of men, the world of the Manes and the world of the gods. This world of men is to be won through the son alone, and by no other rite; the world of the Manes through rites; and the world of the gods through meditation. The world of the gods is the best of the worlds. Therefore they praise meditation. [I – V – 16]

Verse 49:

Actions, after producing inclination towards the Self in the intellect by purifying it and after having achieved their goal, disappear like clouds at the end of the rainy season. [Verse 49]

Sureshvaracharya:

• Once maturity comes, karmas will leave you, normally we say, you drop Karmas.

Example:

• Ripe Mango falls.
• Reduction of Laukika and Veidika Karmas happen when you mature our desires have to get refined.
  a) Sukha Ichha – Desire for Happiness.
  b) Moksha Ichha
  c) Dharma, Artha, Kama can’t give Sukham
  d) Jnana Ichha
  e) Shastra Vichara Ichha – Jnanam not through meditation but through Vichara.
  f) Sravana Ichha.
• For coming to Sravanam, Karma Yoga – Nithya Nimitta Karma – important.
• Reduce Prayashchitta, Kamya, Nisheda karmas for Chitta Shudhi.
• Karma will not give Moksha + Jnanam.

Gita:

कायेन मनसा बुध्या
केवलैरिन्द्रियेऽरपि ।
योगिनः कर्म कुर्वन्ति
सझं त्यत्त्वात्माशुद्ध्ये ॥ ५-११ ॥

kāyēna manasā buddhyā
kēvalairindriyairapi |
yōgīnāḥ karma kurvanti
saṅgaṁ tyaktvātmaśuddhayē ॥ ५-११ ॥

Yogis, having abandoned attachment, perform actions merely by the body, mind, intellect and senses, for the purification of the self (ego). [Chapter 5 – Verse 11]
Verse 50:

The greatness of the performance of daily obligatory duties is for this reason. [Introduction - Verse 50]

Therefore, for the purpose of purification of the mind, daily and occasional obligatory deeds have always to be done by seekers of liberation who desire knowledge of the Self. [Verse 50]

- Karma Yoga important upto purification of mind.
Verse 51 - Introduction:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>यथोक्ते सर्वज्ञवचनं प्रमाणम्</th>
<th>( \text{yathokte } \text{'rthe sarvajña-vacanaṃ pramāṇam} )</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

The utterance of the omniscient Lord is the authority in respect of what has been stated. [Introduction - Verse 51]

- How Sureshvaracharya knows this?

Verse 51:

| “आरुरुक्षोमुनियोंगं कर्म कारणमुच्यते। योगारूढस्य तस्येव शामः” एवेति च स्मृति: || ५९ || | \( \text{“ārurukṣor muner yogam karma kāraṇam ucyate yogārūḍhasya tasyaiva śama” eveti ca smṛtiḥ} \) |
|-------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------|

The smrti text says: "For a devotee who wishes to attain to yoga, action is said to be the means. For the same [devotee], when he has attained to yoga, quiescence" alone [is the means]. [Verse 51]

Gita:

| आरुरुक्षोमुनियोंगं कर्म कारणमुच्यते। योगारूढस्य तस्येव शामः: कारणमुच्यते || ६-३ || | \( \text{ārurukṣōrmunēryōgaṃ karma kāraṇamucyate} || \text{yōgārūḍhasya tasyaiva śamaḥ kāraṇamucyate} || 6-3 || \) |
|-------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------|

For a Muni or Sage who wishes to attune to yoga, action is said to be the means; for the same Sage who has attuned to yoga, inaction (quiescence) is said to be the means. [Chapter 6 – Verse 3]
Yoga Rudasya:

- Once you have come to Jnana Yoga and have Sadhana Chatustaya Sampatti, same Karma is obstacle.

Example:

- Yamnotri climb.
- Morning 6 AM – Sweaters – ok
- 12 Noon in Chennai – Obstacle.
- For a Seeker, Munehe, Yogam Arurukso – Yoga here is Jnana Yoga.
- After Chitta Shuddhi, Nitya Naimitta Karma – is given up in Sanyasa not in Grihasta.
From the performance of daily obligatory duties merit arises. From the origination of merit comes destruction of sin; from this arises purification of the mind, and from this comes the understanding of the real nature of bondage; there from dispassion arises; from this comes a longing for liberation, and this leads to a search for the means thereto, and from this comes the renunciation of all actions and their means; then there is the practice of yoga; from this comes the inclination in the mind towards the inward Self, and then there arises the knowledge of the meaning of texts such as "tat tvam asi", and from this results the destruction of ignorance; thereafter comes the state of remaining as the Self alone, as shown by the texts, "Being but Brahman, he is merged in Brahman," "Being liberated, one becomes free."

[Introduction – Verse 52]

- Full Range of Sadhanas presented for Moksha.
1) Nitya Naimitta Karma Anushtanam – Pancha Maha Yagya.

2) **Dharma Utpattih**:
   - Spiritual Punyam increases.

3) Spiritual Papam goes away.
   - Obstacles of Sravanam / Mananam / Nididhyasanam – goes away.

**Ishavasya Upanishad**:
   - Svarga Loka dark world of pleasures.
   - Lack of interest in Vedanta is Papam.

4) **Chitta Shudhi**:
   - Nitya Anitya Vastu Viveka.

5) Person clearly understands nature of Samsara.

6) **Vairagyam**:
   - Detachment from the world.

7) **Mumukshutvam**:
   - Greater detachment from the world, greater is attachment to Jnanam and Moksha.

8) **Moksha Upaya Paryeshanam**:
   - Go after Sadhanas, means for Moksha due to spiritual hunger.

9) **Sanyasa** – Renunciation of all conditions which produce Karma dedicate life to Jnana Yoga.
   - Now both Grihasta + Sanyasis (Institution Karma) have no time to study.
• New definition of Sanyasa in Grihasta or Sanyasa Ashrama.

**PORT Reduction**

- Possessions
- Obligatory duties
- Relations
- Transactions

- Port steals my time and my mind.
- In meditation, only port comes.
- Create conducive set up and listen Vedanta without pre-occupied mental condition.
- Orange robe not important.

10) **Yoga Abhyasa**:
- Sit and watch mind.
- Learn to withdraw mind and be comfortable with yourself without TV, Mobile.
- Acclamatisation for a quiet life of long study and contemplation.

11) **Pratyak Pravanata Chittam**:
- Enjoying inwardness, aloneness of mind.
- Mind without pre-occupation, uninterrupted by PORT thought.
- Enquiry into Tat Tvam Asi leads to Jivatma / Paramatma Aikyam, Aparoksha Prarijnanam.

12) Total Destruction of ignorance and Dvaitam.
13) Abiding in Atma, Binary format.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Karma Yogi</th>
<th>Jnana Yogi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Δ Format</td>
<td>- Binary format, pratasmarami.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Jiva / Jagat / Ishvara</td>
<td>- Drk Drishyam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Oh Lord help me to face Prarabda.</td>
<td>- Seer – Seen format</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Require faith and conviction in Veda.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Universe = Rope Snake = Jagan Mithya.
- I am – Rope = Aham Atma Satyam.
- Draw strength from Atma during Prarabda confrontation.
- Jagan Mithya includes Mithya Prarabdam also.
- I Atma can’t be touched by Prarabda.
- I support everything, I am happy Brahman, not hapless Jiva.
- Day I decide to shift format, Jnana Yoga begins, Jnana Nishta begins.
- Svatmani eva Avasthanam = Jeevan Mukti.

14) Videha Mukti:

- I am not affected by one of the bodies in creation.
- From Nitya Karma Anushtanam to Videha Mukti – 14 stages in Journey of Jiva.
Verse 52:

Thus, action leads successively to the removal of ignorance. Action cannot [directly] remove ignorance like knowledge, because it is not opposed to it. [Verse 52]

What Pramanam?

a) Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

Regarding this there is the following verse: ‘Being attached, he, together with the work, attains that result to which his subtle body or mind is attached. Exhausting the results of whatever work he did in this life, he returns from that world to this for (fresh) work.’ Thus does the man who desires (transmigrate). But the man who does not desire (never transmigrates). Of him who is without desires, who is free from desires, the objects of whose desire have been attained, and to whom all objects of desire are but the Self—the organs do not depart. Being but Brahman, he is merged in Brahman. [IV – IV – 6]
• Remaining in Brahman while alive is Jeevan Mukti.
• Apyeti – Merge into Brahman after death = Videha Mukti.

b) Katho Upanishad:

This body of eleven gates is indeed of the unborn even minded Self. Having meditated upon this (the seeker) grieves not and the liberated one is ever liberated indeed. This is verily that. [II – II – 1]

- Vimuktashcha Vimunchyata
  ↓      ↓
  Jeevan Mukti  Videha Mukti

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Karma</th>
<th>Jnanam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Indirect means to Moksha.</td>
<td>- Direct – Means to Moksha.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Remote</td>
<td>- Proximate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Karma is indirect for removing Avidya because Karma is friendly with Avidya.

Pure Atma ➔ Jiva Atma with identification with Body / Mind ➔ Agyanam ➔ Karma
Verse 53 – Introduction:

Why Karma not direct means for Moksha?

a) Whatever is consequence of Karma, it is not found in Moksha.

Example:

• No trace by forensic experts – person acquitted.

b) Whatever consequence of Moksha.

• Don’t find in Karma.
• Therefore there is no connection between Karma and Moksha.

The effect of action has no scope at all in respect of liberation, and what takes place in liberation does not require the help of action. This will be explained.

**Karma** | **Jnanam**
---|---
- Dvaitam | - Advaitam
- In time and space. | - Beyond time, space.
- With change | - Without change
Verse 53:

The result of action is origination, attainment, purification, or modification. Since liberation is not any of these, action is not the means thereto. [Verse 53]

Verse 24:

Since liberation is only the destruction of ignorance, action is not the means thereto. Action does not remove ignorance in the same way as error caused by darkness [does not remove darkness]. [Verse 24]

Chatur Vidha Karma Phalams Karma is associated with:

a) Aptihi:
   • Production of something.

b) Aapyam:
   • Reaching something.
c) Samskaryam:
  - Purifying.

d) Vikaryam:
  - Modifying.
  - Only 4 factors associated with Karma, Moksha has no connections with any one of them, Nitya Mukta Svarupa.
  - No need to do anything for Moksha, only know and claim – I am Mukta now.

Gaudapadacharya:
  - As long as you are in trapped time, past, present, future, you are in Samsara.
  - Come out, cause – effect, doing Sadhana for Moksha.
  - Teacher struggling to get you out of time.
  - Student: Waiting for Moksha in Meditation.
  - Moksha transcends time Karma always within time, can’t be cause of Moksha.
  - Jnanam helps you to claim Moksha is my nature which need not be produced.
  - Concludes refutation of 1st Purva pakshi in Verse 53.
Summary so far

3 Purva Pakshi’s – Kevala Karma gives Moksha

Verse 1 – 13
- Abyupethya Karma Vadi
- Refuted from Verse 23 – 53
- Atma Jnanam is there but not required for Moksha.

Verse 14 – 19
- Anabyupethya Karma Vadi.
- Atma Jnanam is not there in Veda.

Verse 20 – 22
- Samuchhaya Karma Vadi
- Jnanam together with Karma gives Moksha.
- Refutation – Verse 54 – 79

- Karma can purify mind and keep it prepared for Jnanam.
- Karma is remote, indirect cause.
So far, it has been shown that action by itself cannot directly destroy ignorance. In Verse (I. 29 ff.) beginning with "hitam samprepsatam" (those who wish to attain the good), it has been stated that considering the nature of the seeker of liberation, the nature of knowledge, and its object, there is no scope for action of every kind in respect of liberation. The way in which the association of action finds a place as a remote aid in respect of the origination of knowledge has also been explained. Now it will be stated that knowledge of the ever-existent Self is the special and the best means to destroy ignorance and that nothing else, either as the principal or subsidiary, can be the means [in combination with knowledge]. On this issue, he first explains why knowledge as a subsidiary (to karma) cannot be the cause [of the destruction of ignorance]. [Introduction - Verse 54]
Tritiya Samuchaya Vada
Nirasa for Moksha

3 Types

(1) Jnana Pradhanam
- Jnanam – Angi – 75%
- karma – Angam – 25%

(2) Karma Pradhanam
- Karma – Angi – 75%
- Jnana – Angam – 25%

(3) Sama Pradhanam
- 50% Contribution of Jnanam and Karma.

1st:
- Jnanam gives Moksha supported by karma.

Sureshvaracharya:
- All 3 views of Purva Pakshi not accepted.
- Jnanam gives Moksha unsupported by Karma.
- Kevalam Karma – Laukika, Veidica, Upasana not sufficient for Moksha.
- Karma Yoga and Jnana Yoga have cause – effect relationship.
- Jnana Yoga and Moksha have cause – Effect relationship.
- No direct cause – effect relationship between Karma and Moksha.
• Nithya Naimitta Karma purifies mind and after purification, job of Karma is over.
• Vedanta Pramanam Jnanam alone destroys self-ignorance and gives Moksha.
• Analyse Svabava of seeker Mumukshu, Jnanam, and object of knowledge – Atma.
• In Moksha Svarupa, no process involved, no Karma involved.
• We accept Krama Samuchaya.
  Karma Yoga – 1\textsuperscript{st} to purify mind.
  Jnana Yoga – for Moksha – liberation.
• We do not accept simultaneous – Sama – Samuchaya discussed in verse 29.

\begin{center}
\begin{tikzpicture}
  \node {Combination}
  \node[below left] at (0,0) {Appropriate};
  \node[below right] at (1,0) {Inappropriate};
  \node {Appropriate}
  \node[below] {Sequential};
  \node[below] {Karma Yoga – 1\textsuperscript{st} – Purify};
  \node[below] {Jnana Yoga – Get Jnanam, be free.};
  \node[below] {2 different times};
  \node {Inappropriate}
  \node[below] {Simultaneous Karma Yoga + Jnana Yoga.};
\end{tikzpicture}
\end{center}

• Self ignorance removal by Mahavakya Vichara alone, direct, unique means.
• Atma Jnanam in mind of seeker not in note books.
He, whose mind is not shaken up by adversity, and who, in prosperity does not hanker after pleasures, who is free from attachment, fear and anger is called a Sage of stead Wisdom. [Chapter 2 – Verse 56]

- Karma can never do job of removing ignorance, hence can never be the means.
- Jnanam independently removes ignorance.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Verse 54 – 79</th>
<th>Verse 20 – 22</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Refutation</td>
<td>Purva Pakshi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Verse 54:

Knowledge cannot remove ignorance by union with action [as its subsidiary]. Action and knowledge cannot exist at the same time as they are related as means and end. [Verse 54]

- Karma cannot take Jnanam as assistant – Jnanam Sannipatriya to remove Ignorance.

Example:

- One suffering from fever, wants mother to sit (Pakkabalam).

Reason:

- Eka Kala Anavastitam.
- At one and same time, Karma and Jnanam do not function.
- Karma Yoga – means to come to Jnana Yoga – prepares mind.
- Jnana Yoga – begins to function when mind is prepared and start understanding Vedanta.
- Otherwise Naishkarma Siddhi class only information not fact for me.
• When Jnana Yoga is functioning, Karma Yoga is non-existent.
• Class is not a waste, class is Karma, Purifying mind.
• Krama Samuchaya – Karma Yoga – 1\textsuperscript{st} – function them Jnana Yoga functions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Karma Yoga</th>
<th>Jnana Yoga</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Sadhana</td>
<td>- Sadhyam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Mind not prepared</td>
<td>- Mind prepared</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Eka Kala Anavastite, both Yogas do not exist simultaneously.
Verse 55 – Introduction:

Also, they cannot be combined as equal partners. [Introduction – Verse 55]

- Karma and Jnana can never play equal role.

Verse 55:

No combination of them is possible, as they cannot co-exist being related as the sublator and the sublated, like the lion and the sheep. [Verse 55]

Samuchaya Refutation – Reason:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Badya</th>
<th>Badaka</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Destroyed</td>
<td>Destroyer Sambandha</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Example:

a) Light - Darkness
Hungry Lion  |  Sheep  
---|---
Destroyer  |  Destroyed  
Jnanam  |  Karma  

- Panchasya = Lion – whose mouth is wide.
- Hungry Lion swallows sheep.
- Similarly Jnanam swallows Karma.
- In one and same mind, Karma and Jnanam can’t co-exist.
- How Jnanam and Karma are enemies?

**Gita Bashyam – Shankara:**
- Karma requires thought “I am Karta, Sadhaka, Samsari, Prarabda problems, looking for remedy through rituals”.

**Ashtavakra Gita:**
- I am not Jiva, Akarta, Asamsari, without Sanchita, Agami, Prarabda.
- Prarabda is Mithya, Jnanam = Siddah Karma – Mithya Sadhanam.

**How can Jnanam and Karma coexist?**

a) As long as I am in Karma Yogi format, helpless Jiva, requiring support from Ishvara, confronting Jagat, I will be in Karma Marga.

b) In Jnana Yogi format, Atma – Anatma format comes in play.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I – Atma</th>
<th>Anatma – World</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Drk – Higher order of reality.</td>
<td>- Mithya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Nitya Mukta Svarupa.</td>
<td>- Drishyam lower order of reality.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Satyam, Asangaha</td>
<td>- Prarabda – Mithya at all times.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Don’t require remedy for unreal problems.
- This is Badya – Badaka Bava Format.

**Vedanta:**

- Pramanam for a prepared mind.
- You are either in Δ format or Binary format.
Verse 56 – Introduction:

If it be asked, "Why are they related as the sublator and the sublated?" the following is the reason. [Introduction - Verse 56]

• Karma and Jnanam can’t coexist in mind of one person.
• One destroys other.
• Why Jnanam will not allow Karta and Karma to coexist?

Verse 56:

Ignorance [as well as karma] is concerned with the unreal. Knowledge is opposed to ignorance. Thus their combination will be like that of the sun and darkness. [Verse 56]

a) Badya – Badaka format (Verse 55)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Destroyer</th>
<th>Destroyed format</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Jnanam</td>
<td>- Karma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Light</td>
<td>- Darkness</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Like light and darkness.

223
Example:
- Waking – Dream can’t coexist, diagonally opposite.
- If Awake, should not work for dream problems.
- Your choice: Awake or dreaming.
- Why we say Jnanam destroys Karma?
- Karma based on Ayatha Vastu.
- Yatha Vastu means Satyam.
- Ayatha Vastu = False knowledge, Agyanam, Mithya Vastu, Na Vidyate Yasmin Tatha.
- Karma based on Karta – I am Brahmana, father, boss, Ahamkara, which is based on Mithya Jnanam, embodiment of ignorance (Avidya Syat).
- Jnanam and Karma are arch rivals.

Example:
- Light (Ravi) and Darkness (Sharvaram).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Karma Yoga</th>
<th>Jnana Yoga</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Δ format</td>
<td>- Binary format</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Jiva, Jagat, Ishvara</td>
<td>- Atma – Anatma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Helpless Jiva requires support of Ishvara.</td>
<td>- Atma is the only reality, Paramartika Vastu.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Anatma is Vyavaharikam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Prarabda is Mithya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- I am Swami, Asangaha, unaffected by Anatma Prapancha.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• Can’t combine master and helpless Jiva.

3 Processes for implementation of Binary format

- Nishchaya
  - Head + Heart must Agree on Jnana Yoga format.

- (2) Karma Pradhanam
  - Decide from today, will follow Jnana Yoga – AA Format.

- (3) Sama Pradhanam
  - Implement Jnana Nishta way of life.

Gita:
- Chapter 3 – Verse 3

Śrī bhagavānuvāca
loke'smin dvividhā niṣṭhā
purā proktā mayā'nagha
jñānayōgena sāṃkhyānāṁ
karmayōgena yōgināṁ

The Blessed Lord said: In this world there is a twofold path, as said before, O sinless one; the path of knowledge of the sankhyans and the path of action of the yogins. [Chapter 3 – Verse 3]
Hence, in the case of a person who has attained knowledge of Brahman, is not involved in action, all injunctions which prescribe the performance of action lose their force, because his nature is such that he is no longer subject to injunctions. If you ask, "How is that possible?" it will be explained. [Introduction – Verse 57]

- In Binary format, Karmas irrelevant.
- Study culminates in Akaraka Brahma Atma.
- Brahma does not exist in field of action, not an accessory of action (subject, object, instrument, Locus.
- I transcend all action is the assimilated knowledge.

Gita :

He, who takes the self to be the slayer and he, who thinks he is slain; neither of them knows. He slays not, nor is he slain. [Chapter 2 – Verse 19]
• I am not Karta.

Jnani:
• Akarta, has no Ashrama.
• Has discovered his very nature.
• Hence Karma Khanda – irrelevant.
• All commandments born out by Abhimana.
• Father, mother, boss, teacher...

Verse 57:

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{ब्रह्मणत्वायद्यहं मानि विप्रो वा क्षत्रकर्मणि} & \quad \text{॥ ५७ ॥} \\
\text{brhaspati-save yad-vat ksattriyo na pravartate} & \quad \text{brāhmaṇatvādy-ahām-māni vipro vā kṣattrā-karmanī}
\end{align*}
\]

Just as a Ksatriya does not perform Brhaspati-sava, even so a Brahmana who considers himself as possessing the nature of Brahmana, etc. does not perform the duties of a Ksatriya. [Verse 57]

• In Karma Khanda – every Karma depends on Varna – Ashrama.
• Brihaspati Svaha – performed by Brahmana, Kshatriya not interested.
• Raja Suya Yaga – performed by Kshatriya, irrelevant for Brahmana.
• Jnani Akarta mentally, how can there be Samuchaya. He is not identified with any Karma. Does not incur omission Papam – Pratyavaya Papam no PORT – no obligatory duty.
Verse 58 - Introduction:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sanskrit</th>
<th>Transliteration</th>
<th>Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>yathāyāṃ dṛṣṭānta evaṃ dāṛṣṭāntikō ’pity etad āha</td>
<td>vediho vita-saṃdeho neti-ney-avaśeṣitaḥ dehādy-anātma-dṛk tad-vat tat-kriyāṁ viksesate ’pi na</td>
<td>To show that what is true of the example also holds good with regard to what is to be illustrated, he says the following. [Introduction - Verse 58]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Like some vedic commandment not relevant for Kshatriya and he doesn’t identify with them, Jnani drops identification will all karmas.

Verse 58:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sanskrit</th>
<th>Transliteration</th>
<th>Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>yathāyāṃ dṛṣṭānta evaṃ dāṛṣṭāntikō ’pity etad āha</td>
<td>vediho vita-saṃdeho neti-ney-avaśeṣitaḥ dehādy-anātma-dṛk tad-vat tat-kriyāṁ viksesate ’pi na</td>
<td>[A person who has the right knowledge] is one who is free from the body, who is free from doubt, who remains [as the Self] through the practice of the technique of &quot;not this, not this&quot; and who sees the body, etc. as not-Self. In the same way [as shown in the example], he does not even look at their action. [Verse 58]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Jnani does not look upon himself as Jiva, changed Jiva / Jagat / Ishvara format.
- Has no doubt – Aham Brahma Asmi and father, teacher, boss is Vesham – not over anxious.
Vesham:

- Not disturbed, mind not preoccupied.
- Grihasta plays role of father, son, not Baram, serials with many episodes. I am deha traya rahita Atma.

Ajnani:

- Mind always pre-occupied, disturbed.

Jnani:

- Perceives body as Mithya Vesham only.
- I am neither Vishwa / Teijasa / Pragya, but am Turiyam.
- As Turiyam how do I look at my own body, mind, profession, world?
- “Anatma” – seen – Mithya.
- I am Drk – seer – sentient.
- Veda Vidhi, Nisheda is Mithya only.
- Like Brahmana looks at Kshatriyas Rituals as irrelevant, Jnani looks at all Vedic commandments as irrelevant, Mithya.

Neti Neti Avaseshyata:

- Description of wise man.
Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:
Wise Man Negates:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Na Iti</th>
<th>Na Iti</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Murtha Prapancha</td>
<td>- Amurtha Prapancha.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Visible, Sthula Shariram</td>
<td>- Invisible, Sukshma Shariram</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- What is left is Chaitanyam.
- I, the left out Chaitanyam am Brahman.
- Avaseshita means left out substratum, Adhishtanam, after negation of world, body – mind complex.
- I Atma can’t claim Varna, Ashrama identity.
- Can’t have Nitya, Naimitta, Kamya, Nisheda Karmas as Jnani.
- No body – Mind – Karma.
Verse 59 – Introduction:

With a view to clarifying this idea, an illustration is given. [Introduction - Verse 59]

- Brahma Satyam, Jagan Mithya mindset dominant in the mind of Jnana Nishta Purusha.

Verse 59:

Just as a child, superimposing the notion of a [real] elephant on the clay-elephant, runs away from it, even so an ignorant man, superimposing the notions of the body, etc. on the Self, is engaged in action. [Verse 59]

- All superimpose 3 fold body upon Asanga Atma.
- Look at relations – father, son, brother, possessions as real like a baby which runs towards or away from a wooden elephant.
- Child looks at it as real elephant as we look at entire universe as real.
- We are like babies, deluded and jumping with joy or sorrow.
Verse 60 – Introduction:

We do not deny the combination of knowledge and action in all cases. Wherever action and knowledge are related as cause and effect, even our father in such a case cannot repudiate [their combination]. With a view to show the distinction in this connection, an example is given. [Introduction – Verse 60]

2 Types of Jnanam:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Apara Vidya</th>
<th>Para Vidya</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Material knowledge.</td>
<td>- Spiritual knowledge.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Ayathartha Jnanam.</td>
<td>- Yathartha Jnanam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Karma friendly, promoting.</td>
<td>- Karma negating.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Gives me more desires, skills.</td>
<td>- I have no intellect or Laukika Jnanam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Veda Purva Jnanam.</td>
<td>- Vedanta Jnanam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Sumuchhaya between Karma and Jnanam possible.</td>
<td>- No Samuchhaya between Karma and Jnanam possible.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apara Vidya</td>
<td>Para Vidya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Retains Jiva / Jagat / Intellect format.</td>
<td>- Like light and darkness.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Promoted – Promoter / Supporter / Supported relationship</td>
<td>- Binary format.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>between Karma and Jnanam.</td>
<td>- Neti – Neti – Murtha, Amurtha Prapancha negated.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Branti Jnanam, erroneous Jnanam.</td>
<td>- What is left out is observer Chaitanyam, Atma, Adhishtanam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Individuality, duality preserved</td>
<td>- Jnani does not look at any Karma seriously.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Visishta Advaitin</td>
<td>- Drops identity with the body, mind, world.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Moksha in Vaikunta, pressing lords feet is Karma Yoga not Moksha.</td>
<td>- No supported, supporter relationship is there between Jnanam (Chaitanyam) and Karma.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Rasa Leela of Gopikas not Moksha but Karma Yoga.</td>
<td>- I am Satyam, Jagan Mithya.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Triangular format maintained and can do varieties of Pujas.</td>
<td>- Δ Replacement Jnanam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Naishkarmya Siddhi study one of the Karmas.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Verse 60:

Just as a person cognizing a post as a thief runs away in fear, even so a deluded person, superimposing intellect, etc. on the Self, is engaged in action. [Verse 60]

Example:

- In darkness, post or stump of tree mistaken as thief or ghost.
- Sthanum – Chora Darshanam.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>For Ajnani</th>
<th>For Jnani</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Chora Real</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- False knowledge promotes Karma of running.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Prayojya – Prayojaka, promoter – promoted relationship exists.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- False knowledge – karma.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Remembers neighbours thief, runs faster.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tells Ajnani:

- You also run away from thief – will discuss later after 5 miles.

- Chora is erroneous
- Right knowledge will drop Karma.
- Jnani wants to stop Ajnani.
- Jnani helpless to stop running humanity.
- Ever wonderful Atma falls as Anatma by wrong identification.
- Adhyasa.
• Taking oneself as Sharira Trayam is Adhyasa, individuality comes.
• Each role whips a person to activity.
• Atmanam Adhyaropaha Branthyā Jagat.
• World Sympathises for world person and wise sympathise for the worldly person.
• Maya successfully continues her Drama.
• Deluded perform Laukika, Vēidika Karmas endlessly.
Verse 61 – Introduction:

Thus, wherever there is means-end relation between knowledge and action, this principle holds good in all those cases. But cases where neither simultaneous nor successive combination is tenable, will be stated [in the sequel]. [Introduction – Verse 61]

- Chora Darshanam and Phalaya Karma Mutually support each other.
- Individuality, Dvaita Darshanam, Promotes varieties of Karmas.
- W.r.t. Vedanta it is Branti Vidya = Avidya = Apara Vidya.
- Individuality and Jatakam negated by Atma Jnanam.
- 1st Karma Yoga.
- 2nd Jnana Yoga.

Verse 61:

Just as right knowledge of the post is not subsidiary to the act of running, even so right knowledge of the Self is not subsidiary to the injunction of action. [Verse 61]
• Suppose the individual gets knowledge of truth, thief does not exist.
• Only post exists, no thief.
• Only Atma exists, no world.
• Then Jnanam + running not possible.
• Atma Jnanam can’t be combined with any Karma.
• I am not Vishwa / Teijasa / Pragya – individual but Turiyam.
• Jnanam not Angam – booster for Karma.

Example:
• Person taught, he is not a worm.
• Not satisfied, world / crow does not know that, hence running away from the world.
• Wormness can’t coexist with human knowledge.
• Individuality can’t coexist with Jnanam.
Verse 62 – Introduction:

For that is the nature of a subsidiary. [Introduction - Verse 62]

- If 2 things should function as supporter and supported, they should have one common feature.

Common feature = Avidya

- Assistant factor (Angam) Branti Jnanam, always follows nature of main factor – running (Angi).
- For running, thief knowledge supporting factor.
- I am Brahmanaha, helps in Sankalpa taking and perform Karma.

Verse 62:

That, indeed, which follows the nature of another in conformity to it can be subsidiary to it. But that which destroys the principal cannot be subsidiary to it. [Verse 62]
Mundak Upanishad:

That which is invisible, ungraspable, unoriginated and attributeless, that which has neither eyes nor ears nor hands nor legs – that is Eternal, full of manifestations, All-pervading, Sublest of the subtle – that Imperishable Being is what the wise perceive as the Source of all Creation. [I – I – 6]

- Adrishyam, Achakshu... not supportive but karma destroying knowledge.
- Supportive factor cannot be destroying factor.
Verse 63:

The knowledge which expects the context of action will be a subsidiary to action; for, that which belongs to the context of something is said to be a subsidiary to it. [Verse 63]

- Jnana Karma Samuchhaya Vadi very powerful during Shankara’s time.
- According to Purva Mimamsa, Vedanta meant to improve Karta.
- Quote Chandogya Upanishad:

He who knows about Om and he who does not know about it both work with strength they derive from Om. But knowledge and ignorance produce different results. Anything done with knowledge [about Om], with faith in the teachers and in the scriptures, and according to the principles of the Upanisads [or of yoga] is more fruitful. This certainly is the right tribute to Om. [1 – 1 – 10]
• After Atma Jnanam, Karmas become efficient.
• Purva Mimamsa not clear about role of Karma and Jnanam.
• To be better Karta they teach Vedanta. How can performer be improved.
• Veda Purva Jnanam can improve all accessories involved in Karma – oblations, number of priests, god facing direction, mantras.
• Knowledge favours Laukika and Veidika Karmas.
• Vedanta negates Karta and hence all Karma accessories.
• Vedanta Jnanam not Angam for Karma.
• Karma continues till Jnanam arises.
• Moment Jnanam arises, Karmas are falsified.
• Karmas not of importance to wise person exactly like dream world looses importance after waking.
• Individuality and Dvaitam looses its significance after Jnanam.
Revision: Verse 54 – 79:

- Jnana Karma Samuchhaya negation.
- Aikya Jnanam negates ignorance and ignorance born misconceptions.
- Negates duality, Karta, karma, Karanam.
- Duality required for Karma is negated by Jnanam.

Example:

- Darkness can’t exist with light.
- Presence of Jnanam = Absence of duality, absence of Karma.
- Therefore Jnanam and Karma can’t go together.
- Hence, wise man does not look at any Karma favourably, Laukika or Veidika.

Verse 60 – Introduction:

2 Types of Knowledge:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Karma Friendly</th>
<th>Karma Negating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Material science, favours Karma.</td>
<td>- No intellect in this Atma Jnanam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Inspires you to do more work.</td>
<td>- Jnanam negates Karma.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Improve family, individual, society, 14 Lokas, Veda Purva.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Retain Karta, individuality and duality.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- This Karma + Jnanam happily get.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Example : Degree to get Job</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Prayojyam – Prayojakam – Supporter – Supported Relationship.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- Erroneous, Branti Jnanam, Ayathartha Jnanam, Karma preserving knowledge.
- Ayathartha Jnanam and Karma can be combined.
- Yathartha and Karma can’t be combined.

**a) Jnana Karmanooha:**
- Samuchhaya of Jnanam and Karma.

**b) Vayam Pratya Chaksnamaha:**
- We do not negate Jnanam and Karma.

**c) Sarvatra:**
- In the case of all types of Jnanam.
- Negate only in the type of knowledge where we accept combination.

**d) Yatra Prayojya – Prayojana Bava:**
- In case of that knowledge, where there is mutual supporter – supported relationship.
- Any knowledge which preserves my individuality – Ahankara, Duality, Dvaita Prapancha retaining Δ format – Jiva / Jagat / Ishvara is Branti knowledge.
- In Yathartha Jnanam, Δ format goes away, have only Atma – Anatma.
- Jnana Yoga is shifting format from Δ to binary format.
- Aham Satyam, Jagan Mithya, there is no Δ format at all.
- In Δ format, Samuchhaya is maintained.
- I am Jiva, Ishvara, Puja, problems all exist.
- Naishkarmya Siddhi – replaces Δ format, not one of the activities of Jiva.
- It is replacement Jnanam.
e) Nivarithum Na Shakyate:
   • Can’t negate Samuchhaya in case of Δ promoting Branti Jnanam.

f) Na Asmat Pitra Api:
   • Even my father, or Brahmaji can’t negate Samuchhaya.

g) Tatra:
   • Among them, Δ promoting and Δ replacing Jnanam.

h) Darshanaya Vibhagaya Pradarshayate:
   • To show difference between Karma friendly and enemical types of Knowledge.

I) Upharan Pradarshayate:
   • I am giving example.

Verse 60:

a) Sthanum Chora Dhiya Alaya:
   • A person mistakes a post of a tree for a thief.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Perceiver</th>
<th>Wiseman / Jnani</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Does not know</td>
<td>- Knows, helpless.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Promotes Karma – runs more thinking of thief in neighbourhood.</td>
<td>- Says false knowledge.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Promoter – Promoted relationship exists.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Jnana Karma Samuchhaya Possible.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Frightened</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
b) Yadvat Phalayate :
  • Runs with cellphone, asks wise man to join.

c) Tasmat :
  • In the same way.

d) Atmanam Budhyadhi Api Adhyaropya :
  • In the same way, ever free, pure Atma I am but I mistake (Adhyaropa) Body, mind as myself.
  • Sharira trayam as myself, Naturally individuality comes – father, son, boss.
  • Each role has duties, problems, makes person run.
  • Can’t complete duties and come to Vedanta.
  • Whole world, Brantya Daya, confused.
  • Wise can’t have Sympathy for the world.
  • In fact, the world pities the Sanyasi.
  • Maya successfully continuing its Drama.

e) Cheshtate :
  • Maintains Laukika and Veidika Karmas.
Verse 61 – Introduction:

a) Evam:
- In this particular case.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chora Darshanam</th>
<th>Paraya Karma</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jnanam can mutually support</td>
<td>Karma</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Rule:
- Where individuality and Dvaita Darshanam is there, there will be varieties of Karmas.

b)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jnana</th>
<th>Karma</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Prayojya</td>
<td>Prayojyaka Bava</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- There is mutual friendship between Jnanam and Karma w.r.t. the Ajnans.
- w.r.t. Jnani, it is Apara Vidya, which is Avidya.
- Jataka Jnanam is Branti Jnanam.

c) When individuality, Jatakam is negated, by Jnani with unique knowledge, Δ format negating knowledge, Jiva, Jagat, Ishvara format negates Δ knowledge.

d) Na Upapadyate:
- Samuchhaya not possible.
e) Sama Kale:

- Simultaneously or sequentially, Kramena,

\[1^{st} \text{Atma Jnanam then karma} \rightleftharpoons 1^{st} \text{Karma then Atma Jnanam}\]

In both combination not possible

Verse 61:

a) Satata Vigyanam:

- Suppose person gains knowledge of truth of thief, doesn’t exist, only post exist.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sthanu Jnanam</th>
<th>Phalayana Karma</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Post exists</td>
<td>- Running Dropped</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- No thief</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Similarly:

b) Atmanaha Tatva Vigyanam:

- Atma Jnanam can’t be combined with any Karma.
- I am not Vishwa, Teijasa, Pragya individual with Biodata.
- I am Paramartika non-individual, Turiya Atma.
- This Jnanam can’t become – Angam, part, booster – Kriya Vidhou – in performing Karma.
Chinmaya Story:

- Person thought he was worm, will be caught by birds, convinced, later wonders – How will bird know I am not worm.
- Wormness can’t coexist with knowledge.
- Individuality can’t coexist with Naishkarmya Siddhi Jnanam.

Verse 62 – Introduction:

- Birds of same feather, flock together.
- Should have similar characteristics, features.

Etad Svabavyam:

- What is the nature of Branti Jnanam and Karma?

Verse 62:

a) Yatu Yasya Bavam Anuvartate:

- Assisting factor should always have nature of primary factor.
Mutually supportive, have Anga – Angi Bava.

b) Yatu Branti Jnanam, Tatu Pralayana Karma Svabavam Anuvartante, it follows.

Anurodhanena:

- By being in conforming to other.
- Both based on Avidya, ignorance of the post.

c) Tatu Tasya Guna butam Syat:

- Gunabutam = Supportive factor for doing primary Karma, any Vedic Ritual.
- I am Brahmana, Kshatriya, is favourable for rituals, take Sankalpa... supportive factor.

Can’t say: Mundak Upanishad

That which is invisible, ungraspable, unoriginated and attributeless, that which has neither eyes nor ears nor hands nor legs – that is Eternal, full of manifestations, All-pervading, Subtlest of the subtle – that Imperishable Being is what the wise perceive as the Source of all Creation. [I – I – 6]

- Not Atma Jnanam promoting Karma.
Rule:

- Gunaha Pradhana Na Syat, Prakaranat.
- Pradhanam Atti – Jnanam swallows, destroys Karma.
- If Jnanam negates Karma, it is Pradhanat Jnanam.
- I don’t have Varna, Ashrama... Jnanam is destroyer of every Veidika Karma.
- How can karma destroyer Jnanam be supporter of Karma?

Guna Pradhanasya Ath Na Bavati:

- Supportive factor should not be destroyer of supported factor.

Verse 63 – Introduction:

a) Yasmat;

- Seemingly simple fact, not understood by Mimamsaka Purva Pakshi, who have thoroughly studied Veda Purva and Anta and have formed Jnana Karma Samuchhaya Vada.
- Powerful philosopher during Shankaras time.
- According to Purva Mimamsaka, Vedanta Jnanam only to improve Karta.

Chandogya Upanishad:

\[ \text{tenobhau kuruto yascaitadevam veda yasca na veda} \]
\[ \text{nana tu vidya cavidya ca yadeva vidyaya karoti} \]
\[ \text{sraddhayopanisada tadeva viryavattaram bhavatiti} \]
\[ \text{khalvetasyaivaksarasyopavyakhyanam bhavati} \]
He who knows about Om and he who does not know about it both work with strength they derive from Om. But knowledge and ignorance produce different results. Anything done with knowledge [about Om], with faith in the teachers and in the scriptures, and according to the principles of the Upanisads [or of yoga] is more fruitful. This certainly is the right tribute to Om. [1–1–10]

- After Atma Jnanam, Karmas will become more efficient.
- Gita for better corporate management.

**Sureshvaracharya :**

- Atma Jnanam is destroyer of Karta, can’t improve performance.
- You the performer indentified with body, mind complex, ego, individuality, Dvaitam is negated.
- How can it polish Karta?

a) **Yasmat :**

- Because.

b) **Karma Prakarane Akankshi (Required) Jnanam :**

- All Jnanam required in Karma Khanda for better performance of Karma.

c) **Karma Guna Bavet :**

- Support, assistant, promoter of Karma.

**Example :**

- Sraddha, 2 priest, Vastu, accessories required helps Karma.
- Vedanta nothing to do with direction of God, number of priests.
• Can’t compare Veda Purva and Vedanta Jnanam.

d) Yadi Yasya Pravartate :
• Whichever knowledge exists in whichever context.

e) Tadu Tat Angam Bavet :
• Karma Khanda Jnanam can become Angam of Karma.
• Can’t use Jnana Khanda Jnanam as Angam of Karma.
• Therefore Samuchaya never possible.
• Karmas can continue till Jnanam has risen.
• When Jnanam rises, Karmas falsified, no importance for a wise man.

Example :
• Dream world looses importance after waking.
• Whole Dvaitam, individuality its significance lost after Atma Jnanam.

Revision :
• Verse 54 – 79 – Sureshvaracharya refuting Jnana Karma Samuchhaya Vada – 3 Branches.
• Karma Pradhana Samuchhaya
Jnana Pradhana Samuchhaya
Sama Pradhana Samuchhaya

All 3 not possible
Side Point:

- Jnanam is Aham Bhrama Asmi.
- This Jnanam can’t go with Karma.
- Other Jnanams friendly with Karma, for performance of Karma.
- Fundamental basis – is I am Karta, doer.
- Aham Karta is promoted, not destroyed.
- Once Kartrutvam is dismantled, then foundation of Karma is gone.
- Can’t combine Karma with Kartrutva eliminating Jnanam.
- It is enemical to Karma.
- Veda Purva deals with knowledge of rituals, nature of Indra, Agni, Varuna Devata, oblations required, Blessings given.
- Indra, Varuna, Chandra, Agni, Surya Devatas Jnanam favourable to Karma hence, Samuchhaya possible.

Verse 63:

- Karma Prakarana Akankshi Jnanam.
- Karma booster Jnanam called karma Anga buta Jnanam.
- Angam is like Catalyst in Chemical reaction.
- Akankshi – means necessary, required for efficient practice of Karma.
Law:

- In the context of whichever Karma, whichever supportive Jnanam is imparted, that supportive Jnanam becomes support or assistant of that Karma.
- Jnanam + Karma mutually support and give greater result.
- Vedanta Jnanam does not come under Karma Prakaranam.
- Vedan Purva separately presents it.
- Vedanta Jnanam destroys Kartrutvam, which is basis of Karma.
Verse 64:

Knowledge which, by its mere origination, destroys our ignorance cannot anywhere be subsidiary or the principal to action. [Verse 64]

- Unlike Karma boosting knowledge, Vdanta Jnanam is of different calibre.

a) Svarupa Labah Matrena :
- By merely coming into existence in the mind of student, Jnanam rising, what does Atma Jnanam do?

b) Avidyayam Nihanti Naha :
- Our self ignorance destroyed by mere rise of knowledge.
- Ignorance of the fact that I am Akarta, Aham Akarta, Knowledge comes.
- It necessarily displaces Adhyasa that I am Karta.
- If I am Akarta is clear, it has to displace notion I am Karta.

c) Kartrutvam Cha Nihanti :
- Jnanam destroys ignorance, Kartrutvam and Karma.
- Where Kartrutvam, doership is not there, Karma can’t exist.
e) Pradhanam Va Na Bavet :

- Jnanam can’t become Angi.

Therefore,

f) Trividha Samuchhaya Na Sambavati :

- Jnanam by itself can give liberation.
- Let Karma come, sweep mental floor and go away.
- After that Karma has no role to play.
- Jnanam single handedly can achieve liberation for us.
Verse 65 - Introduction:

- Samuchhaya Vadi will have to helplessly accept my argument, my conclusion if he follows me step by step.

a) Samuchhaya Vadi Na Api Etad Avashya Abyupaga Gantavyam:
  - Following fact will have to be accepted.
  - Helplessly if thinking is clear, will accept because of following fact.

Verse 65:

Knowledge which does not destroy ignorance does not come into existence at all. Action does not touch knowledge which has destroyed the aggregate of the factors of action. [Verse 65]

a) Jnanam Na Siddhati:
  - Jnanam can’t rise in mind.
b) Ajnanam Anira Kurvatu :

- Without displacing ignorance.
- Jnanam and darkness.
- Light comes, displaces darkness.

**Step 1 : Accept**

- Once Jnanam comes in the mind, Ajnanam is absent, Sishyas Ajnanam, knowers Ajnanam is absent.

**Step 2 :**

- Ajnanam is sustaining principle of Karaka Dvaitam.
- Support for Duality required for Karma, subject, object, instrument, location required for Karma.
- Karma = Karaka Janya Kriya.
- Ajnanam – Nourishes Karaka Dvaitam, Nourishes Kriya.

```
Diagram:

- Jnanam removes ground floor Ajnanam, Karakam, Kriya Automatically fall.
```

2nd Floor

Kriya

Karaka

Karanam

1st Floor

Ground Floor

Jnanam removes ground floor Ajnanam, Karakam, Kriya Automatically fall.
• Vipanna Karaka Gramam
  ↓     ↓
Destroyed Group, Dvaitam

• Vipath – To die, to perish.

• 1\textsuperscript{st} casualty = I – Karta = 1\textsuperscript{st} Karaka.

• Only when I – Karta is available, will he look for homa kunda, priest, oblations.

• Knowledge is that which has removed accessories, Karaka Rahitam Jnanam.

• Karma no Dhoukate.

• Dhoukate – to go, Gachhati.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jnanam</th>
<th>Karma</th>
<th>Dhoukate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Subject</td>
<td>Object</td>
<td>Verb</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Jnanam does not go anywhere near Karma, how can you perform coalition party between Jnanam and Karma?

• No Samuchhaya possible.
Verse 66 – Introduction:

This is also another reason for rejecting the combination of knowledge and action. [Introduction – Verse 66]

- Another Reason.

a) Samuchhaya Nibarhi:
- Nashakaha.
- Destroyer.
- Destroyer of Samuchhaya Vada.
- Jnanam can’t join Karma as leader or follower.

b) Angam Na Bavati:
- Pradhanam api na Bavati - When?

c) Kvachit:
- At any time.

3 types of Samuchhaya

(1) Nishchaya Jnana Pradhanam
(2) Karma Pradhanam
(3) Sama Pradhanam

- Negated in Verse 66
- Negated in Verse 55 + 56

- Aparam = Additional Logic, reasoning.
Verse 66:

Since the sources, nature, and effects of [both] knowledge and action are opposed like light and darkness, there is no combination of them. [Verse 66]

- If you study main features of Jnanam and Karma, you will note that they are totally incompatible.
- No wedding, can’t coexist.

Main – central portion – essence of Naishkarmya Siddhi:

- Both Virodhi, Diagonally opposite.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Karma Yoga</strong></th>
<th><strong>Jnana Yoga</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>a) Δ format</strong></td>
<td><strong>a) Binary format</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>b) Invocation :</strong></td>
<td><strong>b) Invocation :</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- I am feeble, helpless Jiva.</td>
<td>- I am Atma, Jagat Adhishtanam, support of universe, ever free.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>c) Cause :</strong></td>
<td><strong>c) Cause :</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Conclusion of non-enquiry.</td>
<td>- Enquiry through Vedanta Vakya Pramanam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- I am Karta, with many uncompleted tasks, duties.</td>
<td>d) Destroys Kartrutvam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>d) Preserves Kartrutvam, whips me to activity, preserved by nonenquiry.</strong></td>
<td><strong>e) Svarupam :</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>e) Svarupam :</strong></td>
<td>- Prakashatmakam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Avidyatmakam, Aprakasham, Avidya, Darkness.</td>
<td>- In form of Vidya, knowledge.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Isavasya Upanishad :</strong> Andah Tamah...</td>
<td>- I am the light of consciousness illumining body, mind, universe.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Who am I, what is world, not known, in darkness.</td>
<td>- All clear.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Whole Karma is functioning in Semi Darkness of Adhyasa.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- All activities are due to erroneous notion w.r.t. myself and the world.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karma Yoga</td>
<td>Jnana Yoga</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Karma requires darkness</td>
<td>- Jnana requires brightness.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Vichara Abava.</td>
<td>- Vichara Bava.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f) <strong>Karyam</strong></td>
<td>f) <strong>Karyam</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Consequence</td>
<td>- Punya Papa Nashaka Rupam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Punya Papa Vardhaka Rupam.</td>
<td>- Uproots tree.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Karma increases Punya Papam.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Plant tree.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Hetu, Svarupa, Karyani different, no Samuchaya.
- 1\textsuperscript{st} state of Samuchaya Vada Nirasa, over.
- Deeper discussion, more subtler, technical topics now.
When we thus conclude, there are those who on the strength of their own tradition say that the knowledge, “I am Brahman,” which arises from the Vedanta text does not remove ignorance by its mere origination. What then? One who practises meditation every day for a long time can get rid of all ignorance by the accumulated strength of meditation, as shown by the Sruti text, “Becoming (knowing) god, he attains the gods.” Some others maintain that since the knowledge, “I am Brahman,” which has risen from the Vedanta text is relational, it does not at all apprehend the real nature of the Self. What then? This [knowledge] itself, when it is continuously mediated upon [without any break] like the stream of the Ganga produces in a person another knowledge which is different [from it] and which is non-sentential. That alone destroys the entire darkness of ignorance, as shown by the Sruti text, “The Brahmana, after knowing it, should attain direct knowledge”. For the refutation of these two views, this is stated. [Introduction – Verse 67]
Main teaching - principles of Sureshvaracharya:

2 parts of understanding

- Clear understanding of Mahavakya
  - Comes by Sravanam, primary Sadhana.
  - All other Sadhanas are only subsidiary, helps me to practice primary Sadhana.
  - Karma, Puja, Japa, meditation are supportive Sadhanas, Angam.
  - Closely follows Tat Tvam Asi – Upadesa Sahasri of Shankara
    Chapter 18 – 223 verses.

- Clear understanding – nothing else required
  - Purva Pakshi - Objects

First - Purva Pakshi:

- Understanding alone not enough, no liberation.
- Meditation alone will lead to liberation.

Sureshvaracharya:

- How meditation helps in clear understanding?
- What is deficient in clear understanding?
- What is role of meditation?
Revision:

Jnana Karma Samuchhaya

1st Stage

Jnanam and Karma can’t be combined

Jnana Pradhana Samuchhaya

Karma Pradhana Samuchhaya

Sama Pradhana Samuchhaya

2nd Stage

Siddanta:
- Clear understanding of Vedantic teaching gives liberation.

2 Components:
I) Clear understanding of Tat Tvam Asi.
II) Clear understanding that nothing else can give liberation.
• **2 Purva Pakshi’s attacking part II of Sureshvaracharyas conviction:**
  o Clear understanding of Tat Tvam Asi alone not enough.
  o Requires long meditation for liberation, Barama Vadinaha”.
  o Ultimately meditation alone leads to Moksha.

• Sureshvaracharya refutes importance of Meditation.
• Vedanta Sravanam and Vichara final stage of liberation.
• Clear knowledge not enough, does not destroy ignorance.
• Clear understanding has to be generated in the mind by repetition, called Jnana Abhyasa.

**Bavana Vada : (Technical)**

i) Practicing meditation for a long time gives cumulative power to gain knowledge.
   • Cumulative Bavana Samskara, Dhyana Samskara force generated, Jnanam gets power to remove ignorance.
   • Simply understood Jnanam, does not have power.
   • At end of a few years of meditation, Jnanam gets power to destroy ignorance, then Moksha acquired.

ii) Jnana Abhyasa effective, only if Nitya Naimitta Karmas are continued.
   • There is an interval, gap when Mahavakyam is understood, have Jnanam but not effective.
   • Karma produces boosted Jnanam, which leads to liberation.
   • Purva Pakshi – No. 1 : Talks of Karma Sahita Jnana Abhyasa.
Introduction – Verse 67:
- Other Purva Pakshi’s come – Brahma Datta Acharya group.

a) Sva Sampradayawa Bala avastham Va:
  - With support of their group of followers.

b) Ahoohai:
  - Proudly claim.

c) Vedanta Vakyatu:
  - By Mahavakya Vichara.

d) Aham Brahma Iti Vigyanam Samuthpathyate:
  - Accept Aham Brahma Asmi.
  - Jnanam is there.

e) Vichara Janya Jnanam Neiva Nirasyati:
  - But will never destroy self ignorance even though we have clear knowledge.

f) Sva Utpatti Matrena:
  - By mere rise of knowledge in Antahkaranam.

g) Jnanasya Janma:
  - Rise of knowledge does not destroy ignorance.

h) Kim Tarhi:
  - Then what do you want to convey?
i) Ahani Ahani Bavani:
- Day after day, practice upasana.
- Vedanta Mahavakyam = Upasana Vidhi, injunction.
- Darkiya Karyaha = Practice for a long time.

Sanskrit Grammar:

- **3 Numbers**
  - Singular / Dual / Plural
  - 7 – Vibaktis - cases
  - 3 x 7 = 21 Variations
  - Masuline, feminine, neuter
  - 21 x 3 = 63 forms for one word

- Bavana = Samskara in Mind
  - 2 Meanings

- Practice of Meditation
  - Samskara powerful force Added

- Force strengthens after few years, becomes powerful, strengthens understanding.

j) Ajnanam Apagachhati:
- Ignorance goes, class in 2003, effect of class in 2053.
Pramanam : Brihadaranyaka Upanishad :

‘Let me hear what any one of your teachers may have told you.’ ‘Jitvan, the son of Śilina, has told me that the organ of speech (fire) is Brahman.’ ‘As one who has a mother, father and teacher should say, so has the son of Śilina said this—that the organ of speech is Brahman, for what can a person have who cannot speak? But did he tell you about its abode (body) and support?’ ‘No, he did not.’ ‘This Brahman is only one-footed, O Emperor.’ ‘Then you tell us, Yājñavalkya.’ ‘The organ of speech is its abode, and the ether (the Undifferentiated) its support. It should be meditated upon as intelligence.’ ‘What is intelligence. Yājñavalkya?’ ‘The organ of speech itself, O Emperor,’ said Yājñavalkya, ‘through the organ of speech, O Emperor, a friend is known; the Ṛg-Veda, Yajur-Veda, Sāma-Veda, Athar-vāngirasa, (Vedic) history, mythology, arts, Upaniṣads, verses, aphorisms, elucidations and explanations, (the effects of) sacrifices, (of) offering oblations in the fire and (of) giving food and drink, this world and the next, and all beings are known through the organ of speech alone, O Emperor. The organ of speech, O Emperor, is the Supreme Brahman. The organ of speech never leaves him who knowing thus meditates upon it, all beings eagerly come to him, and being a god, he attains the gods.’ ‘I give you a thousand cows with a bull like an elephant,’ said Emperor Janaka. Yājñavalkya replied, ‘My father was of opinion that one should not accept (wealth) from a disciple without fully instructing him.’ [IV – I – 2]
• Result Devata Upasana – Indra, Hiranyagarbha, Prajapati, Devi, Ayappa.
• Understand glory, imagine upon myself, Aham “Hiranyagarbha” Asmi, practice Aikya Upasana.

Lalita Sahasranamam:

अरुणां करुणा तरंजिताक्षीं
धृता पाशाकुशा पुष्प वाणचापाम्।
अगिनादिभि रावृतां मच्छ्रेष्ठे
रहस्यित्येव विभावये भवानीम् ॥

Arunam karuna tarangitakshim
Dhruta pashankusha pushpa banachapam
Animadibhi ravrutam mayukhain
Rahamityevo vibhavaye, bhavanim

I meditate on the great Empress. She is red in color, and her eyes are full of compassion, and holds the noose, the goad, the bow and the flowery arrow in Her hands. She is surrounded on all sides by powers such as anima for rays and She is the Self within me. [Dhyana Sloka – 2]

• Manifests divine qualities of Upasya Devata on Upasaka.
• Get Tejas, powers, become Ayappanmar, Devi Amma, Develop traits and merge.
• Similarly is Brahman merger, Ashabdam, Arupam.
• What applies to Devata, applies to Brahman.

k) Apari tu Bruvate: Purva Pakshi 2

• You are learning Mahavakyam, knowledge born out of analysis of Vakyam.
• Words syntactically connected = Vakyam.
• If disjointed group of words, can’t convey.
• Rama, temple, Abhishekam, songs.
• No subject, object connection.
• Padam (word) reveals Pada-artha.
• **Example:**
  Patre Jalam asti, Adhara – Adheya Sambanda revealed, Padartha Sambanda.
• Every Padartha not isolated but connected.

**Example:**
• Can’t understand water by itself, need connection with Patram.
• Samsrishta / Asamsrishtatmaka – Jnanam.
• Samsargatmaka (relational) / Asamsargatmaka – Jnanam.
• Brahman in Mahavakya is Vakyartha / Samsrita Padartha.
• This can’t give Moksha.
• Only that Brahman which is Avakyartha, Asamsrita, Asamsargatmaka will give Moksha.
• Require Sajatiya, Vijatiya, Svagata Bheda Rahita Kevala Asanga Brahma Vigyanam for Moksha.
• Your Sadhana not over with Mahavakya Vichara.
• Do separate Sadhana to convert Samsrita Brahma Jnanam into Asamsrita Vijnanam.
• Relational knowledge into realisation, enlightenment.

**Meditation converts:**
• By Bavana Upacharya Samskara conversion takes place.
• Sentential knowledge should be converted into non-sentential knowledge.
• How long meditation required?
Till you get liberated, till then we are all learned scholars, not enlightened.

2nd Purva Pakshi:

- Name not clear, Sakshatkara Vadaha, realised people.

I) Vedanta Vakya Janitam – Aham Brahma Asmi Vijnanam:

- Knowledge born out of Mahavakya Vichara.

m) Samsargatvatmakavada:

- Have only relational Brahma Jnanam, not Asanga Brahma Jnanam.

n) Atma Vastu Avagahina Bavati:

- Knowledge born out of Mahavakya Vichara, does not reveal real Brahman.
- Real Brahman is Asanga Brahman.
- Sentence gives only Sasanga Brahma Jnanam, relational Brahman, useful, not real, have to convert.
- Atma Vastu Yatat Mayam = Real Paramatma.
- Avagomi – Revealing, objectifying.

o) Kim Tarhi:

- What is that real Brahman?

n) Etad Eva Vigyanam:

- Same Aham Brahma Asmi, keep on meditating.
p) Ganga Srotravatu:
- Like stream of Ganga flowing.

q) Satatam Abhyasataha Purushasya:
- Person should practice regularly, systematically.
- Transmutation of knowledge to realisation happens.
- People add mystic dimension to spirituality which Sureshvaracharya negates.
- Vedanta has no tinge of Mysticism.
- It is a clear understanding process.
- Another knowledge is born in the mind, conversion achieved by mind alone.

2 Meanings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Shastra</th>
<th>Mind</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Gives relational Brahman knowledge.</td>
<td>- Alone gives real Brahman knowledge in Meditation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Sureshvaracharya gives primary emphasis to Shastra, establishes Pramanam of Shastra can give liberating knowledge.</td>
<td>- Purva Pakshi – gives primary place to meditation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Shastra alone give Vigyanantharam.</td>
<td>- Another knowledge is born.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- What non-relational knowledge do to the individual.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1) Tad Eva Aseshajnana Timiro Sariti:

- Non-substantial knowledge generated in meditation called Sakshatkara.
- Alone is Timira Utsari
  ↓  ↓
  of self ignorance  Destroyer, eliminator, Nashayet
- How much ignorance?
  Asesha – Total ignorance in its entirety.
- Sakshat Kara Jnanam alone can destroy ignorance.

Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

The intelligent aspirant after Brahman, knowing about this alone, should attain intuitive knowledge. (He) should not think of too many words, for it is particularly fatiguing to the organ of speech. [IV – IV – 21]

2) After gaining knowledge through Sravanam – Pragyam Kurvita:

- Maya you practice “Nididhyasanam”, which is meditation Vidhi.
- After learning from Guru, may you practice Nididhyasanam.
- Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:
  Pramanam for – Sravanam not enough, meditation to be done.
- Meditation alone gives final liberating knowledge.
- Upanishad supporting Purva Pakshi alone.
- Sravanat na Jnanam, Nididhyasanam eva Jnanam.

**Purva Pakshi:**
- Liberating knowledge only in meditation.
- Sureshvaracharya gives one sloka and everything of Purva Pakshi goes away.

**Revision:**
- As part of Jnana Karma Samuchhaya Vada Khandanam, Sureshvaracharya is introducing 2 Purva Pakshi’s in this portion of verse 67.
- By negating them, Sureshvaracharya is establishing main teaching in Naishkarmya Siddhi:

  By clear understanding of Vedantic teaching, liberation can be obtained.

  ![Diagram](image)

  - 2 components
    - Clear understanding of Mahavakya
    - Nothing else required other than clear understanding for liberation.

- No meditation required for Moksha.

**Purva Pakshi:**
- Clear understanding not enough for liberation.
• Non-liberating knowledge of Sravanam has to be converted to liberating knowledge by long meditation.

• Mind gets Bavana Samskara, Upajayaha, boosting.

• When conversion process is going on, practice Nitya, Naimittika Karma.

2 Purva Pakshi

- Clear understanding is non-liberating knowledge.
- Prescribes Nitya, Naimittika Karma.
- Only Penultimate knowledge.
- Gives relational knowledge, sentential knowledge.
- Brahman has relationship with other entities.
- Require non-relational Brahma Jnanam.

- Ultimate knowledge, realisation, enlightenment, Sakshatkara happens in meditation.
- Go through Nitya Naimittika Karma.

• 2nd, 3rd, 4th Chapter: Elaborate explanation by Sureshvaracharya.

• Hence one verse 67.

Asya Paksha Dvayasya Nivruttaye:

• Refutation of both meditation philosophers in following verse.
Verse 67:

Knowledge that arises from scripture on its first appearance destroys ignorance which manifests in the form of the instruments of action. Hence there is no combination of these two. [Verse 67]

a) Agama Jnanam:
   - Vedanta Jnanam, Mahavakya Vichara Jnanam.

b) Mridnathi:
   - Destroyed.

1st Purva Pakshi – Negated:
   - Knowledge born out of Jivatma / Paramatma Aikyam instantly destroys ignorance.
   - Birth – becomes dust.
   - Ignorance which sustains Vritti – Kriya – Karaka – duality is destroyed.
   - Dvaitam alone cause of insecurity Dvi Atmai Bayam Bavati.
   - In sleep, never insecure.
   - Insecurity and Samsara starts when you wake up.
Clear understanding enough to get Moksha.

2nd Purva Pakshi – Negated:

- Generally sentence gives relational knowledge Dvaita Jnanam.
- In exceptional cases, sentence can give non – relational Advaita Jnanam also.
- Without meditation, by Analysis of sentence can get non-relational knowledge, final knowledge.
- Agama Jnanam = Non-relational knowledge.
- Chapter 2, 3, deals with this.
- Mahavakyam, exceptional sentence.
- Pure absolute Brahma Jnanam can be gained in Sravanam itself without going to meditation, Samadhi.
c) Sakrut Pravrtya Mridnati:
- This knowledge will destroy ignorance and Samsara through one operation, stroke.
- No repetition required.

Example:
- India won cricket match.
- No Avritti, repetition required.
- Sakrut Pravrtya – At 1st moment.

Example:
- Darkness goes when lamp lit.
- No mystic experience required.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jnanam</th>
<th>Ajnanam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Subjective case</td>
<td>Objective, accusative case</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

d) Ataha, No Sangyatvam – Anayoho:
- No Samuchhaya between Karma and Jnanam.

Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:
- Why Srotavyaha, Mantavyaha, Nididhyasitavyaha?
- 12,000 verses of Sureshvaracharya Vartikam.
- Meditation, not source of any knowledge – material or spiritual.
- Any knowledge comes by appropriate instrument of knowledge.
- Without instrument, it is imagination, intuition not knowledge.
Shad Pramanani – 6 Sources

(1) Pratyaksha

(2) Anumana

(3) Upamana

(4) Arthapatti

(5) Anupalabdhi

(6) Shabda

Shabda

Laukika

- Physics

Vedanta

- Mahavakya
- For spiritual knowledge
- Analyse Tat, Tvam Pada is Pramana operation.
- Ultimate source for Atma Jnanam.

- Mantavyaha and Nididhyasitavya not after Sravanam but for effective Sravanam.
- 2 obstacles in Intellect.
- Mananam and Nidhyasanam for mental block removal.
- In effective listening alone can get final liberating knowledge, Sakshatkara.
Mental Blocks

- Any knowledge from book has to be nonfinal knowledge.
- Convert book knowledge into realisation.
- Through meditation get final realisation.

Sureshvaracharya:
- Vedanta is different type of knowledge, subjective, not objective.

Nididhyasanam

- Removes habit of self Judgement based on body, mind conditions.
- I am Atma, ever free, not mind.
- I have no problems as Atma, Chaitanyam.
- No anger.

- With self-judgement based on Anatma, I can’t claim liberation in 1000 Janmas, greatest Viparita Bavana.

Vedanta Sara:
- 6th Kosha = All relations.
- Remove 2 blocks and listen to Mahavakya and you will be free.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sravanam</th>
<th>Mananam, Nididhyasanam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Angi, primary Mukhyam.</td>
<td>- Angam, support, secondary.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Upa Jeevi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
So far, the combination of knowledge and ritualistic action was refuted on the ground that Brahman is non-dual. Now, even if another view [according to which Brahman is one as well as dual] is accepted, we will show that we cannot, as earlier, have any faith in the rejected [combination theory]. [Introduction - Verse 68]

Verse 67:

- Bavana Vedi – philosopher.

Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

- Mananam and Nididhyasanam for effective Sravanam, for Sravanam, not after Sravanam.

New Purva Pakshi:

- Eka Shastra Vadi, Nana Rasa Brahma Vadi.
- Dissatisfied with Dvaitam and Advaitam.
Both have partial Vision, blind.
New Purva Pakshi gives equal importance to both.
Accept both Dvaitam and Advaitam.
Unity in Diversity.

Example:
- One India, many states, districts.
- One body, many limbs proposed by Bartru Prapancha.

I) Advaitin:
- Metaphysical consequences based on Advaitam.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dvaitam</th>
<th>Advaitam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Purva Mimamsaka</td>
<td>Uttara Mimamsa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasises Veda Purva</td>
<td>Emphasis Vedanta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ignores Vedanta</td>
<td>Ignores Veda Purva.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Veda – Shastra Dvaya Vadina

Veda Purva
- Karma Khanda

Veda Anta
- Jnana Khanda
Anubandha Chatushtayam:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Karma Khanda</th>
<th>Jnana Khanda</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i) Adhikari:</td>
<td>- Raagi</td>
<td>- Viragi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Candidate</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii) Vishaya:</td>
<td>- Anityam</td>
<td>- Nityam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Subject matter</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii) Sambandha:</td>
<td>- Chodaya – Chodaka Sambanda</td>
<td>- Pratipadya – Pratipadaka</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Relationship</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iv) Prayojanam:</td>
<td>- Anityam</td>
<td>- Nityam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Benefit</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- One Veda – Addressing 2 different groups of people, distinct Audience, can’t combine Shastram, Samuchhaya never possible, our Vehement argument.

II) Dvaitin: Eka Shastra Vadis:

- Both Karma Khanda and Jnana Khanda given by one Bagawan.
- Addressing one Hindu Veidika group.
- Existed before and during Shankaras time.
- Proposed by Bartru Prapancha, Visishta Advaitam is evolution of Eka Shastra Vada.
- Rama Raya Kavi – wrote Shankara Ramanuja Bashya Vimarshaha – comparison between Shankara and Ramanujas commentaries on Brahma Sutras Bashyams.
• In Introduction he analyses Veda Eka, Shastra or Shastra Dvayava?
• Elaborate analysis.

**Sureshvaracharya:**
• In this portion, taking on Eka Shastra Vada.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Karma Khanda</th>
<th>Jnana Khanda</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Jiva – Worshipper</td>
<td>- Abheda exists between</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Bheda is subject matter.</td>
<td>- Aikyam, nondifference.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Veda Purva</td>
<td>- Veda Anta.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• What is the relationship between Jivatma and Paramatma?
  o Not Bheda – difference – Dvaitin.
  o Not Abheda – Advaitin – Aikyam.

• Bheda – Abheda is the relationship between Jivatma and Paramatma.
• Brahman – World – Dvaita – Advaita relationship.

**Idiom:**
• Nana Rasam Brahma - mix of Dvaitam – Advaitam.
• Unity in Diversity.

**Which is real?**
• Both real, real unity in real diversity.
Advaita:

- Real unity in apparent diversity.

Consequences:

i. Dvaitam – Advaitam.
ii. Bheda – Abheda

- Therefore continue both, combination alone gives liberation.
- Grihasta Ashrama alone valid, Sanyasa invalid, given up thread.
- 6.30 PM – 8.30 PM – Advaitam
- 9.00 PM – onwards Dvaitam.
Verses 68 – 79 : 12 Verses
Eka Shastra Purva Vadina Khandanam :
Verse 68 : Introduction

Evam tāvad anānātve brahmaṇi jñāna-karmaṇoh samuccayo nirakṛtaḥ. athādhunā paksāntarābhhyupagamenāpi pratyavasthāne pūrva-vad anāśvāso yathā tathābhidhiyate

So far, the combination of knowledge and ritualistic action was refuted on the ground that Brahman is non-dual. Now, even if another view [according to which Brahman is one as well as dual] is accepted, we will show that we cannot, as earlier, have any faith in the rejected [combination theory]. [Introduction – Verse 68]

a) Evam Tavatu :
   • In this manner, until now.

b) Jnana Karma Samuchhaya Nirakruta :
   • Negated Samuchhaya, assuming Brahman is Advaitam.

c) Nanatve Brahmani :
   • Our Siddanta.

d) Atha Adhuna :
e) Pakshantara Abhyugamanam:
• Bartru – Prapancha – Shankaracharya, Abhugamane, Assumes is valid.

f) Api Pratya Vasthane Sati:
• If there is objection, challenge from such a Purva Pakshi, how logical problem, logical discomfort, intellectual discomfort will arise.
• These falacies are clearly explained.

g) Tatha Abidiyate:
• In such a manner, I will teach you.

Verse 68:

अनुत्सारित-नानात्वं ब्रह्म यस्यापि वादिनः ।
तन्मेतनापि दुस्साध्यो ज्ञानकर्मसमुच्चयः ॥ ६८ ॥

anutsārita-nānātvaṁ brahma yasyāpi vādinaḥ
tan-matenāpi dus-sādhyo jñāna-karma-samuccayaḥ

The combination of knowledge and ritualistic action cannot be established even according to the view of the disputants who hold that Brahman is not free from plurality. [Verse 68]

Who is Purva Pakshi?
• Eka Shastra Vadi.

a) Mate Api – Anusarita Nanatvam Brahma Vadina:
• In their matam, plurality continues to exist.
• Utsaritam = Negated.
• Anusaritam = Not negated = present.
• Nondual Brahman, unity in which plurality diversity also exists.
• Plurality is as real as Brahman.
• Advaitin also says there is plurality but plurality is Mithya.

Eka Vadi:
• Dvaita Prapancha also Satyam existing in Advaitam Brahman.
• Svagata Bheda exists in Brahman.
• Therefore called Dvaita – Advaita Samuchhaya (Mixture) Vadi.

Sureshvaracharya:
• From the standpoint of Eka Shastra Philosopher also, Jnana – Karma Samucchaya, combination of 2 formats – Jiva / Jagat / Ishvara – Karma Yoga format and Atma – Anatma Jnana Yoga format.
• Combination is not possible (Dus-Sadhya).
Verse 69 – Introduction :

The alternatives in the [above] theory are stated for the purpose of their refutation separately. [Introduction – Verse 69]

**Negation in 3 levels**

- **Bheda Paksha Vichara**: Me and Ishvara different
- **Abheda Paksha Vichara**: Me and Ishvara identical
- **Bheda – Abheda Paksha Vichara**: Identity in difference

- All 3 angles, it won't work.
- Vikalpaha, dividing Purva Pakshi into 3 portions so that negation becomes easier.
- Dividing rule, method of weakening Purva Pakshi and for clarity in understanding.

**a) Tasya Vibhaga Goptihi :**
- I am going to talk about 3 divisions of Purva Pakshi.

**b) Dushana Vibhaga Pragyanaptaye :**
- For clear understanding and refutation.
Sureshvaracharya asks question to Eka Shastra Vadi:

Clearly tell me

- Is Jivatma identical with Paramatma
- Is Jivatma different than Paramatma

a) Brahma Atmava Bavet?
   - Jivatma (Atma) and Paramatma (Brahmatma) identical in 3 periods of time.

b) Yadiva:
   - Otherwise.

c) Tasya – Anatma Rupakam Va?
   - Anatma means Jiva is different from Paramatma, separate from Jivatma.
   - Before Sadhana what is your assumption?
   - Is Jiva different or same as Paramatma?
• Otherwise Journey useless.
• If you don’t know Delhi is in north or south and you travel west, journey useless.
• **If you want to attain Ishvara first tell me:**

   Is Ishvara

   Different from Jiva?

   Identical to Jiva?

   Karma is utterly useless in either case.

   Use your grey matter, Jnana – Karma Samucchaya useless.

**d) Atma Aneptaptihi Bavet:**

• Suppose you assume.
• Jivatma and Paramatma are identical, one and same, fundamental principle before Sadhana.
• Ishvara can never be lost by me, I am Ishvara.
• Ishvara can never be my goal because it is already myself.
• No question of fighting Vaikunta Ekadasi – Parama Pada Vasal, attain Shukla Gathi for reaching Vaikunta.
• If Ishvara is goal, it is because of delusion and ignorance.
• We crave for Bagawan in delusion, sincere wish after 25 years study of Vedanta.
• Sheer delusion, misunderstanding.
• You can attain God only in one way, remove notion, know Ishvara not my goal.
• Delusion caused by ignorance, ignorance removed only by Jnanam.
• Jnanam alone means of attaining Brahman, if Brahman is self.
• Karma can’t remove delusion, Karma Re-inforces delusion.
• Doing more Sadhana vigorously, after voluntary retirement no use.
• Atma Aneptihi, non-attainment, Paramatma is Mohat Bavet.
• Karma has no role to play, Ignorance goes only by Jnanam.

Kaivalya Upanishad:

न कर्मणा न प्रजयः धनेन त्यागेनैके अमृतत्वमानश: ||
परेन नाकं निहितं गुहायं विभ्राजते यदत्यो विशान्ति || 3-11

Not by work, nor by progeny, nor by wealth, but by renunciation alone, Immortality is attained. Higher than heaven, seated in the cave of the intellect. It shines, which the seekers attain. [Verse 3]

• Karma irrelevant if Jivatma and Paramatma identical.

2nd Option:

• If Jivatma and Paramatma are different, Jivatma is finite, Paramatma is infinite, finite can never become infinite by Karma.
• Karma useless because it can’t convert finite to infinite.
• If Jivatvam my essential nature, I can never drop it and attach to Brahman.
Logic:

- If Jivatvam, finitude is my essential nature, I can never lose my essential nature and attain Brahmavatvam, infinitude.
- Don’t waste time doing Karma for Moksha.
- Karmano Moksha Neiva Sambavati.

e) Itarasya Api Atmanaha:

- If Brahman is different from Jivatma and Brahman is Anatma, then also Karmano Anaptihi Bavet.

- If essentially finite, can’t become infinite.
- One must be infinite to be free from sorrow.

Diagram:

```
   Ishvara
      /   \
     /     \
Identical to Jiva  Different to Jiva

- Karma can’t take me to Ishvara.
- Can’t go to Vaikunta sit under his feet.

- Karma can’t give Ishvaratvam.
```
Now, if Brahman is really attained in view of its being of the nature of the Self, it is only the veil of the demoniac delusion that is the cause of its non-attainment. With regard to this view, [this has to be said]. [Introduction – Verse 70]

Purva Pakshi:

- How do you Vedantin talk about Moksha?
- Karma can’t give Moksha by identity or difference.

Vedantin:

- I talk about Moksha through Jnanam, not through Karma.
- I have no problem.
- You bring Karma as Moksha Sadhanam which has logical fallacy.
- You think you are bound, but you know you are liberated in my philosophy.
- In your philosophy you think you are bound and you think you are liberated in your philosophy which is pure imagination not a fact.
• In my philosophy, you know, you don’t require any Sadhana is the Sadhana.

a) Tatra Yadi Tavatu :
• If we assume 1st possibility.

b) Vastave Neiva Vrittena :
• In reality in terms of essential nature, factually.

c) Brahmapraptam :
• Brahman is already accomplished by me as I the Atma.
• My real nature, if 1st option is accepted by us.

d) Atma Svatavyat :
• Freedom being my very nature.

e) Svarupam It Artaha :
• If freedom is my real nature, my problem is, this real nature is concealed because of my extroverted nature, all the time, running after peace, security, happiness for Moksha.
• This extrovertedness is caused by ignorance alone is the problem.

f) Asura Moha Vidhanam Matram :
• Only concealment, veiling, covering, delusion I have to attain Karma, Sadhyo Mukti in 2018, 2020.
• This delusion caused by Asuram, natural to materialist, extrovert going in search of things outside.
Katho Upanishad:

The self-existent (Brahma) created the senses with outgoing tendencies; therefore, man beholds the external universe and not the internal Self (Atman). But only some wise man desirous of Immortality, with eyes averted (turned within and with his senses turned away) from sensual objects, sees the Atman within. [II – I – 1]

- Jiva goes outside also for Ishvara – for peace, security, happiness.
- Runs after Ishvara, all the time saying Ishvara is in me.
- Asura Moha Vidhanam comes in form of delusion caused by extrovertedness.
- That alone is Anapti Nimittam, cause of non-attainment of Moksha.
- Delusion alone cause of non-attainment of Brahman / Moksha.
- No Karma (Veidica / Laukika) will remove delusion.
- Chanting Vishnu Sahasranamam, information on new year talk in morning or evening, doubt, will not go.
- Fundamental fact missed.

Sureshvaracharya:

- You require understanding “Aham Brahma Asmi”.
- Nothing else required other than understanding.

g) Tasmin Pakshe Tarhi:

- In that case, you require simple understanding – peace, security, happiness is me only.
Verse 70:

Ritualistic actions can never be the means to the removal of the veil of delusion. Since the result can be attained by knowledge alone, ritualistic action is futile there. [Verse 70]

a) Moha Api Dhana Bangaya:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Moha</th>
<th>Api</th>
<th>Dhana</th>
<th>Bangaya</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Delusion</td>
<td>Dropped</td>
<td>Covering</td>
<td>For eliminating, removing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ignorance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

b) Ane Neiva Karmanam:

- You do any amount of Karma, it will not remove ignorance.
- Puja, Japa, Paramapadam.
- Karma never cause.

c) Jnana Phala Avapte:

- Only by understanding Mahavakya Vichara during Sravanam... meditation later...
- Karma not useless – but Karma can’t take you to Brahman.
- Karma useful for many things other than attaining Brahman.
- For preparing mind to come to class, reaching classroom, requires Karma.
• Example: Learn music 7 years to know I will not get music.
• To understand limitation of Karma, Karma is required, not for attaining Brahman.

d) Brahma Prapti Vishaya Nirarthakam:
• All Veidika, Laukika Karmas in vain, futile, redundant, waste.

Revision:
• Sureshvaracharya refutes combination of Karma and Jnanam for liberation.
• Bartru Prapancha Acharya, Eka Shastra Vada, Nana Rasa Brahma Vada, Bheda – Abheda Vada, Jnana Karma Samuchhaya Vada.
• 4 Refer to one group.
• Verse 68 onwards, refutation of this philosophy...
• For negation, Sureshvaracharya divides argument in 3 stages.

3 Stages of Argument

- Bheda Paksha
- Abheda Paksha
- Behda – Abheda Ubaya Paksha

Assume:
- Jivatma and Paramatma different.
- Jivatma and Paramatma are identical.

Assume:
- Jivatma and paramatma are identical (Tamil Nadu and India) and also different (Tamil Nadu only part not total India).

• Paksha means stand.
• In all 3, Karma can’t contribute to liberation, Karma Na Moksha Sadhanam.
• Therefore Karma can’t be combined, need not be combined.

Verse 69 : Question :
• Do you believe Brahman is different or identical with Jiva?
• Either way, you have problem.

I) Abheda Paksha :
• Let us assume Jiva and Brahman are identical.
• Because of ignorance there is difference between Jiva and Brahman.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Identity</th>
<th>Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Fact</td>
<td>- Delusion, misconception.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Actually, I am Brahman.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- I assume I am Jiva.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Notional difference only.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Notion dropping process required.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Notion problem at intellectual level, can’t be solved by Karma.
• Moha Abidana, concealment, veiling of Brahman can’t be removed by Karma.
• Therefore only Jnanam required.
• For Abheda Paksha, Karma can’t work.

II) Bheda Paksha :
• Let us assume Jiva is different than Brahman.
• Then, is Karma useful for attaining Brahma Bava?
**Introduction - Verse 71 :**

**anātma-rūpake tu brahmanī na karma sādhana-bhāvaṁ pratipadyate
nāpi jñānam karma-samuccitam asamuccitaṁ vā
yasmād anyasya svata eva sādhakasya brahmaṇo 'py anyatvaṁ
dsāvata eva siddham. tatraivam**

If, on the other hand, Brahman is not of the nature of the Self, ritualistic action cannot be the means [to the attainment of Brahman]. Nor can knowledge, either combined or not combined with ritualistic action, be the means [thereunto]. The reason is that to the aspirant, who is by his very nature other than [Brahman], Brahman also of its own accord is different from him. Here it is thus. [Introduction – Verse 71]

- Important, significant idea here our approach to spiritual Sadhana will be clear only if fundamentals of Vedanta are clearly grasped.

**a) Anatma Rupa Vatu Brahmani :**

- Suppose Brahman is Anatma.
- I am Atma, subject I, self, and Brahman is different from me, anything different from me is called Anatma.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I</th>
<th>Brahman</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Atma</td>
<td>- Different from Jiva, Anatma.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
b) Karma Sadhnena Bavam Na Pratipadyate:

- Jivas essential nature is finitude, Jivatvam, Samsaritvam.
- By any amount of Sadhana, can never get asamsaritvam, Brahma Bava.
- Spend time in worldly accomplishment, don’t waste your time for Moksha.
- Finite entity can never attain Moksha by becoming infinite.
- 4 Types of spiritual Sadhanas possible.
- All 4 will not lead to Moksha.
- Karma can’t convert finite Jiva into infinite Brahman because Brahman essentially infinite, Jiva essentially finite.
- In such condition Jiva can’t become Brahman, by Karma.
- Karma can’t give Moksha.

I) Na Api Jnanam:

- By any amount of spiritual enlightenment, finite Jiva getting knowledge of himself can’t become Brahman.
- What is knowledge?
- I am finite, Samsari, Jnanam reinforces Samsara, I am more intensely aware of my Samsara.
- **Example:**
  Knowing medical name of disease does not improve situation.
- Will only intensely know problems I have Jnanam can’t give Moksha.
III) Bheda – Abheda Pakshya:

- Karma Samuchittam Jnanam and Karma Asamuchittam Jnanam.

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{Jnanam} & \\
\text{Options} & \\
\text{Mixed with Karma} & \text{Karma unmixed, pure Jnanam} \\
\text{Karma can’t give Moksha} & \text{Jnanam can’t give Moksha} \\
\quad \text{- Pure Jnanam does not give Moksha.} & \quad \text{- Karma re-inforced Jnanam can’t give Moksha.}
\end{align*}
\]

- If Jiva is different from Brahman, whatever you do, Samsara will continue, will go to Vaikunta also as Jiva.
- Jiva in Vaikunta, Samsari only.
- Samsari Jiva closely seated with Asamsari Ishvara.
- If Jiva essentially different from Brahman, knowledge can’t give liberation.
Why? Reason?

Sadhanas essential nature can’t be given up.

Definition of essential nature:
What can’t be given up is essential nature.

Chaitanya Svarupam / Brahma Svarupam.

Svataha, intrinsically different by any amount of Sadhana, you do, finite can’t become infinite.

Samsari can’t become Asamsari by a process.

Similarly, Brahman being essentially different from Sadhana, can’t become finite.

Both have essential, intrinsic, different natures.

Finite Jiva can’t become infinite Brahman.

Infinite Brahman can’t become finite Jiva.

Interchange not possible.

Upadesha Sahashri – Chapter 1 – Nanyad Anyat Prakaranam.

One thing can’t become another.

Svataha Eva Siddham.

Verse 71 – Introduction:

This being so.

No logical reason possible w.r.t. one becoming another.
Verse 71:

Nowhere is there a cause by which one object can become another. When an object remains what it is, it cannot be [another]. Also, when it ceases to be, it cannot become another. [Verse 71]

a) Anyasya Anyatmata Praptou:

- One can’t become another logically.
- Moksha never possible.
- Suppose one says Jiva becomes Brahman through some Sadhana, essentially different from Brahman, by doing Sadhana becomes Brahman.

2 Questions

Does Jiva become Brahman retaining Jiva Bavana?

Does Jiva becomes Brahman after giving up Jiva Bavana.

Assume 1st Option:

- Jiva becomes Brahman retaining Jiva Bava.
Problem:
- Finite Jiva can’t become infinite Brahman retaining its finitude.
- Becoming Brahman will be useless.
- Retaining Samsaritvam, no use becoming Brahman, upgradation useless.
- Crying Jiva or crying Brahman no difference.

Assume 2nd Option:
- Jiva becomes Brahman dropping Jiva Bava / Dropping Jiva / Status.
- Suppose Jiva drops Jiva status, Jiva itself gone, destruction of Jiva, Jiva Bava gone, then who becomes Brahman?
- No Jiva becomes liberated.
- No Jiva to appreciate, enjoy liberation.
- Can’t say Jiva got Mukti.
- Jiva not there to claim Brahma Bava, Moksha.
- 2nd option ruled out.
- Can’t say, Jiva drops Jiva Bava, becomes Brahman, attains Brahman.
- Jiva can’t become Brahman retaining Jiva Bava or dropping Jiva Bava.
- No Sadhana for Moksha, no Jnanam, no Karma or Samuchhaya for Moksha if Jiva and Brahman are different essentially.
- Sureshvaracharya thus refutes Bheda – Abheda Vadi.
- In Advaitam, how it happens?
• I am Brahman, I alone attain Brahma Bava.
• No question of Jiva becoming Brahman.

Question:
• If I am Brahman, why attain Brahma Bava, status?
• I – Brahman, attain Brahma Bava by dropping notion I am Jiva.
• I – Brahman attain Brahma Bava. Not I – Jiva attain Brahma Bava by dropping notion that I am Jiva.
• In Advaitam, Jiva does not become Brahman.
• Brahman is seemingly appearing as Jiva.

Brihadaranyaka Upanishad:

```veda
brahma vá idam agra āsít, tad ātmānam evāvet, aham brahmāsmīti:
tasmāt tat sarvam abhavat, tad yo yo devānām prayābhyata,
sa eva tad abhavat, tathā rśiṇām, tathā manuṣyāṇām. taddhaitat paśyan
rśir vāma-devaḥ pratipede, aham manur abhavaṁ sūryaś ceti,
tad idam api etarhi ya evam veda, aham brahmāsmīti sa idarī sarvam bhavati;
tasya ha na devās ca nābhūtyā īśate, ātmā hy eṣāṁ sa bhavati.
atha yo anyāṁ devatāṁ upāste, anyo'sau anyo' ham asmīti, na sa veda;
yathā paśur, evam sa devānāṁ; yathā ha vai bahavaḥ paśavo manuṣyam
bhuṇjyuh, evam ekaikāḥ pruṣo devān bhunakti; ekasmīnn eva paśāv
ādiyamānē priyam bhavati, kim u bahuṣu? tasmād eṣāṁ tan na priyam
yad etan manuṣyāḥ vidyāḥ  || 10  ||
```
This (self) was indeed Brahman in the beginning. It knew only Itself as, ‘I am Brahman.’ Therefore It became all. And whoever among the gods knew It also became That; and the same with sages and men. The sage Vamadeva, while realising this (self) as That, knew, ‘I was Manu, and the sun.’ And to this day whoever in like manner knows It as, ‘I am Brahman,’ becomes all this (universe). Even the gods cannot prevail against him, for he becomes their self. While he who worships another god thinking, ‘He is one, and I am another,’ does not know. He is like an animal to the gods. As many animals serve a man, so does each man serve the gods. Even if one animal is taken away, it causes anguish, what should one say of many animals? Therefore it is not like by them that men should know this. [I – IV – 10]

- Mahavakya Mantra – Very elaborate Bashyam.
- Never say Jiva becomes Brahman.
- Brahman seemingly becomes Brahman by dropping Jiva Bava.

b) Jivaha Tasmin Satya Api Nashtaha Api No Prati Padyate:
- Jiva never becomes (Prapadyate) Antar Atman Brahman, retaining Jiva Bavaha (Tasmin Sati).

c) Nashtaha Api:
- By dropping Jiva Bava also, Jiva can never become Brahman.
- If you say Jiva and Brahman are different, drop all efforts for Moksha.
- No 4 Purusharthas, 3 enough, spend time in Dharma, Artha, Kama.
- Don’t work for Moksha, Jiva can never attain Moksha.
Introduction – Verse 72:

\[
\text{aparasmiṁs tu pakṣe vidhiḥ}
\]

\[
\text{paramātmānukūlena jñānābhyāsena duḥkhinah}
\]

\[
dvaitino 'pi pramucyeran na parātma-virodhīnā \]

But in the case of yet another view, there is scope for injunction [about meditation]. [Introduction - Verse 72]

Even dualists who experience suffering will be liberated through the practice of meditation [on the jiva] as the supreme Self, but not through that [knowledge of difference] which is contrary to the nature of supreme Self. [Verse 72]

- Sureshvaracharya taking another possible approach.

**Topic:**

- If Jiva and Brahman are different, Bheda Paksha.. Any amount of Sadhana including Karma for Moksha is impossible.
- Jiva can’t become Brahman.
- Same topic, different approach.
- In Shastra, we have Upasana and through Upasana Jiva can become Paramatma.
- By practice of Abheda Upasana, Aham Graha Upasana, Jiva can merge into Brahman.
Gita:

• Whatever you think at time of death, you become that in next Janma.
• Thinking of deer, become deer.
• Thinking of Lord all the time, become Lord.

Sureshvaracharya:

• Logically not possible even if Shastra says.
• Through Upasana Jiva really does not become Paramatma.
• Jiva only goes to Brahma Loka.
• In Brahman Loka, Jiva gets Jnanam, I am already paramatma, drops Jiva Bava Notion.

Sureshvaracharya : Abyupethya Vada
• Let us assume Jiva becomes Paramatma by Upasana.
• Aham Paramatma Asmi, throughout life meditates.

Gita :

| प्रयाणकाले मनसासंचलने  | prayāṇaḥkālē manasācalēna |
| भक्त्या युक्तो योगबलेन चेव  | bhaktyā yuktō yōgabalēna caiva |
| भ्रूवोर्मध्ये प्राणमावेशय सम्यक्  | bhruvōrmadhhyē prāṇam āvēśya samyak |
| स तं परं पुरुषमापति दिव्यम् । । | sa tām param puruṣam upāiti divyam ॥ ॥8-10॥ |

At the time of death, with an unshaken mind full of devotion, by the power of yoga fixing the whole prana (breath) between the two eye brows, he the seeker, reaches the Supreme resplendent Purusha. [Chapter 8 – Verse 10]

• By Upasana, assume by imagination of Aikyam, Bheda Jiva becomes Abheda invoking Paramatma after death.
• What he requires is Jnana Abhyasa, not Jnana Karma Samuchhhaya.
• Jnana Abheda Dhyanam is required not Karma because Karma and Jnanam are opposed to each other.
• Finite Jiva has to invoke only superior Brahma Bava, but spend whole time to perform Veidika Karma, he has to invoke Jiva Bavaha.
Sureshvaracharya : Abyupethya Vada

- Let us assume Jiva becomes Paramatma by Upasana.
- Aham Paramatma Asmi, throughout life meditates.

Gita :

> प्रयाणकाले मनसास्त्रचलनेन
> भक्त्या युक्तो योगबलनेन चैव।
> भ्रुवोर्मध्ये प्राणमाणवेश्य सम्यक्स्तं परं पुरुषमुपैति दिव्यम्।

> prayāṇakālē manasācalēna
> bhaktyā yuktō yōgabalēna caiva |
> bhruvōrmadhīye prāṇam āvēśya samyak
> sa tam param puruṣam upāiti divyam ||8-10||

At the time of death, with an unshaken mind full of devotion, by the power of yoga fixing the whole prana (breath) between the two eye brows, he the seeker, reaches the Supreme resplendent Purusha. [Chapter 8 – Verse 10]

- By Upasana, assume by imagination of Aikyam, Bheda Jiva becomes Abheda invoking Paramatma after death.
- What he requires is Jnana Abhyasa, not Jnana Karma Samuchhaya.
- Jnana Abheda Dhyanam is required not Karma because Karma and Jnanam are opposed to each other.
- Finite Jiva has to invoke only superior Brahma Bava, but spend whole time to perform Veidika Karma, he has to invoke Jiva Bavaha.
• Abheda Dhyanam requires invocation of Asamsari Brahma Bavaha.
• How can you combine Asamsari Brahma Bava and Samsari Jiva Bava?

a) Aparasmitu Pakshe Vidhi:
• Suppose we take concessional stand.
• Jiva becomes Brahman by Upasana, finite becomes infinite after death.
• In this case also,

b) Jnana Abhyasena:
• By practice of Jnanam, knowledge, invocation of Brahman nature in self, Jiva Abheda Upasana.

c) Paramatma Anukulena:
• Conducive to Brahma Aikyam in future, conclusive to future merger.

d) Dukhinaha Dvaitinaha:
• Dvaitins accept Jiva – Brahma Bheda now, Samsari at present.
• After death, remove Samsari Bava and attain Asamsari Bava, Brahma Bava.
• After death, Moksha may come.
• Philosophy of Visishta Advaita.
• Now Samsari, go to Vaikunta Loka, (not attain Jnanam), Brahma Bava attained as a result of Upasana itself.
• Temporarily become Iyengars!
• Abheda Upasnena Brahma Prapti.
In the case of the other view (which holds that the jiva is identical with Brahman), there is no scope at all for injunction. Why? [Introduction – Verse 73]

• Goes back to Abheda Paksha now.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bheda</th>
<th>Abheda Paksha</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Paksha</td>
<td>- Verse 70, 73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Verse 71, 72</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Let Jiva and Brahman be one and same.

One Argument:

• Don’t require Karma to unite them, only drop notion I am different than Brahman.
• Some more Arguments here.

a) *Itarasmin Tu Pakshe Vidhe Reva Anavaktashatvam – Katham?*

• In Abheda Paksha, there is no scope for prescribing any Sadhan at all.
• If Jiva is already Brahman, no scope for prescribing any Sadhana for Moksha – Vide Reva.
• Jnana Viddhi, Karma Viddhi, Sanyasa Viddhi – Katham?
• Not problem – at all.
Verse 73:

Tell me. Where is the need for action on the part of a person who sees everything as non-different from himself, who remains only as Brahman, and who is all, collectively as well as individually? [Verse 73]

- In the Abheda Vada, according to Eka Shastra Vadi, I am one will Brahman.
- What is nature of Brahman?
- In his philosophy, no Paramartika Nirguna Brahman.
- Brahman – Real, world real, included in Brahman.
- Brahman is one, which includes everything.
- Unity in Diversity.
  \[\downarrow \quad \downarrow\]
  Real \quad Real
- One Brahman in which everything is included, Eka – Aneka Rupam.

Technical:

a) Samashtam, Vyastha Butaha:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Totality</th>
<th>Unity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Diversity</td>
<td>Individuality</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• Once I get Jnanam, I know I am Brahman – What type of Brahman?
• Which Brahman is everything in form of Samastha – Vyastha.
• Whole Cosmos included in Brahman.
• 4 Purusharthas included in Brahman.
• I have recognised, I am that Brahman.

**Sureshvaracharya Asks:**

• With this knowledge, I am Brahman in whom everything is already there, what Karma should I do to attain such a Brahman.
• I want to reach America, therefore want to travel.
• I am Brahman, America is in me, no travel required, no Karma to reach America.
• Vaikunta included in me.
• After Abheda Jnanam, what type of Karma is required?

**Karma has 4 results**

- **Aapti**
- **Utpatti**
- **Samskara**
- **Vikara**

• All included in Brahman.
• Why Samucchaya, Shukla Gathi?
• Vaikunta in me, no Karma required.
Revision:

- Eka Shastra Vadi, Entire Veda is one Shastram.
- Every seeker has to follow Veda Purva + Vedanta Simultaneously.
- Jivatma / Paramatma – Bheda from Veda Purva Baga.
- Jivatma / Paramatma – Abheda from Veda Anta Baga.
- Accept both relationships as real, called Bheda – Abheda Vadi.
- Jnana Karma Samuchhaya introduced by him.

Refutation – 3 stages

- Bheda Paksha
  - Verse 71, 72
- Abheda Paksha
  - Verse 70, 73
- Bheda – Abheda Paksha

I) Bheda Paksha: Verse 71, 72

- If Jivatma / Paramatma – Essentially different, then Karma can’t change fact of difference.
- Jiva eternally Samsari, never can become Paramatma, going near Paramatma, no improvement.
- Sick person getting near healthy person, can’t experience good health.
- Bheda Paksha refuted in verse 71, 72.
Abheda Paksha : Refuted in Verse 70, 73

Verse 70 :

• If Jivatma + Paramatma – one and same, then difference caused by only ignorance, misconception.
• If misconception is problem, Karma can’t solve problem.
• Only Jnanam can solve problem of ignorance.

Verse 73 : Argument

• If you believe in Abheda Paksha, every Jnani must know I am one with Paramatma.
• In your Philosophy, Paramatma not Nirgunam Brahman but is totality of creation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>One</th>
<th>Many</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Totality standpoint</td>
<td>- From individual standpoint.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Samastham Rupaha</td>
<td>- Vyastham Rupaha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- India</td>
<td>- Tamilnadu.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Enjoying unity in Diversity.
• In Abheda Vada, knowledge must be – Aham Samastham, Vyastham Buta Brahma Asmi.

a) Brahmani Eva Avatishtataha :

• Wise man should have knowledge.
• Avatishtate – means abiding in Brahman.
• I am that Brahman which is one as total and has 14 Lokas in myself.
• All wealth of world is part of oneself.
• Everything belongs to one who is identical with Brahman.
• 4 Purushartha in Brahman.
• All Punyam in Brahman.
• I am Brahman, all inclusive all Purushartha attained, why do Karma as Jnana Karma Samuchhaya?
• Dharma, Artha, Kama, Moksha, Nondifferent from me, I am Brahman, Brahman is nonexclusive.
• Samastham Vyastham Jagat.
• For such a Jnani, Sarva Anyartha Darshina.
• All non-separate from him, all included in him.
• Everything Satyam.

For Advaitin:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Plurality</th>
<th>Brahman</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mithya</td>
<td>Satyam</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For Purva Pakshi:

• Satya Purushartha, Sarva Anyartham, Sarva Aikyam.
• Brahman is unity in Diversity.
• For such a Jnani, what Karma is there, what is motivation to do karma?
• Therefore your argument illogical.

b) Iti Bruta Mayam:

• Answer my question.
Introduction – Verse 74:

Since it becomes possible as well as impossible for one to perform all actions [on the view of non-difference between jiva and Brahman], there arises also [the defect] of mixing up all actions. [Introduction – Verse 74]

- Abheda Paksha Khandanam.

Another Problem:

- Jnani gains knowledge of Aham Brahma Asmi, like Advaitin.
- Brahman, all inclusive, 14 lokas in Brahman, entire humanity in Brahman, all Varnas, Ashramas in Brahman.
- I am total Brahman.
- What is Varna, Ashrama of that total Brahman?
- Is he Brahmana, Kshatriya, Vaishya, Shudra?
- Is he Brahmachari, Grihasta, Vanasprastha, Sanyasi? Samastham Brahma.
- All Veidika Karmas are based on designation of Yajamana.
- In Sandhya Vandanam, which Veda will he follow? Yajur, Rig, Sama?
- Karmas of Brahmana, Kshatriya, Vaishya, different.
• To do Karma, need to identify Varna, Ashrama, Gothra, and Veda.
• For Jnani, Varna Ashrama can’t be specified.

2 possibilities

- Have all Varna Ashramas.
  - Do all Karmas
  - Sarva Karma Sankara Dosha
  - Confusion in Karmas will be there.

- Can’t specify Varna Ashrama.
  - As Brahmana, no need to do Kshatriya Karma.
  - Don’t do any Karma.

• In Abheda Paksha, Jnana Karma Samuchhaya not possible.
• Jnani will have no Varna – Ashrama or all Varna Ashrama.
• Can’t have specific Varna, Ashrama.
• Jnani not individual but has Jnanam – Aham Sarva Atmaka Brahma.

a) Sarva Karma Nimitta :
  • Is condition for all Veidika Karmas – from one Angle.

b) Asambavabyam :
  • No Karma at all from another angle.
  • Can’t choose Karma is Dosha.
Verse 74:

sarva-jāty-ādi-mattve 'syā nitaraṁ hetv-asaṁbhavaḥ
viśeṣaṁ hy anupādāya karma naiva pravartate

For this person, who identifies himself with all castes, etc., there is no reason at all [for the performance of any ritualistic action]. Indeed, ritualistic action cannot take place at all in the absence of specification [such as caste, etc.]. [Verse 74]

2nd Option:

- Since no specific Varna Ashrama, can’t perform any Karma.

a) Sarva Karma Sankara Asya Jatyadi Madve:
   - For this Jnani, Aham Samastham – Vyastham Brahma, not Nirguna Brahma – iti Jnani.
   - He will possess all Jatis, 4 Varnas – and intermediaries.
   - Brahmana + Kshatriya – get Children.
   - Brahmana + Shudra – get Children.
   - Countless Jatis, duties prescribed.
   - Inter – religious marriages.

b) Na Itara Hetu Asambavaha:
   - Absolutely, there is no specific condition.
   - Hetu – designation – not possible, which body he will identify?
c) **Visesha Anupam Adaya**:
- 1\textsuperscript{st} line is complete sentence.
- Hetu Asambavaha Bavati.
- Totally not possible...
- If Jnani not possible...
- If Jnani can’t take any specific designation.

d) **Karma Neiva Pravartate**:
- Karma never possible.
- In inter-religious marriages, priest confused as to chant what Mantras?
- Gothra, Varna, Veda doesn’t exist for a foreigner.
- Takes over Brahma Gothram
- Veidika Karma requires designation.
- If Varna, Ashrama Dharma disappears, Veidika Karmas will not survive.
- Manu will Run.
If it be said that there is room for injunction [which enjoins the performance of karmas on the basis of eligibility], since there is identification with the body, it is not so for the following reason. [Introduction – Verse 75]

Bheda – Abheda Vadis Solution:

- Why can’t Jnani go by designation of his physical body?
- Date of Birth, parents, Varna / Ashrama.
- Adhyatma Abhimana, identify with his specific body.
- Devotees do Puja for Guru as per his Purva Ashrama Gothra.

a) Adhyatma Abhimanat:
- Based on identification on his own particular body.

b) Vidhi Syat:
- Yajur Veda Jnani, Yajur Veda Sandhya Vandanam.
- For Wise person, if such solution given.

c) Na Evam:
- Not possible.

d) Yasmat:
- Because of following reason.
- Why Jnani can’t do Karma based on Deha Abhimana?
Verse 75:

Also, identification with the body which is due to demoniac delusion is not possible for an enlightened person. If even an enlightened person be subject to demoniac delusion, Brahman-realization would be useless. [Verse 75]

Purva Pakshi Solution:

- Jnani based on Deha Abhimanam – is contradiction.
- Jnani – Definition:
  
  One who does not have Deha Abhimana.

- Jnanam and Ahamkara can’t coexist.
- Why not say.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Paramartika Drishti</th>
<th>Vyavaharika Drishti</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jnani</td>
<td>Ahamkara</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gita :</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pashyan, Srnvan...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[Chapter 5 – Verse 8]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Why can’t Purva Pakshi Say?

Only Advaitin can talk about 3 Drishti not Eka Shastra Vadi.

Advaitin:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jagrat</th>
<th>Svapna</th>
<th>Brahman</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vyavaharika Satyam</td>
<td>Pratibhasika Satyam</td>
<td>Paramartika Satyam</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Unreal / Bheda

Real / Abheda

Purva Pakshi:

- Paramartika Vyavaharika and Pratibasica equally real.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Paramartika</th>
<th>Vyavaharika</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Akarta</td>
<td>Karta</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Both equally
- No different orders

**Bheda Abheda and Visishta Advaitam**:
- Don’t have Pratibhasika Vyavaharika Bheda.
- Answer we give, they can’t give.
- Jnani, can’t have Ahamkara even from Vyavaharika Drishti because he does not accept Vyavahara.

**a) Vidusha**:
- For wise person.

**b) Adhyatma Abhimana**:
- Emphirical, Mithya, Ahamkara is not possible... why?

**c) Asura Sataha**:
- Because Ahamkara is born out of ignorance.
- Asura means Agyana Janyam, because Aham is born out of ignorance.
- You say he is Jnani, Jnani can’t have Ajnanam, can’t have Mithya Ahamkara.
- If no Ahamkara, where is Varna Ashrama Karma? How Samuchhaya?
For Arguments sake, let us assume Jnani has Ahamkara, and Agyanam, Hypothetical.

Both Jnanam and Ajnanam co-exist for Jnana – Karma Samuchharyartham.

d) Vidusha Api Asura Chet:

- If wise person also has Ajna Janya Ahamkara then what is consequence?
- Asura explained in introduction to verse 70.

| तत्र यदि तावत् वास्तवेनैव बृत्तेन ब्रह्म प्राप्तं आत्मस्वाभावायतूः | tatra yadi tāvad vāstavenai vṛttena brahma prāptam ātma-svābhāvyāt kevalam |
| केवलं आसुरमोहापिधानमात्रमेव अनासिनिमित्तं, | āsura-mohāpidhāna-mātram evānāpti-nimittam |
| तस्मिन् पक्षे। | tasmin pakṣe। |

Now, if Brahman is really attained in view of its being of the nature of the Self, it is only the veil of the demonic delusion that is the cause of its non-attainment. With regard to this view, [this has to be said]. [Introduction – Verse 70]

e) Brahma Darshanam Nishphalam Bavati:

- Then Brahma Jnanam becomes useless.
- One gains Jnanam for Ajnana Nivritti.
- If Jnanam and Ajnanam are going to co-exist, why should a person go after Jnanam after all.
- Use time for other purpose.
- Brahma Darshanam Nishphalam Bavati.
Introduction – Verse 76:

Sureshvaracharya has established following so far:

- Jnani can’t have Ajnanam, Ahamkara, Deha Abhimana, Varna-Ashrama designation, Veidika Karma, Jnana – karma Samuchhaya.
- Karma can’t join Jnanam – Sama-kalam, simultaneously or in Krama, one after another.
- Why Jnanam and Karma can’t be practiced simultaneously, parallely?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jnanam</th>
<th>Karma</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Drop body identification.</td>
<td>- Identify with Body.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- After Jnanam, ignorance gone, Deha Abhimana gone.

a) Karma Ajnana Karyatvat:
- Karma is product of ignorance.
- Therefore Sama Kalam, simultaneously or Kramaha or sequentially after Jnanam.
• No combination of Jnanam and Karma.

b) Sangatihi:
• Combination not possible (Another meaning of Sangatih – Link, connection between 2 slokas).
• In Advaita we don’t talk about Jnana Karma Samuchhaya.
• 1\textsuperscript{st} Karma – gets Sadhana Chatustaya Sampatti, drop Karma, go to Jnanam.
• Karma Anantaram Jnanam possible.
• Karma Sama Kale Jnanam not possible.
• After Jnanam, Karma impossible.
• Sangatihi Na Bavati...
• Sureshvaracharya refers to technical point causally.

c) Vastu Avastu Tantratvam: Technical point

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Karma</th>
<th>Understanding / Knowledge / Knowing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Action</td>
<td>- Not action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Listening</td>
<td>- No choice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Has choice</td>
<td>- Vastu Tantram</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Avastu Tantram</td>
<td>- What you receive behind ears, not your choice .</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Travel by Bus, car, cycle, sitting, standing, close eyes, mind in hall.</td>
<td>- Message determined by object, Shabda to which I am exposed to.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Depends on will.</td>
<td>- Not will based.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• Essentially 2 different processes, can’t be combined.
• Purva Pakshi gives another suggestion, refuted in verse 76.

Verse 76:

If it be the case that there is identification with the body (for the enlightened man), then he is an ignorant man. He certainly performs actions. Indeed, who can prevent an ignorant one? [Verse 76]

Revision:

• Sureshvaracharya refutes Bheda, Abheda Vadi.
• Samastav – Vyastav Butam Brahman (SVBB).
• Brahman existing as one total and plurality, individual things and beings.
• See unity in diversity.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unity</th>
<th>Diversity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Satyam</td>
<td>Satyam</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Advaitam talks about unity in diversity also.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unity</th>
<th>Diversity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Satyam</td>
<td>Mithya</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What is the relation of Jivatma and Brahman in Purva Pakshi Matam?

- Bheda – Abheda Vadi:
  - Not pure Bheda or pure Abheda, mixture.
  - There is identity in difference.
  - Tamilnadu / India.
  - Difference and non-difference is there.

3 Stages of Refutation:

- Bheda Vadi: Verse 71, 72
- Abheda Paksha: Verse 70, 73, 74, 75, 76
- Bheda – Abheda Paksha

If Jivatma claims oneness with Samastav – Vyastav Butam Brahman and claims Aham Brahma Asmi, he will have all Varna Ashramas and can’t claim to be Samastav – Vyastav Butam Brahman and do Karma.

As long as I am identified with individual body, I have Varna – Ashrama designation.
• Once I know “Aham Brahma Asmi” I have all designations simultaneously.
• Which means there are 2 possibilities.

2 possibilities

Do all Karmas simultaneously

Not do any Karma

- Because no specific designation belongs to me being Samastav – Vyastav Butam Brahma.

• No question of combining Karma, Karma Samucchaya.
• Before Jnanam, have particular designation.
• Jnana Sama Kalam or Anantaram, Karma not possible.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sama Kalam</th>
<th>Krame Na Va</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Along with knowledge</td>
<td>After Knowledge</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Another incidental Technical point:
• Jnana – Karma have different nature.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Karma</th>
<th>Jnanam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Will based</td>
<td>- Not will based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Avastu Tantram</td>
<td>- Vastu Tantram</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Discussed in Brahma Sutra : Samayvaya Sutra**

![Tattu Samanvayat](image)

But that Brahman (is known from the Upanisads), (It) being the object of their fullest import. [I – I – 4]

- Also in Sarva Vedanta Siddhanta Sara Sangraha.
- For combination, Jnani must identify with specific body, only then designation of Varna – Ashrama comes, pre-requisite of all Karmas.

**Purva Pakshi :**

- Makes last ditch attempt.
- Kasham Kusham Va Avalabyaha.
- 2 types of dry grass, clutching, holding on to.
- Just like a drowning person holds on to a floating straw, similarly, dying Bheda – Abheda Vadi is trying to hold on to some flimsy idea, holding – clutching desperately.
- Answer in Verse 76 by sureshvaracharya.
• Assume, to perform Karma, he comes back to Deha Abhimana, gains Aham Brahma Asmi, I am all pervading Brahman.

• For performing Veidika Karma, he comes to original Jati Varna and performs Karma.

• Purva Pakshi view not mentioned in sloka.

**Sureshvaracharya Says :**

a) *Atha* :

• However, on the other hand.

b) *Adhyatmam Yayat* :

• Suppose Jnani descends from Sarvatma bava, disidentifies from Brahman, totality and chooses to identify with Adhyatmam, Vyashtri Shariram, suddenly he remembers Abipadaye...

c) *Yayat Chet : Gachhet*

• He comes to, takes to...

**If it is your contention :**

• He has lost Jnanam.

  • **If he has gained Jnanam, can’t loose it, because it will means he has come back to ignorance.**

d) *Moodatam Ashrito Bavet* :

• He has come back to Agyanam, delusion means he has no Jnanam.
• Once he is ignorant, Varna – Ashrama Dharma comes, Veidika Karmas come.

e) Saha Karmani Karoti Eva:
• Such person will take on to Karma, Gothra, Sutra...
• Hypothetical situation imagined by Sureshvaracharya.
• Can go without food, do Sandhya Vandanam first, means staunch Karma Abhimana is there.
• Once Deha Abhimana comes, Karma comes with double force.

f) Kaha Vidhi Varanye:
• Who can stop him from taking Pancha Patra Uddarani.
• He will definitely perform Karma, comes to Deha Atma Abhimana, no Jnana Samuchhaya, no Jnanam at all, only Karma.
Previously | Now
---|---
- Jnanam was there, no Karma. | - Karma is there, Jnana gone away.

- Jnanam and Karma mutually exclusive.
- Sama Kale, Karma na bavati.
- Jnana Kale, Varna Ashrama Ne Bavati.
- Karma Kale, Varna Ashrama Badaha Nasti.
- Karma may come back, no Samuchhaya possible.
Introduction – Verse 77:

सिद्धत्वाच न साध्यमः यतः।

Since (what has to be done) has already been achieved (by the man of knowledge), it is not something yet to be accomplished. It is for this reason. [Introduction – Verse 77]

• Another Argument in context of Abheda Paksha.

Abheda Paksha:

• Aham Brahma Asmi saying Samastav – Vyastav Butam Brahma Asmi.
• Suppose such knowledge is there, Karma is not possible because I know, I includes all beings, things in the universe, Brahman is everything.
• I am one with all Veidika Karmas belonging to all Varna Ashramas.
• They perform Nitya, Naimittika karmas, Rig Veda Sandhya, Yajur Veda Sandhya, Agnihotram.
• Brahman = Creation, I includes all Karmas, they are already Svarupam of Brahman.

Advaitin:

• Brahma Svarupam is Nirgunam, Paramartikam.

Bhedabhed Vadi:

• Brahman, Vyavaharikam, Satyam, includes Creation, all Karmas happening all the time.
• What is Svarupam need not be accomplished through effort, naturally there, unconditionally there.

• **Example:**
  Breathing is Svarupam of all living beings – Ant to elephant.

• Don’t have to plan to do Karma of breathing – 7 AM – 10 PM.

• Karma = willfull action by effort.

• Svarupa = Effortlessly present.

• With Aham Brahma Asmi Jnanam, he has Karma as his Svarupam.

• Karma need not be done as action by effort.

• Hence, no Jnana Karma Samuchhaya.

• Karma exists as his Siddha Svarupa.

a) **Karmana Svarupena Siddhatvat Na Sadhanam Bavati :**

• For a Jnani.

**For Ajnani :**

• Karma = Sadhanam, not for Siddah.

• All Karmas accomplished as very Svarupam of Jnani.

• Karma need not be accomplished through an effort.

• Can’t prescribe breathing.
Similarly can’t prescribe Jnana – Karma Samuchhaya.

Yatcha:
Because.

Verse 77:

Action, either as the universal or as the particular, becomes the very nature of the man of knowledge. Therefore, it requires no injunction; it is like breathing in and breathing out. [Verse 77]

a) Karma Yoginaha Atma Eva Bavati:

Yogi = Bheda Abheda Vadi.

Jnanam:

I am all inclusive Brahman.

Aham:
Includes all Karmas.

What type of Karma?

Bheda Abheda sees in 2 perspectives.
b) **Tasmāt Niyogam:**
- Prescription of Karma.

c) **Apekshate:**
- Is not required for Jnanam.
- Karma already included in your Jnani as the very Svarupa.
- Since Karma can’t be prescribed, Jnana Karma Samuchhaya can’t be prescribed.

**Abheda Paksha Arguments / Nirasa:**
- Verse 70, 73 – 77 – 6 Verses over.

**Bheda Paksha Nirasa: Verse 71, 72**
- See them as constituent, component of Bheda, Abheda Paksha and negate.
- Bartru Prapancha Matam.
- Now the components Bheda – Abheda are united and negated as a mixture.
“Then,” so the opponent argues, “let Brahman be different as well as non-different. In that case, both knowledge and action become possible, because they are concerned with oneness and difference.” But this theory itself is untenable. Why is it so? The notion of difference such as “This is different” cannot arise with regard to any object without removing the notion of non-difference. If this is not accepted, the terms “difference” and “non-difference” will lose their ordinary significance. If this theory is entertained [by the opponent] even though there is no evidence for it, then since both positions (i.e. difference and non-difference between Brahman and jiva) are accepted [by him], Brahman would be subject to misery from the standpoint of non-difference. Therefore it is said. [Introduction – Verse 78]
Purva Pakshi – Suggestion:

- If I take mixture Bheda Abheda, I have advantage of remaining in Karma Khanda.
- Want to accommodate Karma Khanda + Jnana Khanda simultaneously.
- Purva Pakshi’s struggle is, how to combine Karma Khanda + Jnana Khanda and become Eka Shastra Vadi.

I) Karma Khanda:

- If I hold to Karma Khanda Paksha alone.
- I am different, Ishvara different, Brahman different.
- In Bheda Paksha I have Advantage of doing Karma.

Disadvantage:

- No Advaita Jnanam.

II) In Jnana Khanda:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Advantage</th>
<th>Disadvantage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Can hold on to Aham Brahma Asmi</td>
<td>Karma goes out</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Purva Pakshi:

- Why can’t I hold on to both Karma Khanda + Jnana Khanda.

Example:

- Thermos flask, put ice cream and coffee together to keep them individually hot, cold.
- Then can do both Karma + Jnanam.
a) Astu Tarhi :
• If individually, Karma Khanda and Jnana Khanda untenable, can’t hold water.

b) Bhinna – Abhinna Atmakam Astu :
• Let us take combination of Bheda – Abheda.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bheda</th>
<th>Abheda</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Hold on to Bagawan for Puja, Karma.</td>
<td>- Hold to Jnana Khanda.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Bagawan different from me.</td>
<td>- Bagawan identical with me.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

What is Advantage?
• Can respect Veda Pura and Veda Anta, both Valid.
• Toughest task in Hinduism.

Gita

In one place
- Chapter 7 – 9.
- You worship God, You are Ishvara Dasa.
- Bheda, Dvaitam.
- Jiva / Jagat / Ishvara.

In another place
- Chapter 13
- You are God, Ishvara.
- Abheda, Advaitam.
- Atma – Anatma.
Controversy:

- If I am God, why worship God.
- Veda Purva – Anta controversy for centuries.
- Do Puja or not after the class?
- How both valid?
- In Puja.

c) Tatacha Sati:

- If you judiciously combine both, them Jnana Karmani Sambavatcha...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Puja Room</th>
<th>Class Room</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bheda</td>
<td>Abheda</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

d) Bheda Jnana Karmani Sambavataha:

- Possible – hown.

e) Bheda – Abheda Vishayatvat Tayorhi:

- Jnanam is based on Abheda Paksha.
- Karma based on Bheda Paksha. This is Purva Pakshi – Matam.

Sureshvaracharya Answer:

f) Tatra Ta Vatu.. Ayam Paksha Eva:

- It is nice to be all accommodative.
- Veda is Pramanam given by God – Purva + Anta both Pramanam.


- You can’t combine, logically untenable.
- Respect Veda, give up logic then blind belief.
- Vedanta does not give up logic.
- Make sure your interpretation does not go against logic called healthy Sraddha.
- Giving up Veda, holding to logic is Nastikatvam.

### 2 Extremes

- Holding Veda
  - Giving up logic
  - Blind belief.
- Holding logic giving up Veda
  - Nastika

- Hold on to Sruti and Yukti Pramanam.
- Interpret Veda without contradicting logic reasoning.
- Bheda – Abheda Vada is contradictory to reasoning, opposite attributes, difference – non-difference.

- **Opposite attributes can’t coexist in one place.**
Jiva has to

- Identical to Brahman
- Different from Brahman

- Not both different and identical.
- Therefore can’t coexist. Therefore Samuchhaya not possible.

Aside Issue:

Gita:

Janaka and others attained Perfection verily through action only; even with a view to protecting the masses you should perform action. [Chapter 3 – Verse 20]

- Advises Vidwan – Jnani to do Karma, Karma Kuryat.
- This is Jnana Karma Samuchhaya.

Reasoning:

- Opposites can coexist under one rare condition.
Both can coexist, both Satyam according to Purva Pakshi.
Therefore we dismiss.

Revision:
- Bheda – Abheda – System of philosophy rejected by Sureshvaracharya.
- What are logical problems?
- Combination refuted here in verse 78.

a) First one and half line upto Tayohi – Purva Pakshi – Matam.
- From Tatra Tavat is refutation.
- Purva pakshi wants to give equal importance to Veda Purva and Veda Anta.
Accept equally

Karma Khanda
- Jivatma / Paramatma
- Bheda

Jnana Khanda
- Jivatma / Paramatma
- Abheda

• Composite system presented.
• Follow both lifelong, die as Samuchhaya Vadi, after death only Videha Mukti, no Jeevan Mukti.

b) Tatra Tadva Dvayam Na Sambavati :
• Difference, non-difference, opposite attribute can’t coexist in same Jiva or Paramatma.

c) Kim Karanam :
• What is the reason? We don’t accept this Vada.

d) Nahi Binnaha.. Padartham Alingate :
• Perception of difference, I am Jiva, I have to talk about my relationship with Paramatma.

Perceiving myself

- As different from Paramatma
- Same as paramatma
• Buddhi here = Perception, cognition, understanding, not intellect here.
• Aham Binnaha iti – I Jivatma am different from Paramatma.
• This perception is possible only under one condition.
• It should displace another perception, Abheda Buddhi Anirakrutya.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I am Dasa</th>
<th>Aham Brahma Asmi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aham Baktaa Asmi</td>
<td>Aham Ishvara Asmi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Am I Bakta or Bagavan?
• Bakta can’t be Bagavan.
• In Advaitam, can accommodate both in a peculiar way.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vyavaharikam</th>
<th>Paramartikam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Jiva, Bakta</td>
<td>- Bagavan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Do Puja</td>
<td>- Abheda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Teach Advaitam.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• 2 degrees of reality, opposites can coexist if they belong to 2 different orders of reality.

• Bheda, Abheda reality, both not Satyam, 2 orders of reality, can coexist.
• Without negating perception of difference, one can’t embrace, associate with indifferent Paramatma.
We are forced to accept one of two.

d) Evam Bhi Anapyugame Sati :
- Have to accept Bheda Abheda. Logical contradiction, can’t coexist.
- Impossibility of coexistence of Bheda – Abheda.
- Suppose you don’t accept Abheda, ignore, logical contradiction, you will have to introduce.
- Bheda – Abheda as extra-ordinary mysterious concept.
- Your theory will become abnormal with contradictions.
- Will have to say it is Alaukika Vishaya.

e) Alaukikam Pragyeta :
- Sarva Pramana Virudha, Nishpramanam.
- Will violate all perceptions, reasoning.

Bheda Abheda Vadi :
- What is wrong in that?
- You also talk of Maya, extraordinary Phenomena, indescribable.
It (Maya), is neither existent nor non-existent, nor both; neither same nor different nor both; neither made up of parts nor Partless nor both. Most wonderful it is and beyond description in words. [Verse 109]

- Mahadbuta Maya, Nirvachaniya, logically uncategorisable, indescribable, Alaukika Padartha.
- Bheda – Abheda like Maya.

Sureshvaracharya:
- Our Maya, no problem, Bheda Abheda has problems.

e) Athaha:
- However.

f) Nishprayojanam Api:
- Coexistence of Bheda – Abheda simultaneously is violating all Pramanams, violates Pratyaksha, Anumana, Shastra.

g) Kadapi Ashriyati:
- Resorted to, accepted by.
h) Tatu Nishpramanyam:
   • If it is accepted, what will be problem.

i) Ubayor Paksha Abyugamat:
   • Means you are accepting Bheda – Abheda in both Jiva – and Ishvara.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bheda Paksha</th>
<th>Abheda Paksha</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- No problem</td>
<td>- Samsari Jiva and Asamsari</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Ishvara Asamsari, Jiva Samsari.</td>
<td>Ishvara when they join.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Jiva – Ishvara different</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

j) Brahma Dukhi Syat:
   • Dukhi Jivas misery joins Ishvara, Ishvara takes sorrows of Jiva, becomes Maha Samsari.
     • Sarva Jiva Dukham will mingle with Ishvara at the time of Abheda Paksha Darshanam.
     • Ishvara becomes Maha Samsari.
     • Sarvagaya, Sarva Shaktiman mingles with Sarva Samsaritvam.
     • What is the use of becoming such a Samsari.
     • Bheda – Abheda Vada Ridiculous.

k) Ataha Aha:
   • I want to say this.
Verse 78:

If Brahman is different as well as non-different on account of [the common and] specific qualities, then in your theory Brahman is surely subject to misery. Also, it has to bear the entire misery [of all the jivas]. Wonderful is the wisdom of those who talk about the Self! [Verse 78]

- Same idea condensed here.

a) Brahma Binna – Abinnam Viseshav Syad Chet:
- If Brahman is both identical and different from Jiva Chet – then.

b) Tey Brahma Dukhi Syad:
- Your Brahman which is associated will all Jivas will become sorrowful.
- We present same to Visishta Advaitins.
- If all Jivas become part of Ishvaras Shariram, Ishvara will have Samashti Dukham.
- Ishvara has to cry for sometime, smile for sometime simultaneously.

In Advaitam:
- Ishvara not affected by sorrow, all sorrow is Mithya.
- What is Mithya can’t affect Satyam.
• Anyatra Dharma – Adharma, relative happiness and Sadness, can’t affect absolute Asanga Brahman.
• Brahman is free from Sukham and Dukham.
• For Advaitin, Dukham is experienced but Mithya Prapancha.
• Bheda – Abheda Vadi does not accept Mithya.
• If your don’t accept Mithya, will have problems everywhere.

For Advaitin:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Brahman</th>
<th>Jagan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Satyam</td>
<td>Mithya</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Brahman Satyam common to both Visishta and Advaitin.
• Main difference is Jagan Mityatvam.
• Otherwise what will happen?

Te Brahman Dukhi Bavet:
• Your Brahman will be Maha Samsari, has to share sorrows of all Jivas, human, plant, animal.

Visishta Advaitin:
• Bagavan is Anantha Kalyana Guna, only Positive attributes, sorrow outside Bagavan.

Advaitin:
• Bagavan will be limited then, Sa Antaha, he does not reach where sorrows are there.
Problems in Bagawan

- Only solution, sorrow is superimposed on Bagavan, does not affect Bagavan.
- Dreamer superimposed on waker Adhishtanam, does not affect waker, only logical solution.
- You will have endless problems if you don’t accept Mithyatvam of Jagat.

c) Aho Pragnya:
- Teasing Purva Pakshi, wonderful, intelligent, you are.
- You came to Shastra to remove your sorrow.
- Now, you made Bagawan also sorrowful.
- Atma Vadina, spiritual people, Bheda – Abheda Vadis.
- Pragnya is intelligence, Brihaspati...